

**ADDRESSING
THE PRESENT-DAY CULTURE OF SEXUAL PREDATION
AND COVER-UPS IN U.S. SEMINARIES**

Fifth Edition

Gene Thomas Gomulka, CAPT, CHC, USN Ret.

Sexual abuse victims' advocate, investigative reporter, and screenwriter; former seminary formator and instructor with an S.T.L. from the Pontifical University of St. Thomas Aquinas in Rome; former Navy Chaplain/Captain (O6) and member of the U.S. Marine Corps Inspector General Team; ordained a priest for the Altoona-Johnstown Diocese and later made a Prelate of Honor (Monsignor) by St. John Paul II

February 25, 2024

INTRODUCTION

This updated report has been prepared for the Bishops of Roman Catholic (Arch)dioceses throughout the United States; the U.S. Apostolic Nuncio, Cardinal Christophe Pierre; and the Knights of Columbus leadership in New Haven, Connecticut. Unlike the 1985 report, “The Problem of Sexual Molestation by Roman Catholic Clergy: Meeting the Problem in a Comprehensive and Responsible Manner,”¹ co-authored by Dominican Father Thomas Doyle, which was distributed confidentially to U.S. bishops and hand-carried by Philadelphia Cardinal John Krol to the Vatican, this report will be released to the media and made available to the public.

The genesis of the report is twofold: a surging number of seminary officials across the country reported within the past decade alone to have abused their power and sexually exploited vulnerable seminarians; and grave transgressions alleged to have been perpetrated by Cardinal Timothy Dolan and officials of the Pontifical North American College (NAC) in Rome against Anthony Gorgia, a former seminarian for the Archdiocese of New York at the NAC and a Third Degree Knight of the Henry Stolzenthaler Council #1675 in Staten Island, New York. Mr. Gorgia requested for two years that Church officials investigate predatory behavior on the part of the NAC vice-rector, Father Adam Park, as well as the retaliation Gorgia suffered by Cardinal Dolan and the NAC rector, Father Peter Harman, after he was receiving word from fellow seminarians about Park’s misconduct which Gorgia himself witnessed. When U.S. and Vatican Church officials, as well as the Knights of Columbus, ignored multiple reports substantiating the allegations against Cardinal Dolan, the Archdiocese of New York, and NAC officials, Gorgia had no choice but to seek the protection of vulnerable seminarians whose safety was at risk by filing suit in New York State Supreme Court. His ongoing legal Complaint attributes various legal and moral violations to Cardinal Dolan and NAC officials, alleged either to have engaged in or covered up predatory behavior or homosexual misconduct.

This report shows how the problems addressed in the lawsuit are not limited to the NAC but have impacted – and continue to affect – a growing list of seminaries in the U.S. and around the world. Insofar as Church officials have a documented history² of covering up sexual predation and misconduct by either failing to respond to reports or by undertaking “internal” whitewashed investigations with predetermined outcomes, the report calls upon the Apostolic Nunciature, all U.S. Ordinaries, and the Knights of Columbus to endorse the creation of a lay-led investigatory board – similar to the National Review Board established by the United States Conference of Catholic Bishops (USCCB) in 2002 – whose task is to undertake independent seminary investigations free from clerical interference while guaranteeing confidentiality on the part of the seminarians. Church officials found to have abused their power over vulnerable seminarians, as well as bishops or seminary officials who have covered up homosexual cultures or other serious problems in seminaries, should be subject to disciplinary action up to and including laicization.

Just as Doyle and his co-authors predicted that the U.S. Church could face \$1 billion in settlement and legal fees within ten years if it did not act on the recommendations contained in their 1985 report, this report predicts that the number of vocations, seminarians, and priests will continue to decline; more churches will close; and additional lawsuits by victimized seminarians and priests will be filed unless the recommendations contained within this report are implemented in a timely manner.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I.	GROWING PERCENTAGE OF HOMOSEXUALLY ORIENTED BISHOPS, PRIESTS, AND SEMINARIANS	4
II.	DECREASE IN SEMINARIANS, ORDINATIONS AND HETEROSEXUALLY ORIENTED PRIESTS AND BISHOPS	10
III.	PREDATORY BEHAVIOR, HOMOSEXUAL MISCONDUCT, AND REPRISALS AGAINST WHISTLEBLOWERS REPORTED IN VARIOUS SEMINARIES AND (ARCH)DIOCESES	17
IV.	THE ANATOMY OF CLERICAL COVER-UPS	30
V.	THE THOMAS DOYLE-ANTHONY GORGIA CONNECTION	40
VI.	LAWSUIT OF <i>ANTHONY J. GORGIA V. TIMOTHY DOLAN ET AL.</i> : SPOTLIGHT II OF THE SEMINARY CRISIS	42
VII.	CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS	53
VIII.	INDEX	61
IX.	NOTES	64
X.	APPENDIX (See: www.gomulka.net/SeminariesAppendix.pdf)	
A.	LEGAL COMPLAINT OF <i>GORGIA V. DOLAN ET AL.</i>	2
B.	AFFIDAVIT OF FORMER FBI SPECIAL AGENT IN CHARGE KENNETH T. MCCABE	61
C.	AFFIDAVIT OF A SUBJECT OF FATHER ADAM PARK'S SEXUAL MISCONDUCT	78
D.	AFFIDAVIT OF FORMER SEMINARY FORMATOR GENE THOMAS GOMULKA	89
E.	A STUDY OF SEXUAL MISCONDUCT AND COVER-UP IN THE DIOCESE OF SPRINGFIELD IN ILLINOIS: THE CONTEXT THAT ENABLED FATHER PETER HARMAN	120
F.	NINE REPORTS OF SEXUAL MISCONDUCT AND COVER-UP RECEIVED BY EVERY U.S. ORDINARY, THE APOSTOLIC NUNCIATURE, THE NAC BOARD OF GOVERNORS, AND ARCHDIOCESE OF NEW YORK OFFICIALS	130
G.	FOUR REPORTS OF SEXUAL MISCONDUCT AND COVER-UP RECEIVED BY KNIGHTS OF COLUMBUS LEADERSHIP AND COUNCILS THROUGHOUT THE UNITED STATES	160

GROWING PERCENTAGE OF HOMOSEXUALLY ORIENTED BISHOPS, PRIESTS, AND SEMINARIANS

It was over 20 years ago that seminary rector and professor, Father Donald Cozzens, called attention to the changing “ethnic face and sexual orientation” of the U.S. priesthood in his best-selling book, *The Changing Face of the Priesthood*.³ While some Church leaders at the time questioned Cozzens’ research particularly in regard to the percentage of homosexuals in the priesthood, later studies by Dariusz Oko,⁴ Paul Sullins,⁵ James G. Wolf,⁶ and the late A.W. Richard Sipe⁷ all supported Cozzens’ findings that “the priesthood was becoming a gay profession.”

Since the papal election in 2013, Pope Francis has appointed or promoted a number of self-proclaimed pro-LGBTQ+ prelates⁸ like Chicago Cardinal Blase Cupich,⁹ Newark Cardinal Joseph Tobin,¹⁰ Washington Cardinal Wilton Gregory,¹¹ Santa Fe Archbishop John Wester,¹² San Diego Cardinal Robert McElroy,¹³ Lexington Bishop John Stowe,¹⁴ Cheyenne Bishop Steven Biegler,¹⁵ Tucson Bishop Edward Weisenburger,¹⁶ Phoenix Bishop John Dolan,¹⁷ and several others. These prelates, either presently or in the future, are very likely to increase the pro-LGBTQ+ demographic of the College of Cardinals charged with selecting the reigning pontiff. Insofar as the pope has surrounded himself with a number of clerics accused of engaging in predatory behavior or homosexual misconduct, (e.g., Cardinal Francesco Coccopalmerio,¹⁸ Bishop Gustavo Zanchetta,¹⁹ Monsignor Battista Ricca,²⁰ etc.), the percentage of homosexually oriented prelates has had to have increased to well over 50 percent.

A May 2001 article reported that “the Catholic priesthood in Britain is fast becoming a gay profession.”²¹ In January of 2020, Pope Francis appointed Canon David Oakley,²² the rector of England’s largest seminary, as the Bishop of Northampton. During Oakley’s seven-year tenure as rector, the prestigious seminary was tainted by claims of being run by a “homosexual clique”²³ that was being overlooked because of a “homosexual culture in the Church’s hierarchy.”

After conducting confidential interviews with a number of gay priests, *The New York Times* religious news writer, Elizabeth Dias, reported that while it has been estimated that “gay men probably make up at least 30 to 40 percent of the American Catholic clergy,”²⁴ some gay priests told her “the number is closer to 75 percent.” One priest in Wisconsin told her “he assumed every priest was gay unless he knows for a fact he is not.”

A 2012 psychological study of “actively ministering or retired priests” in the U.S. revealed that only 26.9% of the priests identified themselves as heterosexuals,²⁵ 67.3% self-identified as gay/homosexual; and 5.8% reported that they were bisexual. This study, viewed in relation to previous studies, shows how the percentage of gay clergy has risen considerably over the past decades.

A former Irish Catholic priest, Pat Buckley, publishes a blog in which he wrote on February 24, 2024:

Today, the RC priesthood and episcopate are predominantly gay.
Is it a case that they promote each other?
Is it a case that they promote each other in return for sexual favours?
The case of ex-Cardinal Theodore McCarrick is a case in point.
Mc Carrick saw to it that quite a number of his former bedfellows got mitres.

The old belief that the Holy Spirit appoints bishops is nonsense.
In the RCC people get promoted for being a company man, for having a
brown tongue and it seems for bending over for your superiors.
Why are so many gay men attracted to the priesthood?
Do they go in there to hide?
Do they go in to escape?
Do they go in for the position and the status?
Do they go in for the easy, comfortable life?

The large number of homosexuals in the priesthood became evident when *The Kansas City Star* reported that at least 300 U.S. priests²⁶ suffered AIDS-related deaths between the mid-1980s and 1999. Priests were found to be much more likely to die from AIDS than other adult men as the annualized death rate of priests who died of AIDS in Kansas and Missouri from 1987 to 1999 was seven times that of the general population. Death certificates were also found to cover up the real cause of clerical deaths due to HIV/AIDS.

The reporting of *The Kansas City Star* is echoed by the findings of Dr. Joseph Barone, a member of the National Catholic AIDS Network. After conducting an “underground AIDS testing program” for NAC seminarians over the course of ten years, Dr. Barone concluded that 1 in 12 NAC seminarians tested HIV-positive,²⁷ mainly due to male-to-male sexual transmission. Barone reached this conclusion around the same time a priest on the NAC faculty was dismissed after it was feared that his sexual acts with both seminarians under his authority and other faculty members might be exposed.

Jesuit Father Paul Shaughnessy, while on active duty as a Navy Chaplain, received backlash from then-Archbishop Edwin O'Brien, head of the Archdiocese for the Military Services (AMS), when Shaughnessy wrote a controversial article in *The Catholic World Report* entitled “The Gay Priest Problem.”²⁸ In his November 2000 article, Shaughnessy lamented the death of many of his Jesuit brother priests due to AIDS. The percentage of gays has always been considered to be higher in religious orders than among diocesan clergy. In his January 2019 article entitled, “The Gay Church,”²⁹ Andrew Sullivan reported that the percentage of gay priests is “60 percent or higher among religious orders like the Franciscans or the Jesuits.”

Shaughnessy's work was supported by another chaplain, Navy Captain Eugene Gomulka, who wrote an August 27, 2001 article in *America* magazine entitled, “Home Alone in the Priesthood.”³⁰ Monsignor Gomulka noted how of the 250 chaplains from 60 different faith groups he was supervising, ten percent of the Catholic chaplains “were imprisoned or separated as a result of homosexual conduct.” This percentage of predator priests serving with Marines was roughly the same percentage the Spotlight Team of *The Boston Globe* reported three months later in its explosive series of clerical abuse articles. The reason the John Jay report erroneously claimed that 4.127 percent of U.S. priests were found to have abused minors between 1950 and 2002³¹ was because U.S. bishops grossly underreported their numbers of abusive priests and abuse victims to the National Review Board and the John Jay College.

A dramatic increase in both the number and percentage of Catholic gay clergy over the past decades was also confirmed by the research of Rev. Dr. Paul Sullins in his 2018 *Clergy Sex Abuse Report*.³² Sullins' research, which showed a clear relationship between homosexuality and clerical sex abuse, debunked the flawed John Jay report that argued there is no relationship between homosexuality and “pedophilia.” Insofar as no more than

10 percent of clerical abuse cases involve pedophilia (i.e., the sexual abuse of pre-pubescent children), the John Jay report comparison of homosexuality with pedophilia often echoed by pro-LGBTQ+ prelates like Cardinal Cupich is irrelevant. A 2008 study, “Differentiating Pedophilia from Ephebophilia in Cleric Offenders,” published in *Sexual Addiction and Compulsivity*, showed how John Jay researchers, unlike Rev. Dr. Sullins, did not examine critical data that differentiated between pedophile and ephebophile offenders when they prepared and published their pricy \$1.8 million report in 2004 for the U.S. bishops.

Sullins’ correlation between an increase in clerical abuse cases and an increase in homosexual clergy is also supported by an earlier 2011 study, “Sex Abuse of Minors by Catholic Clergy,”³³ co-authored by Richard Fitzgibbons and Dale O’Leary, as well as by research undertaken by the late Dr. Judith Reisman who showed how the incidence of homosexuals molesting children is up to 40 times greater than heterosexuals.³⁴ Reisman’s findings are consistent with those of *The Gay Report*, a study by homosexual activists Karla Jay and Allen Young, which determined that “73 percent of homosexuals acknowledged having preyed on adolescents or younger boys.”³⁵ Unfortunately, the Boy Scouts of America did not heed Reisman’s warnings about not allowing gays to serve as scoutmasters and, as a result, have now filed for bankruptcy protection as a result of some 95,000 abuse lawsuits³⁶ involving teenage scouts. The findings of Jay, Young, and Reisman may also account for why, of the 36 US bishops³⁷ who have been accused of molesting minors, 80.5% of those cases involved male victims.³⁸

With an increase in the ordination of closeted gay candidates who have entered seminaries in their late 20s, 30s, and 40s after having pursued other careers, one can expect an increase in the percentage of sexually active Catholic clergy owing to a difference in partnering rates between heterosexual and homosexual males. According to a 2012 study published by the National Center for Biotechnology Information (NCBI) of the National Institutes of Health,³⁹ heterosexual men reported a median of 1 partner over a one-year period, while homosexual men reported a median of 4 partners. The difference between the number of reported lifetime sex partners was much more significant. Straight men between the ages of 18 and 24 reported having had a median of 4 sex partners, while gay men reported having 15. Straight men between the ages of 35 and 39 reported a lifetime median of 10, while gay men reported a median of 67.⁴⁰ In light of the remarkable difference between the average number of male heterosexual and homosexual partners, it is logical that priests reported or caught engaging in a variety of serial sex acts will only increase as the percentage of gay bishops, priests, and seminarians increases.

Members of the gay community have widely acknowledged for years the presence of large numbers of homosexual clerics in the Catholic Church. In his 2019 work, *In the Closet of the Vatican: Power, Homosexuality, Hypocrisy*, French gay writer and researcher, Frédéric Martel, argues that the majority of priests and bishops are gay.⁴¹ His conclusions are based upon some 1,500 interviews with 41 cardinals, 52 bishops and monsignors, 45 papal ambassadors or diplomatic officials, 11 Swiss guards, and hundreds of priests and seminarians. Martel’s position is confirmed by findings that four out of five clerics working at the Vatican⁴² and more than three out of five U.S. priests are estimated to be homosexuals.⁴³

Martel’s study is supported by a number of news articles that would lead one to conclude that the percentage of gay cardinals is higher than the percentage of gay

archbishops and bishops; and the percentage of gay bishops is higher than the percentage of gay priests. This is only logical insofar as homosexual bishops who nominate priests for the episcopacy, both as ordinaries and auxiliaries, are more inclined to recommend fellow homosexuals over heterosexual candidates.⁴⁴

An increase in highly-placed gay clerics or bishops is also supported by a number of recent scandalous orgies, drag parties, or other sexual conduct cited as involving prominent clerics that were either covered up or tolerated by Church officials. In 2005, then-Springfield in Illinois Bishop George Lucas was reported to former U.S. Apostolic Nuncio, Archbishop Gabriel Montalvo Higuera, for allegedly having engaged in graphic sexual acts at an orgy with Father Peter Harman in the presence of seminarians and other clerics, including Bishop Kevin Vann. While both the Apostolic Nunciature and the Springfield Diocese had covered up the orgy allegations, recent Court filings and witnesses⁴⁵ incriminate not only Lucas and Harman, but also various Springfield officials who failed to submit these allegations to an authentic and independent investigation.⁴⁶ The orgy at which Bishop Lucas, Father Harman, and then-Monsignor Vann were reportedly in attendance at the Bishop's residence is not unlike the June 2017 drug-fueled gay orgy⁴⁷ in the former Palace of the Holy Office in Vatican City at which Cardinal Francesco Coccopalmerio and Monsignor Luigi Capozzi⁴⁸ were reported to have been present. Shortly thereafter, in 2018, media reports emerged claiming that videos were found in the basement of Mother of Dolours Church in Vandalia, Illinois showing "up to a dozen Springfield priests dressed in drag and engaging in homosexual acts."⁴⁹ A number of the priests reportedly identified in the videos continue to serve in ministry,⁵⁰ presently hold high-ranking positions on Bishop Thomas Paprocki's leadership team. In August of 2021, Brazilian Bishop Tomé Ferreira da Silva⁵¹ resigned in disgrace after video footage went viral allegedly showing him "exposing himself to the other man and engaging in an act of masturbation."⁵² Ferreira had previously been the subject of other Vatican investigations in 2015 amid allegations that he was in a romantic relationship with his driver and in 2018 after it was alleged that he exchanged sexually explicit messages with an adolescent male and covered up clerical abuse in his diocese.

The percentage of homosexual bishops is very likely to increase now that Pope Francis has appointed Cardinals Cupich and Tobin to the Congregation for Bishops.⁵³ Members of this Congregation are influential in assisting the Pope to determine which men to appoint and promote as bishops throughout the world.

The findings of Martel⁵⁴ and others about the extremely high percentage of gays in the episcopacy and priesthood are also confirmed by a number of other scandals reported to have involved priests in recent years. In 2018, two Chicago priests, Fathers Berrio and Giraldo Cortez,⁵⁵ were arrested after police body camera footage caught the two having oral sex in public. Shortly after the arrest, LifeSiteNews published a shocking description⁵⁶ of the bedroom of the former pastor of Chicago's "first officially 'gay parish'," Father Daniel Montalbano, where he died some years prior sitting stark-naked connected to a sex machine. The U.S. presbyterate was again shaken when in July of 2021, Monsignor Jeffrey Burrill,⁵⁷ who had been the highest ranking U.S. cleric not ordained a bishop, resigned from his post at the United States Conference of Catholic Bishops (USCCB) amid findings by The Pillar that he allegedly engaged in "serial sexual misconduct" using the Grindr app,⁵⁸ a location-based social networking and online dating application for members of the LGBTQ+ community. The Pillar likewise reported that usage of Grindr was detected in more than 10 Newark archdiocesan rectories and clerical residences between 2018 and

2020,⁵⁹ and that “during a period of 26 weeks in 2018, at least 32 mobile devices emitted serially occurring hookup or dating app data signals from secured areas and buildings of the Vatican ordinarily inaccessible to tourists and pilgrims.”

While the cases of Monsignor Burrill and Fathers Berrio, Giraldo-Cortez, and Montalbano are just several among many other accounts confirming a homosexual culture in the U.S. priesthood, clerical sexual activity is likewise systemic abroad. “Le Notti Brave Dei Preti Gay,” a 2010 investigative report by Italy’s *Panorama*, published the findings of journalist Carmelo Abbate⁶⁰ who captured video footage allegedly showing three Rome-based priests engaging in sexual acts with male escorts, among other inappropriate conduct. In 2018, an Irish priest⁶¹ in Kildorrey became the subject of a county state police investigation after video footage emerged allegedly showing him having gay sex on a church altar. Two years later, in 2020, former Swiss Vicar General, Father Alain Chardonnens,⁶² was reported to have been caught appearing naked on a gay dating website. Chardonnens admitted to having engaged in homosexual relations before entering seminary, but explained that he only recently joined the dating site because of the “coronavirus quarantine.”

At the Vatican, Congregation for the Clergy official, Monsignor Tommaso Stenico,⁶³ was allegedly shown on secret film in his Vatican office propositioning a young man, inviting him for sado-masochistic sex, and arranging to meet him in St. Peter’s Square. While Stenico later claimed after he was caught that he was only “posing” as a homosexual, Stenico was suspended from his Vatican post.⁶⁴ Stenico’s suspension was followed by headlines claiming that Gentleman of His Holiness, Angelo Balducci,⁶⁵ procured seminarians and other males for an organized network of gay prostitution.⁶⁶ These allegations would later be joined to 2013 reports by *La Repubblica*⁶⁷ alleging that a 300-page Vatican dossier compiled by three cardinals outed an underground network of high-profile homosexual clerics, replete with sex parties, and that this network controls the careers of ranking Vatican officials.⁶⁸ A 1,200-page dossier of a similar description⁶⁹ was sent to the Vatican in 2018 by a male escort identifying 40 “actively gay” priests and seminarians in Italy and enclosing WhatsApp chat logs and other evidence in support of the claims. The escort said that he outed the priests and seminarians because he was angered by the culture of “hypocrisy” that surrounded their sex lives. After Vatican-owned properties were said to be the site of “seedy saunas and massage parlors where priests pay for sex,”⁷⁰ it was reported that Monsignor Luigi Capozzi⁷¹ overdosed on cocaine and was rushed to a Rome hospital after participating in a 2017 drug-fueled gay orgy in the former Palace of the Holy Office. Monsignor Battista Ricca,⁷² who, while assigned to the Apostolic Nunciature in Uruguay, after being ordered by the Nuncio to get rid of his Swiss live-in boyfriend, was later caught “stuck in [a] lift with [a] rent boy” and also beaten up in a gay bar. It was following Jorge Bergoglio’s papal election that he appointed Ricca to serve as his “prelate,” or personal representative, at the Vatican Bank, while also making him the director of his papal residence, the Casa Santa Marta.

After Martel published his findings on the percentage of highly-placed homosexual clerics,⁷³ former U.S. Nuncio, Archbishop Carlo Maria Viganò, confirmed the presence of what he called a “gay mafia” among bishops. In a June 2019 interview⁷⁴ with *The Washington Post*, Viganò relayed, “the ‘gay mafia’ among bishops is bound together ... by a shared interest in protecting and advancing one another professionally and sabotaging all efforts at reform.” Viganò had previously identified what he called a “homosexual current” in his explosive 2018 “Testimony,”⁷⁵ naming as part of this “current” Cardinal

Coccopalmerio, alleged to have been present at the 2017 Vatican drug-fueled orgy; Cardinal O'Brien, who preceded Cardinal Dolan as rector of the NAC; Cardinal Renato Raffaele Martino; and Archbishop Vincenzo Paglia; as well as certain residents of the papal household at Casa Santa Marta. Viganò also revealed that accused homosexual predator, ex-Cardinal Theodore McCarrick, had orchestrated the appointments of pro-LGBTQ+ Cardinals Robert McElroy,⁷⁶ Blase Cupich⁷⁷ and Joseph Tobin⁷⁸ to their respective Sees of San Diego, Chicago and Newark. The late Bishop Robert Morlino⁷⁹ had similarly written of a homosexual current sweeping the Church, writing to the Catholics of his Madison Diocese, "It is time to admit that there is a homosexual subculture within the hierarchy of the Catholic Church that is wreaking great devastation in the vineyard of the Lord."

Even though media attention has focused on priests who perpetrated sexual misconduct involving minors or bishops who covered it up, little has been written about what actually causes priests and bishops to engage in this behavior which in most cases involves teenage boys and young men, often seminarians. In an open letter to Pope Benedict XVI in May of 2008, the late A.W. Richard Sipe,⁸⁰ one of the country's foremost experts on clergy sexual abuse, wrote that he had heard⁸¹ "from many priests about their seduction by highly placed clerics and the dire consequences in their lives that does not end in their victimization alone ... This abuse paves the way for them to pass the tradition on—to have sex with each other and even with minors." Sipe's findings were validated by a 1994 letter to Bishop Edward T. Hughes from a priest who reported enduring "sexual and emotional abuse" at the hands of ex-Cardinal McCarrick and contended that these experiences "had left him so traumatized that it triggered him to touch two 15-year-old boys inappropriately."⁸² An investigation has yet to be undertaken to discover how many cardinals, archbishops, and bishops that are alive today preyed upon seminarians and young priests who today "pass this tradition on."

Those reading this report need to know that every U.S. Ordinary was asked to comment on the findings in this study contained in an earlier manuscript entitled, "Catholic Clerical Sex Abuse: The Real Cause." When asked whether they agreed with Pope Francis, Cardinal Blase Cupich, and other Church leaders who identified "clericalism"⁸³ as the root cause of the sexual abuse crisis, one lay chancery official, after consulting his archbishop, wrote, "'Clericalism' is clearly a contributing factor to the abuse problem, but the real issue is one of homosexual predation, flowing out of the apparent prevalence of men in the priesthood dealing with same-sex attraction. Church leaders who deny or diminish this fact undermine their own ability to lead." When asked to respond to this comment, one homosexual priest who himself was the victim of sexual abuse when he was young, anonymously said, "While all sexual predators of seminarians are homosexuals, not all homosexuals are predators, just like all squares are rectangles, but not all rectangles are squares." Like the Church that clearly distinguishes between "homosexual orientation" and "homosexual behavior" in its teachings on sexuality, so too does this report – knowing that "not all homosexuals are predators" - attempt to distinguish clearly between "predatory behavior" which can be both criminal and immoral, and "homosexual conduct" which the Church – unlike the State - deems immoral.

DECREASE IN SEMINARIANS, ORDINATIONS AND HETEROSEXUALLY ORIENTED PRIESTS AND BISHOPS

The numbers of seminarians, ordinations and Catholic priests are going down. In 1970 there were 419,728 priests worldwide. In 2017, the number dropped to 414,582. During that same 47 year period, the Catholic population has nearly doubled, growing from 653.6 million in 1970 to 1.3 billion today. The number of priests worldwide has not only declined, but has also significantly failed to keep up with a near doubling of the Catholic population.

According to the Center for Applied Research in the Apostolate⁸⁴ (CARA), the number of priests in the U.S. dropped from around 60,000 in 1970 to approximately 35,000 today. The current average age of U.S. priests is 70 and the number of priestly ordinations declined in just three years by 24 percent from 2017 to 2020.

The decrease in priestly ordinations is coupled with a trajectory of seminary closures following the exposure of rampant homosexual cultures. Within the past two decades alone, scandalous conduct on the part of rectors, vice-rectors, priest faculty members, or seminarians was followed by the closure of the North American College (NAC) counterpart in Belgium, the American College of Louvain⁸⁵ (ACL); St. Anthony's Seminary⁸⁶ in Santa Barbara, California; Austria's seminary in St. Pölten;⁸⁷ St. Thomas Aquinas Seminary⁸⁸ in Missouri; St. John's Provincial Seminary⁸⁹ in Detroit (aka "the Pink Palace"); Casa Jesus⁹⁰ in Chicago; and Christ the King Seminary⁹¹ in Buffalo; among other institutions.

Saints Cyril and Methodias Seminary,⁹² part of the Polish Orchard Lake Schools near Detroit, is slated to close in the spring of 2022 after a young priest and a layman brought suit in December of 2020 against the chancellor, Father Miroslaw Krol,⁹³ claiming they were fired or forced to resign after reporting being sexually abused by Krol. Like the Gorgia lawsuit, the complaint involves predatory behavior by a high-ranking seminary official, reprisals and a cover-up by several Church leaders with the help of high-paid lawyers funded by hard-working Catholics who don't have a clue how their contributions are being used to protect sexual predators.

The last major study of U.S. seminaries ordered by the Vatican was undertaken in 2005-06 by then-Archbishop Edwin F. O'Brien who is infamous for significantly underreporting the number of sexually abusive military and VA chaplains⁹⁴ when he was the Archbishop for the Military Services, USA. When O'Brien was informed in 2002 by one of his chaplains (in a letter dated May 6, 2002) that a seminarian he recommended for the priesthood left the seminary after constantly being propositioned by gay seminarians, O'Brien failed to take action. He neither inquired as to the name of the seminary in which the former seminarian was enrolled, nor if the veteran might consider returning to study at another seminary. Later in 2005, O'Brien reportedly attempted to recruit two avowed homosexuals to study for the priesthood and apply to be chaplains in the military. One of those two men later wrote,⁹⁵ "As head of the 2005 seminary visitation, he [O'Brien] told reporters that men with homosexual inclinations should not be admitted to the seminary...Yet he had been recruiting at Courage, a conference for men and women struggling with homosexuality."

Many abusive priests whose victims were mainly teenage boys were themselves groomed and preyed upon while they were high school seminarians.⁹⁶ Had the formation of these abusers been better, i.e., had bishops, vocation directors and rectors prevented

them from being preyed upon, they more than likely would not have gone on to molest teenage boys and young men like they themselves were abused during their period of psychosexual development. The number of high school seminaries in the United States dropped from more than 120 in 1967 to 7 in 2017, while enrollment declined from approximately 16,000 high school seminarians to less than 600.⁹⁷ Both of these numbers are even smaller today.

As a result of the closure of nearly all U.S. high school seminaries, and with college seminaries replacing the role high school seminaries once had at introducing young men to clerical culture, the average age at which many “homegrown” predators were themselves first preyed upon in seminaries has increased. In turn, the average age of victims with whom these abusers “pass the tradition on” has also increased, with the number of teenage victims being replaced by seminarians who are for the most part between the ages of 18 and 27. Hence, based on this development, one can project that the target age group of victims of clerical sex abuse will increase proportionately. Because more victims will be over the age of 18, which is the canonical age of majority, abuse of these vulnerable individuals is often ignored by both Church leaders and the media when studying Catholic clerical sex abuse. The shift in the average age of victims consequently appears to have little to do with the protocols put into place by the 2002 Dallas Charter⁹⁸ and more to do with the closure of high school seminaries and the even more significant decline in the number of priests in a position to commit abuse.

In the early 1970s, following the sexual revolution of the 1960s, far fewer heterosexually oriented young men were showing interest in the priesthood and more high school seminaries were closing. Church leaders made up for their loss of heterosexual vocations by bending their recruiting requirements and accepting homosexual candidates. Unlike most heterosexual candidates who entered seminaries without any sexual experience and were ordained around the age of 26, many sexually-experienced gay candidates only began their seminary education in their late 20s, 30s, and even 40s. When some of them admitted to vocation directors or bishops that they were homosexuals, they were advised to keep this to themselves which then led Catholics to believe they sacrificed having a wife and children in order to follow Christ.

Even though the Vatican’s Congregation for the Clergy in December of 2016 reiterated that men with “deeply rooted homosexual tendencies” should not be admitted into Catholic seminaries,⁹⁹ one still reads accounts about the continued presence of gays in seminaries, and even about seminary superiors who enable homosexual cultures by discriminating against heterosexual candidates for the priesthood. A March 2019 article recounted an interview with a seminarian studying for the priesthood in Rome who said, “There are about 20 of us in my seminary. Seven are clearly gay. About six others have, we might say, tendencies.¹⁰⁰ That agrees more or less with the usual percentage: between 60 and 70 per cent of seminarians are gay. Sometimes I think it’s as many as 75 per cent.” The Roman seminarian in 2019 proved that Michael Rose’s words in *Goodbye, Good Men* rang prophetic when he summarized the deteriorating condition of seminaries, stating,

How many heterosexual seminarians...have decided to leave the seminary and abandon their vocations because of the 'gay subculture' they were forced to endure, because they had been propositioned, harassed or even molested? We're not talking here about the presence of a few homosexually-

oriented men who conduct themselves with perfect chastity. Rather there exists an intense and often threatening atmosphere.¹⁰¹

Not only straight seminarians, but also homosexually oriented seminarians who wish to lead celibate lives are leaving formation or being expelled after turning down or reporting sexual advances by gay priests and/or seminarians. Timothy Passow who was in formation with the Oratorians in Brooklyn left after the Provost, Father Anthony Andreassi, C.O. failed to discipline Passow's homosexually active Novice Master, Father Michael Callaghan.¹⁰² Just like Monsignor Jeffrey Burrill,¹⁰³ the disgraced former General Secretary of the United States Conference of Catholic Bishops (USCCB), was caught using the gay hook-up Grindr app, so too did Passow discover that Callaghan had an active Grindr account which helped to explain why Callaghan was overly touchy and attempted to get Passow to spend an overnight with him outside of the Oratory. According to screenshots on his Grindr app profile, Callaghan embraces "all races and ethnicities" and welcomes "duos" (i.e., when an escort is willing to service two clients of the same sex at once - usually male). Callaghan also wrote, "Regular FB or FWB would be ideal." While "FB" (aka "F--- Buddy") is someone you get together with for sex and sex only; "FWB" (aka "Friend With Benefits") is a friend with whom you can hang out and have sex without any emotional commitment.

What is very disturbing is that priests like Callaghan and Burrill who are reported for engaging in homosexual behavior are returned to ministry by their bishops/superiors while seminarians like Passow and others who were preyed upon not only leave formation, but often leave the Catholic Church owing to: 1) Being scandalized by the sexual predation and homosexual misconduct they reported; 2) Failure on the part of Church leaders to discipline sexually active predator priests; and 3) Refusal by the diocese/order to be compensated for the huge financial losses they suffered as a result of the wasted time they spent in formation. The Brooklyn Oratory refused to compensate Passow \$137,939.40, the amount of money he calculated to have lost as a result of joining the Oratorians.

The increase in the number and percentage of Catholic gay clergy is not only impacting the recruitment of heterosexually oriented seminarians, but also the retention of heterosexual priests and even bishops. Dutch Auxiliary Bishop of 's-Hertogenbosch, Rob Mutsaerts, resigned¹⁰⁴ after his Ordinary, Gerard de Korte, opened his cathedral for a "Pink Saturday" LGBT event. Upset with the Ordinary's pro-gay agenda, Mutsaerts wrote in his blog, "They want to change the doctrine on homosexuality not because they want to be merciful toward the heavy burden of sin, but to say sin is no longer sin." In August of 2021, Bishop Xavier Novell Gomà¹⁰⁵ of the Diocese of Solsona in Spain resigned "after months of pressure from pressure from LGBTQ groups in Spain, after the bishop said sodomy is a crime and that abortion is a genocide akin to the Holocaust." While Pope Francis was reported to have promptly accepted Gomà's resignation, he rejected¹⁰⁶ the resignation of pro-LGBTQ+ German Cardinal Reinhard Marx¹⁰⁷ who admitted to having covered up countless sex abuse cases when he was the bishop of Trier. Shortly after, in September 2021, Francis rejected the resignation of German pro-LGBTQ+ Archbishop Stefan Heße,¹⁰⁸ who came under fire for his handling of sex abuse cases.¹⁰⁹

Some Vatican observers perceived these administrative shake-ups to be similar to Cardinal Gerhard Müller's stepping down as the Prefect for the Congregation of the Doctrine of the Faith. It was reported that Pope Francis ordered Müller to cease his investigation into allegations of sexual abuse involving British Cardinal Cormac Murphy-

O'Connor¹¹⁰ who, as a member of the St. Gallen Mafia, helped secure Francis' election. Müller soon after found himself removed from his post and replaced by Francis' fellow Jesuit, Cardinal Luis Ladaria Ferrer.

Just as some seminary rectors have tolerated - or even fostered - a "homosexual clique" of gay seminarians,¹¹¹ so too do gay bishops often discriminate against heterosexual priests by filling chancery or other high positions with priests who share their sexual orientation. Shortly after his installation, then-Springfield in Illinois Bishop George Lucas,¹¹² himself accused of homosexual misconduct, announced that the honorific rank of "Monsignor" would be conferred upon 15 Springfield priests. A number of those to be promoted were known to have either covered up for Lucas' predecessor, accused-sexual predator Bishop Daniel Ryan, or engaged in homosexual behavior themselves with male prostitutes or with one another. Among those Lucas rewarded include former Springfield Chancellor, Eugene Costa,¹¹³ who was found beaten in Springfield's Douglas Park, a place known for gay activity, by two teenagers who claimed Costa¹¹⁴ offered them \$50.00 for sexual favors; John Renken,¹¹⁵ who as Ryan's Vicar General covered up reports of sexual abuse and was himself known for his relationships with homosexuals; and Thomas Holinga,¹¹⁶ the Director of Clergy Personnel who was one of Ryan's frequent traveling companions. Lucas likewise shielded the career of his reported homosexual lover, Father Peter Harman, who was later installed as rector of the NAC by the seminary's Board of Governors Chairman, Archbishop John Myers, himself alleged in court filings by a whistleblower priest to have committed homosexual acts.¹¹⁷ It was also under Myers that Washington D.C.-priest, Father Adam Park, with a history of alleged homosexual harassment and misconduct, was recruited to serve as the NAC vice-rector. While these and other homosexual clerics found their careers enhanced, "canceled priests" like Richmond Father Mark White; Chicago Father Paul Kalchik; La Crosse Father James Altman; Detroit Fathers Eduard Perrone and Michael Suhy; San Antonio priest Father Clay Hunt; and Companions of the Cross priest Father Mark Goring, who preached the Church's traditional teachings on faith and morals or exposed sexual misconduct by clerics or cover-ups by prelates found themselves suspended or punished.

Homosexual or pro-LGBTQ+ clerics tend to be promoted over their heterosexual counterparts because the former are often more inclined to cover up for priests who engage in some of the same types of behavior they themselves either secretly live out or condone. The Vatican has seen devastating results when it replaced a bishop accused of abuse or cover-up with a heterosexually-oriented prelate less inclined to conceal sexual misconduct. Archbishop Diarmuid Martin, who was appointed to replace Dublin Cardinal Desmond Carroll, was never made a cardinal after he handed over 80,000 files from the archdiocesan archives to civil authorities revealing how the archdiocese had covered up the predation of priests. Unlike Chicago Cardinal Blase Cupich who allowed non-Catholic lesbian Chicago Mayor Lori Lightfoot to receive communion at a Mass he celebrated, former Philadelphia Archbishop Charles Chaput, like Archbishop Martin, was also not made a cardinal after he asked pastors not to give Communion to those publicly violating church sexual teachings on marriage and gay relationships. Prelates like Martin who exposed clerical abuse or Chaput who defended the Church's teaching on marriage as the life-giving relationship between one man and one woman were guaranteed under the current pontificate that they would never be made cardinals and/or be elected to the pontificate.

In Florida's Diocese of Palm Beach, the Vatican appointed Bishop Anthony O'Connell to replace Bishop Joseph Keith Symons, who resigned in 1998 after admitting that he molested five boys. Just four years later, O'Connell himself resigned after admitting to molesting an underage seminarian, which prompted the Diocese to be called "certainly among the most troubled dioceses in terms of clergy sex-abuse cases."¹¹⁸ In Newark, then-Archbishop Theodore McCarrick was replaced by Archbishop John Myers, who himself would be accused in a lawsuit of homosexual misconduct. While Myers oversaw secret payouts to McCarrick's victims, McCarrick went on to become the Archbishop of Washington where he would be named a Prince of the Church. McCarrick, who would eventually be laicized for abusing minors, seminarians, and priests, was replaced by Cardinal Donald Wuerl, who resigned in disgrace after his record of covering up abusive priests spanning his tenure as bishop of Pittsburgh was exposed. Pro-LGBTQ+ Cardinal Wilton Gregory was sent to Washington to cover up for both McCarrick and Wuerl just like the Vatican sent Archbishop Lucas to the Diocese of Springfield in Illinois to replace Bishop Ryan after he was accused of sexual misconduct. Lucas himself was alleged to have preyed upon a 17-year-old seminarian when he was vice-rector of St. Louis Preparatory North, and, like his Springfield predecessor, to have engaged in homosexual relations with his own priests. Lucas' long-time St. Louis contemporary, then-Bishop Timothy Dolan, replaced accused Milwaukee Archbishop Rembert Weakland after Dolan had proven his skill at covering up abuse allegations¹¹⁹ as auxiliary bishop in the Archdiocese of St. Louis. Dolan would later come under fire for "creatively maneuvering"¹²⁰ predator priests and moving nearly \$57 million off of archdiocesan books to impede lawsuits of sexual abuse victims.¹²¹

At the NAC, a former seminarian alleged that then-rector James Checchio¹²² dismissed him for objecting to Checchio's recommendation of two actively homosexual seminarians from the Diocese of Providence, Rhode Island for ordination. Interestingly, one of those candidates that Checchio endorsed would later be accused of exposing himself to a young seminarian. When Checchio was promoted to become Bishop of Metuchen and later the Chairman of the United States Conference of Catholic Bishops (USCCB) Committee for Clergy, Consecrated Life and Vocations, he was replaced as rector in 2016 by Father Harman, who employed some of the very same tactics used by his predecessor to cultivate the NAC's retaliatory subculture. Harman, himself accused of homosexual misconduct,¹²³ is also alleged to have ignored reports of homosexual misconduct against the seminary's vice-rector, Father Park, and to have retaliated against those not complicit with Park's misconduct.

People who say, "It doesn't matter if a priest is straight or gay, just as long as he leads a celibate life," fail to understand that: 1) The straight priest is asked by the Church to forego having a wife and children which involves the life-giving Sacrament of Marriage, while the gay priest is asked to abstain from a behavior which the Church deems "an intrinsic moral evil;"¹²⁴ and 2) Apart from sexual activity, homosexually oriented priests experience far more psychological support and fulfillment when they socialize with or go on vacations with fellow gay priests than heterosexually oriented priests do when they are in the company of other priests. Catholic laity often do not think twice when two homosexually oriented priests vacation together, ordinarily because they do not have a clue about their sexual orientation.

As a result of the decrease in the number of heterosexually oriented priests, one should not be surprised that a former Swiss Guard said that many Guards return to Switzerland

believing that the Catholic priesthood is either “the greatest hideout for homosexuals” or “the most gay profession on earth.”¹²⁵ The Swiss newspaper, *Schweiz am Sonntag*, reported that a former Guard claimed he had been the target of more than 20 “unambiguous sexual requests”¹²⁶ from priests, bishops, and a high ranking cardinal while serving in the Vatican. The Commander of the Swiss Guard, *Kommandant* Elmar Theodor Mäder, warned Guards to stay away from homosexual clerics and complained in writing to the Curia about this problem. When questioned by the media about the existence of a gay lobby in the Vatican, Mäder said, “I cannot refute the claim that there is a network of homosexuals”¹²⁷ in the Vatican.

Church leaders will not admit to the negative effect the recruitment and ordination of so many homosexuals over the past 50 years has had on the recruitment and retention of heterosexuals who often suffer from “destabilization” – a condition in which heterosexuals who find themselves in an environment with a large percentage of gay men suffer a loss of morale and a sense of alienation. This alienation often emerges from a lack of shared interests between homosexual and heterosexual clerics; disdain of homosexual bishops toward their heterosexual priests; and a fear on the part of ordained homosexuals that their heterosexual counterparts might expose their closeted lifestyles. The destabilizing condition which has resulted in the loss of heterosexually oriented seminarians and priests is exacerbated by gay bishops and priests who wrestle with repression and self-contempt in living in the closet¹²⁸ with the lie they project of having sacrificed having a wife and children to answer Christ’s call to “come follow me.”

The internal self-conflict gay priests admit experiencing was voiced by former Milwaukee Archbishop Weakland, who resigned after it was revealed in 2002 that he had a homosexual affair with former Marquette theology student, Paul Marcoux, and that Marcoux received a secret payout of \$450,000 for sexual assault charges he filed against Weakland. An 11-page handwritten letter from Weakland to Marcoux portrayed a tortured soul who believed he was at a “crossroads” in his life and had neglected his duties as a priest and bishop because, in the words of Weakland, “my life was so caught up in yours.” While Weakland recounted that the Papal Nuncio, Archbishop Montalvo-Higuera, instructed Weakland by saying, “Of course you are going to deny it,” Weakland responded, “I can’t deny that something happened between us.”¹²⁹ Reflecting on his 2009 memoir, “A Pilgrim in a Pilgrim Church: Memoirs of a Catholic Archbishop,”¹³⁰ Weakland said that he wanted to be candid about how homosexuality, in his words, “came to life in my own self, how I suppressed it, how it resurrected again.” Weakland appears to be one of many examples confirming findings by A.W. Richard Sipe and South African sociologist Victor Kotze that at any given time, no more than 45 to 50 percent of priests practice celibacy, to which then-Prefect of the Congregation for the Clergy, Cardinal Jose Sanchez, replied, “I have no reason to doubt the accuracy of those figures.”¹³¹

A study published in April 2021 by researchers Avner Seror and Rohit Tiku¹³² revealed new pitfalls bishops face when they rely upon homosexual candidates to inflate the number of priestly vocations in their dioceses. Seror and Tiku found that as states began legalizing same-sex marriages, these states saw a drop in Catholic seminary enrollment by approximately 15 percent not seen in states that had not yet implemented such legislation. This significant shift was not seen in the enrollment of Catholic diaconal or lay ministers where celibacy is not ostensibly projected as a requirement. The study attributes this outcome in part to how an overwhelming majority of clerics has historically used the Catholic priesthood as a cover for closeted homosexual lifestyles. Father Richard P.

McBrien, cited in the 2021 study, wrote in 1987 that “...in a society where homosexuality continues to be stigmatized, the celibate priesthood can offer an esteemed and rewarding profession in which ‘unmarried and uninterested’ status is self-explanatory and excites neither curiosity nor suspicion.” An increase in societal acceptance of homosexuality has since opened new doors for homosexuals to pursue their lifestyles apart from the priesthood. A similar outcome was already seen in 2019 among European Catholic vocations, according to Martel, who cited the “homosexual liberation” of the 1970s and the “gay socialization” of the 1980s as leading to other options for adolescents no longer restricted to the priesthood to hide their homosexual orientation. Martel concluded, “The lack of vocations has multiple causes, but the homosexual revolution is paradoxically one of the main forces behind it.”¹³³ While the U.S. priesthood is on track to maintain its rapport as a “gay profession,” with the percentage of homosexual bishops, priests, and seminarians continuing to far outpace the percentage of heterosexuals, dioceses who depend upon homosexuals to fill parishes and chancery offices will see continued declines in the number of both heterosexual and homosexual seminarians being ordained.

In light of the profound negative impact the recruitment of homosexuals has had on the recruitment and retention of heterosexual seminarians and priests, Cardinals Timothy Dolan, Blase Cupich, Edwin O’Brien, Joseph Tobin, and Wilton Gregory; Archbishop John Nienstedt; Bishops Joseph Bambera, James Checchio, Robert McElroy, J. Mark Spalding, Michael Olson, John Stowe, Arthur Serratelli, John Dolan, and Michael Saporito; and others who are either viewed as being strong LGBTQ+ supporters like Father James Martin, or, in some cases, have been accused of keeping homosexually active or homosexual predator priests in ministry, need to realize that there are not enough gay men who make up about 2.2 percent of the U.S. population to staff U.S. parishes which have steadily been closing¹³⁴ at an average rate of over 100 per year. In 1990 there were 19,620 parishes in the U.S. compared to 16,703 in 2020 – a loss of 2,917 parishes. With the USCCB having filled its leadership of the Committee on Clergy, Consecrated Life and Vocations in recent years with pro-LGBTQ+ prelates like Cardinal Tobin and Bishop Checchio, it appears these trends will persist as homosexuals are recruited and promoted while heterosexuals are ostracized on the basis of their orientation.

Most Catholics are unaware of how the decrease in seminarians and ordinations is caused in part by the increase in homosexual seminarians, priests, and bishops. Neither Church leaders nor the Catholic media want to admit to the change in the sexual orientation of Catholic clergy over the past fifty years. Because many Catholic families are “kept in the dark” about this development, those with heterosexually oriented sons who enter seminaries often find themselves in very compromising positions.

For decades, the Catholic laity remained silent while bishops unjustly treated good priests or covered up sexual and financial transgressions that could have resulted in criminal prosecution and imprisonment. In some cases, the faithful were kept uninformed of how widespread the problem of clerical misconduct has been, in part due to bishop-endorsed Catholic media outlets like *Catholic News Agency* and *Catholic News Service* who have taken unprecedented and even unethical steps¹³⁵ to cover up for their episcopal benefactors and to avoid reporting how straight seminarians have been harassed and discriminated against by gay Church leaders. After the mother of one seminarian who alleged being sexually harassed by his seminary vice-rector and an older seminarian found her son’s extensive evidence rebuffed by *National Catholic Register* and other “Catholic” media outlets, the mother concluded, “It was of interest to no one.” The

bishops' media lackeys stood silent, without regard for the seminarian's vocation which succumbed to homosexual predation. Among other factors, such media outlets' neglect to report on the real causes of the vocations crisis helps explain why the number of seminarians, priests, and parishes continues to decrease.

Fortunately, more and more Catholics are speaking out, creating watchdog organizations on the international level like the Survivors Network of those Abused by Priests (SNAP); on the national level like The Roman Catholic Faithful (RCF); as well as on the diocesan level like *Ecclesia Militans* in San Diego, The Angry Catholic in Scranton, and the Gaylord Diocesan Watch. Websites like Bishop-Accountability.org and ComplicitClergy.com, as well as unbiased media organizations staffed mainly by devout Catholics like Church Militant and LifeSiteNews, are real "pain in the necks" for leaders of the institutional church who for years were able to have their "sins" covered up. Over 80 Catholic Podcasters like Dr. Taylor Marshall in the U.S. provide a platform to air the concerns of Catholics like Hollywood director, producer and actor Mel Gibson¹³⁶ whose support for the "Coalition for Cancelled Priests" who were unjustly treated by their bishops was aired by Marshall and other podcasters. These Catholic lay persons and organizations embody the message of Archbishop Fulton J. Sheen to the Supreme Convention of the Knights of Columbus when he said, "Who is going to save our Church? Not our bishops, not our priests and religious. It is up to you, the people. You have the minds, the eyes, and the ears to save the Church. Your mission is to see that your priests act like priests, your bishops act like bishops, and your religious act like religious."¹³⁷

PREDATORY BEHAVIOR, HOMOSEXUAL MISCONDUCT, AND REPRISALS AGAINST WHISTLEBLOWERS REPORTED IN VARIOUS SEMINARIES AND (ARCH)DIOCESES

Just as the sex abuse of minors in the Catholic Church came to light in January of 2002 with a series of explosive articles published by the Spotlight Team of *The Boston Globe*, so too was the problem of predatory behavior and homosexual misconduct in Catholic seminaries first exposed by investigative journalist, Michael Rose, in his April 2002 work, *Goodbye, Good Men*. Reviewers took note of how seminaries' "gay subcultures" and "heterophobia" were driving away healthy heterosexual men.¹³⁸

While experts have called the testimonies supporting the lawsuit of former seminarian Anthony Gorgia against Cardinal Dolan and North American College (NAC) officials "Spotlight-II" resembling the magnitude of *The Boston Globe's* findings, it is important to note that sexual misconduct at the NAC is part of a much larger context of what has permeated numerous other seminaries in recent years. Much like the Spotlight Team, the Gorgia lawsuit confirms a pattern at work in other seminary scandals: 1) Sexual predation targeting subordinates is allowed to go unchecked; and 2) Whistleblowers are swiftly punished, as they are perceived as a threat to revealing the secret sex lives of seminary and Church officials and endangering their career aspirations.

A June 2021 affidavit included in this report by former FBI Special Agent in Charge, Kenneth McCabe, indicates that the issue of sexual predation in seminaries is an especially urgent matter owing to the fact that seminarians may be considered "vulnerable adults." McCabe points out that "*Adult vulnerability* can be of a physical, social, economic, or environmental nature," which is compounded by "the power seminary and church leaders wield" over seminarians. Additionally, seminarians *per se* are afforded no specific protections under the Church's *Code of Canon Law*, and they are entirely dependent upon their bishops and superiors to achieve ordination. Seminary and Church leaders also present themselves as authority figures who induce seminarians into a relationship of total reliance, trust, and submission. Consequently, McCabe notes that "a seminarian's vulnerabilities can be easily exploited by superiors for ulterior motives."

While seminary and Church leaders often project public statements about "transparency" and "freedom for reporting," overwhelming numbers of seminarians face a different reality when they attempt to report sexual abuse. Victimized seminarians frequently find that sexual predators are protected by high-ranking Church leaders who oftentimes themselves are hiding checkered lifestyles. While more than 2 out of 3 sexual assaults go unreported to police in the general public, with a leading reason being fear of retaliation,¹³⁹ these figures are far more meaningful in seminaries where victims are defamed; find their reports uninvestigated; or are told to give up their hopes of ever being ordained if they reveal what happened to them. Those who speak of abuses in seminaries or how superiors cover it up are often dealt a fatal blow to their vocations.

The sexual exploitation of seminarians by seminary and Church officials is by no means a newly-emerged issue. Seminary predation cases increased near the turn of the 1970s in the aftermath of the sexual revolution and the surge in recruitment of homosexual faculty members and seminarians. As such, Church officials have had decades to address a problem which has since deteriorated owing to the desire of many to cover for predatory priests. While this report catalogues a number of modern day recurrences of sexual

misconduct and cover-up in seminaries and (arch)dioceses in the U.S. and abroad, the examples provided are by no means exhaustive,

St. Anthony's Seminary in Santa Barbara, California, closed in 1987 after a history of sexual predation scandals rocked its faculty members. In 2012, thousands of seminary documents publicly exposed the scope of sexual abuse by 54 friars assigned to the seminary. 2004 lawsuit filings¹⁴⁰ had previously recounted the extent of abusive behavior on the part of a number of superiors toward their students and tactics used by seminary leadership to cover it up:

Victim #15 also was sexually assaulted and beaten by [Father Mario] Cimmarrusti so badly he bruised like Victim #12 and also bled from his wounds. Victim #15 recalls Fr. Cimmarrusti requiring him to strip completely naked during one of the beatings, and then proceeding to strike Victim #15 33 times, 'once for each year of our Lord's life.' . . . After the beatings, Cimmarrusti had the sobbing victims drop to their knees; caressed, stroked and blessed them while pulling their heads into his crotch; and frequently threatened them with eternal damnation if they told anyone.

Victim #9 went to St. Anthony's rector, Xavier Harris, and reported the attempted rape by Cimmarrusti. Fr. Harris responded promptly by questioning Victim #9's 'vocation' and expelling him from St. Anthony's. Meanwhile, Fr. Cimmarrusti's abuse of St. Anthony's students continued.

The accounts of abuse and reprisal provided by St. Anthony's Seminary students bear a painful resemblance to what countless other seminarians have suffered up to the present in many U.S. seminaries. While Church officials claim that the number of abuse cases has declined since the 2002 Dallas Charter, this chapter attempts not only to refute this fallacy, but to provide evidence showing that the rise in seminary scandals and its consequences for priestly vocations is very much a current issue.

One of the cases addressed by Rose in *Goodbye, Good Men* involved Joseph Kellenyi, a seminarian who was sent from Mundelein Seminary in Illinois to complete his theological studies at the NAC's counterpart, the American College in Louvain, Belgium. According to Rose, Kellenyi immediately felt like an outsider owing to his perception that more than half the seminarians were homosexuals. According to Kellenyi, the American College rector, Father David Windsor, failed to intervene after Kellenyi reported a senior seminarian, Patrick Van Durme, for making multiple advances toward him. Kellenyi believes he was given a negative evaluation and was discontinued because he resisted being pressured into engaging in a gay relationship with Van Durme whom he believed was carrying on a gay affair with the rector. Realizing that he was a victim of retaliation, Kellenyi stated, "The issue was never one of my suitability for ordination. Rather it was that the gay clique had been given veto power over who got ordained." Any seminarian or priest who might out gay bishops, priests, or seminarians is seen as a threat that must be removed lest they suffer the fate as Monsignor Jeffrey Burrill who in 2021 was outed by *The Pillar* that reported him for his use of the Grindr app; or the NAC vice-rector, Father Adam Park, who abruptly left his post just days after Burrill was outed amid allegations that Park had preyed upon seminarians under his authority.

The American College in Louvain closed as a seminary in June of 2011, a little over 20 years after St. John's Provincial Seminary ceased to operate near Detroit. Several Detroit-area priests described their seminary as a "veritable hothouse" for the gay subculture. One priest said, "Everyone there knew what was going on. There were visits at night as gay seminarians cruised from room to room."¹⁴¹ In an article published in *Catholic World Report*, Michael Rose wrote that a St. John graduate recited a long list of active homosexuals who were ordained:

Some of the priests are now vocal gay activists, and others have left the priesthood to take up a full-time gay lifestyle in the San Francisco area. At least two are known to have died from AIDS. Others have been placed on administrative leave after charges of sexual abuse of minors. All of the offending priests, my informant said, were known to be active homosexuals during their seminary years.¹⁴²

St. John's Provincial was not the only seminary referred to as the "Pink Palace." St. Mary's Seminary in Baltimore, similarly dubbed, was among the seminaries cited by Rose for having had a prominent "gay subculture." Andrew Walter who attended St. Mary's as a seminarian for the Diocese of Paterson, described the seminary as a place where "some of the students and faculty used to get dressed up in leather to go to 'the block,' Baltimore's equivalent to 42nd Street in Manhattan." According to Walter, this was a regular practice of seminarians who at times were even accompanied by faculty members to gay bars. Walter, who was labeled "homophobic," was expelled from the seminary for not being part of the homosexual subculture. He was later ordained in 2000 for the Diocese of Bridgeport. Walter's assessment of St. Mary's was confirmed by another former student, since ordained, who described the seminary by writing, "I was forced to attend a seminary that protected militant homosexuals."¹⁴³

More recently, another accusation of homosexual misconduct at St. Mary's in Baltimore was brought forward in a November 1, 2019 letter to the Apostolic Nuncio alleging that a seminarian studying for the Baltimore Archdiocese had been sexually harassed from approximately 2018 to 2019 by a second career transitional deacon in his 40s. The alleged gay transitional deacon was retained by his Ordinary, Baltimore Archbishop William Lori, while the straight seminarian - coerced into leaving formation - also left the Catholic Church along with his family to join "had it" Catholics,¹⁴⁴ the second largest denomination in the U.S.

Two months after Rose published his book, Palm Beach Bishop Anthony O'Connell resigned when he acknowledged having abused a seminarian at St. Thomas Aquinas Seminary in Hannibal, Missouri where he had served twenty years as spiritual director and rector. Unlike ex-Cardinal Theodore McCarrick whose victims were college seminarians, O'Connell's victims were high school seminarians.

In the weeks following the 2018 McCarrick revelations, former seminarian, Gabriel Giella, broke the silence about the landscape of his Rhode Island seminary during the period shortly following the 2002 release of Michael Rose's *Goodbye, Good Men*. Giella described a climate where priests groomed and propositioned seminarians and half-drunk priest guests were seen "leaving the bishop's and clergy quarters at the crack of dawn." Among the most striking of incidents, Giella recounted the purported events of one Holy Thursday night when, after an evening of drinking, seminarians participated in what was

called a “seven rectories devotion.” The practice, according to Giella, described a game referred to as “which priest will follow us into the bathroom?” Giella alleged that one of the seminarians who returned from the alcohol-fueled rectory visits pulled Giella into his room, closed the door, and asked that Giella perform oral sex on him. Giella, who said that he turned down the seminarian’s request, was reportedly approached by another seminarian who cried because he envied that Giella, and not he, had been asked to perform the sexual act. The seminarian allegedly told Giella, “You know full well that every guy here including the priests and even the bishop would f[**]k you if they had the chance.” Summarizing his experience at the seminary, Giella wrote,

Sexual secrecy is the currency in the church and learning how to use it is almost treated like an art form in seminaries ... Sexual secrecy and blackmail is the clergy’s bitcoin by which position, power, and control are bartered in the shadows, costing children and adults alike their faith, their safety, and well being – and in some cases, their lives.¹⁴⁵

When the number of heterosexually oriented seminarians dramatically declined amidst the increase in homosexual candidates, bishops kept their vocation numbers artificially high by importing seminarians from other countries. In 2012, Canadian priest, Father John Lavers, conducted an investigation into allegations of homosexual activity among seminarians at Holy Apostles Seminary near Hartford.¹⁴⁶ Lavers confirmed that Chicago Cardinal Joseph Bernardin was the first to establish a gay seminarian pipeline from Colombia and other Latin American countries to the United States in 1987, working closely with then-Archbishop McCarrick to establish another pipeline on the East Coast in Newark, New Jersey. Lavers uncovered that that the Diocese of Newark in 2003 created a “house of formation” in Columbia for seminarians who were expelled from Colombian seminaries for homosexual activity. These gay seminarians were then accepted to study for a number of dioceses including Chicago, Hartford, Newark and Paterson whose Ordinaries then had them assigned to study at Christ the King near Buffalo, Holy Apostles near Hartford, and Casa Jesus in Chicago. While Holy Apostles is still in operation following the swift removal of 13 sexually active seminarians, Casa Jesus was closed in 2016 and Christ the King closed its doors in the spring of 2021. One of the graduates of Casa Jesus, Father Diego Berrio, was arrested in Miami Beach on September 3, 2018 for engaging in oral sex with Colombian Father Edwin Giraldo Cortez “in full view of the public passing by on Ocean Drive and the sidewalk.” The behavior of these and other priests who were imported as seminarians led investigators to conclude that the gay Colombian pipeline was a form of sex trafficking designed to provide gay bishops and priests with “fresh meat.”

Follow-up reports focus in on Paterson Bishop Arthur Serratelli’s alleged importation of seminarians, claiming that as of 2019, evidence suggested he was continuing to facilitate a gay seminarian pipeline from South America to the U.S. through his former vocation’s director, Father Hernan Arias. A number of communications addressed to Serratelli beginning in 2005 allege that Arias had a history of homosexual misconduct, including attempted anal sex with an 18-year old male discerning a priestly vocation. In a March 2, 2006 letter to Serratelli, the victim reminded Serratelli that being underage and served alcohol by Arias “was clearly in violation of the law,” and even though he was 18, “non-consensual sex is rape regardless of the age of the victim.”¹⁴⁷ When Serratelli neither investigated nor removed Arias following this communication, the alleged victim wrote in April of 2006 to the Apostolic Nuncio, Archbishop Pietro Sambi, stating, “Fr. Arias ... took advantage of the fact that I was considering a vocation to the priesthood, befriended me,

plied me with alcohol, and attempted to have anal sex with me.” Like most pre-seminarians, seminarians, and former seminarians who report clerical sexual abuse and episcopal cover-up to Vatican authorities, they rarely receive even an acknowledgement of their communications. Although Serratelli in time removed Arias as vocations director under pressure from a Paterson priest and Arias’ parishioners, he later tasked Arias in 2012 with supervising the Diocese’s Spanish-speaking vocations. In 2013, one seminarian wrote to the rector at Holy Apostles Seminary, “Very soon in Paterson some seminarians will be ordain [sic] to the sacred orders all of them are gay. The problem is in this diocese father Hernan Arias is the protector of them because he is gay too.” Even though other seminarians alleged that Arias sexually propositioned them in exchange for his promise that their ordination would be ensured, he remained in charge of Spanish-speaking vocations as of 2019 and currently is the pastor of St. Margaret in Morristown, New Jersey.

While a number of Catholic and secular media sources questioned the connection Rose drew between an increase in the percentage of gay clerics and the decline in the numbers of heterosexually oriented priests and seminarians, the accuracy of Rose’s investigative reporting has been validated by the statistical decline in seminarians and ordinations. His findings are also confirmed by reports of sexual scandals at various seminaries that resulted either in the dismissal of faculty members who preyed upon and sexually harassed seminarians, or in the separation of seminarians who experienced and/or reported homosexual misconduct.

Former seminarian Anthony Gorgia and numerous other witnesses are not the first to bring forward allegations of sexual misconduct at a Vatican City State seminary. Kamil Jarzembowski, who was enrolled at St. Pope Pius X Seminary within the walls of Vatican City, reported an older seminarian, Gabriele Martinelli, for allegedly molesting his roommate. The alleged victim reported that Martinelli abused him hundreds of times from 2007-2012 with acts that included “climbing into the fellow altar boy’s bed, pulling down his underpants and submitting him to oral sex...” While the victim maintained that he attempted to fight back against Martinelli, he was terrified of being dismissed from the seminary. Father Ambrogio Marinoni told a Church investigator that Martinelli would “exploit the circumstance and exercise a sort of dominion over the other youngsters.” The rector, Father Enrico Radice, and several bishops with whom Jarzembowski spoke, never interviewed the victim and the police were never called in. The cover-up of Jarzembowski’s report, according to *The Washington Post*, is evidenced by more than 2,000 pages of documents. Similar to the case involving Joseph Kellenyi who reported Patrick Van Durme to the American College in Louvain rector, Father David Windsor, Jarzembowski was kicked out of the seminary, while Martinelli was made a priest.¹⁴⁸

Christ the King Seminary near Buffalo, New York was likewise exposed in the media in 2018 when seminarians Matthew Bojanowski and Stephen Parisi resigned after suffering an environment where sexual misconduct was tolerated and covered up. Bojanowski resigned after alleging being reprimanded against for reporting sexual harassment at the hands of Father Jeffrey Nowak, his confessor and spiritual director. Buffalo Bishop Richard Malone was later caught in August 2019 recordings saying that “It’s very clear that Jeff Nowak had what I think was a very, very unhealthy and inappropriate attachment to ... Matt Bojanowski ...The simple version here is we’ve got victims and we have a perpetrator, and the perpetrator here is Jeff Nowak...” Malone also commented that he was in a “true crisis situation,” saying, “...this could be the end of me as bishop.”¹⁴⁹ Three months later, Malone was forced to resign in disgrace over his mishandling of clergy

sexual misconduct. Also at Christ the King, Parisi, a former dean of seminarians, attributed his departure to an ongoing “cover-up of sex abuse” at the seminary. The Christ the King rector, Father Joseph C. Gatto, was later forced to resign after being accused himself of homosexual predation, and Christ the King Seminary has since closed amid disturbing allegations of homosexual misconduct. Among the allegations include the events of a 2019 pizza party during which Buffalo priests, including Father Art Mattulke, a Christ the King spiritual director, engaged in pornographic conversations with seminarians. Several seminarians affirmed that the priests discussed homosexual sex, being aroused by pictures of a parishioner’s sexual organ, and jokes about a priest who taught at the seminary going to truck stops to give oral sex. Additional news reports cited confirming reports by other Christ the King seminarians, describing the environment as “thoroughly corrupt ... [and] saturated with sexual discussion and activity” and a place where “homosexual conduct went unpunished, with some faculty even bringing their live-in boyfriends to the seminary, where they would spend the night and shower together.”¹⁵⁰

In retaliation for the allegations they exposed, both Bojanowski and Parisi were falsely accused of harassment, disorderly conduct, and trespassing by Buffalo diocesan officials loyal to former Bishop Malone. The criminal charges filed by Catholic Erie County District Attorney (DA), John Flynn, were all dismissed in court as unfounded and the former seminarians are suing for defamation and a denial of their First Amendment rights. One of the diocesan officials who contributed to the DA’s malicious prosecution of the defendants was John Flynn’s friend, the Vicar General, Father Peter Karalus. Karalus himself was accused of misconduct which, after an “internal” Church investigation that was reviewed by Flynn, was unsurprisingly found unsubstantiated.

Gatto is not the only rector to be removed in 2018 amid a homosexual abuse probe. Monsignor James P. Moroney was likewise forced to resign as rector of St. John’s Seminary in Brighton, Massachusetts after facing allegations that he “allowed a ‘toxic culture’ of homosexual abuse and cover-up to flourish during his tenure at St. John’s.”¹⁵¹ John Monaco, a former St. John seminarian from 2014-2016, recounted, “I witnessed in abundance inappropriate behavior by faculty and seminarians alike.” He said, “Some priests were known to ‘groom’ other seminarians with lavish gifts and favoritism. Other priests would form cliques with seminarians and would even invite certain ones into their rooms for private ‘parties’.” In a 2018 published letter, Monaco relayed the betrayal he felt when he wrote,

As a victim of sexual abuse and misconduct, I, like the man in the parable who was attacked by robbers, found myself stripped of all I thought I had. I thought I had security and safety within the walls of an institution dedicated to forming men after the Heart of Jesus. I thought I had trust in those in power to promptly address issues of misconduct... And lastly, I thought I had a priestly vocation—something which I have now given up in exchange for a prophetic one.¹⁵²

Before Monaco undertook theological studies at St. John’s, he attended college at St. Charles Borromeo Seminary near Philadelphia. Like a number of former seminarians who reported witnessing scandalous behavior in more than one seminary, Monaco recounted being groped at a party at which St. Charles seminarians ended up “sleeping in each other’s arms.” When he reported what happened at the party to his seminary formation

director, he said he was told that he needed to be more understanding of his fellow seminarians.

A seminarian for the Diocese of San Diego who left a career as a Navy attorney to enter the seminary alleged that in February of 2018, Father Juan Garcia Castillo forcibly groped his genitals in a bathroom following a parish event. Castillo had emigrated from Honduras where he was ordained by Cardinal Oscar Rodriguez Maradiaga who himself was reported for having slammed 48 seminarians who exposed rampant homosexuality in their seminary. The San Diego seminarian testified that despite his protests to Castillo's groping, Castillo proceeded to massage his genitals. After the seminarian reported Castillo to the police, the San Diego Diocese removed Castillo from the parish without informing parishioners that he had been charged with sexual battery. Castillo was found guilty in Vista Superior Court in December of 2018 and was sentenced to six months in jail. Castillo was also mandated to register as a sex offender in the State of California.¹⁵³

Castillo is not the only cleric to face conviction for charges of sexually assaulting a seminarian. Former seminarian Mahe Thouvenel alleged that in December of 2018, Archbishop Luigi Ventura, a Vatican diplomat, repeatedly groped him at the celebration of Mass. Thouvenel recounted that he was dismissed from the seminary after filing a police report. Thouvenel was one of five other men who accused the Archbishop of fondling their buttocks during ceremonies or Mass in 2018 and 2019. The testimonies of the five victims led to the 2020 conviction of Ventura, who was sentenced to a suspended 8-month prison sentence for sexual assault.¹⁵⁴

In March of 2019, a lawsuit was filed by an unnamed former seminarian against Bishop Michael Bransfield, the former bishop of Wheeling-Charleston, West Virginia. The lawsuit claimed that Bransfield "sexually abused, molested, fondled and assaulted" the plaintiff "and other adolescent and 'adult' males." Bransfield was forced to resign in September of 2018 for alleged sexual abuse and financial abuses after having given hundreds of thousands of dollars in cash gifts to senior Catholic leaders.¹⁵⁵

While the names of former seminarians who file abuse lawsuits are often not revealed, James Heathcott disclosed his identity when he said former St. Paul and Minneapolis Archbishop John Nienstedt, when he was the rector of Sacred Heart Major Seminary in Detroit, expelled him after he rebuffed Nienstedt's sexual advances. Heathcott was one of several former priests and seminarians who gave sworn affidavits alleging that Nienstedt propositioned them. After criminal charges were filed against the archdiocese and Nienstedt was accused of failing to protect minors and vulnerable adults, Nienstedt was forced to resign.¹⁵⁶ Despite sworn testimony that Nienstedt preyed upon vulnerable seminarians and priests, Detroit Archbishop Allen Vigneron still invited Nienstedt to concelebrate a public Mass at Detroit's Sacred Heart Seminary in June 2018.

Archbishop Vigneron is also implicated in a federal lawsuit against Father Miroslaw Krol and the Orchard Lake Schools (OLS) where Vigneron serves on the Board of Regents. According to the plaintiffs, one of whom is a priest, they were forced to resign or abruptly fired after they repeatedly reported Krol for abusing them. According to the Complaint,

After the Plaintiffs arrived at OLS, they both soon realized that Krol had recruited them not because of their potential to serve OLS, but for their potential to serve Krol sexually ... Each Plaintiff has in turn suffered

professional repercussions and retaliation as a result of his refusal to submit to and reporting of Krol's unwanted sexual advances.¹⁵⁷

Just as Father Krol is alleged to have engaged "in sexual activities with seminarians," so too is Father Park alleged to have preyed upon seminarians when he was the NAC vice-rector. Interestingly, both Fathers Krol and Park were ordained by ex-Cardinal Theodore McCarrick whose sexual abuse victims were mainly seminarians and young priests.

A letter dated November 1, 2019 was sent to the Apostolic Nuncio, Archbishop Christophe Pierre, alleging that Baltimore Archbishop William Lori covered up predatory behavior and harassment reported by one of his seminarians who attended St. John Paul II Seminary in Washington, D.C. as a college seminarian before being assigned to St. Mary's Seminary in Baltimore for theology studies. In the letter, a parent of the victimized seminarian accused the St. John Paul II Seminary rector, Father Carter Griffin of the Washington Archdiocese, and transitional deacon Christopher Pinto of the Archdiocese of Baltimore, of "sexual harassment and psychological and spiritual abuse." The incidents referenced, including accusations that the seminarian was retaliated against for reporting the abuse, span from approximately 2014-2019. Baltimore Auxiliary Bishop Adam Parker, a member of the NAC Board of Governors, was also named as having taken part in the cover-up of the alleged abuse. . Insofar as Lori is the Supreme Chaplain of the Knights of Columbus, the Supreme Knight, Patrick Kelly, received a letter dated August 11, 2021 informing him of Lori's involvement in sexual predation cover-ups and requesting that he "call for the resignation of Archbishop Lori from his position as Supreme Chaplain."¹⁵⁸ Kelly has yet to respond to the correspondence.

The case of the former Baltimore seminarian whose harassment reports were never properly addressed is similar to that of three former Cleveland seminarians who reported being sexually harassed by Cleveland priest, Father James Cosgrove. While Deacon Christopher Pinto in Baltimore and Father James Cosgrove in Cleveland eventually were removed from ministry, this only occurred *after* the harassed and psychologically abused seminarians felt coerced into leaving formation. Instead of acknowledging how these former seminarians were harmed both by their predators as well as by Church officials who failed to act upon the former seminarians' reports, Cleveland diocesan officials defended their omission by arguing that the behavior reported by the seminarians did not "involve any conduct with a minor, any physical contact with any person (sexual or otherwise), or any criminal activity whatsoever." One of the former seminarians found this response "stunning."

The sexual predation of seminarians does not only occur inside the walls of seminaries. Before being ordained a priest for the Diocese of Buffalo, Ryszard Biernat was assigned as a seminarian to work in a local parish with Father Arthur Smith. Biernat alleges that Smith came into his bedroom one night and attempted to engage him in gay sex. When Biernat reported the matter to Auxiliary Bishop Edward Grosz, he said Grosz told him what happened was his own fault for not having locked his bedroom door. Smith would later be accused of abusing his own nephew, and Grosz would be accused of sexually abusing a male victim. Just like the Polish seminarian at Saints Cyril and Methodius who alleged being threatened by his New Jersey bishop with never being ordained a priest if he reported what Father Mirosław Krol did to him, so too did Biernat testify that Grosz threatened to have his Green Card revoked and have him deported back to Poland if he

ever told anyone what Father Smith had done to him. It was not until years later that Biernat told news reporters that Grosz's treatment of his complaint was "ten times worse" than the actual abuse he alleges Smith inflicted on him inside the rectory of St. Thomas Aquinas Church.

Some years after Biernat reported being sexually assaulted by Father Smith, a Mexican seminarian studying at Mount Angel Seminary in Oregon brought suit against Oakland priest, Father Van Dinh, the pastor of St. Michael's Church in Livermore, California. In the complaint, the plaintiff alleged being blindfolded, having his hands tied in front of him, and raped by Dinh in 2017. When police detectives served a search warrant at the church, they discovered, among other items, a glass meth pipe and thong underwear hidden in a locked closet; a blindfold found inside a nightstand drawer; and sex toys secreted behind a mirror on the floor. Upon completion of the investigation, the case was forwarded to the District Attorney's office recommending Dinh be charged with two felonies: "Sodomy by force, violence, or fear" and "oral copulation by force or fear." Just as Erie County District Attorney, John Flynn, never prosecuted one Buffalo Diocese priest ever accused of sex abuse, so too did the Alameda County District Attorney's Office decline to file criminal charges against Dinh. Nevertheless, after reviewing the results of the police investigation, Oakland Bishop Michael Barber, SJ, asked for Dinh's resignation as pastor of St. Michael Parish which was accepted on June 19, 2018.¹⁵⁹

In addition to many documented cases of homosexual predation in which vulnerable seminarians are sexually abused or harassed by faculty members or fellow seminarians, there have been reports of orgies at which bishops or seminary leaders hosted seminarians. In a letter dated January 6, 2005, the Apostolic Nuncio to the United States, Archbishop Gabriel Montalvo Higuera, was informed of an orgy reported to have taken place in the episcopal residence of Springfield in Illinois Bishop George Lucas. According to an eyewitness who claims he was paid \$300 for participating in the orgy, Bishop Lucas, who is currently the Archbishop of Omaha, and Father Peter Harman, the current rector of the NAC in Rome, were described in graphic detail as having engaged in anal sex.

Investigator: [REDACTED] screwing [REDACTED] [REDACTED]
Witness: [REDACTED]
Investigator - In the ass.
Witness: In the ass. [REDACTED] [REDACTED]'s bent over that couch. He got his pants off, down to his knees, and he's getting fucked. He got like little brown freckles on his ass.
Investigator: [REDACTED] does.
Witness: Yeah. They're not very dark. (unintelligible).
Investigator: Little brown - hairy ass, smooth
Witness: They're kinda like this.
Investigator: Yeah, but I mean a hairy ass, smooth....
Witness: He don't have that much hair on his ass. He shaves his ass.
Investigator: Big penis, little penis - did you see it at all?
Witness: I couldn't see his penis because he was, he was over
Investigator: Yeah, okay.
Witness: over the couch like that.
Investigator: Yeah. Okay, go ahead.

Witness: And so we all started having sex, and after that we left. As I was leavin', [REDACTED] [REDACTED] came up to me and handed me three \$100 bills.

The witness also alleged that there were three seminarians present, two of whom he described during his interview with an investigator as having engaged in oral sex:

Investigator: What about the three seminarians?

Witness: Yeah. They were - well two of them were having sex with him. The other one was just sittin' there.

Investigator: Who were the two having sex with?

Witness: [REDACTED]

Investigator: What kind of sex? What was he doing?

Witness: [REDACTED] was givin' them oral sex. And they were standin' in front of him with their pants down, and uh, he was on his knees, takin' turns.

When an investigator wrote Father Harman about his alleged graphic participation in the orgy, Harman responded four days later recommending that the allegations be referred to Bishop Lucas, writing, "Bishop Lucas has asked everyone, clergy and laity alike, to address to him any such allegations about wrongdoing by anyone officially representing the church." When the investigator received Harman's reply, he responded that same day by writing, "In your letter you suggest this individual [who reported the events at the orgy] approach Bishop Lucas. That statement would be laughable if this were not such a serious issue, especially considering his name was mentioned in conjunction with yours."

Around the same time the orgy was reported to have occurred in Springfield, Illinois, a vast cache of photos and videos were discovered allegedly depicting young priests having sex at orgies in the seminary at St. Pölten, Austria. *Profil*, a Vienna magazine, published pictures reportedly showing the rector, Father Ulrich Küch, and the vice-rector, Father Wolfgang Rothe, kissing and groping seminarians. An investigation uncovered about 40,000 photographs and an undisclosed number of films, including child pornography, that were downloaded on computers at the seminary. Even though the Austrian Bishops' Conference issued a statement declaring that "homosexuality and pornography" could have no place at the seminary, St. Pölten Bishop Kurt Krenn refused to resign and appeared to compound the crisis by saying, "This has got nothing to do with homosexuality. It's just boys' pranks." While Küch and Rothe resigned from their seminary positions, *Der Spiegel* later reported that Rothe, who took part in "wild gay sex parties" in Austria, resettled in Germany where he was serving at a parish in Munich. Rothe was photographed in 2021 as he participated in the blessing of same-sex couples at St. Benedict's Church in Munich.¹⁶⁰

Besides seminarians who left their seminaries (in some cases even the Church) after being sexually harassed by gay priests and seminarians and suffering reprisals from Church leaders for exposing homosexual predation in their seminaries, there are also seminarians who left after being coerced by gay or pro-gay vocation directors to seek spiritual direction from priests whom they perceived to be homosexuals. Robert, who wishes to keep his last name anonymous, is a former seminarian from the Diocese of Albany who attended St. Joseph's Seminary in Dunwoodie, New York and who reported being coerced into attending spiritual sessions with Father Christopher DeGiovine who

promoted homosexuality. According to Robert, DeGiovine attempted to instruct him how "in the ancient pagan times homosexuals were regarded as being closer to the Divine." When the ex-seminarian brought the matter to the attention of Bishop Edward Scharfenberger, he was dismayed that the bishop failed to investigate his concern. Robert was ousted from St. Joseph's Seminary in December of 2018 in reaction to his report against DeGiovine.¹⁶¹

Scharfenberger's treatment of Robert in Albany was no different than his unjust treatment of Father Ryszard Biernat in Buffalo. Despite a 218-page complaint filed by the New York Attorney General in State Supreme Court vindicating Biernat who exposed abuse cover-ups "under the leadership of five bishops, two future bishops and its legal counsel,"¹⁶² Scharfenberger never lifted Biernat's suspension when he was the apostolic administrator of the Buffalo Diocese. The current Bishop of Buffalo, Michael Fisher, who was made an auxiliary bishop in the Washington Archdiocese by disgraced Cardinal Donald Wuerl who was alleged to have covered up sex abuse in the Pittsburgh Diocese, has still not restored whistleblower Father Biernat to ministry.

While some seminarians caved into pressure from seminary or Church officials not to report sexual misconduct in exchange for ordination, these victims often later wrestled with the decision of having kept silent when they watch the perpetrator go on to repeat the abuse upon others. In 2013, former priest, Father Brian Devlin, joined three other priests alleging that Cardinal Keith O'Brien had sexually abused them. Devlin claimed that his abuse by O'Brien happened while he was studying to become a priest at Dryrange seminary. Devlin described O'Brien's acts as a "power abuse" and said that had he reported O'Brien at the time, his dream of becoming a priest would have been "killed in its tracks." Devlin explained that he had no means of redress in the Church and that "only the Pope can deal with a cardinal." Ironically, O'Brien had been one of the Church's most well-known sex abuse investigators before becoming the United Kingdom's most senior cleric. Admitting to failures in his sexual conduct, O'Brien resigned in disgrace.¹⁶³

Like Devlin who lived with his experience of predation for years, Diocese of Knoxville priest, Father Brent Shelton, penned a 2021 open letter revealing that as a seminarian, he had been the target of sexual advances by a priest. Shelton alleged that after Father Jose Saldana had "forced himself on top" of him, an incident that nearly drove him from the priesthood, he learned that Saldana was later accused of abusing other teens. Describing the anguish his silence about the experience caused him, Shelton wrote,

I am a witness to priestly predation, which I was complicit in covering up ...
I've thought about that hotel incident every single day since it happened over
30 years ago, but I cringe whenever any priest or bishop speaks of the need
for 'healing' in these situations.¹⁶⁴

The issue of homosexual misconduct and cover-up has also become increasingly problematic in recent years in dioceses and seminaries around the world. When in 2018, 48 Honduran seminarians complained of an "epidemic" of homosexuality at their Tegucigalpa major seminary, Honduran Cardinal Oscar Rodriguez Maradiaga, a ranking member of Pope Francis' advisory council, slammed the seminarians for exposing homosexuality inside the seminary. The impetus of the complaint stemmed from the fact that a seminarian from the Honduran Diocese of Santa Rosa de Copán tried but failed to take his own life after he had discovered his male lover in the seminary was in another

relationship. The descriptions of the Tegucigalpa seminary in 2018 were joined to the testimonies of two former seminarians who experienced misconduct by Honduran Auxiliary Bishop Juan José Pineda when he taught at the seminary several years prior. One seminarian alleged that Pineda attempted to engage him in nonconsensual sexual relations and touched his intimate parts and chest. The seminarian remarked, “Bishop Pineda never respected what I told him, not to touch me.” A second seminarian similarly alleged that Pineda attempted to abuse him, an attempt which the seminarian shunned. According to the seminarian, Pineda defamed his reputation, punished him, and ultimately had him expelled. Pineda, who was reputed to have slept with seminarians, resigned in 2018 as Auxiliary Bishop amid allegations of sexual and financial misconduct.¹⁶⁵

Also in 2018, four former Chilean seminarians and several others recounted sexual abuse horrors that had taken place previously in their seminary near Santiago involving the rector, Father Mauro Ojeda, Father Humberto Henriquez, and Bishop Gonzalo Duarte. Ojeda is alleged to have stalked and harassed seminarians threatening that they would be banned from the seminary if they refused to go naked into a pool with him. Henriquez is accused of raping a seminarian whom he drugged. Among many other acts, Duarte is accused of forcing students to give him back massages and to kiss him on the mouth “without the seminarian’s consent.” Seminarians who refused to do so were disparaged for not having “homosexual attitudes.” The former seminarians testified that they all went to their respective ecclesiastical superiors who did nothing but guarantee them that they would never be ordained.¹⁶⁶

Unlike reputed homosexual or pro-LGBTQ+ bishops who have turned a blind eye to homosexual activity in seminaries, former Dublin Archbishop Diarmuid Martin decided to stop sending seminarians to St. Patrick’s College in Maynooth following reports in 2016 of a “poisonous” atmosphere of misconduct at the seminary. Describing his assessment of St. Patrick’s, one seminarian remarked that “one of the elements which is destroying life in the seminary is the existence of a homosexual culture ... The bishops have turned a blind eye to this problem.” Sources claimed that St. Patrick’s was a place where sexual harassment and gay sex were fostered; the use of the gay dating app, Grindr, was prevalent; and whistleblowers were dismissed for bringing forward allegations. Nearly two years later, in 2018, the seminary’s newly-appointed president acknowledged that St. Patrick’s “will have to change if it is to survive.”¹⁶⁷

Joining a list of numerous seminarians whose reports of misconduct up to the present go unanswered, a seminarian at Theological College (TC) at Catholic University in America (CUA) in Washington, D.C., claimed that Church and seminary leaders failed to act upon reports that he had been sexually assaulted by a transitional deacon. The seminarian’s allegations were reported to seminary faculty; now-Trenton Bishop David O’Connell, who as CUA president was allegedly informed by a CUA professor that he had “a moral and a legal obligation to investigate;” and even to McCarrick, who at the time was Archbishop of Washington. Despite these reports, the deacon went on to be ordained a priest; the victimized seminarian left formation; and the accusations went uninvestigated for nearly seventeen years. After being contacted by the alleged victim in 2018, Cardinal O’Malley referred the allegations to the Vatican Congregation for Clergy, writing, “These materials concern very serious and troubling allegations of sexual misconduct, retaliation and cover up in the Theological College at Catholic University of America....” A 2018 memo from a CUA professor to O’Malley similarly revealed, “At the time these events occurred, there was a pattern of retaliation against anyone who informed seminary and

canonical authorities ... Even today, there is a reasonable fear of retaliation against those involved.”¹⁶⁸

Seminarians who have reported being abused or dismissed for reporting predatory behavior or homosexual misconduct have discovered that appeals to responsible Church officials and the Vatican for justice are ignored. Just as Pope Francis, when he was the Archbishop of Buenos Aires, attempted to get Argentina’s Supreme Court to reverse a ruling against his priest friend, convicted child sex abuser, Father Julio César Grassi, so too did Francis shield his friend, Bishop Gustavo Zanchetta, after he was accused of the “aggravated continual sexual abuse” of two seminarians. Zanchetta’s trial is set to take place October 12-15, 2021 at which at least 39 witnesses are expected to testify. The public ministry said Zanchetta could face three to ten years in prison.¹⁶⁹ The trial not only highlights the problem of the homosexual predation of seminarians that has not gone away since Michael Rose wrote his explosive book in 2002, but it also demonstrates clearly that it is only through criminal and civil courts that former seminarians can achieve justice.

THE ANATOMY OF CLERICAL COVER-UPS

The Vatican and U.S. bishops have a documented history of covering up scandalous, immoral, and even criminal behavior involving bishops, priests, and seminarians. A June 2021 affidavit by former FBI Special Agent in Charge, Kenneth McCabe, points out that cover-up tactics employed by Church officials take on a pattern. McCabe affirms,

In cases of clerical misconduct, concealment by church officials often includes tactics such as inducement of trust by superiors over vulnerable subjects; gaslighting and other forms of manipulation; whitewash, including the intentional exclusion of witnesses to produce a contrived conclusion; preemptive and *ad hominem* attacks on witnesses; feigned plausible deniability; refusal to investigate alleged offenses; and deceptive public statements.

This chapter endeavors to provide examples of how the episcopate has utilized these tactics to cover up seminary and clerical misconduct across dioceses up to the present.

The opening scene of the movie, *Spotlight*, which documented the work of *The Boston Globe's* investigative reporting, illustrated how members of the criminal justice system conspire at times with Church officials by failing to prosecute sexually abusive clerics. Such was the case with Archdiocese of Boston Father John Geoghan who, over a 30-year career in six parishes, was accused of abusing more than 130 boys. Both *The Boston Globe* and *Philadelphia Inquirer* investigations would report that “more than 130 U.S. bishops have been accused of failing to adequately respond to sexual misconduct.”¹⁷⁰

The way Cardinal Bernard Law covered up for Geoghan and countless other priests is very similar to the way Cardinal Edwin O'Brien covered up for his Navy Chaplain, Father John “Matt” Lee, when O'Brien was the Archbishop for the Military Services (AMS). When a senior Catholic chaplain forwarded to O'Brien an allegation he received from another priest that Lee was cohabitating with a “live-in boyfriend,” O'Brien failed to investigate the claim or to take any action against Lee. O'Brien, instead, attempted to defame the senior chaplain who informed him of the accusation by ordering that he undergo a psychological evaluation. O'Brien's tactic was later documented in an article by Father Thomas Doyle, O.P. entitled “Cardinals Behaving Badly.” Five years after O'Brien covered up the senior chaplain's May 6, 2002 report, Lee was arrested for conduct unbecoming an officer, aggravated assault, sodomy, and failure to inform sex partners that he was HIV positive. O'Brien misled the media to believe he was never warned about Lee's sexual involvement with young service members, and his successor, Archbishop Timothy Broglio, falsely claimed in a letter dated September 17, 2019 that the senior chaplain who wrote O'Brien only “reported suspicions about Lee's probable homosexual orientation.” Unlike Geoghan who ultimately was convicted and was murdered within a year of serving his ten-year prison sentence, Lee is still alive serving a 30-year sentence in a Federal Correctional Institution.

Lee was not the only sexually abusive military chaplain O'Brien covered up for during his 10 years at the AMS. Before being made a cardinal, O'Brien reported just two cases of sex abuse involving minors in the AMS. Although these were two cases more than what Pope Francis himself reported when he was the Archbishop of Buenos Aires (“In my diocese it never happened”),¹⁷¹ *BishopAccountability.org* has since uncovered over 150

priests of the AMS with credible abuse allegations involving hundreds of minors and young adults. A year after O'Brien submitted his false report which led John Jay researchers to grossly underreport the percentage of predatory U.S. clergy, O'Brien was chosen by the Vatican to undertake a study of all U.S. seminaries to counter reports of growing homosexual cultures in seminaries documented by Donald Cozzens, Dariusz Oko, Michael Rose, and others.

Just before beginning his investigation, O'Brien told a reporter from the *National Catholic Register* that "even homosexuals who have been celibate for 10 or more years should not be admitted to seminaries." Not long after making that comment, O'Brien was reported to have attempted to recruit two avowed homosexuals to study for the priesthood and apply to be chaplains in the military. One of those two men later wrote, "As head of the 2005 seminary visitation, he [O'Brien] told reporters that men with homosexual inclinations should not be admitted to the seminary...Yet he had been recruiting at Courage, a conference for men and women struggling with homosexuality."¹⁷² O'Brien's statement is also challenged by the rise in the acceptance and ordination of seminary candidates such as David Cherry and Alexander Balzanella by Westminster Cardinal Vincent Nichols in 2020 and Christopher William Butler by Leeds Bishop Marcus Stock in 2021 who were known either to have supported or entered into homosexual partnerships.

In light of the fact that the *National Catholic Register*, owned by the Eternal Word Television Network that also owns *Catholic News Agency*, did not expose O'Brien's duplicity, it did not come as a surprise that the *Register* never questioned O'Brien's findings that were incongruous with any of the concerns raised by Cozzens and other researchers, as well as allegations raised at various seminaries. Without a doubt, the report was a complete whitewash of the state of U.S. seminaries. According to O'Brien's report, "Almost universally, the candidates — both diocesan and religious — received great praise from the Apostolic Visitors. The candidates are generous, intelligent, full of zeal, pious, and faithful to prayer. They are demonstrably loyal to the Church's Magisterium. They are signs of great hope for the Church in the U.S."¹⁷³

In an April 10, 2019 letter, Pope Emeritus Benedict XVI referred to O'Brien's 2005-2006 visitation to U.S. seminaries as well as an earlier Vatican visitation ordered in 1982. Benedict wrote:

In various seminaries homosexual cliques were established, which acted more or less openly and significantly changed the climate in the seminaries. ... The Holy See knew of such problems, without being informed precisely The Visitation that now took place brought no new insights, apparently because various powers had joined forces to conceal the true situation.¹⁷⁴

While previously, Detroit Cardinal Edmund Szoka reportedly attempted to divert the 1982 Visitation from any discussion of the homosexual culture at St. John's Seminary (referred to as the "Pink Palace" by local homosexuals), a detailed dossier by seminarian Eduard Perrone documenting the institution's homosexual scandals led to the seminary's closure.

Those who worked as military chaplains with O'Brien were not surprised to learn how he covered up the problem of homosexual predation and behavior in U.S. seminaries. In 2002, three years before O'Brien undertook the seminary study, a chaplain wrote him a

letter recounting how a sailor he recommended to study for the priesthood gave up his military career to enter the seminary only to leave six months into the academic year. When the chaplain wrote that the veteran left after seminary officials did nothing to discipline gay seminarians who were constantly coming on to him, O'Brien neither inquired what seminary he attended nor inquired if he would be interested in returning to study at another seminary. The chaplain concluded that O'Brien himself was gay and was only interested in recruiting other gays to become priests and chaplains. His conclusion was later supported by reports of O'Brien's relationship with gay priests of the New York Archdiocese including the late Father Peter Miqueli and a gay-for-pay prostitute, Keith Crist. When Miqueli was a seminarian at St. Joseph's Seminary in Dunwoodie, New York, he was alleged to have had "an affair" with O'Brien who was the rector at the time. After Miqueli was ordained and O'Brien was named the NAC rector, O'Brien was said to have been driven by Crist to Miqueli's parish where he allegedly engaged in "orgies." A separate witness indicated that O'Brien was also close to New York former Vicar General, Monsignor Gregory Mustaciuolo, who studied with Miqueli at Dunwoodie during O'Brien's tenure as rector. Both Miqueli and Mustaciuolo were reported to have engaged in "masochistic activities" with O'Brien whom they knicknamed "the master."¹⁷⁵

O'Brien's underreporting and cover-up of homosexual predation and behavior in the military and in U.S. seminaries resembles how New York Cardinal Timothy Dolan, who succeeded O'Brien as the NAC rector, is also alleged to have covered up for Miqueli and numerous other priests accused of misconduct when he was in St. Louis, Washington, D.C., Milwaukee and New York. In 2015, Miqueli made the front pages of New York newspapers with headlines like, "Sex slave' priest wanted a threesome with my boyfriend." Miqueli resigned as pastor of St. Frances de Chantal parish in Throggs Neck after his parishioners filed a civil lawsuit against Miqueli, Crist, Dolan, and the New York Archdiocese. The suit accused Dolan of protecting "Miqueli's illegal scheme" and charged Miqueli with embezzling nearly \$1 million to pay for male prostitutes, lavish vacations, drugs and a New Jersey home where he could carry on his gay lifestyle in private. Despite a preponderance of evidence, Joseph Zwilling, a spokesman for the New York Archdiocese, claimed in a statement that the allegations against Dolan and Miqueli were "completely false."¹⁷⁶

Just as O'Brien failed to act when he was informed in 2002 of Father Lee's immoral behavior five years before Lee's arrest in 2007, so too was Dolan informed in 2015 of Miqueli's multiple problems five years before Miqueli's death in 2020 owing to "chronic alcohol abuse." Documents show that Crist's girlfriend, Tatyana Gudin, who was aware of her boyfriend's involvement with Miqueli, wrote Dolan in the summer of 2015, "Cardinal Dolan, you had many opportunities to put an end to this. And you didn't. By your deliberate indifference, you have allowed Miqueli to cause harm to himself and many other people. Cardinal Dolan, you will never be able to say you didn't know."

It was not until Dolan was hit with a lawsuit that he handpicked an investigative firm, Renaissance Associates, to respond to the allegations he was facing in Court. Both Renaissance investigators, who were paid by the New York Archdiocese, as well as the the Bronx and Manhattan District Attorneys' Offices, failed to interview key witnesses like Gudin; neglected to subpoena any documents; and refused to investigate all the allegations. With the absence of vital fact-finding steps, it came as no surprise that criminal allegations against Miqueli were called "unsubstantiated" by those to whom Dolan referred the case. Interestingly, a number of those recruited by Dolan to respond to the accusations

themselves had a history of corrupt practices or blatant conflicts of interests. For example, the Bronx DA's Office had itself been accused in a 2018 lawsuit of hosting on-duty sex parties and "rampant prosecutorial misconduct." In response to the New York Archdiocese and the DA's attempts to shut down the case, irate St. Frances de Chantal parishioners wrote a letter saying:

He [Miqueli] abused his people ... and the ADNY did nothing to come to our aid when it was happening, did nothing to stop it, and is now putting a cosmetic spin on the disgrace that they allowed to continue, casting doubt on the veracity, decency and integrity of the abused parishioners.¹⁷⁷

When the allegations were finally taken up by the Vatican, an investigator, Father Richard Welch, advised Dolan that the allegations had in fact never truly been adjudicated, stating, "We are investigating matters that have not been investigated." After receiving a dossier of about 2,500 pages, the Vatican ultimately concluded that Miqueli was in fact guilty of "moral and financial crimes," a conclusion substantiated by an unprecedented volume of evidence.

The way Dolan mishandled allegations of sexual, financial, and other improprieties involving Miqueli came to light when Miqueli was found dead in his New Jersey home that had a "sex dungeon in the basement where it is believed he had a number of drug-fueled "alleged 'pee drinking' sex romps" with Crist. Gudín and others closely involved in the case believe "Cardinal Dolan deceived the public while turning his back on his spiritual son, allowing him to live – and die – in spiritual squalor."¹⁷⁸

Miqueli is not the only cleric known to Dolan who is alleged to have engaged the services of prostitutes. Dolan studied for seven years at high school and college seminaries in St. Louis with current-Omaha Archbishop George Lucas. In January of 2005, Lucas and other priests of the Springfield in Illinois Diocese were accused in a letter to the Papal Nuncio of participating in a gay orgy in Lucas' episcopal residence. According to an eyewitness who said he was paid \$300 for participating in the orgy, Lucas engaged in anal sex with Father Peter Harman while other gay priests were similarly occupied in the presence of seminarians. Informants regarding the Springfield orgy reported that they faced threats and retaliation, preemptively and after reporting the scandalous events attributed to Lucas and Harman. Stephen Brady, among those who brought forward the allegations, related that when he first met with Lucas, he was told by the bishop, "You and your family will not be welcome in any parish in the Diocese of Springfield until you dissolve *The Roman Catholic Faithful* [the group which had exposed the allegations]." Lucas was also quoted as saying, "It would be too bad if Mr. Brady were hit by a drunk driver and killed." The threats faced by these informants are consistent with a pattern of reprisal by accused Church officials against whistleblowers in order to prevent the exposure of credible revelations that would endanger their careers.

What happened next is a textbook example of how Vatican and U.S. Church leaders cover-up sexual misconduct often involving homosexual predation or behavior. Instead of the Vatican calling for an impartial lay investigation of Lucas and those alleged to have taken part in the orgy, it was Lucas himself who hired an attorney, Bill Roberts, to look into "allegations of misconduct by priests of the diocese." The Lucas-appointed attorney shielded Lucas' name and the name of his reported homosexual lover, Father Harman, from inclusion in this sentence because the real motive of the so-called "investigation" was

specifically to clear Lucas and those surrounding him of accusations that he, along with priests from his diocese, engaged in “homosexual activities.” Even though the suspect “investigation” was sparked by allegations involving gay sex on the part of Lucas, Roberts and the Special Panel devoted their time to addressing the homosexual activities of the previous bishop, Daniel Ryan, and a few diocesan priests. When it came to the allegations against Lucas, the Lucas-commissioned Panel disregarded vital evidence and witnesses proving the credibility of the allegations. Neither the eyewitness to the orgy nor the investigator who reported the orgy to the Nuncio were either deposed or interviewed by the Panel. Insofar as Lucas himself was reported to the Vatican for engaging in “homosexual activities,” this internal “investigation” headed by Lucas’ defense attorney, Roberts, was no different than had former President Bill Clinton himself appointed a lawyer to investigate claims that he was having sex with a White House intern. After reviewing both evidence and Lucas’ highly-suspect Special Panel, former FBI Special Agent in Charge, Kenneth McCabe, found the allegations against Lucas and Harman to be “entirely credible,” affirming, “I find no reason to doubt the credibility of the information provided by the eyewitness regarding the orgy.”

Lucas’ strategy resembles how the Vatican dealt with reports from mother superiors that African bishops wanted them to make their sisters available to priests for sex in an effort to reduce the clerical death rate from AIDS. Instead of investigating the claims it received, the Vatican forwarded the complaints to the offending bishops who retaliated by having the mother superiors removed for making these reports. When one nun was impregnated by a priest, he forced her to have an abortion which resulted in her death. It was the priest who got her pregnant who then conducted her funeral Mass.¹⁷⁹

The investigation of Lucas literally by Lucas himself is similar to a “secret investigation” former St. Paul and Minneapolis Archbishop John Nienstedt authorized of himself when he faced allegations of sexual misconduct. In January 2014, Nienstedt charged his subordinates with investigating these allegations that had been made against him. With the help of a Minneapolis law firm, Auxiliary Bishops Andrew H. Cozzens and Lee Pinche discovered that they “did not have enough objectivity or experience with such investigations.” Revealing some of the very same pitfalls of the Lucas-assembled Panel, Cozzens and Pinche admitted that “there was no meaningful structure to address allegations against bishops,” nor did they “have authority to act,” leading them to conclude that the investigation “was doomed to fail.” When there were internal disagreements about how to complete the investigation, Bishop Piche thought it best to hire a second firm to complete the review because Nienstedt contended the first firm had been unfair to him. Father Daniel Griffith, the Director of the Archdiocesan Safe Environment Program who disagreed with that decision, counseled Nienstedt “to resign for the good of the archdiocese.” Recognizing the intrinsic conflict of interest of having subordinates investigate one’s superior in the chain of command, Bishop Cozzens concluded that the Catholic Church “desperately needs an independent structure, led by experienced lay personnel, to investigate and review allegations made against bishops, archbishops and cardinals.” Cozzens’ message would be echoed by Michigan Attorney General, Dana Nessel, who warned Catholics in 2019 not to trust Church officials to self-police the abuse scandal. Nessel commented, “If an investigator knocks on your door, ask to see their badge, not their rosary.”¹⁸⁰

Albany Bishop Edward Scharfenberger reached the same conclusion when, during the “summer of shame 2018,” Cardinal Donald Wuerl suggested that the U.S. bishops might

create a commission of bishops to investigate rumors of sexual misconduct by other bishops, passing concerns on to a Vatican office. In saying, “We have reached a point where bishops alone investigating bishops is not the answer,” Scharfenberger argued that laypeople, not bishops, should lead inquiries into allegations of misconduct by U.S. bishops. Scharfenberger’s assessment was well-informed, owing to the fact that while 78 Catholic bishops worldwide have been accused publicly of sexual crimes against children, and more than 35 bishops worldwide have been accused publicly of sexual wrongdoing against adults, few have been severely disciplined. Many have been allowed to retain the title of bishop, and only 7 have been laicized to date, including ex-Cardinal Theodore McCarrick.¹⁸¹

The majority of U.S. bishops agreed with Scharfenberger and were prepared to vote for the creation of just such a lay led investigatory body during their November 2018 USCCB meeting until Pope Francis intervened and asked them to delay their vote pending the convocation of a Vatican Summit scheduled for February of 2019. Interestingly, it was at the November 2018 meeting that Rev. Dr. Paul Sullins distributed his Clergy Sex Abuse Report.¹⁸² Sullins’ report differed from the John Jay College of Criminal Justice report, whose conclusions were not arrived at based on collecting or examining any direct data and were based on clinical estimates and flawed data provided by U.S. bishops who significantly underreported the number of abuse cases in their dioceses. Sullins concluded that the increase or decrease in the percent of male victims was correlated, almost perfectly, with the increase or decrease of homosexual men in the priesthood. Pro-LGBTQ+ prelates like Chicago Cardinal Blase Cupich, Newark Cardinal Joseph Tobin, and San Diego Bishop Robert McElroy did not act upon Sullins’ findings any more than the U.S. bishops and the Vatican that buried Dominican Father Thomas Doyle’s co-authored 1985 report, “The Problem of Sexual Molestation by Roman Catholic Clergy.”¹⁸³ Obviously, when Cardinal Cupich was chosen to play a leading role in the February 2019 Summit, it came as no surprise that Sullins’ conclusions were ignored; the homosexual predation of mainly teenage boys was never addressed; and the participants were told the sex abuse crisis was the result of “clericalism.” Three months later, in May of 2019, Pope Francis promulgated a *motu proprio*, *Vos estis lux mundi*, which precluded lay led investigations and established procedural norms for “bishops investigating other bishops.”

Even before the official promulgation of *Vos estis lux mundi*, the ineffectiveness of one bishop investigating another bishop was demonstrated when Baltimore Archbishop William Lori was sent by the Vatican to investigate Wheeling-Charleston Bishop Michael Bransfield who was accused of sexually abusing seminarians and priests, as well as excessive and improper use of Church funds. For years the Vatican received numerous complaints about Bransfield’s financial and sexual problems and failed to act. When Lori was finally appointed to investigate these allegations which he and other prelates already knew to be true, Lori deceptively removed his name from the list of those who received some \$350,000 in cash gifts from Bransfield. It was only when *The Washington Post* discovered that Lori’s name was missing that Lori admitted to having redacted his name and returned to the diocese the \$7,500 Bransfield had given him over the years. When Lori served as interim administrator of the diocese prior to the appointment and installation of Bishop Mark Brennan, he released a list of the names of West Virginia Catholic clergy who have been “credibly accused” of sexual abuse of minors. Bransfield was not on that list, despite having been accused of abusing a minor in 2012. Lori’s omission of Bransfield’s name caused Judy Jones, the Midwest regional leader for SNAP (Survivors Network of those Abused by Priests) to wonder what other claims the diocese deemed not to be ‘credible.’”

Jones called for an independent investigation by law enforcement professionals stating that “we have seen church officials deem accusations not credible only to be proven horribly wrong later.”¹⁸⁴

In an effort to discourage legislators from passing laws extending the statute of limitations in sex abuse cases, bishops such as Cardinal Dolan have attempted to pass off Church-sponsored “reconciliation and compensation programs” as a way to remedy the clerical abuse problem. Recent laws, such as the New York Child Victims Act, have forced allegations against accused bishops and priests that were whitewashed by dioceses to be revisited in civil courts, where diocesan-appointed officials cannot prejudice the outcome. Review by the Courts has the potential not only to underscore the credibility of these allegations, but also the dubious methods employed in Church-sponsored investigations. Such appears to be the case with Dolan’s handling of allegations against his former Director of Priest Personnel, Father Thomas Devery, after an individual contacted the New York Archdiocese around 2016 alleging that Devery had sexually abused him as a minor. Devery was permitted to remain the Pastor of one of the Archdiocese’s largest elementary schools, and parishioners had even been requested to recommend him for a six-year reappointment as pastor. The families, parishioners, and school parents of Devery’s assignment were never informed of the allegations until some five years later as a result of a March 2021 media statement released by SNAP. A secret Archdiocesan-sponsored investigation, which failed to invite additional potential victims to come forward, predictably claimed that the allegation was “unsubstantiated.” While the New York Archdiocese may have hoped that this dubious conclusion would prevent the alleged victim from considering filing suit, the individual advanced the accusations against Devery to the New York State Supreme Court in 2019. The Archdiocese’s conclusion was further undermined after a second victim brought forward allegations in July of 2021 in a separate lawsuit alleging abuse by Devery. The second lawsuit resulted in Devery stepping down from ministry.

The mishandling of the allegations against Devery by Dolan is similar to the way the Vatican and other bishops have consistently abuse allegations: deny the allegations; defame the alleged victims and their attorneys as being financially motivated; pay lawyers and “subjective and biased” investigators to conduct “investigations” with pre-determined results; and have the Vatican find the allegations to be “unsubstantiated” with the hope and goal that the civil court will be influenced to render a similar verdict.

The way Dolan handled accusations against Devery, and the way bishops like Nienstedt and Lucas handled accusations against themselves, resembles how Knoxville Bishop Richard Stika is reported to have handled several allegations that one of his seminarians sexually harassed other seminarians in approximately 2019. When the accused seminarian was dismissed from his seminary in 2021, Stika, described as being “very fond” of him, took him into his shared episcopal residence with Cardinal Justin Rigali and gave him an office in Knoxville’s chancery. When the diocesan review board appointed George Prosser, a retired law enforcement investigator, to review the homosexual misconduct allegations against the seminarian, Stika was said to have dismissed the investigator after he was “asking too many questions.” Stika then replaced Prosser with a member of the review board, Chris Manning, who admitted to only interviewing the accused seminarian while making no efforts to contact the alleged victims. Stika’s handling of the allegations against his former seminarian led one reporter to question, “Quis custodiet ipsos custodes? [Who shall watch over the watchers?]”¹⁸⁵

In certain cases, bishops cover up for alleged predators not only by shielding them from inclusion on lists of the accused, but also by keeping them in parishes without ever informing parishioners that accusations were brought against them. Archdiocese of New York priest, Father Donald Timone, faced substantiated allegations that he had sexually abused teenage boys, one of whom committed suicide after years of suffering from the traumatic experience. Despite the accusations resulting in settlement payouts, Cardinal Dolan permitted Timone to continue to serve in New York parishes, and New York's Director of Priest Personnel, accused-Monsignor Edward Weber, even signed a 2018 letter of suitability vouching for Timone as "a priest in good standing" who "had never been accused of any act of sexual abuse or sexual misconduct involving a minor." It was only after *The New York Times* December 2018 exposé informing New Yorkers about Timone's past, and after Boston Cardinal Seán O'Malley reported Dolan to the Apostolic Nunciature for covering up for Timone, that Dolan was forced to remove Timone from ministry.¹⁸⁶

One of the clearest examples of how Church investigations usually result in the publication of whitewashed reports involves the November 2020 McCarrick report entitled "Report on the Holy See's Institutional Knowledge and Decision-Making Related to Former Cardinal Edgar McCarrick (1930 to 2017),"¹⁸⁷ that Pope Francis ordered be undertaken in October of 2018. That report was compiled in much the same way that the "Special Panel on Clergy Misconduct" report was completed in August of 2006 in the Diocese of Springfield in Illinois. The McCarrick report was undertaken in response to Archbishop Carlo Maria Viganò's August 22, 2018 "Testimony" in which he alleged that U.S. and Vatican Church officials, including Pope Francis, mishandled the claims against McCarrick. Similarly, what prompted the convening of an internal Special Panel in Springfield was a January 6, 2005 letter sent to the Apostolic Nuncio accusing Bishop George Lucas and clergy of his diocese of engaging in "homosexual activities." Both investigations were led by defense lawyers (i.e., Jeffrey Lena and Bill Roberts) who were retained by the very prelates who were accused of wrongdoing (i.e., Pope Francis and then-Bishop Lucas).

Defendants like Francis and Lucas who appoint their own lawyers to spearhead "investigations" can be assured of not being found guilty of the charges against them as their attorneys could be disbarred were they to reveal evidence proving the guilt of their clients. The conflict of interest that exists in employing certain defense attorneys was the reason Archbishop Lori was criticized for appointing Attorney Gregg Berstein to a panel called to investigate sexual misconduct by former Bishop Bransfield after Bernstein represented a former Catholic priest who admitted a decade earlier to sexually abusing six Baltimore-area children.

In comparing the flawed methodology of the McCarrick investigation with the Springfield Special Panel, one cannot help but note how neither Archbishop Viganò nor Stephen Brady who brought forward the allegations against Francis and Lucas respectively were deposed or called upon to offer testimony under oath. Also, people who had first hand knowledge of the guilt of the accused (i.e., Bishop Robert McElroy who was in receipt of credible evidence against McCarrick that Richard Sipe had him served to be given to Pope Francis; and Thomas Muñoz, among other witnesses, who alleged that he witnessed Father Harman sodomizing Bishop Lucas) were never deposed or called to testify to what they knew. While the McCarrick report shifted the focus from Francis to St. John Paul II, the Special Panel report shifted the focus from Lucas to his predecessor,

Bishop Daniel Ryan. Both internal reports manufactured by defense attorneys unsurprisingly “cleared” the accused parties (i.e., Francis and Lucas) while those who had scrutinized the evidence and the testimony of witnesses firmly believe that: 1) Viganò truly did warn Francis about McCarrick saying that he “corrupted generations of seminarians and priests” just like then-Archbishop O’Brien was warned about Lee but chose to ignore the predation allegations; and 2) Lucas truly did engage in homosexual relations with Harman as described very graphically by Thomas Muñoz whose testimony was found credible by a retired Special Agent in Charge of the Federal Bureau of Investigation.

While bishops mislead people to believe that the Church has significantly decreased clerical sex abuse and cover-up since the implementation of the 2002 Dallas Charter spearheaded by accused ex-Cardinal McCarrick, empirical data suggests a different reality. Misleading questionable reports which tout a decline in the number of abusive priests heavily rely upon Church leaders who in many cases grossly underreport the true number of credibly accused priests. In December of 2018, the Illinois State Attorney General found that that Cardinal Cupich and the other Illinois bishops failed to disclose sexual abuse allegations against 500 clergy and neglected to investigate many of those cases. One year later, the *Associated Press* identified “more than 900 clergy members accused of child sexual abuse who were missing from lists released by the dioceses and religious orders where they served.”¹⁸⁸ Flawed reports downplaying post-Dallas Charter abuse also fail to account for how many victims reported priests to dioceses, only to learn that diocesan review boards such as the one overseen in St. Louis by then-Auxiliary Bishop Timothy Dolan never retained the accusations reported in diocesan files. Dioceses have routinely conducted internal or Church-sponsored investigations as a strategy for disingenuously “clearing” accused priests in order to prevent victims from bringing forward costly civil suits. Similarly unaccounted for are the number of accusations against predatory priests which were known to and never acknowledged by prelates like Cardinals Bernardin, Dolan, George, Gregory, O’Brien, Rodriguez, Stella, and Wuerl or (arch)bishops like Aquila, Auza, Boyea, Burnette, Callahan, Checchio, Deeley, Gaydos, Gomez, Gruss, Hanefeldt, Hoepfner, Jugis, Lori, Lopes, Lucas, Malone, Matano, Monforton, Mueggenborg, Mulvey, O’Hara, Paprocki, Parker, Pierre, Provost, Raica, Sartain, Shlesinger, Vann, Waltersheid, Whalen, and Wong. While evidence demonstrates knowledge of such allegations by these and other prelates, these allegations would naturally not be included in the tally of post-Dallas Charter abuse cases.

The closure of most high school seminaries led Church leaders to make up for this loss of vocations by recruiting and ordaining closeted homosexuals in their 20s, 30s, and 40s. With college seminaries replacing the role high school seminaries once served, more and more cases have been reported in recent years involving male abuse victims between the ages of 18 and 27, individuals who often find their reports unjustly dismissed insofar as Canon Law does not classify these victims as “minors.” While the Dallas Charter addresses protections for minors, it fails to protect seminarians and other adults who have increasingly become targets of predatory bishops, seminary officials, or other priests.

Advocates find claims of a decrease in abuse after 2002 to be both premature and false. It is not possible to know the full extent of sexual abuse until victims have worked through repressed memories, a painful process which can take decades. If the number of reported abuse victims is low just before and after the implementation of the Dallas Charter in 2002, it is not so much that abuse dropped during that period, but rather because the

victims have yet to report their abuse. According to 2014 findings by the National Children's Advocacy Center, abuse disclosure rates may be as low as 16 percent and fewer than 25 percent of victims immediately disclose abuse following the incident. These statistics are echoed by Gisela Priebe and Carl G. Svedin who observed that typically between only 6 and 15 percent of disclosures are made to legal authorities.

Both Catholic and secular media sources often fail to investigate and verify reports issued by Church leaders and their communication departments. For example, when the Springfield in Illinois Special Panel reported in 2006 that the witness who alleged that Bishop Lucas and Father Harman engaged in anal sex failed to pass a polygraph exam, not one media outlet pointed out that defense attorney Bill Roberts, whom Lucas retained to head the Special Panel, hired an investigator, William O'Sullivan, who had the polygrapher ask the witness if he had sex with the bishop instead of asking, "Did you witness Bishop Lucas having sex with Father Harman?" It would be akin to asking a female White House witness, "Did you have sex with President Clinton" instead of, "Did you witness President Clinton having sex with White House intern, Monica Lewinsky?" In light of attempts of obfuscation like this on the part of Church officials and their high paid lawyers and so-called "investigators," it should not come as a surprise to an experienced investigator that the Special Panel never included one word about William O'Sullivan and his involvement in its final report despite the fact that the employment and mention of investigatory agencies are often well publicized in an effort to lend credibility to the findings of such reports.

Just as some Church leaders quote the grossly inaccurate 4 percent clerical sex abuse figure published in the 2004 John Jay report grounded in episcopal underreporting, so too do these same officials mislead the public with charts suggesting that clerical sex abuse significantly dropped following the implementation of the Dallas Charter in 2002. When researcher Paul Sullins looked at the database of Survivor Accounts of Catholic Clergy Abuse, Denial and Silence (SACCADAS)¹⁸⁹ which charted the number of reported alleged clerical sex abuse victims between 1950 and 2017, he was misled to believe that if abuse rose in the past in direct proportion to the number of gays in the priesthood, so then a decrease in abuse must point to a decline in the number of homosexual Catholic clergy. This conclusion, published by Sullins in "Receding Waves: Child Sex Abuse and Homosexual Priests since 2000,"¹⁹⁰ led Mark Regnerus to echo Sullins belief in an article he published in *Public Discourse* entitled "Declining Homosexuality in the American Priesthood."¹⁹¹

If one's premise is flawed, then one can expect one's conclusions likewise to be flawed. The flawed premise on the part of Sullins and Regnerus is that clerical abuse has declined. If one looks carefully at the SACCDAS chart, one sees that there was less *reported* abuse beginning after 1980, around 20 years *before* the implementation of the Dallas Charter. Reported abuse is quite different from actual abuse. Because most clerical abuse victims wait forty to fifty years before reporting the abuse they suffered during their teenage years, it is impossible today to report the amount of clerical abuse that truly occurred between 1980 and the present. If one were to have done a study of abuse in 1980, the amount of abuse *reported* then would have been significantly lower than what appears in reports today, some 40 years after the fact. Insofar as one cannot accurately say how many clerical abuse victims there were between 1980 and the present, one cannot also argue that the number of homosexual Catholic clergy has decreased owing to a corresponding decline in the number of sexual abuse cases.

THE THOMAS DOYLE-ANTHONY GORGIA CONNECTION

In order to understand why Cardinal Timothy Dolan endorsed absurd reasons concocted by the North American College (NAC) rector, Father Peter Harman, in an effort to prevent Anthony Gorgia's return to the NAC following urgent surgery, one must look at how Church leaders have reprised against priests and seminarians over the years who have exposed homosexual predation and misconduct on the part of cardinals, archbishops, bishops, priests, and seminarians.

In 1985, while employed by the Apostolic Nunciature in Washington, D.C., Dominican Father Thomas Doyle co-authored a report entitled, "The Problem of Sexual Molestation by Roman Catholic Clergy: Meeting the Problem in a Comprehensive and Responsible Manner."¹⁹² The authors of the report not only exposed a serious abuse problem within the Church, but they also offered concrete steps Church leaders needed to take to resolve the problem. The confidential report given to every U.S. Ordinary and hand-carried by Philadelphia Cardinal John Krol to the Vatican was covered up and the recommendations were never acted upon. While the authors warned that U.S. dioceses and religious orders might find themselves paying out \$1 billion in settlements and legal fees if they failed to act, that figure currently stands today at over \$4 billion. Around the same time, Doyle's concerns were echoed by Catholic journalist, Jason Berry, who wrote his first article on clerical sexual abuse for the *National Catholic Reporter* and *The Times of Acadiana* exposing Father Gilbert Gauthe of the Lafayette Diocese who admitted to sexually molesting 37 minors in hundreds of incidents. Berry appeared on a number of national television programs arguing that child sexual abuse had become "the Watergate of the Catholic Church," and no bishop seemed to echo his concerns.¹⁹³

Just as U.S. bishops and the Vatican never acted on Doyle's 1985 co-authored report, so too does the historical record show that only three U.S. Ordinaries called for a thorough investigation into the allegations of predatory behavior, homosexual misconduct, and cover-up naming Cardinal Dolan and NAC officials. Every U.S. Ordinary, the Apostolic Nuncio, and the NAC Board of Governors, received multiple investigatory communications reprinted in this report and which were also posted online on April 22, 2020, May 8, 2020, May 31, 2020, June 18, 2020, June 27, 2020, July 3, 2020, July 16, 2020, and July 25, 2021. The record also shows that communications documenting the allegations against Dolan at the NAC, as well as the reprisal suffered by Anthony Gorgia, were all sent to his local Knights of Columbus Stolzenthaler Council #1675 in Staten Island, New York, and to the Knights' National leadership in New Haven, Connecticut on July 20, 2020, September 23, 2020, and March 27, 2021. This correspondence is also included within this report.

Father Doyle's "reward" for his hard work that could have saved tens of thousands of victims from clerical sexual abuse was to be shown the door of the Vatican Embassy, just as the door to Gorgia's room at the NAC was closed to him after he was receiving word from fellow seminarians about misconduct on the part of the vice-rector, Washington priest, Father Adam Park, which Gorgia himself witnessed.

What has never been reported in the media is that while Doyle refused to cover up the abuse reports that were being sent to the Nunciature, this was not the case for then-Father Blase Cupich, who worked at the Nunciature from 1982 to 1987, and for then-Father Timothy Dolan, who followed Cupich and served there from 1987 to 1992. Both Cupich

and Dolan were rewarded handsomely for not exposing the Church's abuse problem that remained fairly secret until the Spotlight Team of *The Boston Globe* began publishing a series of explosive articles in January of 2002.

Having been barred from the Embassy like Gorgia was barred from the NAC, Doyle found himself called upon as an expert witness to testify in hundreds of abuse court cases. When bishops found that his testimony was costing them hundreds of millions of dollars, they put pressure on his military Ecclesiastical Endorser, then-Archbishop Edwin O'Brien, to force him to leave the priesthood. Six months before Doyle was scheduled to complete 20 years of active duty service as an Air Force Chaplain, O'Brien revoked his endorsement based on specious claims about a Canon Law memo Doyle wrote about daily mass and the reservation of the Blessed Sacrament on military facilities. O'Brien's attempt to have Doyle declared an apostate failed when Doyle's Dominican Prior had no problem with an Orthodox bishop saving his retirement by endorsing Doyle for his last six months of military service. Even though the Dominicans refused to remove Doyle's faculties owing to pressure from Catholic bishops who were angered by Doyle's testimony at abuse trials, he was not allowed to celebrate the sacraments when he returned home to the D.C. area owing to a denial of faculties by then-Washington Cardinal Theodore McCarrick. How ironic that one of the Church's most respected abuse victims' advocates was told that he could not celebrate Mass and preach by one of the Church's most notorious abusers of minors, priests, and seminarians.

What Father Doyle did in addressing and exposing the abuse of minors in the Catholic Church is similar to what former seminarian, Anthony Gorgia, is doing today in exposing homosexual predation and behavior not only at the NAC, but also in many seminaries in the United States and around the world. Just as Church leaders have defamed and vilified Doyle after his testimony for victims cost dioceses and religious orders hundreds of millions of dollars in lawsuits, so too have over thirty U.S. and Vatican bishops been identified by investigators for having covered up homosexual predation and behavior at the NAC in Rome and at other seminaries.

In recognition of his advocacy work for victims of clerical sexual abuse, The Voice of the Faithful honored Doyle with their first Priest of Integrity Award in 2002. David Clohessy, national director of the Survivors Network of those Abused by Priests (SNAP), called Doyle "an absolute hero." Doyle also received the Cavallo Award for Moral Courage (1992) and the Isaac Hecker Award from the Paulist Fathers (2003). In June of 2003 Doyle was also issued an official commendation from the Dominican Fathers for his "prophetic work in drawing attention to clergy sexual abuse and for advocating the rights of victims and abusers."¹⁹⁴

What recognition Anthony Gorgia might receive from the Knights of Columbus or other Catholic organizations for his efforts to protect current and future seminarians from sexual predation has yet to be seen. While the Knights may not have been aware of Doyle's confidential report that Church leaders covered up, they cannot say they are unaware of the past and present predation of seminarians documented in this report. Both Knights and U.S. bishops today are in a position to prevent future seminarians from suffering abuse or reprisals like those suffered by seminarians who look forward to being deposed and testifying under oath in Court.

LAWSUIT OF ANTHONY J. GORGIA V. TIMOTHY DOLAN ET AL.: SPOTLIGHT II OF THE SEMINARY CRISIS

Amid scores of sexual misconduct allegations unfolding across seminaries, the Pontifical North American College (NAC) in Rome and the Archdiocese of New York stand at the epicenter of the Church's ongoing crisis of seminary predation and cover-up. Filed in New York State Supreme Court in February 2021, an extensively-documented legal Complaint by former NAC seminarian Anthony Gorgia (Appendix A) names New York Cardinal Timothy Dolan; the NAC rector, Father Peter Harman; and the vice-rector, Father Adam Park as defendants in allegations of sexual harassment, misconduct, cover-up, and retaliation against seminarians perceived as a threat to outing the furtive predatory behavior and homosexual misconduct of leading seminary and Church officials.

Regarded by experts as one of the largest present-day seminary predation scandals, the lawsuit of *Gorgia v. Dolan et al.* gives voice to disturbing trends that have led to the hemorrhage of countless priestly vocations:

1. Posts of seminary rectors, vice-rectors, faculty members, and vocations directors have increasingly been filled by sexually-active homosexual priests, who in many cases attribute their rise to a web of scandal-ridden bishops;

2. Bishops and seminary officials wield total power over seminarians' ability to attain ordination, a power which can be exploited to force subordinates to submit to superiors' predatory acts or to keep silent about the misconduct they may witness;

3. Accused predators are often shielded by high-powered Church officials who employ a pattern of cover-up tactics at the expense of seminarians, lest these officials' own scandalous practices be revealed; and

4. Many dedicated seminarians have made tremendous sacrifices to pursue their vocations and gave a lifetime of talents to the Church, only to be driven out of seminaries should they refuse to be complicit with misconduct.

Homosexual Bishops Promote a New Generation of Priests

Father Harman was accepted as a seminarian of the Diocese of Springfield in Illinois by accused sexual predator, Bishop Daniel Ryan, who was notorious for his scandalous sexual activity with underage boys, seminarians, priests, and prostitutes. After graduating from Quincy Notre Dame High School in 1991, Harman was sent by Ryan to study at St. Meinrad College Seminary which was rumored for years to foster an active gay subculture. In 1995, Ryan nominated Harman to study at the NAC, at which time then-Monsignor Timothy Dolan was rector. Harman was approved by Dolan for ordination and was ordained a priest by Bishop Ryan in July of 1999, three months before Ryan's resignation on October 19, 1999. Informants reveal that Harman would later be called Bishop George Lucas' homosexual "lover" after Lucas succeeded Ryan. Harman and Lucas were reported to have engaged in graphic homosexual acts at an orgy alleged to have taken place in the presence of seminarians and priests, including current Orange Bishop and NAC Board of

Governors member Kevin Vann. With Harman's checkered past involving seminarians covered up by Springfield officials, Harman was promoted to succeed accused-Monsignor Jeffrey Burrill as the NAC's Director of Pastoral Formation and Director of Media Relations before being installed by Archbishop John Myers as rector in 2016.

Father Adam Park began his studies as a seminarian for the Archdiocese of Washington at St. Pius X Seminary in Scranton, Pennsylvania. Park resided at St. Pius X with Father Albert Liberatore, who was alleged in a lawsuit to have used his seminary room to sexually abuse a male victim. Ex-Cardinal Theodore McCarrick nominated Park for seminary studies at the NAC in 2001. Despite Park's reputation for open homosexual behavior and for making unwanted advances during his seminary years, McCarrick ordained Park to the priesthood in 2005. Park would later serve as priest-secretary to Cardinal Donald Wuerl from 2008-2012 before serving as Chaplain at George Washington University. Under Wuerl, Harman recruited Park for the position of vice-rector at the NAC in 2017. Facing multiple accusations of homosexual predation in Court, Park abruptly left his post as vice-rector in July 2021.¹⁹⁵ Park became the second highly-placed cleric within days of Monsignor Burrill's outing to relinquish his position in a cloud of homosexual misconduct allegations.

The Case of Anthony Gorgia

From the age of six, Gorgia felt a calling to the priesthood. Dedicating a lifetime of talents to serving his Church and his community, Gorgia also excelled as his high school's Valedictorian and later graduated at the top of his University class with *summa cum laude* distinction. While Gorgia was offered full scholarships and annual stipends by prestigious colleges, he declined them in order to pursue his vocation by studying at a Catholic University. Gorgia knew that he had the potential to become a doctor or a lawyer, but he chose to study for the priesthood so that he could serve the people of God.

Gorgia became a seminarian of the Archdiocese of New York in 2015, and he began studies at Cathedral Seminary House of Formation in Douglaston, New York. Gorgia was well-respected by both the faculty and his peers, and he graduated with a Master of Arts in Catholic Philosophical Studies degree at the top of his seminary class with distinction. Owing to Gorgia's outstanding performance and superlative evaluations, Cardinal Dolan nominated him to continue his studies at the NAC in 2017. At the NAC, Gorgia remained at the top of his class and consistently earned excellent evaluations from the faculty. The Knights of Columbus of Stolzenhaller Council in Staten Island, New York, of which Gorgia was a third-degree Knight, had proudly endorsed his vocation and even displayed a framed picture in their Council hall of Gorgia greeting Pope Francis when he was chosen to serve the Pope's Christmas Eve Mass in 2017. At the close of Gorgia's first year at the NAC, the faculty unanimously promoted him to his second year and appointed him to serve as the seminary's representative to the Pontifical Gregorian University.

Beginning near the start of his second year in Rome, Gorgia was receiving word from other seminarians about Park's proclivities for initiating inappropriate, uninvited physical contact with seminarians under his authority, behavior which Gorgia himself had witnessed. In time, Gorgia would come to learn of the extent and severity of Park's predatory behavior, as well as the extremes NAC officials took to cover it up, as accounts poured in from seminarians and others who were subjects of Park's sexual harassment and misconduct. Gorgia would also come to learn of evidence supporting allegations that

Harman had been covering for Park and was plagued by graphic sexual misconduct allegations found “entirely credible” by a former FBI Special Agent in Charge.

Around the same time seminarians began to approach Gorgia with accounts of Park’s misconduct, seminary rectors in Buffalo and Boston, and Wheeling-Charleston Bishop Michael Bransfield, were being removed from their posts as a result of seminarians holding them accountable for engaging in or covering up alleged homosexual misconduct. In light of these events, the lawsuit alleges, Harman and Park feared that Gorgia had already been in possession of all the incriminating evidence against them and perceived him as a threat to having their homosexual lifestyles revealed. According to the lawsuit, Harman and Park were aware that such revelations could “harm their chances of advancement in the Church; lead to their dismissal like seminary officials in Buffalo, Boston, and elsewhere ... and possibly result in their laicization.” Fitting a larger pattern of seminary officials who reprise against potential whistleblowers in an effort to prevent adverse disclosures from being brought against them, Harman and Park devised a plan to drive Gorgia out of the NAC, thereby attempting to shield themselves from exposure at the expense of Gorgia’s vocation.

In October of 2018, Gorgia was informed by physicians that he needed to return to New York for an urgent operation. Following all the directives provided him by his formation advisor, Birmingham priest Father John McDonald, Gorgia obtained permission from Dolan and from the NAC to return to New York for the surgery and for a brief period of recovery.

While in New York, Gorgia received a congratulatory letter from Dolan dated November 21, 2018, in which Dolan praised Gorgia’s strong performance in his preparation for the priesthood. Just three weeks later, however, Dolan sent Gorgia a letter of an entirely different tenor, stating that Harman suddenly objected to Gorgia’s return to the NAC based upon entirely fabricated and absurd claims against his permission documentation and human formation. As these reasons were entirely false and easily disprovable, Gorgia requested on five occasions to meet with Dolan and to present him with evidence proving the facts of the matter. Although Dolan received written statements from a seminary psychologist and a trusted priest debunking Harman’s concocted excuses, Dolan refused all of Gorgia’s requests to meet with him, clearly out of fear that Gorgia would present him with evidence of Park’s misconduct that Dolan would have been obliged to act upon.

The lawsuit cites several of multiple motives that impelled Dolan’s own participation in a plan to cover-up homosexual misconduct or predatory behavior by Harman and Park at the cost of Gorgia’s vocation. As Dolan himself was a former NAC rector, he was well-aware of the recurrence of sexual misconduct at the NAC. In the wake of Dolan’s installation as rector, National Catholic AIDS Network member, Dr. Joseph Barone, concluded after ten years of research that 1 in 12 NAC seminarians tested HIV-positive,¹⁹⁶ mainly due to male-to-male transmission. It was also around this time that a NAC faculty member was dismissed after seminary officials feared his predation of seminarians would be exposed. Dolan also has long-standing ties to Harman’s alleged homosexual lover, Archbishop Lucas, dating back to a close friendship they had when they studied and lived together in high school and college seminaries in St. Louis for seven years. An investigation also revealed that the steps Dolan took to sabotage Gorgia’s vocation and to cover up sexual predation at the NAC fit a pattern of tactics he employed to cover up scores of sexual abuse allegations during his tenure in St. Louis, Washington, D.C, Milwaukee, and New York. The pattern unequivocally shows Dolan retaining or promoting priests accused of

sexual misconduct while defaming, gaslighting, or ignoring whistleblowers who objected to such misconduct.

Witnesses, Affidavits Confirm the Allegations in the Lawsuit

The lawsuit of *Gorgia v. Dolan et al.* furnishes independent accounts and affidavits from multiple witnesses who confirm the allegations against the defendants. While this report presently supplies June 2021 affidavits of a former FBI Special Agent in Charge; an experienced seminary formator; and a subject of Park's sexual misconduct, this report will continue to be updated with new witness statements and affidavits as they are filed in Court.

Affidavit of former FBI Special Agent in Charge Kenneth T. McCabe (Appendix B)

Kenneth McCabe is a former Special Agent in Charge (SAC) of the Pittsburgh division and director of eleven satellite offices who retired after twenty-one years of service in the Federal Bureau of Investigation (FBI). McCabe's work involved assignments on a Special White House Working Group, consulting with international governments, leading high-profile investigations, and evaluating intelligence, information, and evidence obtained from investigations. McCabe is presently a licensed Certified Fraud Examiner and owner of a consulting and investigation firm.

In his affidavit dated June 20, 2021, McCabe stated that after following Gorgia's case for more than one year and carefully reviewing evidence, he found the allegations against the defendants to be entirely credible and supported by documentary evidence.

McCabe stated that when he conducts an investigation, he considers what he called "three critical indicators of suspicion": *capability, opportunity, and motive*. According to McCabe, he found strong evidence of each on the part of the defendants in the case of *Gorgia v. Dolan et al.*

McCabe indicated that the capability of defendants such as Dolan, Harman, Park, and McDonald to victimize or retaliate against seminarians under their authority is made possible by their positions of power over vulnerable subjects. According to McCabe, Church officials such as the defendants "induce a subordinate...into a relationship of submission, trust, and complete reliance upon them," a reliance which can be "easily exploited." McCabe also found that the capability of seminary officials such as Harman, Park, and McDonald to perpetrate misconduct or cover-up is enhanced by the fact that they are supervised by Ordinaries and members of the NAC Board of Governors who themselves have been accused of grossly covering up misconduct. *Opportunity*, McCabe observed, is evident in how the defendants exploited Gorgia's departure for an urgent operation as a pretext to remove him from the NAC lest he expose the NAC's sexual misconduct crisis. The *motive*, according to McCabe, was particularly clear, insofar as Harman and Park feared suffering the same fate as other U.S. seminary rectors who were being removed around the same time amid homosexual misconduct allegations submerging their seminaries. Dolan cooperated with Harman and Park out of personal interests, owing to his strong ties to the NAC, Harman, and Harman's alleged homosexual lover, Archbishop Lucas.

In his affidavit, McCabe also addresses how *precedent* likewise confirms the allegations against the defendants, stating,

In this case, I have been able to locate not only credible accounts from multiple, independent witnesses in which a number of the defendants were reported to have used their dominance to exploit vulnerable persons, but also of defendants enlisting the help of those with even greater power to cover up their actions.

McCabe's finding validates not only other cases where overwhelming numbers of bishops and seminary officials used their positions to cover up sexual predation in seminaries, but also complaints from other NAC seminarians who alleged experiencing episodes of misconduct by Park or were forced into leaving the NAC after reporting or witnessing Park's behavior.

The affidavit concludes with an analysis of allegations that Archbishop Lucas and Father Harman engaged in graphic sexual acts at an orgy in the presence of seminarians and other Springfield clerics. After thorough analysis, McCabe affirmed that he found these allegations "entirely credible." McCabe relayed that among the details he reviewed are "the reported setting of the orgy; the alleged dimensions and specific descriptions of Harman's and other participants' intimate body parts; and the graphic sexual acts attributed to Harman and Lucas, among others." The affidavit relays that these allegations are supported by other, separate misconduct allegations against Lucas and a number of other participants at the orgy, a fact which McCabe finds to be a credit to the eyewitness.

McCabe also stated that among the evidence he reviewed regarding the alleged orgy were letters to the U.S. Apostolic Nuncio, Archbishop Montalvo-Higuera, and to Harman himself. McCabe reported that "Harman's response, signed in his own hand, reveals a number of suspicious characteristics." These characteristics, according to McCabe, include "the absence of a denial which is aided by carefully chosen words" and "Harman's recommendation that his conduct be reported to Lucas, an obvious apparent conflict of interest owing to Lucas' own compromised position in the allegations."

McCabe maintains that both the Vatican and Springfield officials have failed to address these allegations with any authentic and independent investigation, an omission which has allowed Harman to be in a position of power as rector over seminarians.

Affidavit of a Subject of Park's Sexual Misconduct (Appendix C)

One subject of Park's misconduct who submitted a June 2021 affidavit was ordained a priest of the Diocese of Charleston, South Carolina, having attended the NAC from 2003 to 2007. During this time, defendants Adam Park and John McDonald both attended the NAC as seminarians.

The subject affirmed that while at the NAC, he witnessed various episodes of Park's uninvited physical behavior toward seminarians. These included incidents where Park would "caress and rub their shoulders and upper back" and "put his hand on the small of their backs [near the buttocks]." The subject went on to cite a friendship between Park and McDonald while they were both seminarians, and he described McDonald as "one of the biggest purveyors of gossip in the seminary," particularly surrounding "insinuations of the sexual lives of priest faculty members and seminarians."

The affidavit describes an incident in Dupont Circle in which Park, while priest secretary to Cardinal Wuerl, is alleged to have made nonconsensual sexual advances toward the subject. The subject affirmed, "Park 'felt me up' by rubbing my pectoral muscles while making cooing remarks in my ear. Park's actions had a definite sexual connotation; were unwanted; and unwelcomed."

After learning that additional sexual misconduct allegations emerged against Park, the subject indicated he believed the allegations were credible and was concerned that Park was using his position as the NAC vice-rector to victimize seminarians. The subject affirmed that in July of 2020, he reported his experience of Park's misconduct to Bishop James Checchio, Chairman of the USCCB Committee on Clergy, Consecrated Life and Vocations; as well as to Father Harman, who as the NAC rector would have been obliged to act upon such a report. The subject affirmed that he informed Harman,

Adam's penchant for inappropriate touchy-feeliness becomes a whole new thing entirely when such unwanted physical touch is initiated by an ecclesiastical superior to a man under his jurisdiction.

The subject revealed that Harman avoided responding to the accusations presented and failed to investigate the matter. The affidavit relays, "there was no indication that Harman had taken any dutiful action which, as Rector, he would have been obliged to do ... it became obvious that no investigation had ever occurred and that the NAC had neither been transparent nor wished to hear from me."

The incident of the subject who submitted his affidavit is only one of multiple other accounts that brought forward against Park by separate witnesses. The legal Complaint recounts the experience of another seminarian who revealed that he was "harassed" by Park in the form of repeated uninvited physical contact which caused "extreme discomfort" and "dread." When the seminarian made Park aware that he objected to these advances, Park repeatedly taunted the seminarian until the seminarian left the NAC, within just six months of these disturbing encounters. The seminarian relayed that he felt he "couldn't say anything" to NAC authorities because of their close relationships with one another. This seminarian's experience is among other additional corroborating accounts of homosexual advances made by Park throughout the years. A number of witnesses allege that they were forced into leaving the NAC or found their reports uninvestigated after they witnessed or attempted to report Park's behavior to present or past NAC officials.

Another former NAC seminarian whose vocation was ended after he objected to the ordination of two actively homosexual seminarians from the Diocese of Providence, Rhode Island, remarked that he believed in the claims of the lawsuit and described the NAC by saying, "That place is an absolute festering swamp."

Affidavit of Former Major Seminary Formator Gene Thomas Gomulka (Appendix D)

Gene Thomas Gomulka, a former seminary formator at St. Francis Seminary in Loretto, Pennsylvania, was ordained a priest of the Diocese of Altoona-Johnstown in 1974. Gomulka undertook seminary formation at the NAC in 1971 where he resided with Cardinals Burke, Cupich, DiNardo, Dolan, and Harvey; as well as (Arch)bishops Blair, Boyea, Brennan, Broglio, Cote, Doherty, Hagan, Hoepfner, Olmsted, Mulvey, Nienstedt,

Provost, Scharfenberger, Schnurr, T. Tobin, Vigneron, and Zurek. A retired Chaplain with the rank of Navy Captain (O6), Gomulka served on active-duty for twenty-four years. During this time, he founded the Navy Chaplain Candidate Program in Europe designed to recruit and evaluate seminarians from the NAC and the American College in Louvain, Belgium, for service as military chaplains. Gomulka was recognized in 1989 for his work with vocations and for recruiting 27 percent of the Catholic Chaplains on active duty; 34 percent of those in the Naval Reserve; and 66 percent of the Catholic seminarians in the Chaplain Candidate Program. Gomulka later served as an investigator on the USMC Inspector General (IG) Team, during which time he handled five sex abuse cases involving priests who made up 10 percent of all Catholic chaplains serving with Marines.¹⁹⁷ His investigations also led to the prosecution of both line and Chaplain Corps officers accused of whitewashing reports or covering up abuse or harassment allegations. In 1999, after co-authoring the Marine Corps and Navy Core Values of “Honor, Courage, and Commitment” and being awarded the Alfred Thayer Mahan Award for “literary achievement and inspirational leadership” by the Secretary of the Navy, Gomulka was made a Prelate of Honor with the title of “Monsignor” by Pope St. John Paul II. Before Gomulka’s retirement in 2004, he supervised approximately 150 chaplains from 47 faith groups who were assigned to about 80,000 Marines stationed or deployed over two-thirds of the earth.

Gomulka’s affidavit explores how seminarians are not provided any particular protections under the Catholic Church’s *Code of Canon Law*, and as such, are entirely dependent upon their bishops and seminary superiors for advancement to ordination. With his experience on the USMC IG Team of exposing cover-up tactics, Gomulka observed that a common tactic employed to conceal abuse is *gaslighting*, which he defines as including “attempt[s] to manipulate the complainant into admitting patently false claims against himself in an effort to distract an individual from discovering the transgressors’ real motives.” In this context, Gomulka affirmed that the motive of Harman, Park, McDonald, and Dolan for exploiting easily disprovable claims to remove Gorgia from the NAC was their alarm that he might expose the depth of homosexual activity in some of the defendants’ lives.

As a formator well-versed in the evaluation of seminarians, Gomulka maintained that no seminarian is suddenly discontinued just three months into the academic year after having just received the faculty’s unanimous vote to advance, or on the basis of absurd and disprovable claims about permission documentation or “human formation.” Gomulka observed that the defendants’ reprisals appeared to have begun with the stunning contradiction of what Gorgia had been told *just two days prior* by his formation advisor, that Gorgia had mastered the formational stage required. The types of reasons that *do* justify sudden removal from the seminary, according to Gomulka, would have to be of a very grave nature, none of which applied at all to Gorgia. Gomulka stated,

Claiming that the Plaintiff warranted sudden discontinuance from the NAC for allegedly contacting his Archdiocese before informing his formation advisor of his need for urgent surgery was truly laughable. He asked his formation advisor, McDonald, what to do, and followed his directions explicitly. This would be akin to saying that a secretary who objected to sexual harassment in the workplace was fired because she typed ‘its’ instead of ‘it’s’ in one piece of correspondence.

The types of reasons the NAC Handbook lists as justifying immediate removal include “sexual harassment or misconduct” or “slander, calumny, or detraction,” which in reality

applied to a number of the defendants. For this reason, Gomulka observed, the defendants had to exploit ridiculous and baseless means to prevent Gorgia from revealing sexual misconduct at the NAC which would have warranted their immediate removal from their posts.

Gomulka also described a number of ways in which Dolan abandoned his duties toward Gorgia in favor of participating in a cover-up for Harman, Park, and the NAC. Recognizing that the bishop is primarily responsible for his seminarians' welfare, Gomulka affirmed, "It is in the bishop's power, and in fact his duty, to intervene on behalf of his seminarian if a seminary official breaches his duty of trust." According to Gomulka, Dolan, who was a former NAC rector, would have been aware that Harman's absurd, fabricated excuses to prevent Gorgia's return did not at all justify sudden discontinuance after Gorgia had just been told by his formation advisor that he had mastered the formational stage required. Gomulka added:

By actions so far removed from any normal seminary process, the defendants used their power to demand that the Plaintiff acquiesce to their ulterior motives and that he betray his good name by admitting to false claims against him, all under threat of losing his vocation and the value of all he had given up to pursue the priesthood.

Over 30 U.S. and Vatican Bishops, and Knights of Columbus Leadership, Are Implicated in Cover-Up

Over the course of two years, numerous communications and no less than seven reports were submitted to responsible Church officials informing them of incriminating allegations against Harman and Park. This correspondence, reprinted in this report and dated April 22, May 8, May 31, June 18, June 27, July 3, and July 16 of 2020, was received by:

Cardinal Timothy Dolan of the Archdiocese of New York; Gorgia's Ordinary
Cardinal Wilton Gregory of the Archdiocese of Washington; Park's Ordinary
Bishop Thomas Paprocki of the Diocese of Springfield, Illinois; Harman's Ordinary
Bishop Steven Raica of the Diocese of Birmingham, Alabama; McDonald's Ordinary
Members of the NAC's episcopal Board of Governors
Archbishop Christophe Pierre, the U.S. Apostolic Nuncio
Every U.S Ordinary
United States Conference of Catholic Bishops (USCCB) officials, including
 Archbishop José Horacio Gomez, President
 Bishop James Checchio, Chairman, Committee of Clergy, Consecrated Life and
 Vocations
Vatican officials including
 Cardinal Oscar Rodriguez Maradiaga,
 Cardinal Beniamino Stella, Prefect, Congregation for the Clergy
 Archbishop Jorge Carlos Patrón Wong, Secretary for Seminaries
 Father Tomasz Pocałujko
Archdiocese of New York clerics/officials, including
 Auxiliary Bishop Peter Byrne
 Auxiliary Bishop Gerardo Colacicco
 Auxiliary Bishop John O'Hara

Auxiliary Bishop Edmund Whalen, Vicar for Clergy
Father Christopher Argano, Director of Vocations
Father James Ferreira, former priest-secretary to Cardinal Dolan
Father Thomas Devery, Pastor, Our Lady Star of the Sea, Staten Island, NY

At the time of the 2020 reports, the prelates listed as members of the NAC Board of Governors who oversaw Harman and Park were:

Archbishop Samuel Aquila of the Archdiocese of Denver, Colorado
Bishop Earl Boyea of the Diocese of Lansing, Michigan
Bishop Kurt Burnette of the Byzantine Catholic Eparchy of Passaic
Bishop William Callahan of the Diocese of La Crosse, Wisconsin
Bishop Robert Deeley (Chairman) of the Diocese of Portland, Maine
Bishop Joseph Hanefeldt of the Diocese of Grand Island, Nebraska
Bishop Michael Hoepfner of the Diocese of Crookston, Minnesota
Bishop Salvatore Matano of the Diocese Rochester, New York
Bishop Michael Mulvey of the Diocese of Corpus Christi, Texas
Auxiliary Bishop Adam Parker (Secretary) of the Archdiocese of Baltimore, Maryland
Bishop Glen Provost of the Diocese Lake Charles, Louisiana
Archbishop J. Peter Sartain (Vice-Chairman) of the Archdiocese of Seattle, Washington
Auxiliary Bishop Bernard Shlesinger of the Archdiocese of Atlanta, Georgia
Bishop Kevin Vann of the Diocese of Orange, California
Auxiliary Bishop William Waltersheid of the Diocese of Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania

At the time of the filing of the February 2021 legal Complaint and the June 2021 affidavits, the prelates listed as members of the NAC Board of Governors were:

Archbishop Samuel Aquila of the Archdiocese of Denver, Colorado
Bishop Earl Boyea of the Diocese of Lansing, Michigan
Bishop Kurt Burnette of the Byzantine Catholic Eparchy of Passaic
Bishop William Callahan of the Diocese of La Crosse, Wisconsin
Bishop Robert Deeley (Chairman) of the Diocese of Portland, Maine
Cardinal Timothy Dolan of the Archdiocese of New York
Bishop Michael Hoepfner of the Diocese of Crookston, Minnesota
Bishop Peter Jugis of the Diocese of Charlotte, South Carolina
Bishop Steven Lopes of the Personal Ordinariate of the Chair of St. Peter
Auxiliary Bishop Daniel Mueggenborg of the Archdiocese of Seattle
Auxiliary Bishop Adam Parker (Secretary) of the Archdiocese of Baltimore, Maryland
Bishop Glen Provost of the Diocese of Lake Charles, Louisiana
Bishop Kevin Vann of the Diocese of Orange, California
Auxiliary Bishop William Waltersheid of the Diocese of Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania

The reports informed recipients of numerous other scandals which broke in U.S. and international seminaries and stated that “what happened to Anthony is potentially suggestive of gay church officials abusing their power and reprising against heterosexually oriented vulnerable seminarians.” The recipients were requested to undertake an investigation into all the allegations contained in the reports, including “whether ... Fathers Park and Harman are homosexuals who are discriminating against heterosexually oriented candidates for the priesthood.”

While Boston Cardinal Seán O'Malley, Fall River Bishop Edgar da Cunha, and Arlington Bishop Michael Burbidge responded by stating that they were referring the "deeply troubling allegations" to the Apostolic Nunciature "out of concern" for NAC seminarians, Ordinaries Dolan, Gregory, Paprocki, and Raica; Archbishop Pierre; NAC Board of Governors members, and USCCB, Archdiocese of New York, and Vatican officials all failed to respond and to investigate these reports. Under Cardinal Gregory, the Archdiocese of Washington was found to have electronically blocked reports addressing misconduct allegations against Park, a priest of the Archdiocese, in an effort feign plausible deniability.

Paprocki was also cited in a July 25, 2021 communication forwarded to the Apostolic Nunciature and all U.S. Ordinaries for ignoring reports informing him that Harman, his priest, had engaged in illicit conduct and concealed predation toward vulnerable seminarians. With reference to Paprocki's role in the cover-up, the report stated:

While it has been in your power as Harman's Ordinary to recall and ultimately discipline him after being informed that his actions pose potential risks to the welfare of seminarians, you refused to cooperate with Cardinal Seán O'Malley and other U.S. Bishops who, while not being Harman's Ordinary, found the allegations against your priest worthy of an investigation through the Apostolic Nunciature.¹⁹⁸

The same communication also advised Paprocki, "You should also know that the witnesses are prepared to show that subsequent acts of alleged misconduct could have been prevented had you investigated reports concerning Fathers Harman and Park when you first received them." Like "more than 130 U.S. bishops" who were identified for having covered up sex abuse in their dioceses, so too has Paprocki covered up allegations that Harman used his position to cover up predatory behavior involving Park, and that Harman himself engaged in homosexual behavior in the presence of seminarians.

Knights of Columbus leadership, including Supreme Knight Patrick Kelly; Past Supreme Knight Carl Anderson; and Supreme Chaplain Archbishop William Lori were also informed of the allegations, but to date have failed to respond or act upon them. Beginning in May of 2020, Henry J. Stolzenhaller Council #1675 in Staten Island, New York, and Knights of Columbus Headquarters in New Haven, Connecticut, received numerous communications about the investigation into Cardinal Dolan and NAC seminary officials. Emails documenting the accusations against Dolan and the NAC were sent to Stolzenhaller Council and to the Knights' National leadership on July 20, 2020, September 23, 2020, March 27, 2021, and August 11, 2021. In the interest of transparency, a list of Councils throughout the country which also received the allegations was included at the footer of the September 23, 2020 correspondence. The Knights were informed that their failure to act upon sexual misconduct and cover-up allegations jeopardized the credibility of their vocations recruitment campaigns. The August 11, 2021 correspondence to Supreme Knight Kelly stated:

If people were to learn that the Knights of Columbus were involved in covering up sexual predation in seminaries like the NAC ... might they ask, *How can the Knights be taken seriously when they say that they support priestly vocations?* Former seminarians and Knights like Anthony responded to the K of C appeals for vocations, only to be let down when it was shown

that the Knights, through their silence, rendered consent to one of the largest predation crises tearing through U.S. seminaries today (Cf. St. Thomas More, '*Qui tacet consentire videtur*').¹⁹⁹

After two years of silence and failure by responsible NAC and Church officials to investigate, Gorgia had no choice but to file suit against clerics who had victimized or endangered seminarians. The fact that Gorgia and numerous victims have to rely upon civil courts to secure protections for seminarians appears to be an indictment upon the U.S. and Vatican prelates and Knights of Columbus leadership who have turned a blind eye to sexual predation.

CONCLUSIONS

A plethora of factual evidence, witnesses, and countless news reports, including those cited and linked in this report, prove beyond a shadow of a doubt that vulnerable Catholic seminarians continue to be groomed, preyed upon, sexually harassed, and abused in seminaries. The sexual exploitation of seminarians is not a problem of the past; it is a rising occurrence in the present which is on track to increase. The crisis is compounded by prelates and seminary leaders found to have shielded accused predators, concealed what they knew to be a destructive reality, and retaliated against those who called out cultures of misconduct in their seminaries.

This report has provided abundant evidence found “credible” by investigators, including a former FBI Special Agent in Charge, showing a pattern of seminary and Church officials engaging in sexual predation and misconduct that were later covered up, uninvestigated, or whitewashed.

The cases cited in this report, which hardly begin to exhaust the number of seminarians who have come forward, show how whistleblowers like former seminarian Anthony Gorgia who were not complicit with the grooming, harassment, or abuse of fellow seminarians were coerced into leaving formation while clerics accused of sexual misconduct continued to repeat their actions unabated. In many cases, these clerics were protected by seminary and Church leaders who oftentimes themselves were guilty of engaging in the immoral behavior that was reported.

Similar to thousands of victims of clerical sex abuse who were forced to file lawsuits after Church officials failed to act upon their credible allegations and attempted to portray them as being “just out to make money from the Church,” so too did Anthony Gorgia have no choice but to bring the damning allegations against Cardinal Dolan and North American College (NAC) seminary officials to the Courts after two years of requests for an investigation from the Vatican, responsible Church officials, and senior Knights of Columbus leadership went ignored.

Just as *The Boston Globe*'s Spotlight investigation initially appeared to be concerned with just a few accused predator priests, the independent investigation documented in this report began with allegations by victimized NAC seminarians and by Gorgia who suffered retaliation by Cardinal Timothy Dolan and NAC officials. As happened in Boston, throughout this investigation, reports of predatory behavior and cover-ups involving numerous seminaries began pouring in, showing that the offenses perpetrated against Gorgia and NAC seminarians were only “the tip of the iceberg.” Based on the input of seminarians, both international and across the United States, it became clear that heterophobic homosexual “subcultures” identified in 2002 by investigative reporter Michael Rose have evolved into more secretive homosexual “cultures” in the present owing to an increase in the percentage of homosexual prelates, seminary rectors, vocation directors, and seminarians whose actions are far more intensely, and even vindictively, covered up. Frederic Martel, himself gay, concluded as much in his work, *In the Closet of the Vatican*, in which he wrote:

If you want to integrate with the Vatican, adhere to a code, which consists of tolerating the homosexuality of priests and bishops, enjoying it if appropriate, but keeping it secret in all cases ... Being homosexual is possible in the Vatican, easy, ordinary, and even encouraged; but the word 'visibility' is forbidden ... to be one who brings down scandal upon [the closeted clerical culture] is to exclude oneself from the family.²⁰⁰

Had Church leaders acted responsibly in taking note of the findings of clerical and lay experts like Richard Sipe, Paul Sullins, Dariusz Oko, Richard Fitzgibbons, Dale O'Leary, and Andrew Cozzens, or had they not ignored the recommendations contained in Father Thomas Doyle's 1985 coauthored sexual abuse report, thousands of clerical sex abuse victims could have been spared. Unfortunately, Church leaders demonstrated no more wisdom than the Boy Scouts of America that ignored the warnings of Dr. Judith Reisman about not allowing homosexuals to serve as scoutmasters. Both institutions have paid heavily in the process, with over 30 U.S. Catholic dioceses and religious orders claiming bankruptcy as a result of the U.S. Church's payout of over \$4 billion, and the Boy Scouts filing for bankruptcy protection in the wake of some 95,000 sex abuse lawsuits.

This report is being submitted to every U.S. Ordinary, the Apostolic Nuncio, and Knights of Columbus leadership so that abuse suffered by seminarians once silenced may at last be told; those who have contributed to concealed misconduct in seminaries may be held accountable; and steps may be taken to prevent abuse in the future. Should this report's findings and recommendations go unanswered, as happened with reports from other clerical and lay experts over the years, those who have contributed to this report predict that the hemorrhage of vocations will continue; Church and seminary leaders will increasingly find themselves named in lawsuits; the rate of parish closures will increase; and the faith of countless Catholics will continue to be destroyed.

RECOMMENDATIONS

Recommendation One

Create *truly* independent, lay investigative boards outside of the control of bishops or seminary leaders to probe sexual misconduct complaints from seminarians. Similar to people who are chosen to serve on juries, members of these boards cannot have any fiduciary or other ties to (arch)diocesan or seminary officials which would involve a conflict of interest. Uncompromised board members would represent different disciplines and areas of expertise such as law enforcement, civil law, medicine, psychology, etc. Upon receipt of misconduct reports from seminarians, board members should immediately forward the allegations to law enforcement or civil authorities, as appropriate, and the accused party should be removed from the seminary pending the conclusion of an unbiased investigation to reduce the risk of repeated acts of abuse.

Rationale: Many internal Church investigations have been shown to have covered up sexual misconduct on the part of Church and seminary officials. Expert sex abuse advocates have found Church-directed investigations by accused prelates like St. Paul and Minneapolis Archbishop John Nienstedt; then-Springfield Bishop George Lucas; and others to have uniformly been “subjective and biased.” Just as the Argentine Supreme Court justices were not swayed by then-Cardinal Jorge Bergoglio’s 2,800-page report designed to persuade them to overturn the 15-year sentence of convicted child sex abuser, Father Julio César Grassi, so too are many U.S. Courts inclined not to be influenced by Vatican or diocesan internal reports based upon findings from investigators bought and paid for by the Church. Even if a lawyer retained by the Church were led to believe that a cleric he was called to defend were guilty, he could not reveal this without incurring serious penalties including disbarment for an egregious breach of attorney-client privilege. The proposal of bishops investigating other bishops has also proven unsuccessful. Auxiliary Bishop Andrew Cozzens acknowledged after being tasked with investigating Nienstedt, his Ordinary, that he “did not have enough objectivity or experience with such investigations,” had “no meaningful structure to address allegations against bishops,” and did not “have authority to act.” Consequently, independent seminary investigative boards must be as “untouchable” and objective as the first members of the National Review Board headed by former Governor Frank Keating. Unfortunately, Keating, a former prosecutor and FBI agent, resigned his position after comparing some bishops to “La Cosa Nostra.” He explained how he felt the bishops wanted to use his position to cover up the extent of molestation in the Church when he wrote:

My remarks, which some bishops found offensive, were deadly accurate. I make no apology. To resist grand jury subpoenas, to suppress the names of offending clerics, to deny, to obfuscate, to explain away; that is the model of a criminal organization, not my church.²⁰¹

Recommendation Two

When an investigation into an accused cleric is opened, its commencement should be made public to all relevant parties so that anyone with information will have a chance to bring forward testimony. While seminarians interviewed should be

guaranteed anonymity, the results of the investigations must be made public to ensure accountability for the methods used and the outcomes determined.

Rationale: Church-sponsored investigations undertaken by parties compensated by accused or implicated prelates, such as one convened by Bishop George Lucas to respond to allegations against himself; by Bishop Richard Stika to determine whether one of his seminarians was guilty of sexually harassing other seminarians; by Cardinal Dolan to decide if Father Miqueli had committed homosexual and financial misconduct; or by Pope Francis to determine whether he had covered up for McCarrick, have routinely excluded witnesses and evidence they are presented with in order to obtain a pre-conceived, contrived conclusion. Such grave omissions were made possible by the fact that accused parties' attorneys never publicly revealed the methods they used nor the nature of the evidence they received.

In other cases, Church and seminary officials do not make public the fact that a cleric has been named in accusations or is under investigation, which shrouds proceedings in secrecy while preventing additional prospective witnesses or victims from coming forward with supportive evidence. Although Father Harman and the NAC Board of Governors had received and failed to investigate credible reports alleging that Father Adam Park had committed acts of sexual misconduct, NAC seminarians were never informed that their superiors had received such reports, and Park remained in his post as the vice-rector until he abruptly relinquished his post following the filing of damning Court affidavits against him, Harman, Dolan, and other implicated defendants. It was after seminarians were informed via media reports that their vice-rector had been accused of sexual harassment and misconduct that even more corroborating accounts were brought forward.

While attorneys retained by accused parties release whitewashed reports which predictably portray their clients in unrealistically glowing terms, these reports do not disclose who was interviewed, who was not interviewed, or precisely what evidence was submitted to Church Panels. Church officials who publish flawed reports based on misinformation not only cover up the real reasons behind the sexual abuse crisis, but also contribute to a decrease in the number of priests, seminarians, and U.S. Catholics who are scandalized by Church leaders' lack of transparency. As a result of many "had it" Catholics leaving the Church, former Catholics today have become the second-largest "denomination" in the country behind Catholics.

Recommendation Three

Seminary and Church leaders need to be transparent and disclose with candidates seeking the priesthood, both before they enter the seminary and while they are in formation, about the prevalence of sexual harassment and misconduct in seminaries and among the Catholic clergy today. Just as countries issue "immigration advisories" warning travelers of potential threats, so too should bishops honestly disclose to their seminarians of the risks increasingly prevalent in seminaries today which differ from those of the past.

Rationale: Just as Church leaders attempted to deny reports published in *The Kansas City Star* showing that the annualized death rate of priests who died of AIDS in Kansas and Missouri from 1987 to 1999 was seven times that of the general population, so too do most Church and seminary officials neglect to inform seminarians that no more than 45 to 50

percent of Catholic clergy practice celibacy at any given time, and that the percentage of homosexual prelates, priests, and seminarians today exceeds the percentage of heterosexually oriented Catholic clergy.

Many seminarians also report that they were naïve to the existence of predatory cultures in their seminaries until later succumbing to victimization by one of their superiors or by a fellow seminarian. Foreign-born seminarians who come to the U.S. with the hope of pursuing the “American dream” and serving in a U.S. diocese also report having been ignorant that bishops or priests who recruited them often did so with ulterior motives. These seminarians, when attempting to report misconduct to Church leaders, often found themselves threatened with deportation or of losing ordination, while accused-predators are left unpunished.

In 2020, the University of Notre Dame, McGrath Institute for Church Life, published “Sexual Harassment and Catholic Seminary Culture: The First Sociological Survey of Seminarians.” The results of this national study of sexual misconduct in seminaries revealed that “the most important improvement needed at this time is an improved protocol for reporting abuse and harassment, along with improved education regarding that policy and regarding what sexual harassment is in the first place.”

Unfortunately, like the 2004 John Jay report that reached false conclusions based on false data and underreporting by U.S. bishops, so too did the McGrath Institute reach false conclusions about the percentage of seminarians who experienced, witnessed, or reported sexual harassment in their seminaries. Interestingly, some 55 seminaries/houses of formation never responded and another 22 declined to participate in the survey, suggesting that superiors did not want their seminarians to voice their concerns about their seminaries. Some of the seminaries that did participate are either currently being sued for covering up homosexual predation and misconduct or have been reported for fostering heterophobic gay cultures.

The fact that the 46-page report did not even mention the word “homosexuality” which has been shown to be a major cause for the hemorrhaging of heterosexually oriented seminarians would lead one to understand why one seminarian interviewed for the study wrote:

You know, what's so laughable is how woke they're trying to be, and yet, at the same time, not offend anybody. God forbid we mention the word 'gay' or 'homosexual.' The bulk of the issue has to do with people that are not following God's laws; who are not being chaste; who are not keeping their religious promises to God. It's just a bunch of authorities trying to control the narrative, which is fundamentally out of control, and at this point in time, quite laughable.²⁰²

The accuracy of such studies is inhibited by the fact that gay seminarians will naturally deny the existence of homosexual behavior before outing themselves or other gay seminarians and faculty members. Also, straight seminarians, unaware of what their gay superiors or classmates may be doing “behind closed doors” or outside the seminary, may in reality be oblivious to the double lives being led by the latter. Until these straight seminarians are in some way impacted by the misconduct of their gay superiors or fellow seminarians, this misconduct remains a guarded secret. It is not unusual for parish priests

to live and work with predator clerics whom they have no idea may be abusing young parishioners. Just as many seminarians, priests, and bishops conceal their addictions to pornography or their use of gay hook-up apps like Grindr, so too do many of them successfully hide their closeted homosexual lifestyles from fellow clergy and laity.

Seminary investigations like the 2005-2006 study undertaken by then-Archbishop Edwin O'Brien and the 2020 McGrath Institute study which both failed to address the two major transgressions affecting seminaries today - homosexual cultures and cover-up – only serve to perpetuate these problems indefinitely. Critics of the McGrath Institute study observe that there is nothing in their proposed benchmarks to protect seminarians from retaliation when reporting abuse or harassment that they or fellow seminarians may experience. Until safeguards are put into place and offending faculty members or seminarians are expelled for immoral – and in some cases illegal – behavior, one can anticipate a continued decline in both the number and percentage of heterosexually oriented candidates for the priesthood.

Recommendation Four

A truly independent review board with no fiduciary duties to, affiliations with, or compensation by seminary and Church leaders should conduct thorough evaluations of all seminaries on a periodic basis. Seminaries which refuse to participate in such reviews should be disaccredited for their lack of compliance. These evaluations should guarantee respondents anonymity and should ask clear questions assessing the prevalence of sexual exploitation by superiors or other seminarians; superiors' diligence in acting upon complaints; and how effectively responsible Ordinaries and bishops intervened when they were informed of sexual misconduct. Responses should be submitted directly to the review board, without any intervention or interference by seminary and Church leaders. Any complaints would be documented and transparently acted upon by the independent review board.

Rationale: A number of seminarians revealed that while their seminaries had purported internal procedures for the intake of sexual abuse reports, these procedures abysmally failed in practice. Seminarians disclosed that at times, their complaints went unacted upon for years, and predatory cultures in seminaries only deteriorated. When internal seminary reviews were undertaken by compromised Church leaders like Cardinal O'Brien, who himself was known for his history of underreporting abuse and affiliations with homosexual clerics; or by researchers such as the McGrath Institute which compiled underreported data from less than half of all U.S. seminaries, the results had obvious flaws in accounting for the recurrence of sexual misconduct and cover-up which seminarians actually experience. A periodic review of seminaries by uncompromised board members would allow cultures of misconduct or cover-up to be more quickly pointed out and acted upon. Since as many as more than 2 out of 3 sexual assaults go unreported, affording respondents anonymity and a way to submit feedback without responses passing through the hands of seminary superiors may reduce fear of retribution, one of the major factors which has consistently led to the underreporting of unsafe seminary environments.

Recommendation Five

Even though drugs have been developed to help treat and arrest HIV/AIDS, infection with HIV should be medically disqualifying for entry into college and major seminaries, as well as for ordination to the diaconate, the priesthood, and the episcopate. This policy is akin to that of the U.S. military which precludes the accession of applicants infected with HIV. Hence, HIV screening should be administered to ensure that no applicant is accepted and no seminarian or cleric is ordained who is HIV-positive. Exceptions can be made for contraction through medical malpractice or non-consensual behavior.

Rationale: An individual contracts HIV ordinarily through sexual transmission. If a person is HIV-positive through consensual sexual activity before entering the seminary or before ordination, it is questionable if he can live a celibate life. Acceptance and ordination of people who are HIV-positive opens the door for increasing rates of clerical promiscuity²⁰³ which already significantly exceeds infidelity rates among married couples.²⁰⁴

The need for repeated HIV testing among candidates for ordination was made clear by Dr. Joseph Barone, a member of the National Catholic AIDS Network, who studied soaring numbers of seminarians and priests infected with HIV. After conducting an “underground AIDS testing program” over the course of ten years, Barone found that 1 in 12 NAC seminarians tested HIV-positive.²⁰⁵ Barone also treated about 80 priests in Rome who contracted AIDS. The main reason cited for the high rate of infection, according to Barone, was astronomical rates of male-to-male sexual transmission among seminarians and priests. Addressing his findings, Barone said, “The tragedy is many of them have been so duplicitous and so closeted.” Barone’s study would later be supported by the findings of *The Kansas City Star* and other AIDS experts who had worked with infected priests, each of which confirmed that the annualized rate of priests who died of AIDS in some dioceses reached rates of seven times that of the general population. Owing to the high rate of sexual activity in seminaries, there is a strong probability that seminarians may become infected with HIV after their acceptance.

Since *The Kansas City Star’s* reporting, sexually active priests appear to have found new and even illegal ways to cover up their HIV or AIDS diagnoses. In 2011, Colombian Father Rafael Reatiga, a regular visitor to places notoriously frequented by gays in central Bogotá, hired hitmen who killed him together with Father Richard Piffano after Reatiga was diagnosed with AIDS. In the U.S., it was only after Cleveland Father James McGonegal was arrested in 2013 for soliciting sex from a park ranger that he revealed to police that he was HIV positive. At the time of McGonegal’s arrest, it was a third-degree felony for someone with HIV to solicit sex. In 2018, a 37-page affidavit from a special agent with the U.S. Department of Homeland Security alleged that Diocese of Jackson priest, Father Lenin Vargas-Gutierrez, covered up his HIV diagnosis and diverted donated funds to a dating website for HIV-positive users. While Vargas claimed in an email sent by the Jackson Vicar General to the priests of the diocese that Vargas had “cancer” following his HIV diagnosis, the special agent stated in his affidavit that he “believe[d] the email was sent in order to perpetuate the cancer story, to hide Vargas’ HIV condition and protect the Diocese of Jackson from negative publicity.”

While Dr. Barone’s long-term research was completed at the height of the AIDS outbreak, it is likely that that rates of HIV-infection in the Catholic presbyterate is much

higher today owing to both the development of effective HIV-arresting drugs and the drastic rise in the percentage of sexually active homosexual clerics. This projection is confirmed by a 2012 study published by National Center for Biotechnology Information (NCBI) of the National Institutes of Health, which found that homosexuals report a far greater number of lifetime sex partners than heterosexuals. For example, while straight men between the ages of 35 and 39 reported a lifetime median of 10 sex partners, gay men reported a median of 67.²⁰⁶

INDEX

- AIDS/HIV,
 among NAC seminarians, 5, 44, 59-60
 among priests, 4-5, 19, 30, 34, 44, 56, 59-60
- Altman, Father James, 12
- Anderson, Carl J., 51
- Aquila, Archbishop Samuel, 38, 49-52
- Archdiocese,
 Boston, 30, 44
 Buenos Aires, 29, 30
 Chicago, 4, 7, 8, 12, 13, 20, 35
 Military Services, 5, 10, 30, 31, 32, 41
 Milwaukee, 13, 14-15, 32, 44-45
 Newark, 4, 7, 8, 13, 20, 35
 New York, 2, 4, 32-33, 36, 37, 42-52
- Argano, Father Christopher, 49-52
- Andreassi, Anthony, 12
- Arias, Father Hernan, 20-21
- Balducci, Angelo, 8
- Balzanella, Alexander, 31
- Bambera, Bishop Joseph, 15
- Barone, Dr. Joseph, 5, 44, 59-60
- Benedict XVI, Pope, 9, 31
- Bernardin, Cardinal Joseph, 20, 38
- Berrio, Father Diego, 7, 20
- Berry, Jason, 40
- Biegler, Bishop Steven, 4
- Biernat, Father Ryszard, 24-25, 27
- BishopAccountability.org*, 16
 AMS Priests credibly accused, 30-31
- Board of Governors, NAC, 12, 24, 40, 42-43, 45, 49-52, 56
- Boyea, Bishop Earl, 38, 48, 49-52
- Bransfield, Bishop Michael, 23, 35-36, 37, 44
- Broglio, Archbishop Timothy, 30, 47
- Burbidge, Bishop Michael, 51
- Burnette, Bishop Kurt, 38, 49-52
- Burrill, Monsignor Jeffrey, 7, 12, 18, 43
- Byrne, Bishop Peter, 49-52
- Callaghan, Michael, 12
- Callahan, Bishop William, 38, 49-52
- Capozzi, Monsignor Luigi, 7, 8
- Carroll, Cardinal Desmond, 13
- Casa Santa Marta, 8
- Castillo, Father Juan Garcia, 23
- Catholic News Agency*, 16, 31
- Catholic News Service*, 16
- Center for Applied Research in the Apostolate, 10, 39
- Chardonens, Father Alain, 7-8
- Checchio, Bishop James, 13-14, 15-16, 38, 47, 49-52
- Church Militant*, 16
- Cimmarrusti, Father Mario, 18
- Clergy Sex Abuse Report*, 5, 35
- Coalition for Canceled Priests, 16
- Coccopalmerio, Cardinal Francesco, 4, 7, 8
- Colacicco, Bishop Gerardo, 49-52
- ComplicitClergy.com*, 16
- Costa, Monsignor Eugene, 12
- Cozzens, Bishop Andrew H., 34, 54, 55
- Cozzens, Father Donald, 4, 31
- Crist, Keith, 32-33
- Cupich, Cardinal Blase, 4, 5, 7, 8, 9, 13, 15, 35, 38, 40-41, 47
- Dallas Charter
 inaccurate statistics/conclusions, 11, 18, 38-39
- Da Cunha, Bishop Edgar, 51
- DeGiovine, Father Christopher, 26-2
- Deeley, Bishop Robert, 38, 49-52
- Devery, Father Thomas, 36, 49-52
- Devlin, Father Brian, 27
- Dinh, Father Van, 25
- Diocese,
 Buffalo, 10, 20, 21-22, 24-25, 27, 44
 Knoxville, 27, 36
 Northampton, 4
 Palm Beach, 13, 19
 Paterson, 19, 20-21
 Providence, 13-14, 47
 San Diego, 4, 8, 23, 35
 Springfield in Illinois, 6-7, 12, 13, 25-26, 33-34, 37-38, 42-43, 46, 49, 55
- Dolan, Bishop John, 4, 16
- Dolan, Cardinal Timothy M., 2, 8, 13, 15, 17, 24, 32-33, 36, 37, 38, 40-41, 42-52, 53, 56
- Doyle, Father Thomas, O.P., 2, 30, 35, 40-41, 54
- Duarte, Bishop Gonzalo, 28
- Ecclesia Militans*, 16
- Ephebophilia, 5
- Ferreira, Father James, 49-52
- Ferreira da Silva, Bishop Tomé, 7
- Fitzgibbons, Richard, 5, 54
- Francis, Pope, 4, 7, 9, 12, 27, 29, 30, 35, 37-38, 43, 56
- Geoghan, Father John, 30
- Gibson, Mel, 16
- Giraldo-Cortez, Father Edwin M., 7, 20
- Gomà, Bishop Xavier Novell, 12
- Gomez, Archbishop José Horacio, 38, 49-52
- Gomulka, Gene Thomas, 5, 47-49
- Gorgia, Anthony, 2, 10, 17, 21, 40-41, 42-52, 53
- Goring, Father Mark, 13
- Grassi, Father Julio César, 29, 55
- Gregory, Cardinal Wilton, 4, 13, 15, 24, 38, 49-52
- Griffin, Father Carter, 24
- Grosz, Bishop Edward, 24-25
- Hanefeldt, Bishop Joseph, 38, 49-52
- Harman, Father Peter, 2, 6-7, 12, 14, 24, 25-26, 33-34, 37-38, 39, 40-41, 42-52, 56
- Harris, Father Xavier, 18
- Heße, Archbishop Stefan, 12
- Henriquez, Father Humberto, 28
- Higuera, Archbishop Gabriel Montalvo, 6, 15, 25, 46
- Hoepfner, Bishop Michael, 38, 47, 49-52

Holinga, Monsignor Thomas, 12

Homosexuality,
 church closures, 2, 15, 16, 54
 culture/current in the Church, 2, 4, 7, 8, 10, 11-12, 14, 17, 19, 28, 31, 42, 53-54, 57, 58
 destabilization, 14
 heterophobia, 17, 53-54, 57
 increase among bishops, priests, and seminarians, 4-9, 11, 17, 20, 21, 31, 35, 38, 53
 religious orders, 5
 statistics, 4-7, 15, 44, 59-60

Hughes, Bishop Edward T., 9

Hunt, Father Clay, 12-13

John Jay study, 5, 31, 35, 39, 57

Jugis, Bishop Peter, 38, 49-52

Kalchik, Father Paul, 12

Karalus, Father Peter, 22

Kelly, Patrick, 24, 49-52

Knights of Columbus, 2, 16, 24, 40, 41, 43, 49-52, 53, 54
 Henry J. Stolzenhaller Council, 2, 40, 43, 49-52

Kotze, Victor, 15

Krenn, Bishop Kurt, 26

Krol, Father Miroslaw, 10, 23-24

Küch, Father Ulrich, 26

Ladaria Ferrer, Cardinal Luis, 12

Lavers, Father Joseph, 20

Law, Cardinal Bernard, 30

Le Notti Brave dei Preti Gay, 7

Lee, Father John "Matt", 30, 32, 38

Lena, Jeffrey, 37-38

Liberatore, Father Albert, 43

LifeSiteNews, 7, 16

Lopes, Bishop Steven, 38, 49-52

Lori, Archbishop William, 19, 24, 35-36, 37, 38, 49-52

Lucas, Archbishop George, 6-7, 12, 13, 25-26, 33-34, 36, 37-38, 39, 42, 44, 45-46, 55, 56

Malone, Bishop Richard, 21-22, 38

Marshall, Dr. Taylor, 16

Martel, Frédéric, 6, 7, 8, 15, 53-54

Martin, Archbishop Diarmuid, 13, 28

Martin, Father James, 15

Martinelli, Father Gabriele, 21

Martino, Cardinal Renato Raffaele, 8

Marx, Cardinal Reinhard, 12

Matano, Bishop Salvatore, 38, 49-52

Mattulke, Father Art, 22

McBrien, Father Richard P., 15

McCabe, Kenneth, 17, 30, 34, 45-46

McCarrick Report, 37-38

McCarrick, Theodore, 8, 9, 13, 19, 20, 24, 28, 35, 37-38, 41, 43, 56

McDonald, Father John, 2, 40-41, 42-52

McElroy, Bishop Robert, 4, 8, 15, 35, 37

McGonegal, Father James, 59

McGrath Institute for Church Life survey, 57, 58

Miqueli, Father Peter, 32-33, 56

Montalbano, Father Daniel, 7

Moore, Bishop Emerson J., 4

Morlino, Bishop Robert, 8

Moroney, Monsignor James P., 22

Mueggenborg, Bishop Daniel, 38, 49-52

Müller, Cardinal Gerhard, 12

Mulvey, Bishop Michael, 38, 47, 49-52

Murphy-O'Connor, Cardinal Cormac, 12

Mustaciuolo, Monsignor Gregory, 32

Mutsaerts, Bishop Rob, 12

Myers, Archbishop John, 12, 13, 43

National Catholic Register, 16, 31

National Center for Biotechnology Information, 6, 60

National Review Board, 2, 5, 55

Nichols, Cardinal Vincent, 31

Nienstedt, Archbishop John, 15, 23, 34, 36, 47, 55

Nowak, Father Jeffrey, 21-22

O'Brien, Cardinal Edwin F., 5, 8, 10, 15, 30-32, 38, 41, 58

O'Brien, Cardinal Keith, 27

O'Connell, Bishop Anthony, 13, 19

O'Connell, Bishop David, 28

O'Hara, Bishop John, 38, 49-52

O'Leary, Dale, 5, 54

O'Malley, Cardinal Seán, 28-29, 37, 51

Oakley, Bishop David, 4

Ojeda, Father Mauro, 28

Oko, Rev. Dariusz, 4, 31, 54

Olson, Bishop Michael, 15

O'Sullivan, William, 39

Paglia, Archbishop Vincenzo, 8

Paprocki, Bishop Thomas, 7, 38, 49-52

Park, Father Adam, 2, 12, 14, 18, 24, 40-41, 42-52, 56

Parker, Bishop Adam, 24, 38, 49-52

Passow, Timothy, 12

Pedophilia, 5

Perrone, Father Eduard, 12, 31

Pierre, Archbishop Christophe, 2, 24, 38, 49-52

Piffano, Father Richard, 59

Pinche, Bishop Lee, 34

Pineda, Bishop Juan José, 28

Pinto, Christopher, 24

Pocalujko, Father Tomasz, 49-52

Priebe, Gisela, 39

Prostitutes and clerics, 8, 12, 32, 33, 42

Provost, Bishop Glen, 38, 48, 49-52

Radice, Father Enrico, 21

Raica, Bishop Steven, 38, 49-52

Reatiga, Father Rafael, 59

Regnerus, Mark, 39

Reisman, Dr. Judith, 5-6, 54

Renken, Monsignor John, 12

Ricca, Monsignor Battista, 4, 8

Roberts, Bill, 33-34, 37-38, 39

Rodriguez, Cardinal Oscar Maradiaga, 23, 27-28, 38, 49-52

Rose, Michael, 11-12, 17, 18, 19, 21, 29, 31, 53
 Rothe, Father Wolfgang, 26
 Ryan, Bishop Daniel, 12, 13, 34, 37-38, 42
 Saldana, Father Jose, 27
 Sambì, Archbishop Pietro, 20-21
 Sanchez, Cardinal Jose, 15
 Saporito, Bishop Michael, 15
 Sartain, Archbishop J. Peter, 38, 49-52
 Seminarians,
 courts, 2, 6, 17, 18, 22, 23, 29, 42-52
 reprisals, 14, 17, 18, 19, 21-22, 23, 24-25, 26,
 27, 28, 29, 30, 36, 40-41, 42-52, 53, 58
 vulnerabilities, 2, 11, 17, 23, 25-26, 30, 45-46,
 50, 53
 Seminaries,
 1982 visitation, 31
 2005 visitation, 10, 31, 32, 58
 American College in Louvain, 10, 18-19, 21, 48
 Casa Jesus, 10, 20
 Chile, 28
 Christ the King, 10, 20, 21-22
 college, 11, 19, 38
 high school, 10-11, 19, 38
 Holy Apostles, 20, 21
 Honduras, 23, 27-28
 Meinrad, 42
 North American College (NAC), 2, 5, 8, 10, 12,
 13-14, 17, 18, 24, 25-26, 32, 40-41, 42-52,
 53, 56, 59
 Pope St. Pius X (Scranton), 43
 Pope St. Pius X (Vatican City), 21
 Rhode Island, 19-20
 Sacred Heart, 23
 St. Anthony's Seminary, 10, 18
 St. Charles Borromeo, 22-23
 Sts. Cyril and Methodius, 10, 23-24
 St. John (Brighton), 22
 St. John's Provincial, 10, 19, 31
 St. John Paul II, 24
 St. Joseph's (Dunwoodie), 26-27, 32
 St. Louis Preparatory North, 13
 St. Mary's, 19, 24
 St. Patrick's (Maynooth), 28
 St. Pölten Seminary, 10, 26
 St. Thomas Aquinas, 10, 19
 Theological College, 28-29
 Seror, Avner, 15
 Serratelli, Bishop Arthur, 15, 20-21
 Scharfenberger, Bishop Edward, 27, 34-35, 48
 Shaughnessy, Father Paul, S.J., 5
 Sheen, Archbishop Fulton J., 16
 Shelton, Father Brent, 27
 Shlesinger, Bishop Bernard, 38, 49-52
 Sipe, A.W. Richard, 4, 9, 15, 37, 54
 Smith, Father Arthur, 24-25
 Spalding, Bishop J. Mark, 15
 Special Panel on Clergy Misconduct,
 Springfield, Illinois
 cover-up, 33-34, 36, 37-38, 55
 Stella, Cardinal Beniamino, 38, 49-52
 Stenico, Monsignor Tommaso, 8
 Stika, Bishop Richard, 36, 56
 Stock, Bishop Marcus, 31
 Stowe, Bishop John, 4, 15
 Suhy, Father Michael, 12
 Sullins, Rev. Dr. Paul, 4, 5, 35, 39, 54
 Sullivan, Andrew, 5
 Survivors Network of those Abused by Priests
 (SNAP), 16, 35, 36, 41
 Svedin, Carl G., 39
 Swiss Guards, 6, 14
 Symons, Bishop Joseph Keith, 13
 Szoka, Cardinal Edmund, 31
 Tiku, Rohit, 15
 Timone, Father Donald, 37
The Angry Catholic, 16
The Boston Globe, Spotlight, 5, 17, 30, 41, 53
The Gay Report, 5-6
The Kansas City Star, 4-5, 56, 59
*The Problem of Sexual Molestation by Roman
 Catholic Clergy*, 2, 35, 40-41, 54
The Roman Catholic Faithful, 16, 33
 Tobin, Cardinal Joseph, 4, 7, 8, 15, 16, 35
 United States Conference of Catholic Bishops
 (USCCB), 2, 7, 14, 15-16, 35, 47, 49-52
 Van Durme, Patrick, 18, 21
 Vann, Bishop Kevin W., 6, 38, 42, 49-52
 Vargas-Gutierrez, Father Lenin, 59
 Vatican,
 cover-up, 2, 6, 7, 10, 11, 12, 13, 19, 20, 21,
 24, 25, 29, 30, 31, 33-34, 35, 36, 37-38,
 40-41, 46, 49-52, 53-54, 55
 homosexual conduct, 6, 7, 8, 14, 21, 23
 Ventura, Archbishop Luigi, 23
 Viganò, Archbishop Carlo Maria, 8, 37-38
 Vigneron, Archbishop Allen, 23, 24, 48
Vos estis lux mundi, 35
 Waltersheid, Bishop William, 38, 49-52
 Weakland, Archbishop Rembert, 13, 14-15
 Weber, Monsignor Edward, 37
 Weisenburger, Bishop Edward, 4
 Wester, Archbishop John, 4
 Whalen, Bishop Edmund, 38, 49-52
 White, Father Mark, 12
 Whitewashes,
 church-sponsored/internal investigations, 2,
 10, 17, 26, 30, 31, 32, 33, 34, 35, 36, 37-38,
 53, 55, 56, 58
 conflicts of interest, 26, 30, 32, 33, 34, 35, 36,
 37-38, 46, 55
 media outlets, 16, 31
 underreporting misconduct, 5, 18, 31, 32, 35,
 38, 58
 Windsor, Father David, 18, 21
 Wolf, James G., 4
 Wong, Archbishop Jorge Carlos Patrón, 38, 49-
 52
 Wuerl, Cardinal Donald, 13, 27, 34-35, 38, 43,
 47
 Zanchetta, Bishop Gustavo, 4, 29

Notes

¹ Thomas Doyle et al., "The Problem of Sexual Molestation by Roman Catholic Clergy: Meeting the Problem in a Comprehensive and Responsible Manner." 9 June 1985.

<https://www.documentcloud.org/documents/1216510-doyle-mouton-peterson-report-1985.html>.

² Jereky Robuck et al., "American bishops face new judgment over sexual abuse after decades of failed reforms, cover-ups," *The Philadelphia Inquirer*. 2 November 2018.

<https://www.inquirer.com/news/pennsylvania/catholic-church-bishops-sex-abuse-coverup-pennsylvania-west-virginia-wyoming-20181103.html>.

³ Michael Paulson, "Rector's book on clergy, sex is bestseller -- among priests," *The Boston Globe*. 3 June 2000. http://archive.boston.com/globe/spotlight/abuse/extras/book_reviews/060300_cozzens.htm.

⁴ Dariusz Oko, "With the Pope against the Homoheresy," *Torate-caeli.blogspot.com*. 8 April 2012.

<https://rorate-caeli.blogspot.com/2013/02/fr-dariusz-okos-major-article-with-pope.html>.

⁵ Paul Sullins, "Is Catholic clergy sex abuse related to homosexual priests?" *Ruthinstitute.org*. November 2018. <http://www.ruthinstitute.org/clergy-abuse-statistics>.

⁶ Steven H. Propp, "Review of 'A Sociologist Studies, and Interviews, Catholic Priests'," *Amazon.com*. 18 February 2014. https://www.amazon.com/gp/customer-reviews/R#U22QB43G7P3U/ref=cm_cr_dp_rvw_ttl?ie=UTF8&ASIN=0060696710.

⁷ Sharon Otterman, "A.W. Richard Sipe, a Leading Expert on Clergy Sex Abuse, Dies at 85," *The New York Times*. 9 April 2018. <https://www.nytimes.com/2018/08/09/nyregion/aw-richard-sipe-a-leading-voice-on-clergy-sex-abuse-dies-at-85.html>.

⁸ James Martin, "Fr. James Martin: Pope Francis has appointed 'many' pro-LGBT cardinals, bishops," *YouTube.com*. 29 June 2019. <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=avhwkeDz7Xk>.

⁹ Michael J. O'Loughlin, "Chicago's Cardinal Cupich: Saying gay, lesbian and L.G.B.T. is a step toward respect," *America*. 18 July 2017. <https://www.americamagazine.org/politics-society/2017/07/18/chicagos-cardinal-cupich-saying-gay-lesbian-and-lgbt-step-toward>.

¹⁰ Catholic News Agency, "Cardinal Tobin: Catechism language 'very unfortunate' on homosexuality," *Catholicnewsagency.com*. 18 April 2019. <https://www.catholicnewsagency.com/news/41076/cardinal-tobin-catechism-language-very-unfortunate-on-homosexuality>.

¹¹ Peter, "Why Faithful Catholics Should Reject Wilton Gregory as Archbishop of Washington, D.C.," *Complicitclergy.com*. 30 March 2019. <https://www.complicitclergy.com/2019/03/30/tell-pope-francis-i-reject-wilton-gregory-as-the-new-archbishop-of-washington-d-c/>.

¹² Scott Wylan, "Santa Fe archbishop expresses support for gay, transgender youth," *Santa Fe New Mexican*. 27 January 2021. https://www.santafenewmexican.com/news/local_news/santa-fe-archbishop-expresses-support-for-gay-transgender-youth/article_d869d936-5ff2-11eb-813e-b751fb3ec275.html.

¹³ Lisa Bourne, "Openly pro-LGBT bishop: There's no 'gay subculture' in my U.S. diocese," *LifeSiteNews.com*. 16 January 2019. <https://www.LifeSiteNews.com/news/openly-pro-lgbt-bishop-theres-no-gay-subculture-in-my-u-s-diocese/>.

¹⁴ Martin Bürger, "Pro-gay Catholic bishop: Trump is 'so much anti-life'," *LifeSiteNews.com*. 10 August 2020. <https://www.LifeSiteNews.com/news/pro-gay-catholic-bishop-trump-is-so-much-anti-life/>.

¹⁵ Madeleine Davison, "Bishops sign dueling statements on LGBTQ people," *National Catholic Reporter*. 25 January 2021. <https://www.ncronline.org/news/opinion/bishops-sign-dueling-statements-lgbtq-people>.

-
- ¹⁶ Pete Baklinski, "Cardinal joins 7 US Catholic bishops in affirming youths who identify as LGBT: 'God is on your side'," *LifeSiteNews.com*. 25 January 2021. <https://www.LifeSiteNews.com/news/cardinal-joins-7-us-catholic-bishops-in-affirming-youths-who-identify-as-lgbt-god-is-on-your-side/>.
- ¹⁷ Louis Knuffke, "Pro-LGBT bishop takes over as head of Phoenix diocese," *LifeSiteNews.com*. 8 August 2022. <https://www.lifesitenews.com/news/pro-lgbt-bishop-takes-over-as-head-of-phoenix-diocese/>.
- ¹⁸ Tamar Lapin, "Vatican cops bust drug-fueled gay orgy at home of cardinal's aide," *New York Post*. 5 July 2017. <https://nypost.com/2017/07/05/vatican-cops-bust-drug-fueled-gay-orgy-at-cardinals-apartment/>.
- ¹⁹ Catholic News Agency, "Argentine bishop under investigation for sex abuse attending pope's Lenten retreat," *The Catholic World Report*. 11 March 2019. <https://www.catholicworldreport.com/2019/03/11/argentine-bishop-under-investigation-for-sex-abuse-attending-popes-lenten-retreat/>.
- ²⁰ Nick Squires, "Pope's 'eyes and ears' in Vatican bank 'had string of homosexual affairs'," *The Telegraph*. 19 July 2013. <https://www.telegraph.co.uk/news/worldnews/europe/vaticancityandhollysee/10191600/Popes-eyes-and-ears-in-Vatican-bank-had-string-of-homosexual-affairs.html>.
- ²¹ New Zealand Herald, "Priesthood haven for homosexuals," *Nzherald.co.nz*. 4 May 2001. <https://www.nzherald.co.nz/world/priesthood-haven-for-homosexuals/TTD6XHFLD3EVN5B4A6HQD2I4/>.
- ²² Christopher Lamb, "Canon David Oakley is new Bishop of Northampton," *The Tablet*. 8 January 2020. <https://www.thetablet.co.uk/news/12351/canon-david-oakley-is-new-bishop-of-northampton>.
- ²³ Liz Dodd, "English seminary responds to gay clique allegations," *The Tablet*. 23 October 2018. <https://www.thetablet.co.uk/news/10908/english-seminary-responds-to-gay-clique-allegations>.
- ²⁴ Elizabeth Dias, "'It Is Not a Closet. It Is a Cage.' Gay Catholic Priests Speak Out," *The New York Times*. 17 February 2019. <https://www.nytimes.com/2019/02/17/us/it-is-not-a-closet-it-is-a-cage-gay-catholic-priests-speak-out.html>.
- ²⁵ Stephan Kappler et al., "Roman Catholic Gay Priests: Internalized Homophobia, Sexual Identity, and Psychological Well-Being," *Pastoral Psychology*. 25 December 2012. https://www.academia.edu/17015869/Roman_Catholic_Gay_Priests_Internalized_Homophobia_Sexual_Identity_and_Psychological_Well_Being?email_work_card=thumbnail.
- ²⁶ Judy L. Thomas, "Catholic priests are dying of AIDS, often in silence," *The Kansas City Star*. 29 January 2000. <https://web.archive.org/web/20131204232729/http://kcsweb.kcstar.com/projects/priests/priest.htm>.
- ²⁷ Tampa Bay Times, "Hundreds of Priests in the U.S. Die of Aids," *Tampabay.com*. 26 September 2005. <https://www.tampabay.com/archive/2000/01/30/hundreds-of-priests-in-the-u-s-die-of-aids/#:~:text=And%20many%20priests%20and%20medical,those%20estimates%20are%20too%20conservative>.
- ²⁸ Paul Shaughnessy, "The Gay Priest Problem," *Bishopaccountability.org*. November 2000. <https://www.bishop-accountability.org/resources/resource-files/media/gaypriest-pf.htm>.
- ²⁹ Andrew Sullivan, "The Gay Church," *New York*. 21 January 2019. <https://nymag.com/intelligencer/2019/01/gay-priests-catholic-church.html>.
- ³⁰ Eugene T. Gomulka, "Home Alone in the Priesthood," *America*. 27 August 2001. <https://www.americamagazine.org/issue/323/article/home-alone-priesthood>.
- ³¹ Karen Terry et al., "The Nature and Scope of the Problem of Sexual Abuse of Minors by Catholic Priests and Deacons in the United States," *United States Conference of Catholic Bishops*. 27 February 2004. https://www.bishop-accountability.org/reports/2004_02_27_JohnJay_revised/.

-
- ³² Paul Sullins, "Is Catholic clergy sex abuse related to homosexual priests?" Ruthinstitute.org. November 2018. <http://www.ruthinstitute.org/clergy-abuse-statistics>.
- ³³ Richard Fitzgibbons and Dale O'Leary, "Sexual Abuse of Minors by Catholic Clergy," *The Linacre Quarterly*. 1 August 2011. <https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC6026962/>.
- ³⁴ Ken Walker, "Homosexuals more likely to molest kids, study reports," *Baptist Press*. 30 May 2001. <https://www.baptistpress.com/resource-library/news/homosexuals-more-likely-to-molest-kids-study-reports/>.
- ³⁵ Di Gregory Rogers, "Report on 'The Gay Report'," Documentazione.info. 20 April 2006. <https://www.documentazione.info/report-on-the-gay-report>.
- ³⁶ Claims Journal. "Boy Scouts Aim to Settle 95,000 Abuse Claims Before Cash Crunch," Claimsjournal.com. 18 November 2020. <https://www.claimsjournal.com/news/national/2020/11/18/300537.htm>.
- ³⁷ Bishop Accountability, "Bishops Accused of Sexual Abuse and Misconduct," Bishopaccountability.org. 13 July 2021. <https://www.bishop-accountability.org/bishops/global-list-of-accused-bishops/#UnitedStates>.
- ³⁸ Joseph M. Hanneman, "Homosexuality and power are key dynamics in priest abuse scandal," ChurchMilitant.com. 3 February, 2020. <https://www.ChurchMilitant.com/news/article/false-shepherd-part-v-common-denominator>.
- ³⁹ Healthline, "What's the Average Person's Number of Sexual Partners?" Healthline.com. 20 August 2018. <https://www.healthline.com/health/healthy-sex/average-number-of-sexual-partners>.
- ⁴⁰ Sarah Nelson Glick et al., "A Comparison of Sexual Behavior Patterns Among Men Who Have Sex With Men and Heterosexual Men and Women," *JAIDS Journal of Acquired Immune Deficiency Syndrome*. 1 May 2012. https://journals.lww.com/jaids/Fulltext/2012/05010/A_Comparison_of_Sexual_Behavior_Patterns_Among_Men.13.aspx.
- ⁴¹ Nick Squires. "Catholic Church cover-up of sex abuse linked to secret gay culture in Vatican, book claims on eve of papal summit," *The Telegraph*. 20 February 2019. <https://www.telegraph.co.uk/news/2019/02/20/catholic-church-cover-up-sex-abuse-linked-secret-gay-culture/>.
- ⁴² Harriet Sherwood, "Four in five Vatican priests are gay, book claims," *The Guardian*, 12 February 2019. <https://www.theguardian.com/world/2019/feb/12/four-in-five-vatican-priests-are-gay-book-claims>.
- ⁴³ Bradley Eli, "The Lavender Mafia Unmasked," ChurchMilitant.com. 24 January 2019, <https://www.ChurchMilitant.com/news/article/the-lavender-mafia-unmasked>.
- ⁴⁴ Andrew Sullivan, "The Gay Church," *New York*. 21 January 2019. <https://nymag.com/intelligencer/2019/01/gay-priests-catholic-church.html>.
- ⁴⁵ Gene Thomas Gomulka, "Exposed: Shocking New Allegations in Lawsuit against Cardinal Dolan and North American College," YouTube.com. 28 June 2021. <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=zyCil5kPTkI>.
- ⁴⁶ Gene Thomas Gomulka, "Summer of Shame 2021: U.S. and Vatican Bishops Drowning in Sexual Predation Scandal," YouTube.com. <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=RgcvbQvO5ek>.
- ⁴⁷ Pete Baklinski, "High-ranking priest caught in cocaine-fueled gay orgy in Vatican apartment," LifeSiteNews.com. 6 July 2017. <https://www.LifeSiteNews.com/news/high-ranking-monsignor-with-link-to-pope-francis-caught-in-cocaine-fueled-g/>.
- ⁴⁸ Maike Hickson and John-Henry Westen, "Source: Vatican cardinal was at drug-fueled homosexual party, and Pope knows it," LifeSiteNews.com. 10 October 2018. <https://www.LifeSiteNews.com/news/source-vatican-cardinal-was-at-drug-fueled-homosexual-party-and-pope-knows/>.

-
- ⁴⁹ Joseph M. Hanneman, "Videos allegedly show Illinois priests engaged in homosexual acts," *The Catholic World Report*. 4 October 2018. <https://www.catholicworldreport.com/2018/10/04/videos-allegedly-show-illinois-priests-engaged-in-homosexual-acts/>.
- ⁵⁰ Gene Thomas Gomulka, Letter to Bishop Thomas Paprocki. 9 July 2021. www.gomulka.net/Paprocki.pdf.
- ⁵¹ Muri Assunção, "Brazilian bishop resigns 4 days after video that appears to show him masturbating goes viral," *New York Daily News*. 18 August 2021. <https://www.nydailynews.com/news/world/ny-brazilian-bishop-resigns-video-masturbating-dom-tome-rio-preto-sao-paulo-20210818-inrnjffhqrainj27dqzkrx2pq-story.html>.
- ⁵² Michael Haynes, "Brazilian bishop resigns after video shows him 'half-naked' on call with man," LifeSiteNews.com. 18 August 2021. <https://www.LifeSiteNews.com/news/brazilian-bishop-resigns-after-video-shows-him-half-naked-on-call-with-man/>.
- ⁵³ Joshua McElwee, "Cardinal Tobin joins Cupich on Vatican's influential Congregation for Bishops," *National Catholic Reporter*. 4 March 2021. <https://www.ncronline.org/news/people/cardinal-tobin-joins-cupich-vaticans-influential-congregation-bishops>.
- ⁵⁴ Tom Kington, "80 per cent of Vatican priests gay, says writer Frédéric Martel," *The Times*. 13 February 2019. <https://www.thetimes.co.uk/article/80-per-cent-of-vatican-priests-gay-says-writer-fr-d-ric-martel-30d8m65fw>.
- ⁵⁵ Claire Chretien, "Two Chicago priests arrested for public sex in Miami," LifeSiteNews.com. 4 September 2018. <https://www.LifeSiteNews.com/news/breaking-chicago-priests-arrested-for-public-oral-sex-in-miami/>.
- ⁵⁶ Matthew Cullinan Hoffman, "Pastor of Chicago's first 'gay' Catholic parish was found dead attached to 'sex machine,'" LifeSiteNews.com. 28 September 2018. <https://www.LifeSiteNews.com/news/pastor-of-chicagos-first-gay-catholic-parish-was-found-dead-attached-to-sex/>.
- ⁵⁷ Gene Thomas Gomulka, "Is Msgr. Burrill the Tip of the Iceberg?" *Crisis Magazine*. 28 July 2021. <https://www.crisismagazine.com/2021/is-msgr-burrill-the-tip-of-the-iceberg>.
- ⁵⁸ The Pillar, "Pillar Investigates: USCCB gen sec Burrill resigns after sexual misconduct allegations," Pillarcatholic.com. 20 July 2021. <https://www.pillarcatholic.com/p/pillar-investigates-usccb-gen-sec>.
- ⁵⁹ The Pillar, "Newark archdiocese to investigate app use allegations," Pillarcatholic.com. 23 July 2021. <https://www.pillarcatholic.com/p/newark-archdiocese-to-investigate>.
- ⁶⁰ Barbie Nadeau, "Rome's Subculture of Gay Priests Rocks the Vatican," *Newsweek*. 27 July 2010. <https://www.newsweek.com/romes-subculture-gay-priests-rocks-vatican-74397>.
- ⁶¹ Josh Jackman, "A priest who was filmed having gay sex on a church altar has been suspended," *Pink News*. 2 July 2018. <https://www.pinknews.co.uk/2018/07/02/gay-sex-priest-church-altar-personal-leave/>.
- ⁶² En.news, "Swiss Former Vicar General Appeared Naked On Gay Dating Site," Gloria.tv. 21 July 2020. <https://gloria.tv/post/M4evTJ1RsC4z4hUaDLqh4NQMd>.
- ⁶³ John Hooper, "Sex, lies and videotape: turmoil at the Vatican," *The Guardian*. 15 October 2007. <https://www.theguardian.com/world/2007/oct/15/italy.catholicism>.
- ⁶⁴ Frances D'emilio, "Vatican suspends prelate after TV records advances," *The Spokesman-Review*. 14 October 2007. <https://www.spokesman.com/stories/2007/oct/14/vatican-suspends-prelate-after-tv-records-advances/>.
- ⁶⁵ The Week, "The Vatican's gay hooker scandal," Theweek.com. 8 January 2015. <https://theweek.com/articles/496279/vaticans-gay-hooker-scandal>.

-
- ⁶⁶ Rachel Domadio, "Vatican Enmeshed in Gay Sex Allegations," *The New York Times*. 4 March 2010. <https://www.nytimes.com/2010/03/05/world/europe/05vatican.html>.
- ⁶⁷ La Repubblica, "Sesso e carriera, i ricatti in Vaticano dietro la rinuncia di Benedetto XVI," *Repubblica.it*. 21 February 2013. https://www.repubblica.it/esteri/2013/02/21/news/ricatti_vaticano-53080655/?ref=HREC1-4.
- ⁶⁸ Alexander Abad-Santos, "Did a Secret Vatican Report on Gay Sex and Blackmail Bring Down the Pope?" *The Atlantic*. 22 February 2013. <https://www.theatlantic.com/international/archive/2013/02/secret-vatican-report/318079/>.
- ⁶⁹ Martin Coulter, "Dossier of 40 'actively gay' priests sent to the Vatican by male escort," *Evening Standard*. 4 March 2018, <https://www.standard.co.uk/news/world/dossier-of-40-actively-gay-priests-sent-to-the-vatican-by-male-escort-a3781126.html>.
- ⁷⁰ Michael Day, "Vatileaks scandal: Vatican properties 'used as brothels and massage parlours where priests pay for sex,' claims report," *Independent*. 10 November 2015. <https://www.independent.co.uk/news/world/europe/vatileaks-scandal-vatican-properties-used-brothels-and-massage-parlours-where-priests-pay-sex-claims-report-a6729251.html>.
- ⁷¹ Barbie Latza Nadeau, "The Vatican's Swiss Guards Break Up a Drug-Fueled Gay Orgy in Pope Francis' Backyard," *Daily Beast*. 7 July 2017. <https://www.thedailybeast.com/the-vaticans-swiss-guards-break-up-a-drug-fueled-gay-orgy-in-pope-francis-backyard>.
- ⁷² Michael Day, "Pope's bank clean-up man 'found stuck in lift with rent boy'," *Independent*. 5 October 2015. <https://www.independent.co.uk/news/world/europe/pope-s-bank-clean-man-found-stuck-lift-rent-boy-8721296.html>.
- ⁷³ Harriet Sherwood, "Four in five Vatican priests are gay, book claims," *The Guardian*, 12 February 2019. <https://www.theguardian.com/world/2019/feb/12/four-in-five-vatican-priests-are-gay-book-claims>.
- ⁷⁴ The Washington Post, "Archbishop Carlo Maria Viganò gives his first extended interview since calling on the pope to resign," *Washingtonpost.com*. 10 June 2019. https://www.washingtonpost.com/world/europe/archbishop-carlo-maria-vigano-gives-his-first-extended-interview-since-calling-on-the-pope-to-resign/2019/06/10/00205748-8b79-11e9-b08e-cfd89bd36d4e_story.html
- ⁷⁵ Carlo Maria Viganò, "Testimony," *The Wall Street Journal*. 22 August 2018. <https://online.wsj.com/media/Viganos-letter.pdf>.
- ⁷⁶ Lisa Bourne, "Openly pro-LGBT bishop: There's no 'gay subculture' in my U.S. diocese," *LifeSiteNews.com*. 16 January 2019. <https://www.LifeSiteNews.com/news/openly-pro-lgbt-bishop-theres-no-gay-subculture-in-my-u.s.-diocese/>.
- ⁷⁷ Doug Mainwaring, "Pro-gay prelates Cupich, Tobin, McElroy attack Archbishop Viganò's credibility," *LifeSiteNews.com*. 28 August 2018. <https://www.lifesitenews.com/blogs/pro-gay-prelates-cupich-tobin-mcelroy-attack-archbishop-viganos-credibility/>.
- ⁷⁸ Trey Elmore, "NJ Cardinal gives Blessing to LGBT Pilgrimage to Cathedral," *ChurchMilitant.com*. 20 April 2017. <https://www.ChurchMilitant.com/news/article/cardinal-tobin-green-lights-gay-pilgrimage-at-cathedral-basilica-in-newark>.
- ⁷⁹ Catholic News Agency, "Bishop Morlino: 'Homosexual subculture' is source of 'devastation' in the Church," *The Oklahoman*. 18 August 2018. <https://www.oklahoman.com/article/feed/4969896/bishop-morlino-homosexual-subculture-is-source-of-devastation-in-the-church>
- ⁸⁰ Catholic News Service, "A.W. Richard Sipe, researcher, expert on clergy sex abuse, dies at 85," *America*. 17 August 2018. <https://www.americamagazine.org/faith/2018/08/17/aw-richard-sipe-researcher-expert-clergy-sex-abuse-dies-85>.

-
- ⁸¹ Francis X. Rocca, "The Tense Debate Over Gay Priests," *The Wall Street Journal*. 17 January 2019. <https://www.wsj.com/articles/the-tense-debate-over-gay-priests-11547743698>
- ⁸² Catholic News Service, "N.Y. Times talks to men who received settlements after alleged abuse by Cardinal McCarrick," *America*. 16 July 2018. <https://www.americamagazine.org/faith/2018/07/16/ny-times-talks-men-who-received-settlements-after-alleged-abuse-cardinal-mccarrick>.
- ⁸³ Rick Fitzgibbons, "Anyone who blames abuse crisis on 'clericalism' is part of the abuse crisis cover-up: Psychiatrist." LifeSiteNews.com. 12 September 2018. <https://www.lifesitenews.com/opinion/anyone-who-blames-abuse-crisis-on-clericalism-is-part-of-the-abuse-crisis-c/>.
- ⁸⁴ Center for Applied Research in the Apostolate, "Frequently Requested Church Statistics," CARA. Accessed 13 September 2021. <http://cara.georgetown.edu/frequently-requested-church-statistics/>.
- ⁸⁵ New Oxford Review, "What Is It About the American College of Louvain?" NewOxfordReview.org. July/August 2003. <https://www.newoxfordreview.org/documents/what-is-it-about-the-american-college-of-louvain/>.
- ⁸⁶ Giana Magnoli, "Files Finally Made Public in Sex-Abuse Case Involving St. Anthony's Seminary," *Noozhawk*. 25 May 2012. https://www.noozhawk.com/article/052412_franciscan_sex_abuse_case_files_released.
- ⁸⁷ George Jahn, "Austrian Seminary Shut Down," *The Washington Post*. 13 August 2004. <https://www.washingtonpost.com/archive/politics/2004/08/13/austrian-seminary-shut-down/fdb46767-353d-47ff-989d-39e27c7928de/>.
- ⁸⁸ Associated Press, "Missouri Diocese to Close Seminary," *Apnews.com*. 19 April 2002. <https://apnews.com/article/59012dd61f214d780ae777b48d085b09>.
- ⁸⁹ Christine Niles, "Traditional Detroit Priest Categorically Denies Abuse Allegation," *ChurchMilitant.com*. 8 July 2019. <https://www.churchmilitant.com/news/article/traditional-detroit-priest-categorically-denies-abuse-allegations>.
- ⁹⁰ Christine Niles, "Casa Jesus: Gay Seminarian Pipeline Set Up by Cdl. Bernardin," *ChurchMilitant.com*. 5 September 2018. <https://www.churchmilitant.com/news/article/chicago-cdl.-cupich-waited-a-month-before-removing-child-porn-priest>.
- ⁹¹ Christine Niles, "FBI Arrests Buffalo Seminary Professor for Death Threat," *ChurchMilitant.com*. 13 February 2020. <https://www.churchmilitant.com/news/article/fbi-arrests-buffalo-seminary-prof-for-death-threat>.
- ⁹² Rod Meloni, "S S Cyril and Methodius Seminary to close after more than a century," *ClickOnDetroit.com*. 2 July 2021. <https://www.clickondetroit.com/news/local/2021/07/02/s-s-cyrl-and-methodius-seminary-to-close-after-more-than-a-decade/>.
- ⁹³ Kate Wells, "Three men accuse prominent Michigan priest, Polish seminary leader of sexual abuse," *MichiganRadio.org*. 14 December 2020. <https://www.michiganradio.org/post/three-men-accuse-prominent-michigan-priest-polish-seminary-leader-sexual-abuse>.
- ⁹⁴ Edwin F. O'Brien, "Statement of Archbishop Edwin F. O'Brien to the Priest Chaplains of the Archdiocese for the Military Services on the 'Scandal Studies'," *BishopAccountability.org*. 18 February 2004. https://www.bishop-accountability.org/usccb/natureandscope/dioceses/reports/milarch_rpt.pdf.
- ⁹⁵ Rod Dreher, "The Two Faces Of Cardinal O'Brien," *The American Conservative*. 27 August 2018. <https://www.theamericanconservative.com/dreher/cardinal-edwin-obrien-ron-belgau-gay-seminarians-catholic/>.
- ⁹⁶ Paul Pringle, "Trail of Abuse Leads to Seminary," *Los Angeles Times*. 17 November 2005. <https://www.latimes.com/archives/la-xpm-2005-nov-17-me-stjohns17-story.html>.

-
- ⁹⁷ K. E. Colombini, "The Last of the Junior Seminarians," *Crisis Magazine*, 22 March 2017. <https://www.crisismagazine.com/2017/last-junior-seminarians>.
- ⁹⁸ United States Conference of Catholic Bishops, "Charter for the Protection of Children and Young People," USCCB.org. June 2018. [https://www.usccb.org/test/upload/Charter-for-the-Protection-of-Children-and-Young-People-2018-final\(1\).pdf](https://www.usccb.org/test/upload/Charter-for-the-Protection-of-Children-and-Young-People-2018-final(1).pdf).
- ⁹⁹ Inés San Martín, "Vatican reiterates that homosexuals shouldn't be priests," CRUX. 7 December 2016. <https://cruxnow.com/global-church/2016/12/vatican-reiterates-homosexuals-shouldnt-priests/>.
- ¹⁰⁰ Frédéric Martel, "Grindr, blackmail and confession: The life of a gay seminarian," *The Irish Times*. 2 March 2019. <https://www.irishtimes.com/culture/books/grindr-blackmail-and-confession-the-life-of-a-gay-seminarian-1.3808475>
- ¹⁰¹ Newsmax, "Homosexual Culture Undercuts Priesthood," Newsmax.com. 4 April 2002. <https://www.newsmax.com/pre-2008/homosexual-culture-undercuts-priesthood/2002/04/04/id/666569/>.
- ¹⁰² Gene Thomas Gomulka, "Survival of the Least Fit," ChurchMilitant.com. 27 September 2022. <https://www.churchmilitant.com/news/article/survival-of-the-least-fit>.
- ¹⁰³ Gene Thomas Gomulka, "Is Msgr. Burrill the Tip of the Iceberg?" *Crisis Magazine*. 28 July 2021. <https://www.crisismagazine.com/2021/is-msgr-burrill-the-tip-of-the-iceberg>.
- ¹⁰⁴ Jules Gomes, "Faithful Bishop Quits," ChurchMilitant.com. 17 March 2020. <https://www.churchmilitant.com/news/article/heretical-prelate-forces-faithful-bishop-to-resign>.
- ¹⁰⁵ Jules Gomes, "Godly Bishop Quits as Pope Bows to LGBT Mob," ChurchMilitant.com. 24 August 2021. <https://natalia.churchmilitant.com/news/article/godly-bishop-quits-as-pope-bows-to-lgbt-mob>.
- ¹⁰⁶ Jules Gomes, "Victims Shame Pope Over 'Marx Pantomime'," ChurchMilitant.com. 19 June 2021. <https://www.churchmilitant.com/news/article/victims-shame-pope-over-marx-pantomime>.
- ¹⁰⁷ Robert Shine, "German Cardinal, Key Bishop Endorse Church Blessings for LGBTQ Couples," *New Ways Ministry*. 3 January 2020. <https://www.newwaysministry.org/2020/01/03/german-cardinal-key-bishop-endorse-church-blessings-for-lgbtq-couples/>.
- ¹⁰⁸ Peter, "Two German Bishops Advocate for Change in Church Teaching on Homosexuality." ComplicitClergy.com. 6 February 2020. <https://www.complicitclergy.com/2020/02/06/two-german-bishops-advocate-for-change-in-church-teaching-on-homosexuality/>.
- ¹⁰⁹ Geir Moulson, "Pope rejects German archbishop's resignation over abuse," *Associated Press*. 15 September 2021. <https://apnews.com/article/lifestyle-travel-religion-germany-sexual-abuse-by-clergy-e00e4833e1b3b9dbdfc17aa2c4dca422>.
- ¹¹⁰ Maike Hickson, "Source: Pope blocked investigation of abuse allegations against cardinal who helped elect him," LifeSiteNews.com. 24 September 2018. <https://www.lifesitenews.com/blogs/source-pope-blocked-investigation-of-abuse-allegations-against-cardinal-who/>.
- ¹¹¹ Liz Dodd, "English seminary responds to gay clique allegations," *The Tablet*. 23 October 2018. <https://www.thetablet.co.uk/news/10908/english-seminary-responds-to-gay-clique-allegations>.
- ¹¹² Gene Thomas Gomulka, "Clerical Abuse and Misconduct: Diocese of Springfield in Illinois," Gomulka.net. Accessed on 14 September 2021. <https://ww.gomulka.net/Springfield.pdf>
- ¹¹³ Diogenes, "The other Springfield," *Catholic Culture*. 15 March 2005. <https://www.catholicculture.org/commentary/other-springfield/>.

-
- ¹¹⁴ Mike Frazier, "Priest is Pulled out of Ministry," *Herald & Review*. 3 August 2006. https://herald-review.com/news/local/priest-is-pulled-out-of-ministry/article_2630f583-b66d-5961-a77d-531bfe9bf116.html.
- ¹¹⁵ Sylvia's Site, "Renken: Monsignor John Renken," *TheInquiry.ca*. Accessed on 14 September 2021. <https://www.theinquiry.ca/wordpress/accused/charged/renken-john-monsignor-john-renken/>.
- ¹¹⁶ Joseph M. Hanneman, "Bp. Daniel Ryan a study in corruption, deceit and cover-up," *ChurchMilitant .com*. 6 January 2020. <https://www.churchmilitant.com/news/article/false-shepherd-part-i>.
- ¹¹⁷ Kristen Lombardi, "Outing Cardinal Egan," *The Village Voice*. 31 January 2006. <https://www.villagevoice.com/2006/01/31/outing-cardinal-egan/>.
- ¹¹⁸ Thomas Hargrove and Michelle Sheldone, "Palm Beach Diocese Has One of Nation's Worst Records," *TCPalm*. 5 October 2006. https://www.bishop-accountability.org/news2006/09_10/2006_10_05_Hargrove_PalmBeach.htm.
- ¹¹⁹ Christine Niles, "Cardinal Dolan Caught," *ChurchMilitant.com*. 17 July 2021. <https://www.churchmilitant.com/news/article/cardinal-dolan-caught>
- ¹²⁰ BBC News, "Cardinals Dolan and Mahony quizzed on child abuse," *BBC.com*. 21 February 2013. <https://www.bbc.com/news/world-us-canada-21539070>.
- ¹²¹ The Editorial Board, "Cardinal Dolan and the Sex Abuse Scandal," *The New York Times*. 3 July 2013. <https://www.nytimes.com/2013/07/04/opinion/cardinal-dolan-and-the-sex-abuse-scandal.html>
- ¹²² The Vortex, "Persecuted Seminarian Summit," *ChurchMilitant.com*. 19 July 2021. <https://www.churchmilitant.com/video/episode/vortex-persecuted-seminarian-summit>.
- ¹²³ Gene Thomas Gomulka, "Exposed: Shocking New Allegations in Lawsuit against Cardinal Dolan and North American College," *YouTube.com*. 28 June 2021. <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=zyCil5kPTkI>.
- ¹²⁴ Congregation for the Doctrine of the Faith, "Letter To The Bishops Of The Catholic Church on the Pastoral Care of Homosexual Persons," *Vatican.va*. 1 October 1986. https://www.vatican.va/roman_curia/congregations/cfaith/documents/rc_con_cfaith_doc_19861001_homosexual-persons_en.html.
- ¹²⁵ Ross Benes, "How the Catholic Priesthood Became an Unlikely Haven for Many Gay Men," *Slate*. 20 April 2017. <https://slate.com/human-interest/2017/04/how-the-catholic-priesthood-became-a-haven-for-many-gay-men.html>.
- ¹²⁶ Derek Scally, "Ex-Swiss guard complains of sexual advances in Vatican," *The Irish Times*. 8 January 2014. <https://www.irishtimes.com/news/world/europe/ex-swiss-guard-complains-of-sexual-advances-in-vatican-1.1647562>.
- ¹²⁷ Lizzy Davies, "Swiss Guard veteran claims existence of 'gay network' at the Vatican," *The Guardian*. 20 January 2014. <https://www.theguardian.com/world/2014/jan/20/swiss-guard-veteran-gay-network-vatican-pope-elmar-mader-homosexual>.
- ¹²⁸ Elizabeth Dias, "'It Is Not a Closet. It Is a Cage.' Gay Catholic Priests Speak Out," *The New York Times*, 17 February 2019. <https://www.nytimes.com/2019/02/17/us/it-is-not-a-closet-it-is-a-cage-gay-catholic-priests-speak-out.html>.
- ¹²⁹ Laurie Goodstein, "Ex-Archbishop Speaks About Catholic Church and Homosexuality," *The New York Time*. 14 May 2009. <https://www.nytimes.com/2009/05/15/us/15weakland.html>.
- ¹³⁰ Brian Kates, "Dolan's predecessor, Milwaukee priest Rembert Weakland, admits he's gay in memoir," *Daily News*. 12 May 2009. <https://www.nydailynews.com/news/world/dolan-predecessor-milwaukee-priest-rembert-weakland-admits-gay-memoir-article-1.377441>.

¹³¹ Rod Dreher, "The Elephant Remains In The Sacristy," *The American Conservative*. 24 July 2018. <https://www.theamericanconservative.com/dreher/gay-priests-catholic-elephant-is-still-in-the-sacristy/>.

¹³² Avner Seror and Rohit Ticku, "Legalized Same-Sex Marriage and Coming Out in America: Evidence from Catholic Seminaries." *Chapman University Digital Commons*. 20 April 2021. https://digitalcommons.chapman.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=1344&context=esi_working_papers.

¹³³ Frédéric Martel, "Excerpt: 'In the Closet of the Vatican'," *National Catholic Reporter*. 18 February 2019. <https://www.ncronline.org/news/accountability/excerpt-closet-vatican>.

¹³⁴ Catholic News Agency, "Chicago archdiocese announces nearly two dozen parish mergers, closings," *CatholicNewsAgency.com*. 10 February 2020. <https://www.catholicnewsagency.com/news/43529/chicago-archdiocese-announces-nearly-two-dozen-parish-mergers-closings>.

¹³⁵ Gene Thomas Gomulka, Letter to Catholic News Agency," *Gomulka.net*. 21 July 2021, <https://www.gomulka.net/CNA.pdf>

¹³⁶ Mel Gibson, "Mel Gibson Endorses Coalition for Canceled Priests." YouTube.com. 10 September 2021. <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=XjWjuEjs5sE>

¹³⁷ Elizabeth Scalia, "How to Restore a Church in Scandal?" *WordOnFire.org*. 2 August 2018. <https://www.wordonfire.org/resources/blog/how-to-restore-a-church-in-scandal-begin-with-a-collective-confession/21499/>

¹³⁸ Amazon Book Reviews, *Goodbye, Good Men* by Michael S. Rose, Amazon.com. Accessed on 14 September 2021. <https://www.amazon.com/Goodbye-Good-Men-Liberals-Corruption/dp/1621574261>.

¹³⁹ Rape, Abuse & Incest National Network, "The Criminal Justice System: Statistics," RAINN.org. Accessed 14 September 2021. <https://www.rainn.org/statistics/criminal-justice-system>.

¹⁴⁰ John Roe 4, "Application To Amend Complaint To Identify Fictitious Defendants," *Superior Court of the State of California*. 27 August 2004. https://www.bishop-accountability.org/complaints/2004_08_27_John_Roe_4_v_Does_Santa_Barbara.htm.

¹⁴¹ Christine Niles, "The Spiritual Ruins of Detroit," *ChurchMilitant.com*. 21 July 2015. <https://www.churchmilitant.com/news/article/the-church-in-detroit-paving-the-way-for-evil>.

¹⁴² Michael S. Rose, "The Roots of the Scandal," *Catholic World Report*. 24 May 2002. <https://freerepublic.com/focus/news/689215/posts>.

¹⁴³ Mike Shea, "This Awful Seminary," *DOR Catholic*. 13 October 2009. <http://doratholic.blogspot.com/2009/10/awful-seminary.html>.

¹⁴⁴ Tom Roberts, "The 'had it' Catholics," *National Catholic Reporter*. 11 October 2010. <https://www.ncronline.org/news/parish/had-it-catholics>.

¹⁴⁵ Rod Dreher, "Inside The Seminary Closet." *The American Conservative*, 22 August 2018. <https://www.theamericanconservative.com/dreher/gay-catholic-inside-the-seminary-closet>.

¹⁴⁶ Christine Niles, "Casa Jesus: Gay Seminarian Pipeline Set Up by Cdl. Bernardin," *ChurchMilitant.com*. 5 September 2018. <https://www.churchmilitant.com/news/article/chicago-cdl.-cupich-waited-a-month-before-removing-child-porn-priest>.

¹⁴⁷ Alleged Victim, Correspondence Reporting Abuse. Accessed online on 14 September 2021. https://drive.google.com/file/d/17C9CxT29pwHlxTH1TN_qjVsjuX4koT60/view.

¹⁴⁸ Chico Harlan and Stefano Pitrelli, "A teen was accused of abuse inside Vatican City. Powerful church figures helped him become a priest," *The Washington Post*. 12 July 2021. <https://www.bishop->

[accountability.org/2021/07/a-teen-was-accused-of-abuse-inside-vatican-city-powerful-church-figures-helped-him-become-a-priest/](https://www.accountability.org/2021/07/a-teen-was-accused-of-abuse-inside-vatican-city-powerful-church-figures-helped-him-become-a-priest/).

¹⁴⁹ Ryszard Biernat, "Secret Recordings of Bishop Richard Malone," WKBW.com. 4 September 2019. <https://www.wkbw.com/news/i-team/the-malone-recordings>.

¹⁵⁰ Christine Niles, "Buffalo Priests Suspended Over 'Repulsive' Pornographic Talk," ChurchMilitant.com. 30 April 2019. <https://www.churchmilitant.com/news/article/buffalo-priests-suspended-over-repulsive-sexual-talk>.

¹⁵¹ Stephen Wynne, "Boston Seminary Rector Forced Out Amid Homosexual Abuse Probe," ChurchMilitant.com. 31 December 2018. <https://www.churchmilitant.com/news/article/st-johns-seminary-rector-forced-out-amid-abuse-probe>.

¹⁵² Christine Niles, "Boston Seminary Investigation Confirms Sexual Misconduct," ChurchMilitant.com. 25 November 2019. <https://www.churchmilitant.com/news/article/boston-seminaries-investigation-confirms-sexual-misconduct>.

¹⁵³ Kristina Davis and Teri Figueroa, "Carlsbad priest found guilty of groping seminary student," The San Diego Union-Tribune. 17 December 2018. <https://www.sandiegouniontribune.com/news/courts/sd-me-verdict-priest-20181217-story.html>.

¹⁵⁴ Marsha Macpherson, "Paris court convicts former Vatican envoy of sexual assault," *Associated Press*. 16 December 2020. <https://apnews.com/article/sex-scandals-paris-trials-sexual-assault-france-86899b86f998a7979f893f4cf109d799>.

¹⁵⁵ Robert O'Harrow Jr. and Shawn Boburg, "Warnings about West Virginia bishop went unheeded as he doled out cash gifts to Catholic leaders," *The Washington Post*. 3 July 2019. https://www.washingtonpost.com/investigations/warnings-about-wva-bishop-went-unheeded-as-he-doled-out-cash-gifts-to-catholic-leaders-/2019/07/03/7efa27f4-8d4c-11e9-b162-8f6f41ec3c04_story.html.

¹⁵⁶ Tony Kennedy, "Former seminarian accuses Nienstedt of retaliation over rejected advance," *Star Tribune*. 20 June 2015. <https://www.startribune.com/former-seminarian-accuses-nienstedt-of-retaliation-over-rebuff/308571111/>.

¹⁵⁷ Kate Wells, "Three men accuse prominent Michigan priest, Polish seminary leader of sexual abuse," MichiganRadio.org. 14 December 2020. <https://www.michiganradio.org/post/three-men-accuse-prominent-michigan-priest-polish-seminary-leader-sexual-abuse>.

¹⁵⁸ Gene Thomas Gomulka, "Letter to the Supreme Knight," Gomulka.net. 11 August 2021. <https://www.gomulka.net/SupremeKnight.pdf>.

¹⁵⁹ Vicky Nguyen, "Meth Pipe, Sex Toys Found in Room of Priest Accused of Raping Seminarian at Livermore Church," *NBC Bay Area*. 22 March 2019. <https://www.nbcbayarea.com/news/local/meth-pipe-sex-toys-found-in-room-of-priest-accused-of-raping-seminarian-at-livermore-church/2525/>.

¹⁶⁰ Kirsten Grieshaber, "German Catholics to bless gay unions despite Vatican ban," *The San Diego Union-Tribune*. 10 May 2021.

¹⁶¹ Emily Mangiaracina, "Seminarian ousted after reporting his imposed spiritual director's remarks about homosexuality," LifeSiteNews.com. 8 July 2021. <https://www.lifesitenews.com/news/seminarian-ousted-after-stating-his-forced-spiritual-director-praised-homosexuality/>.

¹⁶² Letitia James, "Complaint against Diocese of Buffalo et al." Supreme Court of the State of New York. 23 November 2020. <https://www.documentcloud.org/documents/20415889-ag-report-on-buffalo-diocese>.

¹⁶³ BBC News, "Disgraced Cardinal Keith O'Brien to leave Scotland for 'prayer and penance'." BBC.com. 15 May 2013. <https://www.bbc.com/news/uk-scotland-22542597>.

¹⁶⁴ Corky Siemaszko, "Tennessee pastor breaks silence about Catholic priest accused of child abuse." *NBC News*. 4 June 2021. <https://www.yahoo.com/now/tennessee-pastor-confesses-kept-silent-235645243.html>.

¹⁶⁵ The Irish News, "Bishop accused of sexual misconduct with seminarians resigns," *IrishNews.com*. 20 July 2018. <https://www.irishnews.com/news/worldnews/2018/07/21/news/bishop-accused-of-sexual-misconduct-with-seminarians-resigns-1387727/>.

¹⁶⁶ Inés San Martín, "Victims recount sexual abuse horrors in Chilean seminary." *CRUX*. 7 August 2018. <https://cruxnow.com/global-church/2018/08/victims-recount-sexual-abuse-horrors-in-chilean-seminary/>.

¹⁶⁷ Sarah Mac Donald, "Ireland's national seminary must 'change if it is to survive'." *The Tablet*. 10 January 2018. <https://www.thetablet.co.uk/news/8376/ireland-s-national-seminary-must-change-if-it-is-to-survive->.

¹⁶⁸ Inés San Martín, "Ex-seminarian's struggle shows 'overlapping jurisdictions' gap in abuse crisis." *CRUX*. 6 June 2019. <https://cruxnow.com/church-in-the-usa/2019/06/ex-seminarians-struggle-shows-overlapping-jurisdictions-gap-in-abuse-crisis/>.

¹⁶⁹ Inés San Martín, "Argentine prelate, friend of Pope Francis faces trial for sexual abuse." *CRUX*. 7 August 2021. <https://cruxnow.com/church-in-the-americas/2021/08/argentine-prelate-friend-of-pope-francis-faces-trial-for-sexual-abuse/>.

¹⁷⁰ Jenn Abelson et al. "Catholic bishops promised reform in sex-abuse scandal. But they didn't look at their own misdeeds." *The Boston Globe*. 3 November 2018. <https://www.bostonglobe.com/metro/2018/11/03/bishops/qVYEiZ5SY5wVzCgA3gvN5O/story.html>.

¹⁷¹ Eric Morales, "Watchdog group alleges Pope Francis covered up sex abuse." *SNAP*. 7 July 2014. https://www.snapnetwork.org/watchdog_group_alleges_pope_francis_covered_up_sex_abuse.

¹⁷² Rod Dreher, "The Two Faces Of Cardinal O'Brien," *The American Conservative*. 27 August 2018. <https://www.theamericanconservative.com/dreher/cardinal-edwin-obrien-ron-belgau-gay-seminarians-catholic/>.

¹⁷³ Tom McFeely, "U.S. Seminary Report Released." *National Catholic Register*. 15 January 2009. <https://www.ncregister.com/blog/u-s-seminary-report-released>.

¹⁷⁴ Jay McNally, "Benedict's Letter Cites Porn Scandal at Detroit Seminary." *ChurchMilitant.com*. 12 April 2019. <https://www.churchmilitant.com/news/article/benedicts-letter-cites-porn-scandal-at-detroit-seminary1>.

¹⁷⁵ Church Militant, "Episcopal Sodomy: Exposing Cdl. Edwin O'Brien." *ChurchMilitant.com*. 23 August 2018. <https://www.churchmilitant.com/news/article/episcopal-sodomy-exposing-cdl.-edwin-obrien>.

¹⁷⁶ Anthony G. Attrino, "Priest accused of using church funds to pay for sex found dead in N.J. home." *N.J.com*. 11 July 2020. <https://www.nj.com/ocean/2020/07/priest-accused-of-using-church-funds-to-pay-for-sex-found-dead-in-nj-home.html>.

¹⁷⁷ Christine Niles, "Spotlight: NY's Cardinal Dolan Exposed." *ChurchMilitant.com*. 16 July 2021. <https://www.churchmilitant.com/news/article/spotlight-nys-cdl-dolan-exposed>.

¹⁷⁸ Christine Niles, "Cardinal Dolan Caught." *ChurchMilitant.com*. 17 July 2021. <https://www.churchmilitant.com/news/article/cardinal-dolan-caught>.

¹⁷⁹ Chris Hedges, "Documents Allege Abuse of Nuns by Priests." *The New York Times*. 21 March 2001. <https://www.nytimes.com/2001/03/21/world/documents-allege-abuse-of-nuns-by-priests.html>.

¹⁸⁰ Michael Betzold, "Sacred Heart Seminary: Ground Zero For Catholic Abuse Scandal In Detroit." *Deadline Detroit*. 25 February 2019. https://www.deadlinedetroit.com/articles/21735/sacred_heart_seminary_ground_zero_for_catholic_abuse_scandal_in_detroit.

-
- ¹⁸¹ Bishop Accountability, "Bishops Accused of Sexual Abuse and Misconduct." BishopAccountability.org. Accessed 15 September 2021.
- ¹⁸² Paul Sullins, "Is Catholic clergy sex abuse related to homosexual priests?" The Ruth Institute. 1 November 2018. <http://www.ruthinstitute.org/clergy-abuse-statistics>.
- ¹⁸³ Thomas Doyle et al. "The Problem of Sexual Molestation by Roman Catholic Clergy." Confidential Report. 9 June 1985. <https://www.documentcloud.org/documents/1216510-doyle-mouton-peterson-report-1985.html>.
- ¹⁸⁴ Vincent DeGeorge, "Can Baltimore's archbishop bring accountability to West Virginia's Catholic Church?" *Baltimore Sun*, 4 February 2019. https://www.bishop-accountability.org/news2019/01_02/2019_02_04_Vincent_Sun_Can_Church.htm.
- ¹⁸⁵ The Pillar, "Stika facing likely 'Vos estis' Vatican investigation." PillarCatholic.com. 23 April 2021. <https://www.pillaratholic.com/p/stika-facing-likely-vos-estis-investigation>.
- ¹⁸⁶ Michael Voris, "O'Malley Turns In Dolan for Abuse Cover-up." ChurchMilitant.com. 29 December 2018. <https://www.churchmilitant.com/news/article/breaking-omalley-turns-in-dolan-for-abuse-cover-up>
- ¹⁸⁷ Secretariat of State of the Holy See, "Report on the Holy See's Institutional Knowledge and Decision-Making Related to Former Cardinal Theodore Edgar McCarrick (1930 To 2017)." Vatican.va. 10 November 2020. https://www.vatican.va/resources/resources_rapporto-card-mccarrick_20201110_en.pdf.
- ¹⁸⁸ Claudia Lauer and Meghan Hoyer, "Hundreds of accused clergy left off church's sex abuse list." *Associated Press*. 27 December 2019. <https://apnews.com/article/ia-state-wire-ri-state-wire-pa-state-wire-ma-state-wire-in-state-wire-f6238fe6724bdf4f30a42ff7d11a327e>.
- ¹⁸⁹ The SACCADAS database is described, with related reports and publications on offer, at the website <http://victimsspeakdb.org/index.html>.
- ¹⁹⁰ Paul Sullins, "Receding Waves: Child Sex Abuse and Homosexual Priests since 2000." The Ruth Institute. 7 June 2019. <http://sullins.epizy.com/published%20articles/Receding%20Waves%202019.pdf?i=2>.
- ¹⁹¹ Regnerus, Mark, "Declining Homosexuality in the American Priesthood." *Public Discourse*. 31 October 2021. <https://www.thepublicdiscourse.com/2021/10/78773/>.
- ¹⁹² Thomas Doyle et al., "The Problem of Sexual Molestation by Roman Catholic Clergy: Meeting the Problem in a Comprehensive and Responsible Manner." 9 June 1985. <https://www.documentcloud.org/documents/1216510-doyle-mouton-peterson-report-1985.html>.
- ¹⁹³ Peter, "He Blew the Whistle on Sexual Abuse in 1985. Why Didn't We Listen? *Complicit Clergy*. 26 August 2021. <https://www.complicitclergy.com/2021/08/26/watch-he-blew-the-whistle-on-sexual-abuse-in-1985-why-didnt-we-listen/>.
- ¹⁹⁴ The Survivors Network of those Abused by Priests, "Tom Doyle." *SNAP*. 15 December 2015. https://www.snapnetwork.org/rlh_tom_doyle.
- ¹⁹⁵ William Mahoney, "NAC Official Resigning." ChurchMilitant.com. 3 August 2021. <https://www.churchmilitant.com/news/article/nac-official-resigning-amid-disgrace>.
- ¹⁹⁶ *Tampa Bay Times*, "Hundreds of Priests in the U.S. Die of Aids," Tampabay.com. 26 September 2005. <https://www.tampabay.com/archive/2000/01/30/hundreds-of-priests-in-the-u-s-die-of-aids/#:~:text=And%20many%20priests%20and%20medical,those%20estimates%20are%20too%20conservative>.
- ¹⁹⁷ Eugene T. Gomulka, "Home Alone in the Priesthood," *America*. 27 August 2001. <https://www.americamagazine.org/issue/323/article/home-alone-priesthood>.

¹⁹⁸ Gene Thomas Gomulka, Letter to Bishop Paprocki. Gomulka.net. July 25, 2021.
www.gomulka.net/Paprocki2.pdf

¹⁹⁹ Gene Thomas Gomulka, Letter to Patrick E. Kelly." Gomulka.net. 11 August 2021.
<https://www.gomulka.net/SupremeKnight.pdf>.

²⁰⁰ Andrew Brown, "In the Closet of the Vatican by Frédéric Martel review – power, homosexuality and hypocrisy." *The Guardian*. 21 February 2019. <https://www.theguardian.com/books/2019/feb/21/in-the-closet-of-the-vatican-by-frederic-martel-review>.

²⁰¹ Joe Feuerherd, "Keating recalls service on review board." *National Catholic Reporter*. 14 August 2009.
<https://www.ncronline.org/news/accountability/keating-recalls-service-review-board>.

²⁰² William Mahoney, "Self-Policing Seminaries." ChurchMilitant.com. 21 May 2021.
<https://www.churchmilitant.com/news/article/self-policing-seminaries>.

²⁰³ Sharon Otterman, "A.W. Richard Sipe, a Leading Expert on Clergy Sex Abuse, Dies at 85," *The New York Times*. 9 April 2018. <https://www.nytimes.com/2018/08/09/nyregion/aw-richard-sipe-a-leading-voice-on-clergy-sex-abuse-dies-at-85.html>.

²⁰⁴ Cristina Montemayor, "What Percentage of Men Cheat?" *Brides*. 17 May 2021.
<https://www.brides.com/what-percentage-of-men-cheat-5114527>.

²⁰⁵ *Tampa Bay Times*, "Hundreds of Priests in the U.S. Die of Aids," Tampabay.com. 26 September 2005.
<https://www.tampabay.com/archive/2000/01/30/hundreds-of-priests-in-the-u-s-die-of-aids/#:~:text=And%20many%20priests%20and%20medical,those%20estimates%20are%20too%20conservative.>

²⁰⁶ Sarah Nelson Glick et al., "A Comparison of Sexual Behavior Patterns Among Men Who Have Sex With Men and Heterosexual Men and Women," *JAIDS Journal of Acquired Immune Deficiency Syndrome*. 1 May 2012.
https://journals.lww.com/jaids/Fulltext/2012/05010/A_Comparison_of_Sexual_Behavior_Patterns_Among_Men.13.aspx.