## ADDRESSING THE PRESENT-DAY CULTURE OF SEXUAL PREDATION AND COVER-UPS IN U.S. SEMINARIES

### **First Edition**

## Gene Thomas Gomulka, CAPT, CHC, USN Ret.

Sexual abuse victims' advocate, investigative reporter, and screenwriter; former seminary formator and instructor with an S.T.L. from the Pontifical University of St. Thomas Aquinas in Rome; former Navy Chaplain/Captain (O6) and member of the U.S. Marine Corps Inspector General Team; ordained a priest for the Altoona-Johnstown Diocese and later made a Prelate of Honor (Monsignor) by St. Pope John Paul II

## September 17, 2021

### APPENDIX

Α.	LEGAL COMPLAINT OF GORGIA V. DOLAN ET AL.	2
В.	AFFIDAVIT OF FORMER FBI SPECIAL AGENT IN CHARGE KENNETH T. MCCABE	61
C.	AFFIDAVIT OF A SUBJECT OF FATHER ADAM PARK'S SEXUAL MISCONDUCT	78
D.	AFFIDAVIT OF FORMER SEMINARY FORMATOR GENE THOMAS GOMULKA	89
E.	A STUDY OF SEXUAL MISCONDUCT AND COVER-UP IN THE DIOCESE OF SPRINGFIELD IN ILLINOIS: THE CONTEXT THAT ENABLED FATHER PETER HARMAN	120
F.	NINE REPORTS OF SEXUAL MISCONDUCT AND COVER-UP RECEIVED BY EVERY U.S. ORDINARY, THE APOSTOLIC NUNCIATURE, THE NAC BOARD OF GOVERNORS, AND ARCHDIOCESE OF NEW YORK OFFICIALS	130
G.	FOUR REPORTS OF SEXUAL MISCONDUCT AND COVER-UP RECEIVED BY KNIGHTS OF COLUMBUS LEADERSHIP AND COUNCILS THROUGHOUT THE UNITED STATES	160

# APPENDIX A

LEGAL COMPLAINT OF ANTHONY J. GORGIA V. TIMOTHY DOLAN ET AL.

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 13

INDEX NO. 151501/2020 RECEIVED NYSCEF: 02/03/2021

SUPREME COURT OF THE STATE OF NEW YORK COUNTY OF RICHMOND -----X Index No.: 151501/2020

ANTHONY J. GORGIA,

VERIFIED COMPLAINT

Plaintiff,

-against-

TIMOTHY DOLAN, THE ROMAN CATHOLIC ARCHDIOCESE OF NEW YORK, ADAM PARK, PETER HARMAN, THE PONTIFICAL NORTH AMERICAN COLLEGE, JOHN GEARY McDONALD and "JOHN DOE-I" through "JOHN DOE-XXV,"

Defendants.

------

Plaintiff ANTHONY J. GORGIA, complaining of defendants, by his attorneys BELAIR & ASSOCIATES, P.C., states as follows:

#### THE PARTIES

1. Plaintiff ANTHONY J. GORGIA ("GORGIA") was at relevant times a seminarian employed by the ROMAN CATHOLIC ARCHDIOCESE OF NEW YORK ("ARCHDIOCESE") and a seminarian preparing for ordination for the ARCHDIOCESE at THE PONTIFICAL NORTH AMERICAN COLLEGE ("NAC") in Rome, Italy.

2. TIMOTHY DOLAN ("DOLAN") was at relevant times the Cardinal-Archbishop and chief executive officer of the ARCHDIOCESE. He is both an alumnus and former Rector of the NAC.

He is reported to have ignored complaints concerning sexual predation by the clergy, and to have "covered up" for such predation in the clergy in Missouri, Wisconsin and New York.

3. The ARCHDIOCESE is a corporation sole and a Latin Catholic archdiocese in New York State, established in 1850. The ARCHDIOCESE is vicariously liable for the acts of DOLAN and potentially other employees who participated in the acts upon which this action is based.

4. ADAM PARK ("PARK"), a NAC alumnus, was ordained a priest for the Archdiocese of Washington by Theodore McCarrick, an involuntarily laicized priest of the ARCHDIOCESE and a former Cardinal-Archbishop of the Archdiocese of Washington. PARK later served as priest-secretary to Cardinal-Archbishop Wuerl, whose resignation as Archbishop of Washington was accepted by the Holy See in October of 2018 amid allegations that Wuerl covered up for accused-predator priests. PARK was also formerly a chaplain to the Newman Catholic Center at George Washington University in Washington, D.C. At relevant times, and currently, PARK was the Vice-Rector of the NAC. He is and was at relevant times an active homosexual.

5. PETER HARMAN ("HARMAN") was ordained a priest for the Diocese of Springfield, Illinois, after being approved for ordination by his NAC rector who, at that time, was DOLAN. At

relevant times, and currently, HARMAN was Rector of the NAC. This position is regarded as a platform leading to an American bishopric. He is reported to have engaged in homosexual acts with other members of the clergy, including at least one bishop from the United States. While at the NAC, GORGIA was unaware of this.

6. The NAC is a Roman Catholic educational institution in Rome, Italy that prepares, inter alia, American seminarians from the ARCHDIOCESE for priestly ministry in the United States. The NAC was founded in 1859 and since 1884 has been under the oversight of the Holy See, currently through its Congregation for the Clergy. For most matters this oversight is delegated to the United States Conference of Catholic Bishops ("USCCB"). In turn the USCCB, exercising this delegated oversight, acts through the NAC's Committee for the North American College, Rome ("Committee"), which is comprised of one bishop from each of the fifteen episcopal regions in the United States. These fifteen members of the Committee serve three-year terms as the Board of Governors for a corporation called the American College of the Roman Catholic Church of the United States. The NAC is vicariously liable for the acts of PARK, HARMAN, JOHN GEARY McDONALD ("McDONALD") and, potentially, others at the NAC.

7. The ARCHDIOCESE, for well over a century, has been routinely and continually sending the elite of its seminarians, college graduates who have completed minor seminary (college) training, to the NAC, rather than to St. Joseph's Seminary, its diocesan seminary at Dunwoodie, New York ("Dunwoodie"). The NAC has been routinely and continuously accepting these seminarians, such as GORGIA, to the NAC for priestly formation for, *inter alia*, the ARCHDIOCESE for the same period of time.

8. These elite graduates of college seminaries in the United States are nominated by their ordinaries, usually bishops, for a four-year program of study and human formation to be ordained to the Catholic priesthood for, *inter alia*, the ARCHDIOCESE.

9. GORGIA was selected and nominated by his bishop, DOLAN, for acceptance to the NAC, which nomination was accepted by the NAC. DOLAN made this selection based upon the laudatory recommendations of GORGIA's faculty and formators at Cathedral Seminary House of Formation in Douglaston, New York, ("Douglaston")

10. JOHN GEARY McDONALD ("McDONALD") is a priest ordained for the Diocese of Birmingham, Alabama and, at relevant times, formation advisor for GORGIA at the NAC. He was a classmate of

PARK when both attended the NAC and at such time was known to have had a "close" relationship with PARK.

11. "JOHN DOES I through XXV" are intended to describe persons within the ARCHDIOCESE or the NAC, whose identities are not yet known, who participated in, collaborated in and/or were complicit in the tortious acts against GORGIA perpetrated by the named defendants set forth below.

#### JURISDICTION

12. This Court has subject matter jurisdiction over this action since no "ministerial exception" or any other exemption or exception exists as respects subject matter jurisdiction. This action does not concern issues of religious doctrine.

13. This Court has personal jurisdiction over defendants DOLAN and the ARCHDIOCESE in that DOLAN is a citizen and resident of the State of New York and the ARCHDIOCESE is a corporation sole, located in the State of New York.

14. This Court has jurisdiction over PARK, HARMAN, McDONALD and the NAC pursuant to CPLR §302(a) 1, 3(i) and 3(ii).

#### RELEVANT FACTS

15. GORGIA was raised on Staten Island, Richmond County, New York by his parents. Since his youth he desired to become a Catholic priest. Shortly before graduating as the valedictorian

of St. Joseph by the Sea High School on Staten Island, he declined a full scholarship to a secular university from which recipients receive financial and academic support to realize their leadership potential and graduate debt-free. The scholarship also came with a \$7,500 annual stipend. Had he not recognized a vocation to the priesthood, he would have accepted the scholarship and pursued a career in medicine.

16. With the goal of becoming a priest, GORGIA entered St. John's University where he graduated with a major in childhood education with minors in theology and philosophy. At St. John's University, he maintained a 4.0 grade point average, and graduated summa cum laude and first in his class. During these college years, he received the International Humanitarian and Peace Recognition Award in November of 2011 from "Grow To Strength," a humanitarian organization. This award came with a letter of recognition from DOLAN.

17. Thereafter, GORGIA was accepted as a seminarian for the ARCHDIOCESE on March 12, 2015. He undertook pre-theology studies at Douglaston where he was in attendance from August, 2015 through May, 2017. Throughout this time, he was highly regarded by his formators and peers for his outstanding performance. This is documented by the unanimous esteem of the faculty (Exhibits "A," "B," "C," and "D"). He continued to

maintain a 4.0 grade point average, earning a Master of Arts in Catholic Philosophical Studies, with distinction.

18. In January of 2017 DOLAN nominated GORGIA to the NAC in Rome, to continue his preparation for the priesthood in July of that year. DOLAN advised GORGIA that he based his decision on the glowing recommendation of the Douglaston faculty and rector, who felt GORGIA had an outstanding performance as a seminarian (Exhibits "A," "B," "C," and "D"). As part of this nomination, DOLAN stated in writing that "the Archdiocese of New York will take fiscal, medical, and legal responsibility for [GORGIA]."

19. GORGIA's time at the NAC went remarkably well, both with his studies and in his human formation, continuously maintaining summa cum laude grades. He was also appointed by the seminary faculty as the representative on behalf of the NAC to the Pontifical Gregorian University ("PGU"). McDONALD was appointed as GORGIA's formation advisor at the NAC. McDONALD observed that after living in Rome for just two months, GORGIA attained objective proficiency in the Italian language beyond NAC students who had lived in Rome for three to four years. McDONALD consistently praised GORGIA as a "star seminarian." GORGIA was chosen to assist Pope Francis at his Christmas Eve Mass in 2017 at St. Peter's Basilica.

20. At the close of his first-theology year at the NAC, GORGIA attended the customary end-of-year faculty evaluation meeting in March of 2018. Also present were McDONALD, PARK and others. At this evaluation, the entire faculty, and PARK in particular, expressed high praise of GORGIA's performance without any reservation or areas of concern. PARK went so far as to ask GORGIA what leadership role he would be interested in undertaking at the NAC. In the weeks following the meeting GORGIA received his evaluation from McDONALD which stated that the NAC faculty unanimously promoted GORGIA to continue at the NAC in the upcoming second year of formation. McDONALD echoed the faculty's praise in their impressions of him. GORGIA signed this written evaluation and a copy was sent to DOLAN.

21. GORGIA subsequently received a letter from DOLAN dated June 11, 2018, in response to GORGIA's evaluation, in which DOLAN told him that he was "delighted" to learn of the superlative faculty evaluation and that he had attained all goals for the first year at the NAC. DOLAN added that he was looking forward to GORGIA's next year at the NAC, as was GORGIA himself (Exhibit "E"). GORGIA also consistently received other commendations from DOLAN and HARMAN (Exhibit "F").

22. The NAC psychologist at the time evaluated GORGIA, as he did all seminarians, in May of 2018. He stated, as he had

consistently stated previously, that he felt GORGIA possessed the qualities to become an outstanding priest.

23. Near the beginning of his second year at the NAC, GORGIA witnessed PARK approach a seminarian from behind. PARK initiated uninvited physical contact with the seminarian while the seminarian was seated in the refectory by what appeared to be back rubbing massage-type action. As GORGIA witnessed this situation, it appeared to him that PARK's interaction was inappropriate. GORGIA had learned in his seminary formation and his preparation at the NAC that such acts can actually be "grooming activity" used by sexual predators. Grooming is a manipulative process used by a sexual predator for the purpose of creating a sense of trust with a vulnerable, targeted person prior to the act of actual victimization and seduction. Such predators present themselves as persons one may trust, so one's guard is lowered. GORGIA was aware of his own, virtually involuntary, facial expression which was one of surprise when he saw this behavior. As PARK looked directly at GORGIA's expression, PARK showed his awareness of GORGIA witnessing this behavior in a disapproving manner. When he saw PARK looking directly at him, GORGIA had an interior "gut-feeling" that the activity was not right and wondered "What would happen to me since I had witnessed what PARK did?" GORGIA's concern was further legitimized by multiple statutes of the NAC's "Code of

Ethical Conduct" and other policies concerning harassment and inappropriate behavior of superiors toward seminarians (Exhibits "G," "H," and "I").

24. Shortly after this incident, the seminarian who received PARK's back rub massage approached GORGIA unbidden, and without being prompted by GORGIA in any manner to do so. The seminarian told him PARK had given him similar back-rub massages and had initiated similar physical contact in the past, and that he found them to be offensive. Since PARK was the Vice-Rector and Director of Human Formation, and the formation advisor for this seminarian, PARK exercised direct control and power over this seminarian and had direct influence over whether he would be allowed to advance toward ordination. PARK, as both Vice-Rector and GORGIA's Director of Human Formation, also exercised the same power and control over GORGIA's own advancement to ordination (Exhibits "H" and "I"). As appears more fully below, HARMAN had even greater power than PARK over GORGIA (Exhibits "H" and "I").

25. GORGIA did not reveal to anyone, either the incident or what was later volunteered to him about PARK's interaction with the subject seminarian, while he was a seminarian of the ARCHDIOCESE.

26. While at the NAC, GORGIA consistently observed PARK had a preference for repetitive social interactions with certain subordinate seminarians, who were athletic, handsome, young and naïve. Other NAC seminarians told GORGIA they observed such acts by PARK, which they found to be inappropriate, strange, and of an exclusive nature toward particular subordinate subjects. Among such disclosures, one such seminarian revealed that he was "harassed" by PARK in the form of repeated uninvited physical contact described as causing "extreme discomfort" and "dread." When the seminarian made PARK aware that he took objection to these advances, PARK repeatedly taunted the seminarian until the seminarian left the NAC, within six months of his disturbing encounters with PARK. The seminarian stated that he felt he "couldn't say anything" to NAC authorities because of their close relationships with one another. GORGIA's concern and that of other NAC seminarians was further legitimized by multiple statutes of the NAC's "Code of Ethical Conduct" and other policies concerning harassment and inappropriate activity.

27. On October 27, 2018, GORGIA was advised by a Roman physician that he needed unavoidable and urgent surgery. The physician indicated that postponing the surgery would increase the risks to GORGIA's health and also lead to more complex and more invasive surgery later. The surgeon at New York University Langone Medical Center who performed GORGIA's surgery has

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 13

likewise described the procedure as medically necessary and attested to GORGIA's diligence in following seminary protocols in a letter of April 3, 2019.

28. GORGIA began the process of obtaining the necessary permission from, sequentially, the NAC, DOLAN, and the PGU to return home to New York for the surgery and to recuperate, while continuing to keep up with his class work (Exhibits "J" and "K").

29. In a letter dated November 21, 2018, DOLAN congratulated GORGIA for his strong academic performance in his journey toward the priesthood (Exhibit "F"). DOLAN likewise stated in an accompanying letter to the NAC's academic dean that he was pleased that GORGIA was "progressing well" at the NAC (Exhibit "F"). However, just three weeks later, on December 13, 2018, while GORGIA was recuperating from his surgery, he received another letter from DOLAN stating that HARMAN, the NAC Rector, raised alleged "concerns" and objected to GORGIA's return to the NAC. DOLAN's letter cited three claims against GORGIA: 1) that his "lengthy absence from the university seminary compromises the integrity of the entire first semester of ... [his] second year;" 2) that regarding his leave for urgent surgery, he "informed [the NAC] that the ARCHDIOCESE had approved ... [his] return home 'before' seeking permission from

### FILED: RICHMOND COUNTY CLERK 02/03/2021 04:25 PM NYSCEF DOC. NO. 13

the college;" and 3) that his formation advisor "brought to ... [his] attention some concerns about ... [his] slow progress in ... [his] human formation" and that he had been "resistant to hearing these reservations and acting upon them."

30. Because all three of the reasons provided in the DOLAN's letter were utterly false, GORGIA wished to meet with DOLAN, to provide proof that what HARMAN had said about him was untrue; and to request an unbiased hearing so he could return to the NAC to continue his formation. Unfortunately, despite <u>five</u> requests for a meeting, DOLAN refused both any of the requested meetings or to listen to GORGIA's side of the story.

31. In regard to the claim that GORGIA's surgery was compromising "the integrity of the entire first semester of ... [his] second year," at no time did he fall behind in his studies, a fact of which his supervisors were well aware. Prior to his departure for surgery, he met with his formation advisor, McDONALD, and with Fr. John Cush, the NAC's academic dean, to discuss a plan to continue his studies remotely during his recovery. As part of this plan, he communicated with his university professors to notify them of his absence and made detailed plans to follow the lectures contemporaneously in New York. In an e-mail to McDONALD of October 30, 2018, GORGIA stated his desire to "remain up-to-date on these assignments"

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 13

and his willingness to deliver all assignments scheduled during the anticipated recovery time prior to his departure. In his reply of October 31, 2018 McDONALD assured him that this was not necessary and that "we can always make them up peacefully in the future." Even so, GORGIA remained diligent in e-mailing McDONALD his assignments <u>before</u> their due dates. In addition, GORGIA remained in contact with his university professors and submitted all of their course assignments <u>before</u> they were due, during the period of his convalescence. Such arrangements, GORGIA was told by other NAC seminarians, had much precedent for seminarians at the NAC who had to undergo surgery and recovery, even for much longer periods of time than GORGIA's own six-week leave for surgery and recovery. These seminarians then continued their formation without interruption.

32. Before leaving for his surgery, GORGIA compiled a written account of his academic arrangements in an e-mail of November 2, 2018 to both McDONALD and Msgr. McNamara. He also repeated these arrangements to Fr. Cush in an e-mail of November 5, 2018 (Exhibit "K"). Fr. Cush relayed these academic preparations to the moderator of GORGIA's program of studies, Fr. Nicolas Steeves, S.J., who, in an e-mail of November 6, 2018 copied to the academic dean, thanked GORGIA for "so thoroughly preparing ... [his] absence and interim studies and upcoming exams" (Exhibit "K"). When GORGIA told

HARMAN about his commitment to his academics throughout his recovery and the above-mentioned academic plan in place, HARMAN told him that he was not concerned about GORGIA's academics, adding that GORGIA was "a smart cookie."

33. McDONALD wrote to GORGIA in an e-mail of December 7, 2018 that he appreciated GORGIA sending him his assignments and that he was confident that he would be able "easily to get ... [GORGIA] all caught up when the time comes." Throughout his recovery, GORGIA regularly kept in contact with both McDONALD and Msgr. McNamara and updated them on his medical progress. He likewise updated Fr. James Ferreira, DOLAN's priestsecretary, on several occasions regarding his medical progress and his adherence to the arrangements set in place <u>before</u> his departure from the NAC.

34. The second false accusation proffered by HARMAN to prevent GORGIA's return to the NAC involved a fabricated claim that he did not obtain permission to return for his surgery from the NAC before requesting permission from DOLAN. Contrary to this claim, GORGIA met with McDONALD, his formation advisor, on October 29, 2018 to request permission to return to New York for surgery. At this meeting, GORGIA described the medical situation, with documentation, to McDONALD and asked him how to obtain the NAC's permission to leave for surgery. McDONALD

instructed him to request written permission from DOLAN to be sent to PARK. McDONALD stated that he, himself, would advise PARK of GORGIA's request. GORGIA asked McDONALD whether he, GORGIA, should also contact PARK. McDONALD assured GORGIA that he did not need to speak with PARK. McDONALD confirmed that his permissions from both the NAC and the ARCHDIOCESE would be secured if GORGIA followed his advice. Following McDONALD's directions, GORGIA e-mailed Fr. James Ferreira on October 29, 2018, after his meeting with McDONALD (Exhibit "J"). In the email, copied to McDONALD, GORGIA recounted how, per McDONALD's instructions, the seminary required him to obtain DOLAN's permission to return to New York for the surgery. GORGIA also shared details about his meeting with McDONALD at which he made his request. On that same day, Fr. Ferreira responded with an e-mail to PARK stating that DOLAN gave his permission for GORGIA to return to New York for the surgery. Fr. Ferreira then confirmed to GORGIA that DOLAN's permission was transmitted to PARK, all in accordance with McDONALD's instructions at his meeting earlier that day. Fr. Ferreira told GORGIA that his return to New York for surgery and recuperation was "the best course of action." GORGIA replied to Fr. Ferreira that he was confident and committed to remaining current with all his formation requirements during

his recovery, a message to which Ferreira replied affirmatively (Exhibit "J'').

35. On October 30, 2018, GORGIA asked PARK if he received the e-mail from DOLAN's office. PARK told him that he had not yet reviewed it. Having had no response from PARK in the following days, GORGIA again spoke with PARK on November 3, 2018. This time, PARK appeared flustered. PARK also, for reasons unbeknown to GORGIA at that time, appeared angry and stated that "this all happened so fast." GORGIA did not understand why PARK was saying this, as GORGIA submitted a doctor's letter to McDONALD that described the need for surgery as urgent and had fulfilled all of the instructions given to him in a timely manner. As GORGIA was telling PARK how he had fully presented the situation to McDONALD and had followed all of the directions he had been given, PARK, inexplicably, walked away in the middle of GORGIA's conversation. PARK remained intent on maintaining his display of unwarranted anger, rather than listening to GORGIA's presentation of the facts. As PARK was aware of the documented urgency of GORGIA's medical situation, it appeared retrospectively that PARK feared that GORGIA's departure might present him opportunities outside of the seminary to disclose what he witnessed and learned about PARK's inappropriate conduct. At McDONALD's recommendation and after having been assured by his advice that GORGIA had rightly

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 13

followed his directions for obtaining the NAC's permission, GORGIA sent the details of his flight to New York to PARK in an e-mail of November 3, 2018, which was copied to McDONALD. GORGIA added, "Fr. McDonald is aware of this information." He received no reply from PARK. Also on November 3, 2018, GORGIA sent an e-mail to HARMAN, stating that he followed all of the instructions McDONALD provided to him. He received no reply from HARMAN. Upon seeing HARMAN on November 5, 2018, GORGIA asked him if he had a moment to speak briefly with him. HARMAN declined. On November 4, 2018, GORGIA met with McDONALD to recount his conversation of November 3, 2018 with PARK and PARK's angry response. McDONALD again stated that GORGIA had properly followed the NAC's protocols. He assured GORGIA that he should focus upon his recuperation and that he, McDONALD, would clarify any misunderstandings. GORGIA found it strange that, while so many of his peers, NAC faculty members, and professors wished him well on his surgery prior to his departure, both PARK and HARMAN had displayed a very cold affect and offered no expression of empathy.

36. The third allegation put forward by HARMAN to prevent GORGIA's return to the NAC was that McDONALD, his formation advisor, was alleged to have brought to GORGIA's attention "some concerns about ... [his] slow progress in [his] human formation" and that he was allegedly "resistant to hearing these

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 13

reservations and acting upon them." This allegation was completely untrue. There was never a time when McDONALD said so much as a word concerning any deficiency in GORGIA's progress in human formation. In an e-mail of October 15, 2018, just two months before receiving DOLAN's letter of December 13, McDONALD echoed the recognition of GORGIA's good standing by writing that he had mastered "the formational stage required."

37. Two days later, however, on October 17, 2018 GORGIA received an e-mail from HARMAN requesting a meeting. Prior to the meeting, GORGIA asked McDONALD if he knew what the meeting concerned. McDONALD denied any such knowledge. On October 18, 2018 HARMAN falsely alleged that McDONALD had already made GORGIA aware of two criticisms: 1) that GORGIA presented himself as someone who did not like to "try new things," and 2) that he presented himself as "an old man." While all of this was untrue, HARMAN invented false examples of "new things" he alleged GORGIA refused to try. When HARMAN incorrectly said GORGIA should not have worked in a parish over the summer, GORGIA told him that he had not, and that he had worked helping the sick in Lourdes, France, as already documented and approved by both the NAC and DOLAN. When GORGIA refuted this false claim, he then said that GORGIA should have chosen a different work assignment for his second year at the NAC. When GORGIA told HARMAN that he had requested three different work assignments, but that his advisor

reassigned him to the one he completed in the past, HARMAN was speechless and obviously frustrated. It concerned GORGIA that HARMAN presented claims so easily disprovable by documentation GORGIA had already submitted to the NAC regarding his work as a seminarian. He could not at that time understand why HARMAN was so intent on making such false claims. When HARMAN alleged that GORGIA acted like an "old man," HARMAN pointedly ridiculed GORGIA for his posture which was a result of his condition of scoliosis (curvature of the spine). When GORGIA reminded HARMAN that he suffered from scoliosis and that the seminary was already aware of this from the beginning, HARMAN proceeded to again ridicule GORGIA by saying that GORGIA would "have plenty of time to act like an old man" in his elder years. During the meeting, HARMAN appeared to make notes when GORGIA respectfully explained how HARMAN's two claims were not accurate. After he failed in trying to find fault with GORGIA, HARMAN said GORGIA needed to meet with the NAC psychologist, Sr. Mary Patrice Ahearn. When GORGIA went to see her on November 2, 2018 it appeared that she had difficulty understanding why HARMAN referred him to her. When GORGIA told her the Rector said he presented himself as "an old man," she laughed and said that she could not figure out what HARMAN meant by this. She advised GORGIA that she found no problem with him. GORGIA also informed Msgr. McNamara, a member of the NAC faculty since GORGIA's

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 13

arrival in 2017, of the meeting with HARMAN. McNamara also objected to HARMAN's false claims and offered to speak with McDONALD in GORGIA's defense.

38. A recognized tactic of clergy who enjoy power and control over heterosexually-oriented seminarians who are not complicit with the former's homosexual lifestyles is that the latter are referred to psychologists, psychiatrists or to psychiatric institutions as a way of attacking or attempting to discredit their character. A likewise documented tactic of clergy who have secret homosexual lifestyles, and some of the defendants in particular, is to preemptively retaliate against those who witness such behavior in anticipation of these witnesses making adverse disclosures about them.

39. Following his meeting with HARMAN, GORGIA was notified by a seminarian that HARMAN had approached him and another seminarian inquiring if there were things about GORGIA which were of concern to them. Unable to persuade GORGIA's peers to defame him, HARMAN ordered them not to reveal that he had spoken to them about GORGIA. When GORGIA later spoke with McDONALD, McDONALD refused to either affirm or deny having brought up with HARMAN the false accusations, particularly after he had just written two days earlier that GORGIA had mastered "the formational stage required."

#### FILED: RICHMOND COUNTY CLERK 02/03/2021 04:25 PM NYSCEF DOC. NO. 13

40. At that point, GORGIA saw no validity to HARMAN's claims against his character. In the final analysis, HARMAN's claims in DOLAN's letter that McDONALD, GORGIA's formation advisor, "brought to ... [GORGIA's] attention some concerns about ... [his] slow progress in ... [his] human formation" and that GORGIA had been "resistant to hearing these reservations and acting upon them" were categorically false and entirely fabricated. In retrospect there had to be ulterior motives to fabricate such transparently false allegations.

41. In the latter part of 2018, two other U.S. seminary rectors were forced to resign and removed from their posts after seminarians exposed homosexual predation condoned in their seminaries. At or around the same time, the acts taken against GORGIA could only have had as their object the desire of PARK and HARMAN to force a heterosexual seminarian out of the NAC and impose such punitive measures as would insure that GORGIA's prospects for ordination were eliminated. The intention behind this was to protect themselves from exposure of their predatory homosexuality at the NAC which exposure would liken their fate to that which befell the two former U.S. seminary rectors and endanger their ascent to higher office in the Church. This is an odious form of "careerism," and an act of sexual discrimination against the heterosexual GORGIA.

42. Since GORGIA received DOLAN'S letter only five days before he was scheduled to return to Rome, he was concerned that DOLAN and HARMAN appeared to act with haste in order to prevent his return to the NAC using easily disprovable false statements. It also appeared that DOLAN and HARMAN were securing GORGIA's removal from the NAC just before he was to have an upcoming peer evaluation by his fellow seminarians at the NAC. As GORGIA was respected among fellow NAC seminarians, the results of that evaluation were expected to be highly positive. This would have further put the lie to the falsehoods, concocted by HARMAN and PARK, and in which DOLAN was complicit, for removing GORGIA from the NAC.

43. DOLAN decided that on the basis of the three false claims put forward by HARMAN in the letter of December 13, 2018, punitive measures were to be taken against GORGIA, as dictated by HARMAN. The measures included that GORGIA would not be permitted to return to the NAC that year; he would be required to accept a re-assignment in the ARCHDIOCESE from January 2019 to August 31, 2019; the false claims would be disseminated to all members of the faculty at DUNWOODIE (thus irretrievably "poisoning the well" against any effort by GORGIA to complete priestly formation there in the future) and at the completion of the re-assignment, he would be evaluated for re-admission to the NAC and possibly dismissed as a seminarian of both the NAC and

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 13

the ARCHDIOCESE. If GORGIA were to be re-admitted, he would be required to repeat his second year at the NAC. In DOLAN's letter of December 13, 2018, he emphasized the italicized word "*if*" regarding whether GORGIA would even be accepted back by either the NAC or the ARCHDIOCESE at the end of the punitive measures, dictated by HARMAN, all in aid of this nefarious plan.

44. GORGIA replied to DOLAN in a letter of December 14, 2018, providing a detailed account demonstrating each of the three claims raised in DOLAN's letter to be untrue. DOLAN disregarded it, in conformity with a preconceived plan designed and initiated by PARK, HARMAN, McDONALD and the NAC against GORGIA, based on his heterosexual orientation.

45. GORGIA also shared the false claims with Douglaston psychologist Dr. Robert Palumbo. Dr. Palumbo stated that he found HARMAN's claims to represent false attacks on GORGIA's character. In response to the claims in DOLAN's letter of December 13, 2018, Dr. Palumbo wrote a letter of December 14, 2018 to DOLAN (Exhibit "L"). In his letter, Dr. Palumbo professionally described GORGIA's human character as a seminarian to be excellent and stated that the rector's statements about GORGIA were completely untrue. Among his observations, Dr. Palumbo noted that the account GORGIA provided to DOLAN in GORGIA's own letter of December 14, 2018 was

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 13

entirely consistent in every respect with Dr. Palumbo's own recollections of how these events unfolded through GORGIA's communications with him throughout his time in Rome; that GORGIA's affective maturity was "totally appropriate;" that he had found GORGIA to have fulfilled the requirements of his seminary program and that he believed that "it is so important for our Church to continue to form such emotionally healthy young men" as he has found GORGIA to be (Exhibit "L"). In GORGIA's mailing to DOLAN, he enclosed both this letter of Dr. Palumbo and his own letter of December 14, 2018.

46. Both in his letter to DOLAN of December 14, 2018 and in his written correspondence to Fr. James Ferreira of December 16, 2018 and December 17, 2018, GORGIA requested a meeting with DOLAN so that he could present to him the evidence proving his account in his letter of December 14, 2018 to be true and correct.

47. On December 17, 2018, GORGIA was notified by NAC seminarians that HARMAN posted a community-wide memorandum stating that GORGIA would not be returning to the NAC that year and that GORGIA would be re-assigned. GORGIA contacted McDONALD via e-mail on that same day, saying he needed to speak with him regarding an urgent matter and requesting a telephone call. McDONALD ignored his request for this telephone call, and in an

e-mail of December 19, 2018, McDONALD stated that HARMAN shared with him DOLAN'S letter to GORGIA of December 13, 2018. McDONALD also wrote that it would be "wise" for GORGIA to focus on the punitive measures that HARMAN dictated and which DOLAN had accepted without question. This response surprised GORGIA, since McDONALD would have known the claims cited were untrue.

48. After GORGIA submitted his response of December 14, 2018 to DOLAN refuting HARMAN's false claims, DOLAN shared GORGIA's refutations with HARMAN, who then attempted to fabricate new and equally bogus criticisms against GORGIA. On December 19, 2018, five days after the date of GORGIA's letter, GORGIA received an e-mail from HARMAN. HARMAN disseminated this email to PARK, McDONALD and others, which listed additional untruthful criticisms that HARMAN falsely claimed he had discussed with GORGIA prior to his departure for his operation. Upon receiving HARMAN's e-mail, GORGIA shared these false statements with Dr. Palumbo. In a telephone conversation of December 21, 2018, Dr. Palumbo said that he found these statements to be entirely untrue and a fabricated "attack on [GORGIA's] character." He also stated that these claims were apparently the remarks of someone who did not know GORGIA. Dr. Palumbo repeated that the faculty of Douglaston consistently and unanimously regarded GORGIA's character highly and without reservation (Exhibits "A," "B," "C," and "D"). On yet another

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 13

occasion, Dr. Palumbo stated to GORGIA that, based upon his years of experience as house psychologist at Douglaston, "You were the most complete and affectively mature seminarian I have known in my seventeen years at Douglaston."

49. On January 2, 2019, GORGIA received a second letter from DOLAN. Despite Dr. Palumbo's professional statement and GORGIA's account debunking HARMAN's fabricated claims, DOLAN wrote that he would accept what HARMAN stated was true and that he would "abide by it."

50. In a text message and again in a telephone conversation of January 8, 2019 with Fr. Ferreira, GORGIA repeated his request for an urgent meeting with DOLAN before the commencement date of the punitive measures. Fr. Ferreira stated definitively that HARMAN did not want GORGIA back, adding that DOLAN was "too busy" to see him and that he could not "wave a magic wand" to find a moment when DOLAN could meet with GORGIA. After describing DOLAN's personal allegiances to HARMAN and the NAC, Fr. Ferreira told GORGIA that the punitive measures would not be changed. He added that whether DOLAN agreed or disagreed with GORGIA, DOLAN would not oppose HARMAN'S decision to impose punitive measures. DOLAN had the authority to have corrected the situation, but he did not do so.

51. Dr. Palumbo received a "very curt" reply from DOLAN to the supportive statement Dr. Palumbo had written on GORGIA's behalf. In a handwritten letter dated January 16, 2019, DOLAN wrote Dr. Palumbo saying, "You will understand the trust I have in the rector and faculty of the North American College, a trust I have as well in the rector and faculty of Cathedral College" (Exhibit "M"). Dr. Palumbo was disappointed that DOLAN was more interested in covering for HARMAN than in hearing the truth. Later, Dr. Palumbo learned that DOLAN made disparaging remarks against him at a meeting of New York bishops for having written in GORGIA's defense.

52. After having made five requests to meet with DOLAN and having been denied five times, and after having been informed that DOLAN would in any case enforce HARMAN's punitive measures, GORGIA resigned under duress as a seminarian of the NAC and of the ARCHDIOCESE. GORGIA considered it intolerable in conscience to consent to baseless claims against himself and to thereby become complicit therein. In a letter of January 11, 2019, GORGIA therefore submitted his resignation under duress to DOLAN, thereby in retrospect accomplishing precisely what HARMAN had always desired, the assurance that GORGIA would never become a priest. GORGIA conveyed to DOLAN his belief that HARMAN exploited his return for surgery to fabricate claims against him. GORGIA also stated that "an environment in which a

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 13

seminarian is maligned by his superiors and not given the chance to bring the truth to transparency is harmful to his preparation toward the priesthood." Along with his letter of January 11, 2019, GORGIA resubmitted Dr. Palumbo's professional statement of December 14, 2018, and GORGIA asked that it be retained as part of his file in the ARCHDIOCESE (Exhibit "L"). GORGIA thereafter received a handwritten, food-stained letter of January 16, 2019 from DOLAN in which he accepted GORGIA's resignation.

53. That while it was obviously in DOLAN'S power to properly review the matter objectively and to reassign GORGIA to Dunwoodie to complete his studies without the bogus punitive measures, DOLAN did not do so. In fact, DOLAN had already precluded that possibility by including in the aforementioned punitive measures the publishing of HARMAN's bogus claims to the entire faculty at Dunwoodie.

54. GORGIA's spontaneous, mid-year discontinuance from the NAC was achieved not only by defendants' exploiting objectively false claims, but also by their violation of organizational policies. Multiple experienced former seminary employees thoroughly familiar with GORGIA's case have attested to the fact that no seminarian is removed only three months into the year after just receiving the faculty's unanimous vote to be promoted to that year, as did GORGIA, on the basis of such demonstrably

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 13

false and absurd claims. Such is indicated by the NAC Handbook, which cites reasons only of a grave or criminal nature as warranting a seminarian's removal "outside the normal evaluation process," none of which applied at all in GORGIA's case (Exhibit "N"). The Handbook also attests to GORGIA's precise compliance with protocols regarding medical emergencies and affirms GORGIA's rights to an environment free from harassment, retaliation, and calumny (Exhibits "G" and "I"). Defendants' blatant violation of GORGIA's protections under organizational policies further evidence the malice of their actions against GORGIA.

55. GORGIA was unaware of the motives of DOLAN, the ARCHDIOCESE, PARK, HARMAN, McDONALD and the NAC to discriminate against him, or to be complicit in such actions, on the basis of his heterosexual sexual orientation during the foregoing events. GORGIA was unaware at that time of their motives because of their fraud and deceit.

56. In the weeks following his resignation under duress, GORGIA's friends and parishioners told him that they wrote unsolicited letters to DOLAN to attest to his character and to express concern about how he was treated (Exhibit "O"). Those who prepared letters to DOLAN included GORGIA's long-time former Pastor, who, after having known GORGIA for about twenty years,

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 13

stated that the actions taken against GORGIA were baseless and unjust. Among the points raised in this letter, the Pastor noted with reference to the NAC, "I believe that authorities there have misinterpreted and misrepresented events in a way unfavorable to Anthony" (Exhibit "P"). DOLAN in turn disseminated dishonest responses by falsely claiming, *inter alia*, that "I share your dismay that Anthony Gorgia has decided to leave the seminary," and writing that he took "extraordinary steps" to retain GORGIA as a seminarian.

57. Many friends and parishioners also wrote letters to HARMAN, in which they expressed concern about the apparent disregard for the extensive documentation that supports GORGIA's case and requested that GORGIA be granted an opportunity to present his case and evidence for further review. HARMAN replied by falsely and deceitfully attacking GORGIA's credibility, essentially telling the letter-writers that they were uninformed.

58. In a letter of February 17, 2019, GORGIA's parents wrote a respectful letter to inquire of DOLAN as to why the matter seemed to have been left uninvestigated and why he refused to meet with GORGIA (Exhibit "Q"). In an effort to avoid addressing the real reasons for disallowing GORGIA to return to the NAC, and with the aim of achieving plausible

deniability, DOLAN wrote GORGIA's parents by stating, "I only read the opening paragraph, and no more, as the accusatory and uncharitable tone led me to discard the correspondence" (Exhibit "R'').

59. GORGIA reported his case with evidence in several letters to Archbishop Christophe Pierre, Apostolic Nuncio to the United States. Rather than initiating an investigation, Archbishop Pierre replied that the matter was outside of his "jurisdiction," even though Cardinal Seán O'Malley of the Archdiocese of Boston and other bishops confirmed that Archbishop Pierre was an appropriate official to receive and act upon the accusations raised against defendants.

60. GORGIA also reported his case with evidence in a letter to Archbishop Jorge Carlos Patrón Wong, Secretary for Seminaries of the Congregation for the Clergy in Rome. He never received a response, despite signed return receipt confirmation of delivery. Other, multiple and similar efforts by GORGIA and others were similarly unsuccessful in Rome and throughout the United States.

61. DOLAN and responsible officials of both the NAC and the ARCHDIOCESE have been in receipt of multiple reports describing PARK's inappropriate conduct, cover-up by defendants, and the unjust actions taken against GORGIA particularly by HARMAN and

DOLAN. While return receipts confirm delivery, these reports were met with silence by DOLAN and other responsible parties.

62. Multiple individuals also met and wrote to Fr. Christopher Argano, the Vocations Director of the ARCHDIOCESE at Dunwoodie. These individuals detailed to him the circumstances of GORGIA's case and asked Fr. Argano to intervene on GORGIA's behalf as the Vocations Director. Fr. Argano ignored correspondences and in other cases claimed he was "too busy" and acted as if he "did not know" GORGIA, although he had written a glowing letter of recommendation upon GORGIA's entrance to the NAC stating that he knew GORGIA since childhood. As Vocations Director, Fr. Argano knew of, and was in possession of, the abundant positive evaluations that GORGIA received throughout his time as a seminarian. Moreover, Fr. Argano's duty as Vocations Director was to protect the welfare of seminarians of the ARCHDIOCESE, which is who GORGIA was.

63. Much later, upon receiving credible information about the homosexual sex lives of HARMAN and PARK and the discriminatory treatment of heterosexual seminarians at the NAC, as well as grooming and active homosexuality there over the years, it finally became clear to GORGIA that he was perceived as a threat to having defendants' secrets revealed. Such revelations would harm their chances of advancement in the

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 13

Church; lead to their dismissal like seminary officials in Buffalo, Boston, and elsewhere who engaged in or tolerated homosexual misconduct involving faculty and students; and possibly result in their laicization. Had GORGIA likewise been a homosexual who behaved as HARMAN and PARK were reported to have behaved by different witnesses, there is no reason to believe that they would have contrived their false reasons to collude with DOLAN to prohibit GORGIA's return to the NAC and to effectively insure that no one would ever ordain him.

64. GORGIA learned this as a result of people coming to him with unsolicited information about the homosexual proclivities of PARK and HARMAN throughout the years and about a pattern of cover-up of clerical misconduct on the part of DOLAN dating back to his time in the Archdiocese of St. Louis. GORGIA also received unsolicited information from former, heterosexually-oriented NAC seminarians who were separated under different rectors for their refusal to be complicit with a homosexual subculture at the NAC. At no time prior to his resignation did GORGIA ever publicize what was happening to him at the ARCHDIOCESE or the NAC.

65. A NAC seminarian came forward, initially in November of 2019, to report to GORGIA that HARMAN was responsible for PARK's appointment as Vice-Rector. Misbehavior by PARK would

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 13

reflect badly on HARMAN. This seminarian also sent a text message to GORGIA, stating that the Vice-Rector was "too involved" with a seminarian in their class. He begged GORGIA to come forward with whatever he knew (Exhibit "S"). In a later phone call, the seminarian stated that there had been a seminary conference on abuse of authority. Another seminarian, for whom PARK was the formation advisor, appeared to be "crying out for help" by proposing a series of hypothetical situations involving exploitation in frantic succession. Another seminarian started an audio recording of the distressed seminarian's words. During this episode, HARMAN had a nervous reaction to the distressed seminarian's behavior. Turning red in the face, HARMAN, perhaps predictably, stated that if anything like what the seminarian described should happen, HARMAN should be notified. The seminarian and others who contacted GORGIA stated that the term "open homosexual" was used furtively, but pervasively at the NAC to describe PARK. He told GORGIA that PARK was known to touch seminarians inappropriately and again urged GORGIA to report PARK's behavior, saying that GORGIA was competent to make such a report because of his well-known faithfulness as a seminarian. He also advised that other seminarians as well would corroborate the seminarian's account if an investigation were opened, so that witnesses would be protected from retaliation. The

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 13

seminarian stated the need to be "protected" in an investigation process.

66. In a text message of March 26, 2020, the same seminarian mentioned seeing a *Church Militant* article, "<u>Is the</u> <u>North American College Protecting Homosexual Predators?</u>" The seminarian told GORGIA that he hoped there was an investigation opened, because he knew that testimony would be brought forward if it were. On another occasion, the seminarian pointed out a pattern of the types of seminarians PARK "goes after": seminarians that are athletic, naïve, good-looking, and younger. The seminarian expressed concern that seminarians who are propositioned will later become prone to predation themselves.

67. Others have come forward with additional corroborating accounts of homosexual advances made by PARK throughout the years (Exhibit "T"). Some who reported PARK's behaviors to present and/or past NAC officials or were otherwise witnesses to PARK's inappropriate conduct were coerced into leaving the NAC or found their reports uninvestigated.

68. On August 2, 2020, GORGIA learned that an investigator reviewed documentation which described HARMAN and HARMAN's homosexual lover, today the former Bishop of the Diocese of Springfield, Illinois, engaging in relations at an orgy which was described in graphic detail. Among the details attested to

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 13

by the witness include dimensions and specific descriptions of HARMAN's and other participants' intimate body parts. This also included a description of HARMAN's bishop fondling HARMAN's intimate parts and his bishop receiving anal contact from HARMAN. HARMAN was reported as having performed these sexual acts in the presence of seminarians, among others, including a current bishop who is also a member of the NAC Board of Governors. At or about this time, this misconduct was reported to the Apostolic Nuncio. The witness in possession of this knowledge about HARMAN was threatened and retaliated against, both preemptively and after the witness disclosed the scandalous behavior. The witness stated that he was aware his information on HARMAN, HARMAN's homosexual lover, and other prelates would endanger their careers were this witness to come forward. In this is evidenced not only precedent of HARMAN's recklessness toward subordinate seminarians, but also a clear pattern of retaliation against those who possess information concerning HARMAN's cover-up of or active involvement in misconduct. The documentation was reviewed recently by a retired Special Agent in Charge from the Federal Bureau of Investigation, among other experts, who found it to be very credible.

69. GORGIA came to learn about DOLAN from credible research compiled by an investigator. The research is extensive and identifies a pattern by DOLAN of retaining or covering up

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 13

for priests accused of misconduct and/or retaliating against those who are not complicit with misconduct, in Missouri, Washington, D.C., Wisconsin and New York. In certain cases, some victims reported that DOLAN covered up inappropriate conduct throughout his career of which he was directly made aware or to which he was personally an eyewitness. The research also evidences a pattern by DOLAN up to the present of filling prominent positions in the ARCHDIOCESE with priests accused of homosexual misconduct to the detriment or exclusion of those who are not complicit with such misconduct.

70. GORGIA came to learn of credible research suggesting a precedent of members of the NAC Board of Governors discriminating against heterosexuals or retaining faculty members who commit such discrimination or harassment against heterosexuals. A review of the NAC Board of Governors revealed that many members have also sustained accusations of covering up allegations of abuse and mistreating victims. A certain number of NAC Board members, who are bishops, have also been alleged to have been active in homosexual relationships. In June of 2020, a member of the NAC's faculty stated with reference to the NAC that there are "obvious 'issues' that are not articulated and remain unresolved." The NAC faculty member further revealed, "...I often grieve at times when things are [sic] the radar screen are obvious but are not called out or identified."

# FIRST CAUSE OF ACTION AGAINST ALL DEFENDANTS UNDER THE NEW YORK STATE HUMAN RIGHTS LAW

71. Plaintiff GORGIA repeats and realleges all prior allegations with the same force and effect as if fully set forth herein.

72. The <u>New York State Human Rights Law</u> (<u>NYSHRL</u>) is set forth in the <u>New York Executive Law</u> ("<u>NYEL</u>") Article 15 at §290 et seq.

73. Under <u>NYEL</u> §292(5) DOLAN, ARCHDIOCESE, NAC, PARK, HARMAN and McDONALD are employers and or supervisors in positions of *de facto* control over GORGIA (Exhibit "H").

74. Under <u>NYEL</u>  $\S$ 292(6) GORGIA was an employee and or a subordinate of defendants (Exhibit "H").

75. That GORGIA was discriminated against by defendants, because of his heterosexual sexual orientation, by defendants putting forth outrageous falsehoods against GORGIA or in failing to hear and correct the false allegations against him, because of a preconceived intent to protect PARK, HARMAN, McDONALD and the NAC by driving GORGIA out of priestly formation. Defendants desired to protect PARK and HARMAN, McDONALD and the NAC because they perceived a threat to their careers and advancement within the Church since GORGIA, a heterosexual male seminarian,

witnessed and was made aware of homosexual grooming activity by PARK. Defendants further feared that his knowledge could expose the breadth of homosexual activity at the NAC and in some defendants' lives and dioceses.

76. That had GORGIA been a homosexual male seminarian, there would have been no false allegations lodged against him, nor any punitive actions taken against him to drive him from priestly formation.

77. Defendants DOLAN and the ARCHDIOCESE either knew or ought to have known that the allegations against GORGIA were bogus, concocted, outrageously false, in violation of the NYHRL and fabricated. Further, they should have met with GORGIA, considered his documentation, reviewed GORGIA's submission objectively and concluded that the allegations against GORGIA were baseless. They should also have prevented and/or ceased the dissemination of the falsehoods against GORGIA. Alternatively, these defendants ought to have fashioned an accommodation at Dunwoodie, rather than threaten him with false accusations from HARMAN so as to irretrievably prejudice GORGIA in regard to GORGIA's viable Dunwoodie options.

78. That the actions of all defendants constituted an unlawful discriminatory practice as defined in NYEL §296(1) (a).

79. This cause of action is not susceptible to any exemption and exception because the cause of action involves a law of general application and does not involve Church doctrine or undue entanglement in ecclesiastical affairs.

80. That by reason of the foregoing, GORGIA has suffered special economic damages as well as mental anguish and humiliation, all of which are of a continuing nature. Plaintiff also seeks punitive damages and attorneys' fees pursuant to <u>NYEL</u> § 297 (9), (10).

# SECOND CAUSE OF ACTION AGAINST ALL DEFENDANTS UNDER THE NEW YORK STATE HUMAN RIGHTS LAW

81. Plaintiff GORGIA repeats and realleges all prior allegations with the same force and effect as if fully set forth herein.

82. That the <u>NYEL</u> §296 (2) prohibits employment discrimination because of disability.

83. That "disability" is defined in New York as including: a physical or medical impairment resulting from an anatomical, physical or medical condition which is demonstrable by medically accepted clinical or laboratory diagnostic techniques; or a record of such impairment; or a condition regarded by others as such an impairment which, upon the provision of reasonable

accommodations, do not prevent the performance of the activities involved in the occupation held in a reasonable manner <u>NYEL</u> 292 (21).

84. That GORGIA has suffered from scoliosis since his childhood, a fact that was known by all defendants prior to his acceptance as a seminarian of the ARCHIOCESE and of the NAC, respectively. It was this medical condition and anatomical deformity which resulted in HARMAN mocking GORGIA, as set forth in paragraph "37" hereof.

85. That GORGIA was also diagnosed with a spinal condition which required surgery in the United States. His recovery was expected to require convalescence which included post-operative wound care and visits to the surgeon. All defendants were aware of this and gave permission (Exhibits "J" and "K").

86. That a reasonable accommodation was agreed between GORGIA and all defendants, to wit, that GORGIA would submit his assignments timely; and he did submit them even before they were due, during his recovery from spinal surgery (Exhibits "J" and "K").

87. That this agreed plan of reasonable accommodation, which has been employed in the past with other seminarians, was unilaterally discarded by all defendants. They thereafter contrived a false narrative to remove GORGIA from the formation

process and destroy any opportunity to pursue his preparation and to be ordained a priest.

88. That in doing so, all defendants acted in an unlawful and discriminatory practice as defined in the NYEL.

89. This cause of action is not susceptible to any exemption and exception because the cause of action involves a law of general application and does not involve Church doctrine or undue entanglement in ecclesiastical affairs.

90. That by reason of the foregoing, GORGIA has suffered special economic damages as well as mental anguish and humiliation, all of which are of a continuing nature. Plaintiff also seeks punitive damages and attorneys' fees pursuant to <u>NYEL</u> § 297 (9), (10).

## THIRD CAUSE OF ACTION FOR BREACH OF FIDUCIARY DUTY AGAINST ALL DEFENDANTS

91. Plaintiff GORGIA repeats and realleges all prior allegations with the same force and effect as if fully set forth herein.

92. That defendants were in a fiduciary relationship with GORGIA in which all defendants were in positions of *de facto* control and dominance over him. That by reason of his position as a seminarian for the ARCHDIOCESE, having been nominated for

the NAC by DOLAN when PARK, HARMAN and McDONALD had complete control over his advancement, vel non, within the NAC, defendants had complete dominance over him.

93. That GORGIA was uniquely vulnerable and incapable of self-protection regarding his continuation of priestly formation.

94. That this breach of fiduciary duty is a tort which arises from the violation of a relationship of trust and confidence which GORGIA placed in the defendants who assumed control, care and responsibility for GORGIA.

95. That the actions of all defendants breached their duties when they acted in a manner that is contrary to the interest of GORGIA to whom defendants owed a duty of loyalty.

96. This cause of action is not susceptible to any exemption or exception since the action involves a law of general application and does not involve Church doctrine or undue entanglement in ecclesiastical affairs.

97. That as a result, GORGIA has suffered special economic damages as well as damages for mental anguish and humiliation, all of which are of a continuing nature.

## FOURTH CAUSE OF ACTION FOR BREACH OF FIDUCIARY DUTY AGAINST DOLAN AND THE ARCHDIOCESE

44

#### 44 of 58

allegations as if fully set forth herein.

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 13

99. That defendants DOLAN and the ARCHDIOCESE were in a fiduciary relationship with GORGIA in which they were in positions of de facto control and dominance over him. That by reason of his position as a seminarian for the ARCHDIOCESE, having been nominated for the NAC by DOLAN, they had complete control over GORGIA's advancement, vel non, within the ARCHDIOCESE. Defendants had complete dominance over him.

100. That GORGIA was uniquely vulnerable and incapable of self-protection regarding his continuation of priestly formation.

101. That in April of 2019 GORGIA met with Bishop Nicholas DiMarzio ("DiMarzio"), Bishop of Brooklyn, with a view toward pursuing his vocation in the Diocese of Brooklyn. GORGIA described his situation to DiMarzio, including what he witnessed regarding PARK, and presented DiMarzio with a portfolio of documents. DiMarzio said that he was very impressed with GORGIA's record and would accept GORGIA as second year theologian since he had been at the NAC. This was subject only to DiMarzio calling DOLAN to obtain his agreement. At this same meeting, GORGIA recounted to DiMarzio all of GORGIA's attempts to meet with DOLAN to prove his innocence but to no avail.

DiMarzio appeared to be taken aback at DOLAN's shabby treatment of GORGIA.

102. Before the date of GORGIA's meeting with DiMarzio, GORGIA had begun reporting the egregious acts of DOLAN and other defendants to responsible officials, as set forth in paragraphs "59" and "60" hereof. After GORGIA made these reports, DiMarzio was pressured by DOLAN not to accept GORGIA as a seminarian of the second-theology year. DiMarzio wanted to appease DOLAN by re-subjecting GORGIA to the unjust punitive measures which DOLAN had adopted. GORGIA met with DiMarzio a second time on September 11, 2019 to discuss GORGIA's concerns. DiMarzio told GORGIA that he believed in the truthfulness of GORGIA's account but, after having spoken with DOLAN, would not accept him without imposing the unjust punitive measures.

103. That this breach of fiduciary duty is a tort which arises from the violation of a relationship of trust and confidence which GORGIA placed in DOLAN who assumed control, care and responsibility for GORGIA.

104. That the actions of DOLAN, for which the ARCHDIOCESE is vicariously liable, breached the duty of those defendants to GORGIA when they acted in a manner that is contrary to the interest of GORGIA, to whom defendants owed a duty of loyalty.

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 13

105. This cause of action is not susceptible to any exemption or exception since the action involves a law of general application and does not involve Church doctrine or undue entanglement in ecclesiastical affairs.

106. That as a result, GORGIA has suffered special economic damages as well as damages for mental anguish and humiliation, all of which are of a continuing nature.

## FIFTH CAUSE OF ACTION FOR FRAUD AND DECEIT AGAINST ALL DEFENDANTS

107. Plaintiff GORGIA repeats and realleges all prior allegations as if fully set forth herein.

108. That defendants conspired to and did create a completely fraudulent narrative as a pretext to force punitive actions against GORGIA, the effect of which was intended to punish GORGIA and to deter him from pursuing his ordination because of his heterosexual sexual orientation which they regarded as a threat to widespread homosexuality at the NAC which was tolerated, permitted and concealed; and which said defendants wished to continue to protect, all to the detriment and damage of GORGIA.

109. That DOLAN knew or should have known that the narrative of PARK, HARMAN, McDONALD and the NAC was untrue and

purposely made himself ignorant of the evidence which GORGIA attempted to present to him, and ignored it. This followed a pre-conceived plan agreed to with PARK, HARMAN, McDONALD and the NAC to force upon GORGIA an unjust punishment which forced GORGIA's resignation from his position as a seminarian for the ARCHDIOCESE.

110. That GORGIA was not aware of the scheme and conspiracy of all defendants to unfairly punish him for offenses which are demonstrably false because of his heterosexual sexual orientation until after his forced resignation.

111. That GORGIA was not aware until after the expiration of the statute of limitations for the filing of a claim under Title VII of the 1964 Civil Rights Act that he had been a victim of fraud and deceit because of his heterosexual sexual orientation.

112. This cause of action is not susceptible to any exemption and exception to the cause of action because the cause of action involves a law of general application and does not involve Church doctrine or undue entanglement in ecclesiastical affairs.

113. That as a result, GORGIA has suffered special economic damages, which are continuing, as well as mental anguish, humiliation and suffering.

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 13

INDEX NO. 151501/2020 RECEIVED NYSCEF: 02/03/2021

# SIXTH CAUSE OF ACTION UNDER TITLE VII OF THE CIVIL RIGHTS ACT OF 1964 AGAINST ALL DEFENDANTS

114. Plaintiff GORGIA repeats and realleges all prior

allegations with the same force and effect as if fully herein.

115. That in ignoring and/or supporting the false claims against GORGIA, defendants acted against GORGIA to preserve their positions and to cover up the homosexual predations at the NAC because GORGIA was a heterosexually oriented seminarian who had witnessed and was made aware of grooming activities.

116. That in doing so, defendants forced GORGIA to resign under duress, because of GORGIA's heterosexual sexual orientation; and thus defendants violated GORGIA's civil rights.

117. That GORGIA has not exhausted his administrative remedies because of the fraud, deceit, and concealment of defendants.

118. That GORGIA has commenced this action under Title VII within a reasonable time after learning of the fraud and deceit of defendants.

119. That because of defendants' fraud and deceit they are equitably estopped from asserting a statute of limitations defense.

120. This cause of action is not susceptible to any exemption and exception to the cause of action because the cause of action involves a law of general application and does not involve Church doctrine or undue entanglement in ecclesiastical affairs.

121. That as a result, GORGIA has suffered special economic damages, which are continuing, as well as mental anguish, humiliation and suffering. Plaintiff also seeks punitive damages and attorneys' fees pursuant the provisions therefore in Title VII.

## SEVENTH CAUSE OF ACTION FOR INFLICTION OF EMOTIONAL DISTRESS AGAINST DOLAN, PARK, HARMAN, McDONALD AND THE NAC

122. Plaintiff GORGIA repeats and realleges all prior allegations with the same force and effect as if fully set forth herein.

123. That their reckless and outrageous and disingenuous conduct as aforesaid defendants acted in such way as to cause severe emotional distress to GORGIA as a vehicle to force him out of priestly formation.

124. This cause of action is not susceptible to any exemption and exception to the cause of action because the cause of action involves a law of general application and does not

involve Church doctrine or undue entanglement in ecclesiastical affairs.

125. That GORGIA has commenced this action within a reasonable time after learning of the fraud and deceit of defendants.

126. That because of defendants' fraud and deceit they are equitably estopped from asserting a statute of limitations defense.

127. That as a result, GORGIA has suffered special economic damages, which are continuing, as well as mental anguish, humiliation and suffering.

# EIGHTH CAUSE OF ACTION FOR MALICIOUS INTERFERENCE WITH PROSPECTIVE ECONOMIC ADVANTAGE AGAINST PARK, HARMAN, McDONALD AND THE NAC

128. Plaintiff GORGIA repeats and realleges all prior allegations with the same force and effect as if fully set forth herein.

129. That GORGIA had a business relationship with DOLAN and the ARCHDIOCESE.

130. That defendants interfered with those relationships for the sole purpose of harming GORGIA so he would be improperly forced to resign under duress because of GORGIA's heterosexual

sexual orientation by using dishonest, unfair and improper means to preserve their positions and to cover up the homosexual predations at the NAC and forcing GORGIA to resign under duress because of GORGIA's heterosexual sexual orientation.

131. This cause of action is not susceptible to any exemption and exception to the cause of action because the cause of action involves a law of general application and does not involve Church doctrine or undue entanglement in ecclesiastical affairs.

132. That as a result, GORGIA has suffered special economic damages, which are continuing, as well as mental anguish, humiliation and suffering.

## NINTH CAUSE OF ACTION AGAINST ALL DEFENDANTS FOR SEXUAL HARASSMENT FOR MAINTAINING A HOSTILE WORK ENVIRONMENT

133. Plaintiff GORGIA repeats and realleges all prior allegations with the same force and effect as if fully set forth herein.

134. That GORGIA, a heterosexually oriented seminarian was forced by defendants to endure a workplace permeated by discriminatory workplace intimidation, ridicule and insult because he was so oriented, of such a severe nature that the terms of his employment were thereby altered.

135. That <u>NYEL</u> § 296 [1-5] provides a remedy for such hostile work environment.

136. This cause of action is not susceptible to any exemption and exception to the cause of action because the cause of action involves a law of general application and does not involve Church doctrine or undue entanglement in ecclesiastical affairs.

137. That as a result, GORGIA has suffered special economic damages, which are continuing, as well as mental anguish, humiliation and suffering. Plaintiff also seeks punitive damages and attorneys' fees pursuant to NYEL § 297 (9), (10).

## TENTH CAUSE OF ACTION AGAINST ALL DEFENDANTS FOR WRONGFUL DISCHARGE IN VIOLATION OF ORGANIZATIONAL POLICY

138. Plaintiff GORGIA repeats and realleges all prior allegations with the same force and effect as if herein set forth at length.

139. That the punitive measures imposed on plaintiff were in violation of the defendants' organizational procedures for the types of alleged infractions put forward by defendants (Exhibit "N").

140. That by reason of the foregoing, defendants breached their agreement of employment with plaintiff GORGIA, who deems the contract to be as continuing, though breached by defendants so as to recover damages arising from the breach.

141. This cause of action is not susceptible to any exemption and exception to the cause of action because the cause of action involves a law of general application and does not involve Church doctrine or undue entanglement in ecclesiastical affairs.

142. That as a result, GORGIA has suffered special economic damages, which are continuing, as well as mental anguish, humiliation and suffering.

## ELEVENTH CAUSE OF ACTION FOR DEFAMATION AND OR SLANDER AGAINST DOLAN

143. Plaintiff GORGIA repeats and realleges all prior allegations with the same force and effect as if herein set forth at length.

144. That DOLAN caused to be published the false assertions of the codefendants concerning GORGIA's alleged shortcomings, deficiencies and failures at the NAC which indicated that GORGIA was not fit to continue his formation.

54

#### 54 of 58

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 13

145. The said false assertions were untrue, libelous, offensive and/or slanderous, inter alia, in the following respects: that GORGIA's "lengthy absence from the university seminary compromises the integrity of the entire first semester of ... [his] second year;" that regarding his leave for urgent surgery, he "informed [the NAC] that the ARCHDIOCESE had approved ... [his] return home 'before' seeking permission from the college;" and that his formation advisor "brought to ... [his] attention some concerns about ... [his] slow progress in ... [his] human formation" and that he had been "resistant to hearing these reservations and acting upon them."

146. The aforesaid assertions about GORGIA's fitness were easily disprovable; and GORGIA did disprove them in a written submission to DOLAN.

147. DOLAN knew, or in the exercise of reasonable care, ought to have known, that that the statements which he published were untrue.

148. The said publication by DOLAN of the libelous and/or slanderous statements was neither truthful nor otherwise privileged.

149. The libelous/slanderous content described above damaged GORGIA's reputation in a manner which foreseeably would

55

#### 55 of 58

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 13

adversely affect GORGIA and, accordingly, constitutes "special harm" under applicable law.

### TWELFTH CAUSE OF ACTION FOR DEFAMATION AND OR SLANDER AGAINST HARMAN

150. Plaintiff GORGIA repeats and realleges all prior allegations with the same force and effect as if herein set forth at length.

151. In July, 2020 HARMAN caused to be published false assertions concerning GORGIA's alleged shortcomings, deficiencies and failures at the NAC which indicated that GORGIA was not fit to continue his formation.

152. The said false assertions were untrue, libelous, offensive and/or slanderous, *inter alia*, in the following respects: that GORGIA compromised the integrity of the first semester of his second year and that he made slow progress in human formation and that he "quit" the ARCHDIOCESE in the face of reasonable requests from HARMAN.

153. The said publication by HARMAN of the libelous and/or slanderous statements was neither truthful nor otherwise privileged.

154. The libelous/slanderous content described above damaged GORGIA's reputation in a manner which foreseeably would

adversely affect GORGIA and, accordingly, constitutes "special harm" under applicable law.

WHEREFORE, by reason of the foregoing, plaintiff ANTHONY J. GORGIA prays for judgment on the complaint and against defendants for damages in the amount \$50,000,000 in compensatory damages and \$75,000,000 in exemplary damages.

Dated:

New York, New York February 3, 2021

BELAIR & ASSOCIATES, P.C.

Bolan

Raymond W. Befair Attorneys for Plaintiff ANTHONY J. GORGIA 90 Broad Street New York, New York 10004 (212) 344-3900

#### VERIFICATION

I, Raymond W. Belair, an attorney admitted to practice before the courts of New York, do hereby affirm under penalty of perjury the truth of the following matters pursuant to CPLR 3020 (d) 3:

I am one of the attorneys for Plaintiff Anthony J. Gorgia. I have read the foregoing Verified Complaint and know the contents thereof. The same are true to my knowledge, except as to matters therein stated to be alleged on information and belief and as to those matters I believe them to be true. My statement is based upon conversations with my client as well as materials contained in the file in my office.

The reason that this Verification is being made by me and not by my client is that my firm is located in a county where my client has neither a residence nor a place of business. To the best of my knowledge, information and belief, formed after an inquiry reasonable under the circumstances, the presentation of these papers or the contentions therein are not frivolous as defined in subsection (c) of section 130-1.1 of the Rules of the Chief Administrator (22 NYCRR).

Dated: February 3, 2021

Raymond W. Belair

### **APPENDIX B**

AFFIDAVIT OF FORMER FBI SPECIAL AGENT IN CHARGE KENNETH T. MCCABE

Certified Fraud Examiner (CFE), former Special Agent-in-Charge (SAC) of the Federal Bureau of Investigation (FBI), former Pennsylvania Gaming Control Board (PGCB) Commissioner, owner of KTM & Associates Consulting and Investigations

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 95

INDEX NO. 151501/2020

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 06/24/2021

SUPREME COURT OF THE STATE OF NEW YORK COUNTY OF RICHMOND

ANTHONY J. GORGIA,

Index No.: 151501/2020

Plaintiff,

-against-

.

AFFIDAVIT OF KENNETH T. McCABE IN SUPPORT OF CROSS-MOTION AND IN OPPOSITION TO MOTION TO DISMISS

TIMOTHY DOLAN, THE ROMAN CATHOLIC ARCHDIOCESE OF NEW YORK, ADAM PARK, PETER HARMAN, THE PONTIFICAL NORTH AMERICAN COLLEGE, JOHN GEARY McDONALD and "JOHN DOE-I" through "JOHN DOE-XXV,"

Defendants.

-----X

KENNETH T. McCABE, being first duly sworn, deposes and says:

1. I am a former Special Agent-in-Charge ("SAC") of the Federal Bureau of Investigation ("FBI"). I am also a Certified Fraud Examiner ("CFE"), having been certified by the Association of Certified Fraud Examiners ("ACFE"). My public service began when I served for nearly nine years as a Commissioned Officer in the United States Marine Corps ("USMC") upon graduation from Lycoming College with a Bachelor's degree in Political Science. While an Officer of Marines, I received an appointment as a

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 95

Special Agent ("SA") in the FBI. I was Honorably Discharged at the rank of Major, a senior officer or "field grade officer." I later retired as a member of the Senior Executive Service ("SES-4") in the FBI after twenty-one years of service. In my last assignment with the FBI, I served as the SAC of the Pittsburgh Division and directed eleven satellite offices located in two States. Prior to my assignment as the SAC, Pittsburgh, I served as a Senior Executive in the FBI Laboratory Division where I was responsible for the FBI's scientific and technical response to any major crisis, special event or Weapon of Mass Destruction ("WMD") incident worldwide. I directed the FBI's scientific and technical response to the bombing of the USS Cole; the September 11, 2001 attack on America; the Anthrax Investigation; and the 2002 Winter Olympics. I was in charge of the FBI's scientific and technical response and support to the 2000 Democrat and Republican Presidential Conventions. I was one of the FBI's On-Scene-Commanders for the 2002 Winter Olympics and assigned to a Special White House Working Group addressing WMD matters. I was an Inspector conducting audits of FBI offices. I helped start and was then in charge of the FBI's Russian Organized Crime Program. As a Supervisor in Miami, Florida, I was in charge of all drug money laundering investigations. I created strategic plans for major events and crises and managed the response to these crises as the SWAT/Crisis Management Coordinator in Miami,

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 95

Florida. I conducted numerous investigations as a Special Agent involving insurance fraud, bank robberies, drugs, money laundering, kidnappings, extortions, organized crime, fugitives, public corruption and interstate transportation of stolen goods and vehicles. I developed and operated numerous individuals who provided information/intelligence in criminal matters. As a Supervisor and Senior Executive in the FBI I had to evaluate information/intelligence and evidence developed during an investigation. I prepared affidavits for search warrants, arrest warrants and T-III<sup>1</sup> surveillance of individuals' electronic devices. I have testified before Federal and State Grand Juries, Magistrates and Federal Judges. I consulted with the governments of Tinian and The Bahamas on gaming issues and conducted international probity background investigations and security reviews for the governments of The Bahamas and Tinian. I likewise conducted training on how to conduct probity background investigations for those government investigators.

2. I was awarded a Master of Science degree in Criminal Justice Administration from Point Park University, Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania, in 2007. I completed courses at the Kellogg School of Management and The Executive Seminar at Harvard/MIT. I have management experience at all levels of management, and I taught

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> *Title III* of *the Omnibus Crime Control and Safe Streets Act of 1968*, which is a wiretap act. It requires Federal, state and other government officials to obtain judicial authorization for intercepting "wire, oral and electronic "communications such as telephone conversations and emails.

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 95

police schools in the FBI at the International Law Enforcement Academy ("ILEA") in Budapest, Hungary; at the FBI Academy, Quantico, Virginia; and in-country schools in Russia, Slovenia, and Austria. I instructed FBI Executives on Crisis Management and on how to manage high impact cases. I was an Assistant Professor at Point Park University in Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania, teaching courses on Terrorism, Crisis Communications, and Criminal Justice in the Intelligence-National Security Matters and Criminal Justice Programs. I was also an instructor with The Penn State Justice and Safety Institute, where I developed and presented classes in the Police Law Enforcement Executive Course and was an assessor for Law Enforcement entry level, midmanagement, and senior management. I served as an Adjunct Professor at Webster University, where I taught graduate-level courses in the School of Business and Technology and Security Management Courses. I am also a Consultant on Gaming Matters, Security, Crisis Management and Leadership. I am a public speaker to clubs, organizations, businesses, schools, and church groups on Ethics, Honor, Leadership, Gaming, Terrorism, and Crime and the FBI. I was Director, Investigative Services for "Lo Tignov LLC" which was a company investigating Health Care Fraud and Medicare Fraud. I am presently the owner of KTM & Associates Consulting and Investigations (Florida License # A1100285).

### FILED: RICHMOND COUNTY CLERK 06/20/2021 06:05 PM NYSCEF DOC. NO. 95

3. I make this affidavit based upon my extensive experience analyzing information/intelligence and evidence and conducting high-profile investigations; my expertise as a Certified Fraud Examiner; my personal knowledge of the Plaintiff's case, which I have followed for more than one year; my careful review of evidence, including video footage, in support of the detailed accusations of homosexual misconduct made against PETER HARMAN involving his former bishop and vulnerable ("HARMAN") seminarians at an orgy; my review of the Plaintiff's Complaint against defendants TIMOTHY DOLAN ("DOLAN"), THE ROMAN CATHOLIC ARCHDIOCESE OF NEW YORK ("ADNY"), ADAM PARK ("PARK"), HARMAN, JOHN GEARY MCDONALD ("MCDONALD"), THE PONTIFICAL NORTH AMERICAN COLLEGE ("NAC"), and "JOHN DOE-I" through "JOHN DOE-XXV"; the Plaintiff's Complaint Exhibits and other supportive evidence; and the defendants' Motions to Dismiss.

4. In undertaking an investigation, I consider three critical indicators of suspicion: *capability*, *opportunity*, and *motive*. In the process of examining the Plaintiff's Complaint and supportive evidence, I have attempted to identify the presence of each of these three indicators in what has been alleged against the defendants. After my examination, I believe there is strong evidence of *capability*, *opportunity*, and *motive* on the part of the defendants in this case.

### FILED: RICHMOND COUNTY CLERK 06/20/2021 06:05 PM NYSCEF DOC. NO. 95

5. In reviewing the claims brought forward by the Plaintiff, the defendants, owing to their positions of authority over subordinate seminarians, certainly possessed the capability of committing tortious acts such as those alleged in the Complaint. Based on my review of Complaint paragraphs 41, 63, 64, and 67-70, this capability appears to have already been actualized in the past by multiple defendants. Adult vulnerability can be of a physical, social, economic, or environmental nature. Although many vulnerable adult cases involve elder abuse and elder financial exploitation, seminarians are also vulnerable adults owing to their financial dependence and the power seminary and church leaders wield over them. The defendants' assertion of dominance is evident in how they induce a subordinate, such as the Plaintiff, into a relationship of submission, trust, and complete reliance upon them. A seminarian's vulnerabilities can be easily exploited by superiors for ulterior motives. The capability of HARMAN, PARK, and McDONALD [collectively with the NAC, "NAC Defendants"] to commit tortious acts against seminarians such as the Plaintiff is enhanced by the fact that these defendants are retained and supervised by members of the NAC Board of Governors, many of whom themselves were reported for having engaged in or covered up sexual misconduct similar to that alleged against some of the NAC Defendants (Complaint, paragraph 70).

6. As regards the matter of opportunity, the defendants appear to have exploited the Plaintiff's necessary departure for urgent surgery in order to remove him from the NAC under false pretenses. After HARMAN's initial efforts at subornment against the Plaintiff failed while he was still at the NAC, and after HARMAN was unable to persuade the Plaintiff's peers to defame him, HARMAN was forced to enlist the help of defendant DOLAN who was complicit in new, equally fabricated claims. As alleged in paragraphs 28, 31-35, and 85-88 of the Complaint, it seems that the Plaintiff was unjustly punished for doing precisely what the defendants had instructed him to do and had agreed upon in advance with respect to his departure for surgery. Paragraph 42 of the Complaint demonstrates why the defendants had to hastily exploit the Plaintiff's convalescence as an opportunity to secure his removal from the NAC as he was just about to have an upcoming peer evaluation by his fellow seminarians. According to the Complaint,

As GORGIA was respected among fellow NAC seminarians, the results of that evaluation were expected to be highly positive, which would have further put the lie to the falsehoods, concocted by HARMAN and PARK, and in which DOLAN was complicit, for removing GORGIA from the NAC.

The defendants also had to seize this opportunity to discontinue the Plaintiff before he could return and expose all the

incriminating evidence against them which they thought he may already have possessed.

7. While capability and opportunity are clearly evident in the actions of the defendants, I find the Complaint and the Plaintiff's evidence to be particularly effective at illustrating the motive with which the defendants acted. With respect to motive, I find the Complaint to reach a reasonable conclusion which logically follows from the facts recited. This conclusion states that the defendants conspired in a plan designed to prevent exposure of predatory homosexuality toward vulnerable subjects. Essentially, the defendants granted permission for the Plaintiff's departure for surgery, only to use this departure as a pretext for their motive. The defendants' actions took the form of discrimination against the heterosexual Plaintiff. As alleged in paragraph 63 of the Complaint,

Had GORGIA likewise been a homosexual who behaved as HARMAN and PARK were reported to have behaved by different witnesses, there is no reason to believe that they would have contrived their false reasons to collude with DOLAN to prohibit GORGIA's return to the NAC and to effectively insure that no one would ever ordain him.

Reviewing Complaint paragraphs 41 and 63, which cite precedent of similar scandals which devastated other U.S. seminaries around the same time, it is obvious why the Plaintiff was

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 95

"perceived as a threat" to exposing what the defendants feared he may have known about them at that point in time. To abet the defendants' motive, DOLAN turned down five requests from the Plaintiff for a meeting. DOLAN also disregarded compelling accounts by the Plaintiff and experts demonstrating the NAC Defendants' claims to be entirely fraught with deceit (Complaint paragraphs 44-46 and 49-51; Complaint Exhibits "L," "M," and "P"). Insofar as the defendants acted with deceit; and as all the incriminating evidence of HARMAN and PARK's homosexual histories involving subordinates unfolded gradually; I find it entirely consistent that the Plaintiff was unaware of the defendants' motives to discriminate against him until much later (Complaint paragraphs 55 and 63-70 and Complaint Exhibits "S" and "T"). As a Certified Fraud Examiner, I find the Plaintiff's unawareness of the defendants' real motives until later to be plausible, owing to the fraudulent narrative they produced in order to distract him from discovering their real intentions. Such distraction, a veritable case of "gaslighting," is a typical form of manipulation used by offenders toward subordinates in order to prevent the former's deeds from coming to light. The defendants' fraud was compounded by the fact that they had previously induced the Plaintiff to submit to their dominance in a relationship of trust and reliance; only for

these defendants to later manifest these pledges as void by actions so contrary to what they had promised.

8. When I conduct an investigation, I attempt to locate a precedent of an accused party having abused his position to take advantage of others and possessing the power to cover up such abuse. Corroboration via precedent is an important tool, particularly when establishing the strength of a claim for After my review of the Plaintiff's sexual discrimination. Complaint and Exhibits, and based upon my own following of the Plaintiff's case, I believe there is overwhelming precedent in this regard. In this case, I have been able to locate not only credible accounts from multiple, independent witnesses in which a number of the defendants were reported to have used their dominance to exploit vulnerable persons, but also of defendants enlisting the help of those with even greater power to cover up their actions. I find it an injustice for any of the defendants to avoid addressing all of the corroborating accounts which were revealed following the initial grooming activity the Plaintiff witnessed at the hands of PARK toward one of PARK's subordinates. After reading vivid accounts of HARMAN and the NAC Board of Governors' history of homosexual misconduct, as well as PARK's history which only begins to include NAC seminarians becoming the object of taunts by him for rejecting

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 95

sexual harassment; seminarians "crying out for help" with regard to exploitation; seminarians being intimidated from making reports to NAC superiors or coerced into leaving for what they witnessed; or attributions of "aggressive homosexual behavior" to the Vice-Rector, I am convinced that the defendants are incorrect when they depict the Plaintiff's First Cause of Action as "paranoid speculation" (*Memorandum of Law* of DOLAN and the ADNY, "Point V," page 11).

9. In addition to what I already stated in paragraph 5 of my affidavit regarding precedent, I find convincing precedent supporting the Complaint in the evidence, including video footage, I reviewed regarding allegations that HARMAN was engaged in graphic sexual acts with his former Ordinary, Bishop George Lucas ("Lucas"), at an orgy in the presence of vulnerable seminarians. Also implicated in these allegations are Bishop Kevin Vann ("Vann"), a current member of the NAC Board of Governors, and other members of the clergy of the Diocese of Springfield in Illinois (Complaint, paragraph 68). The eyewitness and a certain number of those alleged to have been present at the orgy meet the criteria of "adult vulnerability" which I defined in paragraph 5 of my affidavit. The eyewitness provided an account that is entirely credible. I found the account consistent even with respect to the level of particular

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 95

details which were logical; capable of being verified by a third party and other witnesses; and supported by corroborating evidence. Among the details the witness provided are the reported setting of the orgy; the alleged dimensions and specific descriptions of HARMAN's and other participants' intimate body parts; and the graphic sexual acts attributed to HARMAN and Lucas, among others. I also find it to the witness' credit that his account is corroborated by separate, independent evidence. This verification includes records not only of additional misconduct accusations against HARMAN's former bishop, Lucas, fitting a similar pattern involving seminarians, but also against a number of the Springfield clerics named as participants in the orgy. No less than twenty Springfield priests, including participants at the orgy, have been accused in documentation of homosexual misconduct - as recently as 2018 - which in multiple cases involved vulnerable adults.

10. In the case of the orgy at which sexual acts in the presence of seminarians are attributed to HARMAN, the eyewitness who possessed this incriminating knowledge about him and Lucas was met with threats and reprisals. Just as HARMAN and Lucas seem to have feared that the witness would expose their grave sexual acts following the orgy, HARMAN and the other defendants feared that the Plaintiff would expose what they believed he may

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 95

have discovered about them while he was at the NAC. Just as HARMAN was aided by Lucas, his former bishop; Vann, a current member of the NAC Board of Governors; and other high-powered church officials, it is obvious that HARMAN used his own position of power as the NAC Rector and was aided by those with even greater power to cover up predatory homosexuality at the NAC. According to the Complaint and evidence I reviewed, the latter include DOLAN; various ADNY officials; the NAC Board of Governors and other NAC officials; Bishop Thomas Paprocki, HARMAN's current Ordinary; and the Ordinaries of PARK and McDONALD, among many other prelates, all of whom received and ignored incriminating reports.

11. Among the supportive evidence I reviewed are communications sent to both the U.S. Nunciature and to HARMAN about the orgy. I find it suspicious that both the Vatican and HARMAN's current and former Ordinaries have, to the present, left these allegations without an authentic, independent, and impartial investigation, even while the witness stands prepared to furnish a "disturbing first-hand report" and "several photographs of a private party." An omission of such an investigation has since given HARMAN dominance and enhanced capability over additional vulnerable subjects as the NAC Rector. Similarly, HARMAN's response, signed in his own hand,

reveals a number of suspicious characteristics. Most striking are the absence of a denial which is aided by carefully chosen words, and HARMAN's recommendation that his conduct be reported to Lucas, an obvious apparent conflict of interest owing to Lucas' own compromised position in the allegations.

12. From my experience as a Certified Fraud Examiner, I have found that fraudulent concealment of illicit conduct can take multiple forms. In cases of clerical misconduct, concealment by church officials often includes tactics such as inducement of trust by superiors over vulnerable subjects; gaslighting and other forms of manipulation; whitewash, including the intentional exclusion of witnesses to produce a contrived conclusion; preemptive and ad hominem attacks on witnesses; feigned plausible deniability; refusal to investigate alleged offenses; and deceptive public statements. After examining the Complaint and evidence which the Plaintiff's attorneys are prepared to reveal in discovery, I can identify each of these tactics as present in the actions of either the defendants or those with greater power who abetted the cover-up of defendants' conduct.

13. When gathering information/intelligence during an investigation, it has been my experience that information/intelligence is developed in many ways. It is

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 95

developed by interviewing witnesses, co-conspirators, or victims; interviewing experts; and by reviewing evidence and historical data. At times, it is necessary to interview individuals who are criminals, were criminals, were engaged in illegal activity, or were involved in questionable activity. These individuals are not always the most upstanding people of society. In order to ascertain their statements/information's credibility, I look at their history for providing truthful or helpful information in the past; I try to determine what reason they would have for providing bad or inaccurate information; and I attempt to identify what they would gain by providing either helpful information or bad information. After my thorough analysis and for the reasons I relayed in paragraphs 9-12 of my affidavit, I find no reason to doubt the credibility of the information provided by the eyewitness regarding the orgy.

14. Having conducted a careful examination of the Plaintiff's allegations, I find these allegations to be credible; not frivolous; supported by documentary evidence; and made in good faith.

Sworn to before me this 20<sup>th</sup> day of June, 2021

RAYMOND W. BELAIR NOTARY PUBLIC, STATE OF NEW YORK Registration No. 02BE6408261 Westchester County Commission Expires September 14 2020

KENNETH T. MoCABE

KENNETH T. McCABE

#### CERTIFICATION OF COUNSEL PURSUANT TO UNIFORM RULE 202.8-b

I, Raymond W. Belair certify that that in conformity with 4 Uniform Rule 202.8-b That the foregoing affidavit is contains no more than 3,176 words, inclusive of all words, in conformity with the limits set forth in at Rule 202.8-a.

In conformity with Rule 202.b(c) I have relied on the word processor system for the word count in preparing this document.

AIR RAYMOND

•

# APPENDIX C

AFFIDAVIT OF A SUBJECT OF FATHER ADAM PARK'S SEXUAL MISCONDUCT

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 96

INDEX NO. 151501/2020 RECEIVED NYSCEF: 06/24/2021

SUPREME COURT OF THE STATE OF NEW YORK COUNTY OF RICHMOND

-----X

ANTHONY J. GORGIA,

Index No.: 151501/2020

Plaintiff,

-against-

AFFIDAVIT OF MICHAEL PATRICK CASSABON IN SUPPORT OF CROSS-MOTION AND IN OPPOSITION TO MOTION TO DISMISS

TIMOTHY DOLAN, THE ROMAN CATHOLIC ARCHDIOCESE OF NEW YORK, ADAM PARK, PETER HARMAN, THE PONTIFICAL NORTH AMERICAN COLLEGE, JOHN GEARY McDONALD and "JOHN DOE-I" through "JOHN DOE-XXV,"

Defendants.

-----X

MICHAEL PATRICK CASSABON, being first duly sworn, deposes and says:

1. I am an alumnus of THE PONTIFICAL NORTH AMERICAN COLLEGE ("NAC"), class of 2007. I was in attendance at the NAC as a seminarian for the Diocese of Charleston, South Carolina from 2003-2007. I was ordained a priest in 2007. During my time at

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 96

INDEX NO. 151501/2020 RECEIVED NYSCEF: 06/24/2021

the NAC, defendants ADAM PARK ("PARK"), class of 2005, and JOHN GEARY McDONALD ("McDONALD"), class of 2007, were also in attendance. While residing at the NAC, I studied theology and Canon Law at the Pontifical Gregorian University and the Pontifical University of the Holy Cross in Rome. I obtained an S.T.B. from the Gregorian University and completed one year of studies in Canon Law at the Pontifical University of the Holy Cross. Subsequent to my studies in Rome, I received another theology degree a Master of Theology from Duke Divinity School in Durham, North Carolina, in 2012. I am presently the Director of Advancement at the University of Toronto Libraries.

2. I make this affidavit based upon: my personal knowledge of defendants NAC, PARK, and McDONALD; my experience of having been the subject of an uninvited sexual advance by PARK; my experience of attempting to report PARK's conduct to defendant PETER HARMAN ("HARMAN") out of concern for vulnerable NAC seminarians; my review of the allegations contained in the Plaintiff's Complaint; and my experience of the tactics employed by members of the Roman Catholic clergy to aid cover-up of sexual abuse by priests under their supervision.

3. While I would not consider PARK and I friends, I did witness his behaviors for the two years we were at the NAC together. He would often approach men from behind and lay his

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 96

hands on their shoulders, caress and rub their shoulders and upper back, and put his hand on the small of their backs. This was not invited by the other men and from my perspective did not seem welcome. This behavior became more noticeable in the pub during evenings of heavy drinking - the culture of heavy drinking was not unique to the NAC, but is one of the characteristics of clerical culture. I noticed PARK would perform this behavior often on seminarians who were younger than he was. While I did not know PARK as a friend, he would nonetheless approach me from time to time, usually in the basement gym or the pub at the NAC, and punch me in the upper arm near the shoulder. He would do so in an ostensibly playful manner, but the punches would sometimes sting. He would then caress the area he had punched, and it became clear to me that he was doing so in order to put his hands on my biceps and triceps. I was not attracted to PARK and I did not appreciate his behavior. However, I did not feel comfortable at the time reporting his behavior. Such a report, I felt, would bring me more harm than good.

4. On an evening in 2008, at a restaurant in Dupont Circle, Washington D.C., PARK "felt me up" by rubbing my pectoral muscles while making cooing remarks in my ear. He complimented me on my physique and told me that I must have been going to the

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 96

gym a lot. I was surprised that the Cardinal's secretary was being so obvious in front of others. Cardinal Donald Wuerl was known for his precision and politically astuteness, and PARK's behavior was sloppy and very imprudent. We were not friends and it was shocking to me that he was so forward, especially in public. Given the climate in the Church, I would have thought that PARK would have been much more discreet. PARK's actions had a definite sexual connotation; were unwanted; and unwelcomed. At the time of this event, PARK was the priestsecretary of Cardinal Wuerl, ex-Cardinal McCarrick's successor as Archbishop of Washington.

5. While I was at the NAC, I observed that PARK and MCDONALD were friendly with one another. PARK was two years ahead of MCDONALD and I (who are classmates). MCDONALD and I were also in the same Gesu Caritas spiritual group together during our first year at the NAC. I perceived McDONALD to be politically astute, more mature and "worldly" than most of the rest of us were at the time, and one of the biggest purveyors of gossip in the seminary. McDONALD delighted in gossip, especially around the insinuations of the sexual lives of priest faculty members and seminarians. I did not trust him. Owing to their relationship which predates by nearly fifteen years the time when McDONALD became the Plaintiff's formation advisor, I was

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 96

not surprised to learn in the Plaintiff's case that McDONALD was complicit in a plan to protect PARK from exposure at the NAC, which occurred to the detriment of the Plaintiff.

6. On March 25, 2020 I first learned about the Plaintiff's case in an online article on the *Church Militant* website. I found the Plaintiff's allegations of what he observed to be extremely credible. Recognizing a striking pattern between the conduct alleged against PARK at the NAC and my own experience of his behavior, I volunteered to speak with the Plaintiff and to offer my own account.

7. I first spoke with the Plaintiff on June 29, 2020. During this conversation, I shared with the Plaintiff my experience of having received an unwanted sexual advance by PARK. I told the Plaintiff that I believed in the truthfulness of his account of what he experienced by the defendants, and I expressed my support for him.

8. Having been a NAC seminarian, I was aware that HARMAN, as the Rector, is bound by duty to protect the seminarians under his control; to create a safe environment free from harassment or exploitation; and to act diligently upon any allegations concerning NAC faculty members abusing their power toward seminarians. Since PARK, as the NAC's Vice Rector, is under HARMAN's supervision, I felt obliged to report to HARMAN my

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 96

accusation of PARK's unwelcomed advance in Dupont Circle in support of the Plaintiff. I made this report to HARMAN in writing in July 2020 which I copied to HARMAN's predecessor as NAC Rector, Bishop James Checchio, now the Bishop of Metuchen. In my email, I provided details, recounted in paragraph "4" of my affidavit, to substantiate my accusation. I prefaced my account by informing HARMAN that I believed the Plaintiff's description of events, one of the reasons being my own firsthand experience of PARK's penchant for physical contact. I also made known to HARMAN my concerns about hearing that seminarians under PARK's dominance are being propositioned, writing,

> ...Adam's penchant for inappropriate touchyfeeliness becomes a whole new thing entirely when such unwanted physical touch is initiated by an ecclesiastical superior to a man under his jurisdiction.

I concluded my report by informing HARMAN that I would closely monitor the matter to see if the Plaintiff's accusations and my own report would be resolved.

9. On July 1, 2020 I received an email from HARMAN. HARMAN's reply avoided any response to the accusations I detailed to him concerning PARK. I found it very incriminating that, instead of addressing the improper sexual behavior I recounted about PARK and the risk to NAC seminarians' wellbeing, HARMAN's reaction was to direct ad hominem attacks toward

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 96

the Plaintiff. HARMAN wrote in such a way as to disparage the Plaintiff, accusing him of "ignoring" alleged deficiencies and of "fabrication." HARMAN mentioned that he was aware of what the Plaintiff observed involving PARK's uninvited physical contact with a subordinate formation advisee (Complaint, paragraphs 23-24), but there was no indication that HARMAN had taken any dutiful action which, as Rector, he would have been obliged to do.

10. HARMAN closed his email to me by writing,

...you can ask any current student about the current climate of the house, and any one [sic] would tell you it is not consistent with what Anthony describes or CM [Church Militant news website] want [sic] to depict.

After I read the Plaintiff's Complaint and reviewed Complaint Exhibits such as Exhibit "S" from distressed NAC seminarians complaining about PARK, my concern was confirmed that HARMAN is misrepresenting what really has been taking place at the NAC (Complaint, paragraphs 23-26 and 63-70). From my knowledge of PARK and the NAC, I find the Complaint's allegations to be consistent and credible.

11. I sent a response to HARMAN on or about July 1, 2020 in which I asked him if the Plaintiff's accusations had ever been investigated and what PARK's current status at the time was. When HARMAN refused to respond to my inquiry, it became obvious

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 96

that no investigation had ever occurred and that the NAC had neither been transparent nor wished to hear from me.

12. While the NAC issued a February 2021 statement to Catholic News Agency in response to the Plaintiff's lawsuit claiming that "seminarians are encouraged to report any allegations of misconduct and assured that such allegations are taken seriously," this claim is totally inconsistent with my own experience of how HARMAN dismissed my report. Just as members of an institution can be held accountable if they do not forward allegations of sexual misconduct to all responsible higher authorities, HARMAN should have acted upon my report and shared it with the NAC Board of Governors and with defendant TIMOTHY DOLAN ("DOLAN"), the Plaintiff's Ordinary. A person who is falsely accused of wrongdoing ordinarily welcomes an investigation to clear his or her name. To my knowledge, neither HARMAN nor PARK - nor any of the other defendants for that matter - have ever welcomed an investigation. Furthermore, to the present, neither HARMAN nor any other NAC officials have investigated the report I submitted nearly one year ago.

13. In the same article from Catholic News Agency, a statement from the ARCHDIOCESE OF NEW YORK ("ADNY") claimed that the allegations in the Plaintiff's Complaint are "absurd and have no basis in fact or law." Based on my own personal

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 96

experience, I strongly object. My reported encounter with PARK at Dupont Circle truly has a "basis in fact." As a former NAC seminarian myself, I am aware of the vulnerabilities of seminarians who place their trust in their superiors. Based on all of my life experiences, I am aware that many superiors abuse this trust for ulterior and often self-seeking motives. It is for this reason that I wrote to HARMAN, "I am convinced that *la bella figura*<sup>1</sup> - that thing we NACers do so excruciatingly wellhas to die if the Church is to be reformed." Seminarians should be able to thrive in a safe environment free of harassment, abuse, and reprisals from those in positions of power over them. It is for this reason I hope that this case will move forward, justice will be served, and truth will prevail.

### MICHAEL PATRICK CASSABON

#### MICHAEL PATRICK CASSABON

Sworn to before me this 20th day of June, 2021

RAYMOND W. BELAIR NOTARY PUBLIC, STATE OF NEW YORK Registration No. 02BE6408261 Westchester County Commission Expires September 14 202

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> The public projection of perfection.

#### CERTIFICATION OF COUNSEL PURSUANT TO UNIFORM RULE 202.8-b

I, Raymond W. Belair certify that that in conformity with Uniform Rule 202.8-b That the foregoing affidavit is contains no more than 1,890 words, inclusive of all words, in conformity with the limits set forth in at Rule 202.8-a.

In conformity with Rule 202.b(c) I have relied on the word processor system for the word count in preparing this document.

YMOND W. BELAIR

## APPENDIX D

## AFFIDAVIT OF FORMER SEMINARY FORMATOR GENE THOMAS GOMULKA

Sexual abuse victims' advocate and investigative reporter, former seminary formator and instructor with an S.T.L. from the Pontifical University of St. Thomas Aquinas in Rome, former Navy Chaplain/Captain (O6), former member of the U.S. Marine Corps Inspector General Team, ordained a priest for the Altoona-Johnstown Diocese and later made a Prelate of Honor (Monsignor) by St. John Paul II

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 94

INDEX NO. 151501/2020 RECEIVED NYSCEF: 06/21/2021

SUPREME COURT OF THE STATE OF NEW YORK COUNTY OF RICHMOND

-----X

ANTHONY J. GORGIA,

Index No.: 151501/2020

Plaintiff,

-against-

AFFIDAVIT OF EUGENE THOMAS GOMULKA IN SUPPORT OF CROSS-MOTION IN OPPOSITION TO MOTION TO DISMISS

TIMOTHY DOLAN, THE ROMAN CATHOLIC ARCHDIOCESE OF NEW YORK, ADAM PARK, PETER HARMAN, THE PONTIFICAL NORTH AMERICAN COLLEGE, JOHN GEARY McDONALD and "JOHN DOE-I" through "JOHN DOE-XXV,"

Defendants.

----X

EUGENE THOMAS GOMULKA, being first duly sworn, deposes and says:

1. I am a former seminary faculty instructor/formator and Catholic Navy Chaplain having retired in 2004 with the rank of Navy Captain (O6) after 24 years of active-duty military service. I earned a bachelor's degree from St. Francis University in Loretto, Pennsylvania in 1970. As a diocesan

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 94

seminarian, I was sent to undertake my theological studies in Rome with residence at THE PONTIFICAL NORTH AMERICAN COLLEGE ("NAC"). While enrolled at the Pontifical University of Saint Thomas Aquinas in Rome, I earned a Bachelor of Sacred Theology (S.T.B.) degree in 1973 before being ordained a priest for the Diocese of Altoona-Johnstown, PA in 1974. After returning to Rome where I completed a Licentiate in Sacred Theology (S.T.L.) in 1975, I then was assigned as an associate pastor of Our Lady of Victory Church in State College, PA and also was a member of the faculty and theology instructor to major seminarians (graduate students) at St. Francis Seminary in Loretto, PA. I am very familiar with the seminary formation program which involves preparing, evaluating, and voting on candidates for advancement, all of which I did as a member of the faculty.

2. In 1980 I was granted permission by my bishop to serve as a chaplain to Marine Corps and Navy personnel and their families. In 1986, while serving as the Assistant U.S. Sixth Fleet Chaplain based in Gaeta, Italy, I founded the Navy Chaplain Candidate Program in Europe designed to recruit seminarians from both the NAC in Rome and its counterpart, the American College (seminary) in Louvain, Belgium. Following my Sixth Fleet tour, I was assigned to the Navy Chief of Chaplains Office in Washington, DC where I served as Head, Ecclesiastical

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 94

INDEX NO. 151501/2020 RECEIVED NYSCEF: 06/21/2021

Relations and Recruitment Branch. One of my primary duties was to recruit and evaluate Catholic seminarian and priest candidates for acceptance into the Navy Chaplain Corps. A number of those I recruited and evaluated were seminarians from the NAC and the ARCHDIOCESE OF NEW YORK (ADNY). In the course of my three year tour, I communicated with almost every Ordinary (the archbishop or bishop in charge of an archdiocese or diocese) in the United States; visited almost every Catholic major seminary in the United States; and evaluated seminarians and priests to determine whether they should be accepted and subsequently retained or discontinued as chaplain candidates, reserve or active-duty chaplains. At the end of that tour of duty, I was awarded a Meritorious Service Medal for having exceeded all prior recruitments by recruiting 27 percent of the Catholic Chaplains on active duty, 34 percent of those in the Naval Reserve, and 66 percent of the Catholic seminarians in the Chaplain Candidate Program at that time.

3. During my three-year tour as the Deputy Chaplain of the U.S. Marine Corps (USMC) from 1991 to 1994, I co-authored the Marine Corps and Navy Core Values of "Honor, Courage, and Commitment." During that tour, as an investigator on the USMC Inspector General (IG) Team, I handled five sex abuse cases involving 5 Catholic chaplains who made up 10 percent of the

#### FILED: RICHMOND COUNTY CLERK 06/20/2021 06:05 PM NYSCEF DOC. NO. 94

Catholic Chaplains serving with Marines. Four of the chaplains were found guilty of homosexual predation, and one was found guilty of pedophilia. Another supervisory position I held was as the Marine Forces Pacific Chaplain from 1999 to 2002 when I supervised some 150 chaplains from 47 faith groups who were stationed or deployed with some 80,000 Marines over 2/3rds of the Earth.

4. In 1999 I was made a Prelate of Honor by Saint Pope John Paul II with the title of "Monsignor." Before retiring in 2004, the Secretary of the Navy awarded me the Alfred Thayer Mahan Award (which some refer to as the military equivalent of a Pulitzer Prize) "for literary achievement and inspirational leadership." Owing to my literary endeavors and investigatory experience in the field of sex abuse, I now serve as an abuse consultant and investigative reporter.

5. I make this affidavit based upon my personal knowledge of the Plaintiff, Anthony J. Gorgia; my personal knowledge of defendants NAC and TIMOTHY DOLAN ("DOLAN") with whom I both lived and studied in Rome for three years; my personal knowledge of a priest with whom I studied and worked for seven years who was alleged to have engaged in sexual relations with NAC seminarians when he was on the NAC faculty; my training in and application of Canon Law throughout my ministry; my experience

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 94

of having been on the faculty of a major seminary; my experience of having been a military recruiter and evaluator of seminarians from seminaries in both the United States and Europe, including the NAC and the ADNY; my experience as a chaplain supervisor who has handled a number of abuse cases involving predator priest chaplains; and my experience as an investigator on the USMC Inspector General (IG) team who was able to show the tactics Catholic Church leaders used to cover-up and underreport sex abuse on the part of priests under their supervision.

6. Plaintiff's allegations do not constitute an internal Church matter being addressed under precepts contained in the Catholic Church's Code of Canon Law (*Codex Iuris Canonici* or "CIC"). As a seminarian, Plaintiff had no rights whatsoever under Canon Law, except those rights such as to a Christian Burial which are the rights of any faithful Catholic, and which do not afford any particular rights or protections to seminarians. He is not and never has been a minister of the Church. As the Church and each defendant have consistently admitted, without having ever been ordained a deacon or priest, the Plaintiff is not a member of the clergy; he is and always was a layman. The Plaintiff's identity as a seminarian does not align with what I understand to be attributes the Courts have looked when defining a minister: he has never been

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 94

ordained; he has never presided at public worship and was not a "religious leader;" nor were his essential and regular duties the transmission of the Church's doctrine and mission. I find it ridiculous that defendants attempt to mislead the Court by calling the Plaintiff a "minister" based upon isolated tasks which any member of the laity could have performed. For example, defendants erroneously cite as a "religious duty" that on just one occasion, the Plaintiff assisted Pope Francis at a Mass as an extracurricular activity (DOLAN and the ADNY's Memorandum of Law, "Point II," page 5). I find the aforementioned to be far from adequate credentials of a minister. On the occasion mentioned, the Plaintiff was assisting the Pope in a way not at all different from how any young parish altar server who might carry a bishop's miter (ceremonial pointed hat) at a Mass. The Plaintiff was not a member of the clergy, and his participation had nothing to do with the clerical state, as any member of the laity can assist in this capacity. Similarly, defendants cannot stretch the Plaintiff's "helping the sick in Lourdes, France" at only one point in time into a "religious duty" reserved to ministers ("Point II," page 5), as a broad range of other laypersons including doctors and nurses fit this same secular descriptive. I see no reason to take up the Court's time by quoting from irrelevant Church documents. Writing for the defendants, Father George Sears, who is the rector of a minor,

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 94

INDEX NO. 151501/2020 RECEIVED NYSCEF: 06/21/2021

and not a major seminary like the NAC where the Plaintiff was enrolled, consumed quite a number of pages talking about Church norms and canonical statutes without demonstrating how these directives apply to this particular case; without addressing the fraudulent and discriminatory behavior of the defendants; and without demonstrating how breach of duties, defamation, fraud, discrimination, and the other claims set forth in the Complaint can be construed as simply internal church matters. As a seminary rector - even if it is only a minor seminary - Father Sears also ought to have known that retaliation against seminarians who are not complicit with misconduct on the part of superiors is not immune from civil liability.

7. As both a seminary formator and seminarian recruiter, I take exception to Father Sears' claims about "the exclusively religious nature of the seminary" and the defendants' attempts to exclude seminaries from civil accountability. This is simply not so. The sexual harassment, discrimination, defamation and other tortious claims in the Complaint are no more internal "religious" church matters than the abuse committed by Jerry Sandusky was an internal "university" Penn State matter. Similarly, while defendants claim their actions to be "consonant with the norms of evaluation and the religious nature of the undertaking" (Johnson Jr.'s Affidavit or Affirmation in Support

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 94

of Motion, paragraph 26), there are absolutely no tenets of Church doctrine or seminary norms which have anything to do with endorsing the act of discrimination against a heterosexual by homosexual defendants; defamation; fraud; and the other torts brought forward by the Plaintiff. It is no part of Catholic doctrine or dogma that such acts be performed, and lying is obviously no part of it either.

8. What is most telling about Sears' 25-page legally constructed affidavit is that it gives the impression that Sears has no personal knowledge of the Plaintiff. The fact is, however, the Plaintiff studied under Sears for two years at Cathedral Seminary House of Formation ("Douglaston") during which time Sears recommended that DOLAN nominate the Plaintiff to the NAC based on his superlative evaluations. As noted in Exhibit "D" of the Complaint, on November 17, 2017, Sears wrote, "Dear Anthony, I have been meaning to write this note a while now. I have heard that you are doing quite well at NAC, and that you speak Italian as if you've lived in Italy your whole life! Keep up the good work. Please be assured of my prayers and know how very proud we are of you. You left a great impression on us at Douglaston." At the start of the Plaintiff's second year at the NAC, just less than three months before DOLAN's letter of December 13, 2018, Sears again sent the Plaintiff a

commendation. In a handwritten note dated September 18, 2018, Sears wrote, "Dear Anthony, I thank God and I thank you for your generous response to His call. Please know that I pray the rosary daily for you and all the seminarians I have accompanied" (Exhibit "M").

9. In December of 2018 the Plaintiff received text messages from Dr. Robert Palumbo, the Psychologist at Cathedral Seminary, referencing Sears. The text messages came in the context of the Plaintiff just having received DOLAN's letter of December 13, 2018, abruptly blocking his return to the NAC, and the Plaintiff requesting to meet with DOLAN to present evidence proving the claims of NAC Rector PETER HARMAN ("HARMAN") to be false. In the text messages of December 16, 2018, Dr. Palumbo wrote, "I spoke to Fr. Sears and he said to tell you to stand strong...He feels very much as I do. And, he said to stay strong, he believes it's going to work out ... " Likewise, on December 21, 2018, Dr. Palumbo wrote, "I think you have to present your case to the Cardinal. I will support you in any way you believe is best. You have strong support at Douglaston, especially Fr. Sears who I spoke with again and understands your situation." Dr. Palumbo wrote the Plaintiff a glowing evaluation of December 14, 2018 attached as Exhibit "L" to the Complaint. DOLAN completely disregarded this with the result that the plan

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 94

INDEX NO. 151501/2020 RECEIVED NYSCEF: 06/21/2021

to cover up sexual harassment and misconduct at the NAC was allowed to progress. In disregarding Dr. Palumbo, DOLAN also breached his duty to the Plaintiff to whom, as his Diocesan Supervisor, DOLAN was obliged to prioritize the Plaintiff's best interests and was foremost responsible for the Plaintiff's welfare. In the event, DOLAN not only breached his duty of trust to the Plaintiff, but refused even to speak with him despite five requests, and ultimately abandoned him in favor of HARMAN, who studied under DOLAN at the NAC, but to whom DOLAN owed no duty whatsoever. Owing to the fact that Sears, whose career DOLAN holds in his hands, never made mention of any problems on the part of the Plaintiff in his affidavit, and has consistently stated his support for the Plaintiff, the authenticity of Sears' request that the "Plaintiff's complaint be dismissed with prejudice" is highly suspect.

10. After one reads the statement of a former NAC seminarian in paragraph 26 of the Complaint that he felt unable to report being a victim of sexual harassment by NAC Vice-Rector ADAM PARK ("PARK") because of NAC authorities' "close relationships with one another," it appears that a "conflict in the objective pursuit of justice" existed when it came to the Plaintiff's opportunities to report the Vice-Rector's misconduct (Complaint Exhibit "I," page 4, from the NAC's Freedom for

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 94

INDEX NO. 151501/2020 RECEIVED NYSCEF: 06/21/2021

Reporting. Just three weeks before the Plaintiff departed for surgery, HARMAN tried to fabricate statements against the Plaintiff (likely after he learned the Plaintiff had witnessed an episode of inappropriate behavior by PARK and that seminarians were speaking with the Plaintiff about PARK). When the Plaintiff requested to meet with HARMAN prior to his departure for New York, HARMAN declined the meeting, very likely out of fear that the Plaintiff wished to discuss what he may have learned about PARK. Understandably for similar reasons, JOHN GEARY McDONALD ("McDONALD") ignored the Plaintiff's request for an "urgent" telephone call just after receiving DOLAN's December 13, 2018 letter (Complaint, paragraph 47). What HARMAN and McDONALD did not realize, however, was that the Plaintiff at that point was not aware of the scope and severity of PARK's conduct with seminarians, nor did he have any idea of HARMAN's own homosexual behavior involving, among others, subordinate seminarians. After HARMAN'S initial efforts at fabricating claims against the Plaintiff failed, HARMAN had to, and did, create new, equally bogus reasons in order to drive the Plaintiff from the NAC; and DOLAN went along with the plan.

11. DOLAN also refused to meet with the Plaintiff after receiving five "urgent" requests from him. The defendants committed fraud by contriving false charges against the

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 94

Plaintiff who only later, with additional incriminating evidence provided by other NAC seminarians, became aware of their real motives for not wanting him to return and driving him out of formation. What the defendants did not anticipate, however, was that the Plaintiff would not be complicit with their plan which would require him to admit to the falsehoods crafted against him. Just as someone falsely accused of murder might not enter a guilty plea to avoid being executed, so too could the Plaintiff not violate his conscience by consenting to the defendants' defamatory statements which would imply he actually merited being discontinued from the NAC.

12. While the Plaintiff informed DOLAN in his letter of January 11, 2019 (Johnson Jr. Affirmation, Exhibit "I") that his coerced resignation came under duress, DOLAN disregarded this. Senior officials who deny subordinates an opportunity to present allegations of misconduct often do so in order to feign plausible deniability. Officials such as the defendants often engage in "gaslighting" which includes attempting to manipulate the complainant into admitting patently false claims against himself in an effort to distract an individual from discovering the transgressors' real motives.

13. In any event, even if the Plaintiff had already been in possession of all the incriminating evidence against the

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 94

defendants "during his time as a seminarian," and had he somehow prevailed in obtaining a meeting which defendants vigorously declined, I find absolutely no reason to believe they would have dutifully acted upon the allegations against PARK and HARMAN and rectified their unwarranted treatment of the Plaintiff. While the claim of DOLAN and the ADNY's counsel may be true that letters DOLAN received from the Plaintiff's supporters "approximately one month" after his coerced resignation did not specify allegations of discrimination and sexual misconduct (Johnson Jr.'s Affidavit or Affirmation in Support of Motion, paragraph 29), the whole truth is that DOLAN and responsible NAC officials did receive letters with these very accusations just some months later. The Plaintiff can provide evidence that DOLAN and NAC officials received and ignored no less than five such reports, and that HARMAN ignored reports he received concerning PARK while availing himself of the opportunity to further defame the Plaintiff.

14. Based upon my knowledge of what constitutes unpermitted conduct on the part of seminary superiors toward subordinate seminarians, and after reviewing the defendants' motions to dismiss, I find it a striking omission that the defendants fail to engage the full scope of sexual harassment, misconduct, and cover-up by NAC officials as alleged in the Complaint. Instead,

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 94

they incorrectly isolate only one of multiple and severe illicit incidents of misconduct permeating the NAC. In a curious rewrite of Complaint paragraphs 23-26, defendants refer to one of the events witnessed by the Plaintiff as "someone touching another person on the shoulder." I find this inaccurate description (for example, Memorandum of Law of DOLAN and the ADNY, Point VI, page 12) not contained in the Complaint to be very misleading.

15. The Complaint's well-founded conclusion of sexual discrimination encompasses not only the incident recounted in paragraph 23 concerning PARK's illicit physical contact with a subordinate; but also all the other relevant and detrimental facts alleged against the defendants. Such facts also include the multiple accounts of harassment offered in time by NAC seminarians and the astounding precedent of misconduct by certain NAC defendants (Complaint paragraphs 24-26 and 63-70; and Complaint Exhibits "S" and "T"). In my opinion, none of these aforementioned behaviors constitute an internal seminary matter or permitted conduct. In order to avoid exposure, which undoubtedly would have devastated their Church careers, the defendants seem to have desired to conceal these alleged offenses to the Plaintiff's detriment, only to somehow later call them "irrelevant" in their legal submissions.

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 94

INDEX NO. 151501/2020 RECEIVED NYSCEF: 06/21/2021

16. From my experience as an investigator on the USMC Inspector General (IG) team, I would use the following analogy to demonstrate what I believe was the motive behind the defendants' preemptive strike against the Plaintiff before he could expose sexual harassment and misconduct at the NAC. It is similar to a patron who walks into a convenience store that is being robbed and witnesses the thief killing the sales clerk. If the robber then shoots and kills the patron, the motive behind his action is to prevent the patron from testifying against him in Court. It seems to me that HARMAN and PARK panicked and feared that the Plaintiff might have had sufficient incriminating evidence regarding their sexual proclivities at that time, and that he might expose them upon his return following surgery. Hence, I believe they felt compelled to remove the Plaintiff just as a thief might feel bound to eliminate a murder witness.

17. Even though the U.S. Catholic population grew by 40% from 54.1 million in 1970 to 75.4 million in 2015, the number of graduate-level seminarians decreased during that period by 45% from 6,600 to 3,650. In light of the growing shortage of seminarians and priests in the Catholic Church today, it is very rare for someone who has been accepted as a seminarian by a bishop to be involuntarily transferred or separated. Anyone with

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 94

any seminary experience, such as your deponent, would immediately wonder why a seminarian was involuntarily discontinued early in the academic year without the full vote of the faculty. The Pontifical North American College Student Handbook ("Handbook"), Exhibit "E," identifies the following offenses that might result in discontinuing a seminarian "outside the normal evaluation process" as shown in Exhibit "N" of the Complaint:

- slander, calumny, or detraction;
- stealing, lying or cheating;
- sexual harassment or misconduct;
- the persistent use of any of the College's electronic
  resources for unhealthy, illegal, or immoral purposes;
- alcohol and drug misuse; and
- mental or emotional instability.

18. Certainly, none of these offenses were committed by the Plaintiff. It is also unheard of for a graduate-level seminarian to be involuntarily transferred from one seminary to another. Ironically, the allegations contained in the Complaint indicate that charges such as "sexual harassment or misconduct" or "slander, calumny, or detraction," which do warrant immediate

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 94

removal from the seminary, adequately apply to the defendants in their mistreatment of vulnerable seminarians. As such, it is obvious how the defendants could view the Plaintiff as a threat to having their secrets revealed. If a seminarian is not dismissed because of a criminal or moral offense, but is found lacking in his formation, he may be dismissed through "the normal evaluation process" which involves a vote of the entire faculty at the end of the academic year. The seminarian is provided the outcome of the vote, including the record of how many faculty members voted in favor of or in opposition to his continuance. Such was the case when the Plaintiff was informed that he earned the "unanimous" vote of the faculty at the end of his first year at the NAC to advance to the second year. This is sharply contrasted with the Plaintiff's sudden mid-year discontinuance just a few months later for which he was not supplied any record whatsoever regarding any faculty vote. Insofar as the Plaintiff's coerced discontinuation was imposed early on in the academic year without the full vote of the faculty, this action would had to have been based upon some very extraordinary circumstances, none of which existed in this case nor had they anything to do with the bogus concoctions provided by the NAC defendants to which DOLAN acquiesced. Certainly, the entire faculty would not have voted to discontinue the Plaintiff after having just unanimously voted that he be advanced as a

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 94

seminarian lest they be guilty of violating the procedures set forth in their own Handbook. The NAC by and through HARMAN and PARK, with the wiling complicity of McDONALD, failed to observe organizational procedures by surreptitiously going behind the backs of the faculty and advisors to force out a seminarian who had just been enthusiastically promoted and deemed a "star seminarian" who was congratulated by the entire faculty and rewarded by a special posting as representative to the Pontifical Gregorian University. This was only confirmed for me when I reviewed separate written accounts of how different NAC faculty members reacted to news of the Plaintiff's sudden midyear discontinuance. One NAC priest wrote that he found the Plaintiff's removal "sudden and sad" (Exhibit "H"). Another was described as stating that "everyone is upset that [the Plaintiff is] not coming back." No less compelling is the account I read in paragraph 70 of the Complaint in which a NAC faculty member decried "obvious issues" at the NAC which "remain unresolved." The numerous irregularities contained in the actions of the defendants show that this case clearly does not involve a normal, internal seminary matter.

19. The Pontifical North American College Formation Program ("Program"), Exhibit "F," makes clear that the seminarian's formation advisor is "most directly concerned" with his assigned

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 94

INDEX NO. 151501/2020 RECEIVED NYSCEF: 06/21/2021

seminarian's advancement, and that the formation advisor "represents the seminarian to the faculty and the faculty to the seminarian" (page 22, "Formation Advisor," 4a). This description is consistent with my own major seminary experience. In a normal situation, a formation advisor is obliged to inform his assigned seminarian if the faculty raises concerns about his standing. Based on McDONALD's interactions with the Plaintiff, it is obvious that he never at any point advised the Plaintiff of any alleged concerns of the faculty. Similarly, a seminarian is directed to trust that his formation advisor will represent his concerns to the faculty should any arise. Based on my experience and my reading of Complaint paragraph 47, I find that McDONALD breached his duty when he failed to assist the Plaintiff and neglected to refute HARMAN's claims which he would have known firsthand to be entirely false.

20. Under normal circumstances, an evaluation to determine continuance, which regularly occurs at the end of the year, also allows the seminarian to voice his concerns and to make these concerns known to the entire faculty if he believes his evaluation was unfair or incorrect. It is highly suspect that, if the punitive measures against the Plaintiff truly did come with the consent of the whole faculty, such extreme measures

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 94

INDEX NO. 151501/2020 RECEIVED NYSCEF: 06/21/2021

were taken while the Plaintiff was blocked from having his concerns and evidence heard.

21. Based on my experience in seminary work, I find Sears' discussion of "gradualism" in paragraph 9 of his affidavit regarding a seminarian's suitability based on increasingly demanding goals per year actually to be very incriminating of the defendants insofar as they allege not a gradual decline by a hitherto "star seminarian" in every respect, but a sudden "nosedive" in an untenably short time. As paragraphs 36 and 37 of the Complaint make clear, HARMAN initiated baseless criticisms against the Plaintiff not one year, but just two days after McDONALD had informed the Plaintiff that he had mastered "the formational stage required." While HARMAN sought to deceive the Plaintiff by claiming that McDONALD had already made the Plaintiff aware of these bogus criticisms, McDONALD's statement only two days earlier proves that this was clearly not the case. Also noteworthy is that the Plaintiff had just received the unanimous accolades and vote of the faculty to advance to the second year, and that HARMAN's plot to defame the Plaintiff began only after the Plaintiff had witnessed and received word from other seminarians about PARK. Similarly, as noted in paragraph 29 of the Complaint, DOLAN had congratulated the Plaintiff on his performance at the NAC just three weeks before

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 94

INDEX NO. 151501/2020 RECEIVED NYSCEF: 06/21/2021

sending the Plaintiff the December 13, 2018 letter endorsing the fabricated claims against him. From my experience as a voting member of a major seminary faculty who participated in normal seminary evaluations, I can attest to the fact that it is extremely irregular for the faculty in such a short period of time to suddenly reverse their unanimous vote for a seminarian who has consistently proven his superlative standing. In fact, it appears clear that there was no such re-vote of the faculty and that HARMAN simply pursued his own false ipsi dixit, because of his venal ulterior motive to sabotage the Plaintiff's vocation. The defendants' assertions that the Plaintiff was very soon thereafter suddenly lacking in his performance after having just received the entire faculty's unanimous vote and positive evaluations by HARMAN, PARK, McDONALD and shortly thereafter, DOLAN (for example, Complaint Exhibits "E" and "F"), is totally unbelievable.

22. The section on "Just Treatment" in the Handbook cites as an example of harassment "insults or teasing based on...physical appearance..." Based upon my review of paragraph 37 of the Complaint and the Plaintiff's second cause of action, I was able to identify HARMAN's action of ridiculing the Plaintiff for his medical condition of scoliosis as a violation of this policy. The Plaintiff brought HARMAN's action to DOLAN's

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 94

INDEX NO. 151501/2020 RECEIVED NYSCEF: 06/21/2021

attention in his letter of December 14, 2018 (Johnson Jr. Affirmation, Exhibit "H"). From my experience as a seminary formator, I can attest to the fact that such ridicule by a superior may constitute disability harassment which is not immune from civil penalties.

23. My experience leads me to object to the validity of the claim by DOLAN and the ADNY's counsel that DOLAN acted "unquestionably in conformance with the norms of Roman Catholic priestly formation" when dealing with the Plaintiff (Memorandum of Law, paragraph 28). Although bishops share their responsibility to act in good faith and for the welfare of their seminarians with seminary rectors, the ultimate and primary responsibility rests with the bishop. A bishop is not obligated to submit to what a seminary rector claims, most especially if what the rector says is obviously false. It is in the bishop's power, and in fact his duty, to intervene on behalf of his seminarian if a seminary official breaches his duty of trust. Based on my experience in seminary work, after reviewing DOLAN's letters of December 13, 2018 and January 2, 2019 to the Plaintiff (Johnson Jr. Affirmation, Exhibits "B" and "C," respectively), I found DOLAN's treatment of the Plaintiff to be highly irregular and a breach of his duties as the Plaintiff's bishop. DOLAN's communications contain notable inconsistencies,

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 94

particularly with respect to the fabricated grounds upon which the punitive measures were based. I refer the Court to the second page of the Plaintiff's January 11, 2019 letter, attached to Johnson Jr.'s Affirmation as Exhibit "I," which brought a number of these inconsistencies to DOLAN's attention. One of the most blatant irregularities is how DOLAN communicated in his January 2, 2019 letter that even if he felt the Plaintiff should in the end be readmitted to the NAC, he would submissively waive his own discretion should HARMAN oppose it. It raises a "red flag" when a bishop is unwilling to examine a defamed seminarian's evidence in an unbiased manner and is instead willing to abdicate his own better judgment in favor of a subordinate such as HARMAN.

24. It is also highly irregular - if not unheard of - that a bishop would not allow his seminarian accused of such absurd infractions to present his side of the story before taking drastic action against him. As a former NAC rector himself, DOLAN should have known that HARMAN's fabricated reasons did not at all justify a violation of the NAC's policy on grounds for discontinuance outside the normal evaluation process (Complaint Exhibit "N"). Rather than advocate on behalf of the Plaintiff, DOLAN rendered himself complicit to this violation.

### FILED: RICHMOND COUNTY CLERK 06/20/2021 06:05 PM NYSCEF DOC. NO. 94

INDEX NO. 151501/2020 RECEIVED NYSCEF: 06/21/2021

25. From my experience of proper and normative interactions between superiors and seminarians, I take exception to the defendants' claims to have been "empathetic" in their treatment of the Plaintiff (Johnson Jr.'s Affirmation in Support of Motion, paragraph 12); their ridicule of the Plaintiff's coerced resignation as "voluntary" or a sign of "resistance," and their denial of having taken "any adverse action against [the Plaintiff]" (DOLAN and the ADNY's Memorandum of Law, Point V, pages 10-11). By actions so far removed from any normal seminary process, the defendants used their power to demand that the Plaintiff acquiesce to their ulterior motives and that he betray his good name by admitting to false claims against him, all under threat of losing his vocation and the value of all he had given up to pursue the priesthood. In the Plaintiff's January 11, 2019 letter, he made DOLAN aware that all the defendants created an environment that was intolerable in conscience when he wrote, "...[T]o accept the unjustified allegations offered you by the rector by means of such a program would morally violate my conscience, which unquestionably knows these things to be untrue" (Johnson Jr. Affirmation, Exhibit "I"). Even after the Plaintiff offered this and other statements to DOLAN that his resignation from a life-long dream of pursuing the priesthood was forced, DOLAN abandoned his duties to act with the

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 94

Plaintiff's best interests at the fore and effectively terminated his vocation.

26. After reading the allegations that the defendants interfered with the Plaintiff's economic advantage, I wish to assist the Court in understanding what "economic advantages" he ultimately would have enjoyed had the defendants not committed their tortious actions. After graduating as the valedictorian of his high school, the Plaintiff could have used the full college scholarship with a stipend he was offered and by now could be a practicing physician which he had both the interest and capacity to be. The Plaintiff, however, dedicated seven and a half years of his life preparing to be a priest and undertaking theological studies that are practically useless in the job market. While one can estimate the annual income of a doctor in the New York area, people tend to underestimate the monetary value that can be attached to being a priest in New York State. While the monthly salary of a priest may be relatively low compared to what other professionals with a comparable amount of education may make, the much greater value derives from non-monetary benefits such as room and board, medical coverage, stipends and allowances, post-graduate education, and retirement payments which are made by the parish and/or diocese and are not deducted from a priest's

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 94

salary. Also to consider is how much a person would have to make to maintain a residence in Manhattan that includes a fulltime maid, secretary, and a cook, which oftentimes are available to priests gratis. Based on my experience, I believe these are all questions that need to be kept in mind when determining the opportunities the Plaintiff lost for economic advantage.

27. Based on my subject matter experience, I use the following analogy to help show how the claims in this lawsuit have been brought to the Court in a timely manner. If a secretary is fired because of what are clearly contrived reasons, she may waste time attempting to refute these reasons only later to discover the real motive after speaking with other secretaries who suffered a similar fate. Ordinarily, it is only after she has sufficient evidence to show that she and other women were all let go because they turned down the sexual advances of the boss that she will then bring suit. This often applies as well in abuse cases. An attorney is far more inclined to bring suit when there is more than just one victim accusing a superior of abuse. In this case it was only in time that the Plaintiff uncovered additional seminarians who recounted leaving the seminary because they suffered homosexual harassment by PARK, as well as a shocking history of HARMAN's homosexual activity involving his former bishop and vulnerable

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 94

salary. Also to consider is how much a person would have to make to maintain a residence in Manhattan that includes a fulltime maid, secretary, and a cook, which oftentimes are available to priests gratis. Based on my experience, I believe these are all questions that need to be kept in mind when determining the opportunities the Plaintiff lost for economic advantage.

27. Based on my subject matter experience, I use the following analogy to help show how the claims in this lawsuit have been brought to the Court in a timely manner. If a secretary is fired because of what are clearly contrived reasons, she may waste time attempting to refute these reasons only later to discover the real motive after speaking with other secretaries who suffered a similar fate. Ordinarily, it is only after she has sufficient evidence to show that she and other women were all let go because they turned down the sexual advances of the boss that she will then bring suit. This often applies as well in abuse cases. An attorney is far more inclined to bring suit when there is more than just one victim accusing a superior of abuse. In this case it was only in time that the Plaintiff uncovered additional seminarians who recounted leaving the seminary because they suffered homosexual harassment by PARK, as well as a shocking history of HARMAN's homosexual activity involving his former bishop and vulnerable

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 94

INDEX NO. 151501/2020 RECEIVED NYSCEF: 06/21/2021

seminarians. What else I have found disturbing about the Plaintiff's case is that the alleged shortcomings were not only easily disprovable, but also absurd. For example, claiming that the Plaintiff warranted sudden discontinuance from the NAC for allegedly contacting his Archdiocese before informing his formation advisor of his need for urgent surgery was truly laughable. He asked his formation advisor, McDONALD, what to do, and followed his directions explicitly. This would be akin to saying that a secretary who objected to sexual harassment in the workplace was fired because she typed "its" instead of "it's" in one piece of correspondence.

28. Without usurping the Court's power, I merely suggest that the Plaintiff will be able to bring forward in discovery credible evidence such as HARMAN engaging in homosexual acts with his former bishop in the presence of seminarians, and that the heterosexual Plaintiff will be able to show that he was justified in reaching the conclusion to bring his action. Plaintiff was wronged and was not engaged in "paranoid speculation" as asserted by the defendants.

# EUGENE THOMAS GOMULKA EUGENE THOMAS GOMULKA

Sworn to before me this 21st

day of June, 2021

Belin RNMOND W. BELAIR

NOTARY PUBLIC, STATE OF NEW YORK Registration No. 02BE6408261 Westchester County Commission Expires September 14 2020

#### CERTIFICATION OF COUNSEL PURSUANT TO UNIFORM RULE 202.8-b

I, Raymond W. Belair certify that that in conformity with Uniform Rule 202.8-b That the foregoing affidavit is contains no more than 5,820 words, inclusive of all words, in conformity with the limits set forth in at Rule 202.8-a.

In conformity with Rule 202.b(c) I have relied on the word processor system for the word count in preparing this document.

MOND W. BELAIR any

# APPENDIX E

A STUDY OF SEXUAL MISCONDUCT AND COVER-UP IN THE DIOCESE OF SPRINGFIELD IN ILLINOIS: THE CONTEXT THAT ENABLED FATHER PETER HARMAN

## A Study of Sexual Misconduct and Cover-Up in the Diocese of Springfield in Illinois: The Context that Enabled Father Peter Harman

by

**Gene Thomas Gomulka** 

A former North American College (NAC) seminarian, Anthony Gorgia, filed an explosive lawsuit against Cardinal Timothy Dolan and NAC officials, including the NAC rector and Diocese of Springfield in Illinois priest, Father Peter Harman. Filled with graphic details, the lawsuit alleges that Gorgia was reprised against and coerced into leaving seminary after he received word from other NAC seminarians about inappropriate physical behavior toward vulnerable seminarians by the NAC vice-rector, Washington Archdiocese priest, Father Adam Park, which Gorgia himself witnessed. The lawsuit maintains that Gorgia was perceived as a threat to revealing the depth of the secret homosexual lifestyles of NAC officials, including Harman. As such, according to the lawsuit, Harman and Dolan used entirely false and easily disprovable claims as a pretext to extract Gorgia from the seminary without any justification.

A priest with decades of seminary experience attested to the fact that no seminarian is discontinued just three months into the academic year after having just received the faculty's unanimous vote to advance to that year, as Gorgia did, or having a stellar and exemplary record, as Gorgia had, on the basis of absurd reasons. If a seminarian is discontinued in the middle of an academic year, it is either because he has discerned he is not called to priesthood, or because he committed a serious offense. Insofar as neither of these conditions apply to Gorgia, the real motives of Harman, Dolan, and complicit clerics' actions demand explanation.

To understand why Dolan had such an intense interest in covering up misconduct at the expense of causing harm to Gorgia, one needs to consider the ordeal Father Ryszard Biernat suffered in the Diocese of Buffalo. When then-seminarian Biernat from Poland was working in a Buffalo parish over the summer, he alleged that the pastor, Father Art Smith, entered his bedroom at night and attempted to engage him in gay sex. When he reported the sexual assault to Auxiliary Bishop Edward Grosz, Biernat was told he would be deported and never be ordained a priest if he reported the incident. What Biernat did not know at that time was that Grosz and Smith were classmates in the seminary together, or that what happened to him was a crime. Likewise, when Dolan conspired with Harman to spontaneously prevent Gorgia from returning to the NAC, Gorgia did not know that accused-Omaha Archbishop George Lucas, Harman's bishop from 1999 to 2009, was one year ahead of Dolan in the seminary. Dolan and Lucas were known to have been very good friends as they lived and studied together in St. Louis for seven years. Not only was Dolan a close friend of Lucas, but he also had ties to Harman who lived with Dolan at the NAC for 5 years from 1995 to 2000 when Dolan was the rector from 1994 to 2001. It was Dolan who approved Harman for ordination to the diaconate in 1998 and to the priesthood in 1999. With both Lucas and Harman implicated in the lawsuit brought forward by Gorgia, it is obvious why Dolan would desire to shield Lucas, his former seminary-companion, and Harman, his former seminarian, from shocking allegations.

The following study of the Diocese of Springfield in Illinois will provide important insights into why Father Harman and the vice-rector, Father Adam Park, feared Gorgia's return to the NAC following his November 2018 surgery in New York, and why Cardinal Dolan refused Gorgia's five requests for a meeting with him regarding the matter.

## **Bishop Daniel Ryan**

Daniel Ryan was ordained a priest on May 3, 1956. He served in five different parishes in the Diocese of Joliet in addition to serving as the chancellor and vicar general. A number of young men whose vocations

he helped foster in Joliet were later accused of molesting boys. One such priest, Father Lawrence Gibbs, was sued for raping a 13-year-old altar boy. Ryan was named a co-defendant in that suit which was settled out of court.

Ryan was appointed Auxiliary Bishop of Joliet in 1981 under Bishop Joseph Imesch. Consistent with <u>Imesch's record of transferring abusive priests</u>, Ryan was later installed as the Bishop of Springfield in Illinois in January of 1984. As Springfield's Bishop, one of the young men Ryan accepted to study for the priesthood was Peter Harman. After graduating from Quincy Notre Dame High School in 1991, Harman was sent by Ryan to study at Saint Meinrad College Seminary which was <u>rumored for years to foster an active gay subculture</u>. In 1995 Harman was sent to study theology in Rome one year after Timothy Dolan was appointed the NAC rector. Harman was approved by Dolan for ordination and was ordained a priest by Bishop Ryan in July of 1999, three months before Ryan's resignation on October 19, 1999.

In light of research by the late <u>A.W. Richard Sipe</u> showing how sexually abusive bishops like ex-Cardinal Theodore McCarrick abused seminarians and priests who then went on to become <u>sexual predators and/or</u> to engage in non-consensual gay sex with other adults, it is worthwhile to look at what negative impact disgraced Bishop Ryan may have had on Father Harman and other priests of the Springfield Diocese.

It was already during Ryan's first year in office that he was <u>alleged to have solicited sex from teenage</u> <u>boys</u>. The alleged abuse that occurred in 1984 was not reported until July of 2002, at which time the Sangamon County state's attorney said he could not prosecute because the statute of limitations had expired. <u>Frank Anthony Thomas Sigretto</u> was one of four men who accused Ryan of sexual abuse. Sigretto's testimony was supported by a former Springfield priest, the <u>Rev. John Reeves</u>, who wrote in a seven-page statement that Ryan had made sexual advances toward him when Reeves was both a seminarian and a young priest beginning in the fall of 1984. Reeves said he and Ryan traveled and dined together; shared motel rooms; visited bathhouses; and vacationed in the Cayman Islands and Puerto Rico. Reeves said he was afraid to reject Ryan's advances for fear he would not be ordained.

It was also alleged that Ryan was sexually involved with a prostitute, Danny Evans, in 1985. Evans claimed in a 14-page transcript of an interview with Springfield <u>Attorney Frederic Nessler</u> that he went to motels with Ryan on more than 50 occasions from the 1980s through the late 1990s. Evans also said that Ryan took him on trips to Indiana, Ohio, Chicago and Wisconsin.

<u>Frank Bergen</u> alleged that Ryan gave him money for sex beginning when he was 16 years old. Like Danny Evans, Bergen admitted to having been addicted to drugs at a young age. When questioned by attorneys who were representing clients bringing suit against Ryan and the Diocese of Springfield, Bergen said he was heterosexual and only engaged in homosexual acts for money to feed his drug habit. Most Catholics have no idea what really is done with the hard-earned money they contribute to the Church.

In 1996 <u>Stephen Brady</u>, a devout Catholic, U.S. Army veteran from Petersburg, Illinois, formed Roman Catholic Faithful (RCF). Brady, the father of seven children, gained notoriety four years earlier for a prolife billboard he had erected that called out the local school board for inviting Planned Parenthood to offer a sex education program.

Not long after Brady founded RCF, two Springfield priests, Father John Reeves and "John Doe," revealed to him that they had been sexually assaulted by Bishop Ryan. Two other priests reported similar experiences with Ryan but did not want Brady to mention them even anonymously for fear of reprisals. When Brady reported the matter to Lucas' <u>metropolitan</u> archbishop, <u>Chicago Cardinal Joseph Bernardin</u>, he received a response dated June 24, 1996. At this time, then-Monsignor Thomas Paprocki was Bernardin's chancellor. The letter, which came from Bernardin's Chief of Staff, stated that the cardinal "does not feel...it would be appropriate for him to enter into matters not pertaining directly to his

archdiocese." Brady was led to question Bernardin's own sexual orientation when Bernardin abdicated his duty as Ryan's metropolitan in the letter which ended with, "Such responsibility rests with the local bishop." Knowing that a homosexually active bishop is not going to investigate or sanction himself, Brady realized that Bernardin's recommendation that the allegations against Ryan be referred to Ryan himself would yield no results.

Brady was aware of the fact that in 1994 Steven Cook had accused Cardinal Bernardin of abusing him when he was a teenage seminarian in Cincinnati where Bernardin was the Archbishop from 1972 to 1982. Just one year prior, in 1993, a separate individual had reported to the Archdiocese of Chicago and the US Nunciature allegations that Bernardin, along with Bernardin's Charleston Ordinary, Bishop John J. Russell, had sexually assaulted him in a satanic ritual. While the mainstream media reported that Cook recanted his abuse charges against Bernardin before Cook died of AIDS in September of 1995, it has also been a common practice to pay huge settlements to abuse victims in exchange for recanting the abuse they reported. According to Richard Sipe, "the Chicago Archdiocese's pay off to Cook before Cook died of AIDS was in the \$3 million range." Sipe also pointed out that "Several priests who were associates of Bernardin prior to his move to Chicago revealed that they had 'partied' together; they talked about their visits to the Josephinum to socialize with seminarians." The accusations of Cook and the other victim against Bernardin were squelched at the very same time then-Monsignor Paprocki was Bernardin's chancellor, a position Paprocki held from 1992 to 2000. Documentation kept in the secret vault of the Archdiocese of Chicago from 1993 through 1995 reveal that "the archdiocese of Chicago, the US papal nuncio, the Vatican Secretariat of State and even the papal household all knew of the allegations and yet failed to act on them." Brady's interaction with Bernardin led him to conclude that Ryan had many protectors among the hierarchy who adhered to a code of silence especially when it came to covering for cardinals and bishops who engaged in homosexual predation and behavior. In fact, it was later reported in the media that "Bernardin's entire public career was one of warm relationships with promoters of homosexuality."

After Brady received no help from Bernardin in addressing Ryan's abuse of Fathers Reeves and "Doe," he was contacted by two other Springfield priests who confidentially said they were also victims of Ryan's unwanted advances. Brady then prepared a confidential report of the priests' allegations which were then hand-carried by Father John A. Hardon, SJ, to the Apostolic Pro-Nuncio, <u>Archbishop Agostino Cacciavillan</u>. Instead of initiating an investigation into the abuse allegations involving Bishop Ryan, the Pro-Nuncio betrayed confidentiality and sent a copy of the report and the names of the accusers back to Bishop Ryan. Cacciavillan had no intention of interviewing the victims before declaring the case "closed." Two of the four priests Brady interviewed ended up leaving not only the priesthood, but also the Catholic Church.

After having lost confidence in the Pro-Nuncio, Father Hardon and Father "John Doe" flew to Rome in February of 1997 where they met with Archbishop Darío Castrillón Hoyos, prefect of the Vatican's Congregation for the Clergy. After examining the evidence accumulated by RCF, Castrillón Hoyos arranged for Father "Doe" to work in the Archdiocese of Detroit, but no action was taken against Ryan. When the Vatican failed to intervene and Ryan continued to remain in power, Brady felt compelled to act especially after Ryan's spokeswomen, <u>Kathleen Saas</u>, gave an interview to *The Daily Pantagraph* of Bloomington in which she called the allegations against Ryan "based in ignorance."

When Saas's interview caught the eye of a prostitute who was familiar with the street life of the city, she contacted Brady and provided him with extensive information about two male hustlers who were picked up on several occasions by Ryan whom they referred to as "the Bish." When Brady announced he would be conducting a press conference during which new evidence against Ryan would be revealed, Brady was contacted by Jimmy Lago, Chicago Cardinal Francis George's representative, who got Brady to cancel the December 30, 1997 press conference with the promise that the Chicago Archdiocese would conduct a

serious investigation into the allegations against Ryan. When the Chicago Archdiocese fell through on the promise of an investigation and Lago instead made a public statement on January 6, 1998 claiming that "There's a lot of allegations, but no proof," Brady felt betrayed and rescheduled the press conference. Despite efforts from Cardinal George and other Chicago ecclesiastical authorities to get Brady to call off the press conference, the very moving and emotional event took place on January 15, 1998 with over seventy people in attendance including various media representatives.

Despite a plethora of evidence and testimony of witnesses about Ryan's immoral and predatory behavior, the Vatican and various US ecclesiastical officials continued to do nothing to curb Ryan's behavioral problems. The following year, on April 18, 1999, RCF held a public meeting at which it released details of its two-year investigation of Bishop Ryan's misconduct. It was not until six months following this meeting that Ryan announced his resignation on October 19, 1999.

When interviewed by representatives of the media, Ryan denied that allegations of sexual misconduct directed at him over the years by Stephen Brady, RCF, and numerous witnesses/victims had played a part in his resignation. When asked to comment, Brady responded, "Obviously we are delighted at the announcement of Ryan's resignation, but we are very sad that it took the Holy See almost three years to act. The damage that Ryan has done since we first notified the Holy See of his homosexual activity with prostitutes and others is monumental."

One week after Ryan's resignation, attorneys for a 30-year old former altar boy filed suit against the Springfield Diocese alleging that their client was "sexually assaulted, battered, and psychologically abused" by Rev. Alvin J. Campbell. Ryan was also named in the lawsuit for covering up Campbell's abuse of Matthew McCormick and seven other boys in 1985. McCormick's lawyer, Frederic Nessler, said that Bishop Ryan created an "atmosphere of tolerance to the sexual abuse of minors."

On March 14, 2003, <u>Stephen Brady of RCF testified before the National Review Board</u> for the Protection of Children and Young People about Bishop Ryan who, although retired for over three years, was still sexually active. Brady observed, "Despite many years of rampant sexual misconduct and flagrant abuse of his episcopal authority, which included having sexual relations with underage boys, Bishop Ryan was protected by members of the Roman Catholic hierarchy in order to save themselves embarrassment and in some cases to prevent the spotlighting of their own compromising situations. The hierarchy involved in this cover-up showed no concern at all for Ryan's victims, both adult and underage males."

## **Bishop George Lucas**

Ryan was succeeded by St. Louis-priest George Lucas who was the Bishop of Springfield from 1999 to 2009. Born in St. Louis, Missouri, Lucas attended local minor (high school) and college seminaries along with Timothy Dolan who was one year behind Lucas at both institutions. While Lucas graduated from Cardinal Glennon College in 1971 and went on to study theology at Kenrick-Glennon Seminary, Dolan graduated in 1972 and was sent to study in Rome with residence at the Pontifical North American College.

Lucas was ordained a priest in 1975 and served as the vice-rector of St. Louis Preparatory Seminary from 1982 to 1987. A former seminarian alleged in 2006 that Lucas, while the vice-rector in 1987, made sexual advances toward him, asking what he liked sexually and if he liked older men. The former high school seminarian, who was 17 years old at the time, said he rejected Lucas' multiple advances and later left the seminary.

From 1995 to 1999, Lucas was named the rector of Kenrick-Glennon Seminary. After securing prominent positions in the St. Louis Archdiocese, both Lucas and Dolan became bishops under Archbishop Justin Rigali. Lucas was named the Bishop of Springfield in Illinois in 1999. The three consecrating bishops at Lucas' episcopal ordination on December 14, 1999 were Chicago Cardinal Francis George, accused-Bishop Daniel Ryan, and Apostolic Nuncio Archbishop Gabriel Montalvo Higuera. Cardinal George is proven to have covered up Ryan's scandalous and immoral behavior for years which had also been reported to senior Church officials at the Nunciature in Washington, DC and in the Vatican. The fact that Ryan himself was one of the co-consecrators would lead one to believe that Lucas was hand-picked to do damage control and to take care of Ryan in retirement.

Bishop Lucas purchased a new home for Ryan within St. Agnes parish, the same parish where Father Harman was assigned. Despite allegations of sexual misconduct brought against him, Ryan was permitted by Lucas to help out in parishes and officiate at confirmations in the Springfield and Joliet dioceses while Ryan remained sexually active.

Ryan <u>stepped down from public ministry</u> in September of 2002 when he was accused of abusing a minor in 1984. Although he no longer officiated at services, Ryan continued to engage in the behavior that resulted in his early retirement. On July 5, 2004, Ryan was alleged in a "Domestic Battery" police report to have kicked his "sex partner" <u>Timothy Hugo</u> after Hugo confronted Ryan for making advances toward his boyfriend. The incident took place at Ryan's home, which Hugo believed Lucas knew Ryan was using for sexual encounters.

Hugo also reported witnessing Ryan and the pastor, "Father Bob," kissing and hugging each other in St. Agnes rectory where Father Peter Harman served as the associate pastor. Hugo described Father Bob as a "tall, dark and handsome man of about maybe 47 years old, with salt and pepper hair."

Father Harman was followed at St. Agnes by Father Joseph Havrilka who was ordained on May 28, 2005. In September of 2005, just three months after Havrilka reported to St. Agnes following his ordination, the pastor, Father Robert Jallas, announced that Havrilka would be going on an indefinite leave of absence for "psychological and personal issues." Havrilka, having served as a religious brother for over 20 years before being ordained at the age of 48, was accused of "inappropriate touching" by one of his young parishioners.

Even though Springfield diocesan officials and the Vatican were presented with indisputable evidence of Ryan's ongoing involvement with male prostitutes, Ryan and other homosexual priests continued to engage in immoral homosexual acts long after Lucas was installed as the ordinary. Upon the passing of Bishop Ryan and Joliet Bishop Joseph Imesch some years later, the Survivors Network of those Abused by Priests (<u>SNAP</u>) stated in a news release, "These two prelates, like nearly all of their U.S. colleagues, deserve little or no praise. They protected predators. They endangered innocent children. They kept crimes hidden from police."

It was only a few years after Lucas was installed that he announced the "promotion" of 15 Springfield priests who were to be awarded the honorific title of "Monsignor." Interestingly, a number of these new monsignors were known to have either covered up for Ryan over the years or to have engaged in homosexual behavior themselves with male prostitutes or with one another. A number of those Lucas rewarded for covering up for his predecessor include priests like former Springfield Chancellor, <u>Eugene Costa</u>; John Renken, who served as Ryan's Vicar General; and <u>Thomas Holinga</u>, the Director of Clergy Personnel who was one of Ryan's frequent traveling companions. <u>Costa</u> was shortly after found beaten in Springfield's Douglas Park, a place known for gay activity. The police later arrested two teenagers, ages 15 and 17, who pled guilty to beating Costa while claiming he offered them \$50.00 for sexual favors. Renken and Holinga were both found to have covered up reports from priests who provided graphic

details about how, when, and where Ryan sexually harassed and abused them over the years. Renken, who was a past president of the Canon Law Society and who was appointed in 2002 to serve on the United States Conference of Catholic Bishops (USCCB) Committee for the Protection of Children and Young People, lived for over ten years with <u>Msgr. Kenneth Steffen</u> as "co-pastors" of a small rural parish in Riverton, Illinois. Steffen left the diocese reportedly to "receive physical, emotional and holistic healing," only to be permitted to return to ministry where he was accused in 2017 of stealing approximately \$70,000 from Saints Peter and Paul parish in Alton, Illinois. Renken likewise left the diocese after his relationship with Steffen and other homosexuals became public. While Renken is currently the Dean of the Faculty of Canon Law at St. Paul University in Ottawa, Steffen is retired with priestly faculties limited to ministry to residents of St. Joseph's Home in Springfield where he resides.

It was the appointment of some of these and other known allegedly immoral monsignors that led Stephen Brady to offer the following observations in an RCF newsletter: 1) Many homosexuals have lied, stolen, and blackmailed their way into the priesthood and chancery positions; 2) Homosexual bishops increase in numbers and recruit and reward their sexual partners with the priesthood; and 3) Sexually-active bishops employ other sexual deviants and cafeteria Catholics within their chanceries to keep their secrets safe.

Grave allegations have also come to light regarding homosexual behavior on the part of Bishop Lucas and other priests and seminarians of the Springfield Diocese. Just as evidence proved that Bishop Ryan was paying poor kids to provide sexual services for him which often helped them to pay for their drug habits, so too does detailed and credible accounts allege that Bishop Lucas, Monsignors Renken, Steffen, Lantz, and Dominican Father Clinton Honkomp were recipients of sexual favors.

At the end of December 2004, Stephen Brady and a trained investigator video recorded an interview with Thomas Muñoz, a Hispanic Catholic, who at the time was 37 years old. Muñoz recounted participating in an orgy in the episcopal residence of Bishop Lucas during which he witnessed Lucas engaging in anal sex with Father Peter Harman. He also described other gay sex acts involving Springfield priests, seminarians, and one layperson like himself who had no official financial ties to the diocese.

When Father Eugene Costa, the Springfield Chancellor who was made a Monsignor by Bishop Lucas, was found beaten in a park know to be frequented by gays, Muñoz feared he was being falsely accused of the assault when he was approached by detectives investigating the incident. Muñoz said he had been paid to have sex with Bishop Lucas and a number of Springfield priests. Because he knew all about their double lives, he feared they would either try to have him arrested and sent to prison for something he didn't do, or possibly kill him. He wrote Brady stating, "I will probably end up dead sooner or later over this but I am tired of this torture chamber."

Following the interview with Muñoz, Brady sent a letter to the Apostolic Nuncio, Archbishop Gabriel Montalvo Higuera, dated January 6, 2005, informing him of the orgy involving Lucas, as well as Monsignors Renken and Steffen among others. That same day Brady also sent a letter to Father Peter Harman insofar as Harman was named as a participant in the orgy. Harman's response, dated January 10, 2005, read as if it were written by a lawyer. The most remarkable line in Harman's letter is where he encourages Brady to report the allegations involving him, Lucas and other priests to none other than Lucas himself: "Because Bishop Lucas has asked everyone, clergy and laity alike, to address to him any such allegations about wrongdoing by anyone officially representing the church, I would urge you to assist this individual to seek his assistance." Brady responded to Harman by writing, "In your letter you suggest this individual approach Bishop Lucas. That statement would be laughable if this were not such a serious issue, especially considering that his name was mentioned in conjunction with yours. We were also given an alleged detailed description of a certain part of your anatomy. The individual jumped at the chance for a polygraph examination which suggests he has nothing to hide." Unfortunately, the person who administered the polygraph only asked one question which proved to be very misleading. What the

polygrapher should have asked Muñoz are specific questions such as, "Did you witness Father Peter Harman sodomizing Bishop Lucas at an orgy in the bishop's residence?" Insofar as the polygrapher had ties to the diocese, it appears that his failure to raise a number of important questions was due to a conflict of interest on his part. The Special Panel tried to make out as if Muñoz did not pass the test, although the truth is that the Special Panel had neither interviewed Muñoz nor administered a valid polygraph to him. Had they actually believed Lucas was innocent, one would wonder why the Panel did not arrange for Lucas, Harman or any of the other alleged attendees at the orgy to be administered a polygraph test. Ordinarily, people who are telling the truth often want to be given a polygraph test to strengthen the credibility of their testimony. Lest they be contradicted by witnesses and evidence against them, none of the alleged participants in the orgy went on record in the Special Panel's report as proclaiming themselves innocent.

What happened next reminds me of many so-called "investigations" I had to investigate when I served on the Inspector General Team at Headquarters Marine Corps. A commanding officer would be accused of wrongdoing and he would then have his Admin officer or someone else who reported to him in the chain of command undertake an "investigation" into the allegations against him which would inevitably find him innocent. Lucas used the same tactic by retaining a lawyer, William Roberts, to head a Special Panel which, in a later published report, identified its task as investigating "allegations of misconduct by priests of the diocese." Note that the Panel's report did not read "allegations of misconduct by Bishop Lucas and priests of the diocese." Roberts shielded Lucas' name and the name of his reported homosexual lover, Father Peter Harman, from inclusion in this sentence because the real motive of the so-called "investigation" was specifically to clear Lucas and those surrounding him of accusations that he, along with priests from his diocese, engaged in "homosexual activities." Lucas' strategy resembles how the Vatican dealt with reports from mother superiors that African bishops wanted them to make their sisters available to priests for sex in an effort to reduce the clerical death rate from AIDS. Instead of investigating the claims it received, the Vatican forwarded the complaints to the offending bishops who retaliated by having the mother superiors removed for making these reports. When one nun was impregnated by a priest, he forced her to have an abortion which resulted in her death. It was the priest who got her pregnant who then conducted her funeral Mass. Insofar as both Lucas himself and Father Peter Harman, his alleged "homosexual lover," were reported to the Vatican for engaging in "homosexual activities," this so-called "investigation" headed by Attorney Roberts was no different than had former President Bill Clinton himself appointed a lawyer to investigate claims that he was having sex with a White House intern.

When the Catholic News Agency (CNA) reported the allegations of sexual conduct against Bishop Lucas were "proven false," no one questioned the findings or the methodology of having Lucas investigate himself. If an attorney like Roberts were to represent a person accused of murder, and if in the course of the representation he were to believe that his client were guilty, he could not let this be made known. Likewise, by retaining Roberts, Lucas was assured that no matter what Roberts uncovered, he would not be allowed to make that information public without the risk of being disbarred.

It would not be until years later, in 2021, that Mr. Kenneth McCabe, a highly-credentialed retired FBI Special Agent in Charge (SAC) would question the validity of the conclusions drawn by the 2006 Special Panel with respect to Lucas and Harman. McCabe found Muñoz's account of the orgy to be "entirely credible." In a sworn affidavit filed with the Court, the former FBI SAC argued that the diocese never authentically investigated the accusations against Lucas and Harman. Several months prior to McCabe's Court filing, I attempted to contact Mr. Roberts on two occasions about a number of concerns regarding the Panel's conclusions, but Mr. Roberts failed to respond. With the accusations remaining without a truly impartial investigation, Bishop Paprocki has permitted Peter Harman to serve on the NAC faculty since 2013 before being installed as the rector in February of 2016, despite his alleged sexual history involving seminarians.

Despite the fact that the Nunciature was well-informed of Ryan's and Lucas' legacy of sexual misconduct and cover-up, Lucas was promoted by being named the Archbishop of Omaha in 2009. Monsignor Kevin Vann, who defended Lucas in a homily delivered on February 19, 2005, more than a month after the orgy at which he was reported to have been present, was later recommended by Lucas to be made a bishop. Vann was appointed coadjutor bishop of Fort Worth in 2005, and he was later installed as the Bishop of Orange on December 10, 2012. Vann also currently serves as a member of the NAC Board of Governors.

## **Bishop Thomas Paprocki**

Ordained a priest of the Archdiocese of Chicago in 1978, Paprocki rose to prominence under <u>Cardinal</u> <u>Joseph Bernardin</u>, who was among those noted for covering up the sexual activity of Springfield Bishop Ryan. While Paprocki served as chancellor from 1992 to 2000, it was found that the review board under his direction <u>"wasn't reading full reports on accused priests or interviewing either accusers or the accused"</u> and was alleged in some cases to <u>"take extraordinary steps"</u> to keep certain predator priests in parishes with parishioners kept unaware of the priests' abusive backgrounds. Paprocki is only one of countless chancery officials who was rewarded by being made a bishop for concealing the true extent of clerical sexual predation within the Church. After being appointed Auxiliary Bishop of Chicago in 2003 under Cardinal George, who himself was found to be deeply invested in Springfield's cover-ups, Paprocki was installed as the ninth Bishop of the Diocese of Springfield in Illinois on June 22, 2010.

Just as Paprocki was criticized in Chicago for allowing priests known to engage in homosexual predation and behavior to remain in ministry, so too does evidence indicate that there have been quite a number of sexually-active priests under Paprocki's supervision in Springfield. One chronology alone names approximately twenty Springfield priests spanning as recently as 2018 who have been accused of acts of sexual misconduct with seminarians, young males, and other adult men. Paprocki has allowed a stunning majority of these priests to remain uninvestigated and to remain in active ministry in Springfield parishes, schools, and curial offices. While the Springfield Diocese under Paprocki seems to have taken great lengths to avoid investigating accused clerics, whistleblowers who attempted to report predatory clerics found themselves mistreated. Paprocki was even alleged in 2014 to have removed a heterosexual deacon from his ministry after he rejected homosexual advances by a priest who to this day remains a Springfield Pastor.

Like bishops of most dioceses, Paprocki has faced problems on the part of Springfield clerics who have been accused of misconduct involving drugs, sex, or alcohol which often involves embezzling parish funds. Such a case involved <u>Father Barry Harmon</u> whom Paprocki removed as pastor of two parishes in November of 2017. While the reason given was that he was going on a "medical leave of absence," it was later discovered that Harmon had "misspent" more than \$20,000 from Mother of Dolors parish just as he was alleged to have embezzled \$40,000 from St. Thomas the Apostle Parish in 2005.

A search of Father Harmon's rectory in Vandalia while he was away in a treatment facility led to scandalous discoveries. In addition to uncovering homosexual pornography and drug paraphernalia, it was reported that the diocese confiscated a video of a rectory party in which priests were seen dressed in drag. People who viewed the video identified six Springfield priests among the participants. Only one of the six, <u>Harmon</u>, has been removed from ministry, and a certain number of them presently serve on Paprocki's diocesan leadership team.

In December of 2018, <u>Illinois Attorney General Lisa Madigan</u> blasted Cardinal Blase Cupich and the bishops of Illinois for hiding the names of at least 500 clerics who were credibly accused of sexually abusing children. The following day, SNAP members and others demonstrated across from Springfield's Cathedral of the Immaculate Conception holding signs with the names of <u>Fathers Henry Willenborg and</u>

<u>Thomas Meyer</u>, two predator priests they accused Bishop Paprocki of leaving off its list of the credibly accused clerics.

Paprocki's response was not well-received when he remarked, "A virtuous intent to protect the faithful from scandal unfortunately prevented the transparency and awareness that has helped us confront this problem more directly over the past fifteen years." <u>David Clohessy from SNAP responded</u> to Paprocki's "virtuous" reference by saying, "Cover-ups are selfish, not virtuous, and continuing to cover for predator priests at this juncture is both selfish and irresponsible." Clohessy said it was "disingenuous" for Paprocki to point out that people didn't publicly discuss these kinds of "salacious allegations" because a key reason is that bishops hid abuse reports.

Bishop Paprocki's questionable handling of misconduct is once again coming to light in New York State Supreme Court for the way he failed to investigate grave allegations against Father Peter Harman. In a letter dated <u>April 22, 2020</u>, Paprocki and other ordinaries received a request for an investigation of Father Harman and his vice-rector, Father Adam Park, who were alleged to be homosexuals who were discriminating against Anthony Gorgia, a heterosexual seminarian, whom they feared might "out" them. Paprocki was informed that "What happened to Anthony is potentially suggestive of gay church officials abusing their power and reprising against heterosexually oriented vulnerable seminarians." Paprocki had also received and ignored numerous other communications on the matter as far back as February of 2019, where multiple concerned individuals requested that he open an investigation into Harman's actions. The reports requested that Paprocki, as Harman's superior, "conduct an unbiased and thorough investigation so that justice can be done …" and that Gorgia be granted "an opportunity to present his case and evidence … for further review."

When Paprocki and the other ordinaries failed to acknowledge or respond to the April 22, 2020 letter and many other communications, every US ordinary received reports dated <u>May 8</u>, June 18, June 27, July 3, and July 16 of 2020 in which the allegations Paprocki ignored were addressed in detail. Paprocki has to this day failed to protect vulnerable seminarians by allowing Harman to remain in ministry while the allegations are moving through the Court.

Just as many bishops and priests covered-up for ex-Cardinal McCarrick who preyed particularly upon seminarians and young priests, it appears that Cardinal Dolan is covering up for his old friend, Archbishop Lucas, and for Father Peter Harman; as well as for Father Adam Park who knows the secrets of both retired Cardinal Donald Wuerl and ex-Cardinal McCarrick. Likewise, Paprocki has joined in the cover-up for Harman and Park which appears to stem from Paprocki's relationship with Cardinal Wilton Gregory, Park's Ordinary, as they rose to power together under Bernardin in the Archdiocese of Chicago.

Recent media reports have been filled with headlines of bishops being removed from their posts after they were exposed for engaging in or covering up sexual predation involving minors, seminarians, or other vulnerable adults. With over 30 US and Vatican bishops implicated in the concealment of sexual misconduct at the NAC, it will be interesting to see if they will face the same disciplinary actions incurred by NAC Board of Governors member, <u>Bishop Michael Hoeppner</u>, who was forced to resign as Bishop of Crookston when his record of abuse cover-up was revealed.

Gene Thomas Gomulka is a victims' abuse advocate, investigative reporter, and screenwriter. A former seminary formator and instructor with an S.T.L. from the Pontifical University of St. Thomas Aquinas in Rome, Gomulka is a retired Navy Chaplain/Captain (O6). He was ordained a priest for the Altoona-Johnstown Diocese and later was made a Prelate of Honor (Monsignor) by St. Pope John Paul II.

## APPENDIX F

NINE REPORTS OF SEXUAL MISCONDUCT AND COVER-UP RECEIVED BY EVERY U.S. ORDINARY, THE APOSTOLIC NUNCIATURE, THE NAC BOARD OF GOVERNORS, AND ARCHDIOCESE OF NEW YORK OFFICIALS

356 H Avenue Coronado, CA 92118 22 April 2020

Timothy Cardinal Dolan Archdiocese of New York 1011 First Avenue New York, NY 10022

Dear Cardinal Dolan and other responsible parties,

While this pandemic has left many of us more "vulnerable" seniors wondering if we are going to live or die, the quarantine does afford us time to reflect on the past which, for you and me, would include our formation days together in Rome. Could you ever have imagined back then that you would be reading this letter sitting where you are today?

On May 6, 2002, I reported a Catholic Navy Chaplain, Father John Thomas "Matt" Lee, whom I was informed had a live-in boyfriend. In that same letter to then-Archbishop Edwin O'Brien with a copy to Bishop Joseph Adamec, I also reported a case of a veteran whom I recommended to study for the priesthood who left the seminary after the administration failed to take corrective action when he reported being propositioned by gay seminarians. As Dominican Father Thomas Doyle reported in his article, "<u>Cardinals Behaving Badly</u>," not only did O'Brien refuse to look at the evidence I brought to his office supporting the allegations in my reports, but he also tried to get me to undergo a psychological evaluation before <u>unjustly revoking my ecclesiastical endorsement</u>. It was O'Brien who eventually compelled me to leave the priesthood by getting Bishop Adamec to silence me by offering me orders to serve as a chaplain at a remote state prison.

As a result of the unjust reprisals Father Doyle and I experienced, I could not help but be interested in reading an <u>article about Anthony Gorgia</u> who was a student at the North American College (NAC), and whose resignation under duress you accepted without the fairness of an impartial investigation into his case. Having investigated a number of sex abuse cases involving Catholic Chaplains serving with Marines that I mentioned in my <u>America</u> article published four months before *The Boston Globe* began running its series of abuse articles in January of 2002, and after having been allowed access to the evidence you refused to examine with Mr. Gorgia, it is my opinion that Anthony is a whistleblower whose dismissal had nothing to do with his alleged "slow progress in human formation" or the impact his medical leave would have upon his academic performance.

There are quite a number of reasons I strongly believe that Anthony is the victim of reprisals and discrimination by homosexual priests who viewed him as a threat to their homosexual relationships. These reasons include:

1) Anthony's problems appear to have begun after he showed by his facial expression disdain toward the behavior of the vice-rector, Father Adam Park, who appeared to be inappropriately touching a fellow seminarian (as <u>Monsignor Otto Garcia</u> did to me when I was in my room at NAC studying for my finals) and after Anthony was made aware from classmates of immoral homosexual behaviors involving Father Park. Familiar as I am sure you are with the case involving my own classmate, <u>Father Robert Kelly, who prior to his removal was the NAC Academic Dean</u>, you know all too well how certain "behavior" is covered up which can often result in the priest undertaking it again in the future.

2) The reasons given to justify Anthony's disenrollment are highly suspect. How many seminarians in the history of NAC – or any Catholic seminary - have been disenrolled in the middle of the academic year for such specious reasons involving their "human formation" or "permission" documentation – all of which in Anthony's case are proven to be false accusations? Was it not you yourself who granted Anthony permission in writing to return for the non-elective surgery?

3) You refused to meet with Anthony or respond to specific issues raised by him, his parents and other concerned professionals, clergy and laity. I am certain most people would feel you had a "moral"

duty to hear his side of the story. I can't tell you how many investigations I did in the course of my military career in which senior officers unjustly disciplined subordinates in order to cover-up wrong doing on their own part.

4) You ordered Anthony to undergo a psychological evaluation that lacked justification despite very positive, objective evaluations - even from yourself - showing that Anthony was in no way deficient in his formation. Anthony also had an outstanding record of academic performance which you in multiple communications have praised. Anthony was a Summa Cum Laude student throughout his seminary studies and was chosen by the NAC Faculty and his peers to be the seminary's academic representative to the Gregorian University.

5) You refused to investigate whether or not Fathers Park and Harman are homosexuals who are discriminating against heterosexually oriented candidates for the priesthood. What happened to Anthony is potentially suggestive of gay church officials abusing their power and reprising against heterosexually oriented vulnerable seminarians.

As a NAC alumnus, I cannot help but be concerned if the behavior Anthony witnessed and learned of from other classmates is similar to behavior that contributed to the closing of seminaries like <u>St. John's</u> <u>Provincial Seminary</u> in Detroit (aka the "Pink Palace") and Christ the King Seminary in Aurora where the rector, <u>Father Joseph Gotto</u>, was alleged to have made homosexual advances toward seminarians.

The late A.W. Richard Sipe, in addition to reporting ex-Cardinal Theodore McCarrick to Pope Benedict XVI in 2008 which resulted in McCarrick's censure, discussed his experience in the area of clerical sex abuse when he <u>wrote that he had heard</u> "from many priests about their seduction by highly placed clerics and the dire consequences in their lives that does not end in their victimization alone... This abuse paves the way for them to pass the tradition on—to have sex with each other and even with minors." An investigation has yet to be undertaken to discover how many bishops and priests who were preyed upon by McCarrick when they were young priests and seminarians today "pass this tradition on."

Seminarians who are exposed to homosexual cultures in seminaries react similarly to young people who grow up in homes where alcoholism is a serious problem. While some young people end up imitating the behavior they witnessed and become alcoholics themselves, others demonstrate a particularly strong aversion toward alcohol. Likewise, while a priest like Father Mark White who was ordained by ex-Cardinal Theodore McCarrick is very outspoken in condemning clerical homosexual predation and behavior, the jury is still out on Father Adam Park who was ordained by McCarrick in 2005. Might an investigative reporter find a connection between the way Richmond Bishop Barry Knestout (ex-Cardinal Theodore McCarrick's personal secretary) is dealing with Father Mark White; with the way Cardinal Blase Cupich (whose appointment was alleged by Archbishop Carlo Maria Viganò to have been orchestrated by ex-Cardinal McCarrick) is dealing with Father Paul Kalchik; and the way you are dealing with Anthony Gorgia involving allegations against Father Adam Park (Cardinal Wuerl's former priest secretary)?

When Father "Matt" Lee was arrested in 2007 and charged with aggravated assault, sodomy, conduct unbecoming an officer, and failure to inform sex partners that he was HIV positive, <u>then-Archbishop</u> <u>O'Brien lied by leading reporters to believe he had no knowledge of Lee's homosexual activities</u>. Even though my 2002 letter addressing Lee's homosexual cohabitation may still be found in the office files of both the Archbishop for the Military Services and the Bishop of the Altoona-Johnstown Diocese, I found it interesting that O'Brien's successor, Archbishop Timothy Broglio, lied about what I had reported when he wrote on September 17, 2019, that I simply "reported suspicions of Matt Lee's probable homosexual orientation." I dare say if someone were to write him saying a chaplain had a "live-in girlfriend," I doubt he would state that someone simply "reported suspicions of a chaplain's probable "heterosexual orientation." Had O'Brien not covered up Lee's homosexual predation but got him the help he needed to arrest his behavior, Lee might not find himself serving a 30 year sentence in a Federal Correctional Institution today.

You may recall that Father Walter Rossi, the rector of the Shrine of the Immaculate Conception, who was accused of homosexual predation, was <u>investigated by both the Ordinary of his home Diocese of</u> Scranton and the Archbishop of Washington in whose archdiocese the Shrine is located. Insofar as Fathers Park and Harman are priests of the Archdiocese of Washington and the Diocese of Springfield in Illinois; and insofar as Father John McDonald - <u>who appears to be playing the role of Richard Rich</u> in *A Man for All Seasons* – is from the Diocese of Birmingham, I think it is only appropriate that I copy the Ordinaries of all these priests involved in this alleged reprisal against Anthony.

In addition to copying Archbishop Wilton Gregory, Bishop Thomas Paprocki, and Bishop Steven Raica, I think it is also appropriate that I copy the Apostolic Nuncio, Archbishop Christophe Pierre, insofar as the North American College is located on property of the Vatican City State. Owing to the fact that the February 2019 Vatican Sex Abuse Summit excluded addressing the sexual abuse of seminarians after Pope Francis' top reformer, <u>Cardinal Óscar Rodríguez Maradiaga, slammed "seminarians for exposing homosexuality inside the (Tegucigalpa) seminary</u>," I will also send a copy of this letter to Cardinal Sean O'Malley in his role as *President of the Pontifical Commission for the Protection of Minors* and as a mandatory reporter.

An innocent person who is sentenced to prison is entitled to compensation for the unjust action that was taken against him. If Anthony was unjustly separated from NAC and it is later revealed that Fathers Harman and/or Park are homosexuals who have preyed on seminarians, other adults or even minors, then I think all of the prelates who are in receipt of these allegations should be prepared to compensate him for the seven years of his life that were lost; for the defamation he suffered; and for the unjust discrimination he experienced based on his heterosexual orientation.

Lest you fail to act and are in violation of *Vos estis lux mundi* owing to the allegations involving Cardinal O'Brien and Archbishop Broglio that I have joined to those of Mr. Gorgia, I strongly encourage you and the three other Ordinaries to undertake an impartial and thorough investigation into all of the allegations contained within this communication. If I were tasked with this investigation, I would begin by speaking with members of Anthony's class in a manner in which their responses were assured to be totally confidential. Unless the investigation is carried out in an impartial manner which absolutely guarantees confidentiality - thereby protecting respondents from reprisals - one cannot expect the results to be of any value.

In order to preclude the recipients of this letter saying they were never informed of the numerous allegations contained in this communication, I will imitate the late A.W. Richard Sipe who made it clear that he had reported Theodore McCarrick to Pope Benedict XVI by posting a copy of his letter on his website. Hence, one can also read this letter at <u>http://www.gomulka.net/Dolan.pdf</u>

Sincerely,

Demulko

<u>Gene Thomas Gomulka</u> Rev. Msgr., Captain, CHC, USN (Ret)

CC: Cardinal Sean O'Malley

Archbishops Christophe Pierre and Wilton Gregory Bishops Thomas Paprocki and Steven Raica Fathers Christopher Argano and Thomas Devery North American College Board of Governors Your Eminence/Excellency,

You are receiving a copy of "<u>Gorgia v. Dolan</u>" to inform you of allegations I both received and reported of misconduct at the Pontifical North American College (NAC) in Rome.

If you are a college football fan, you might recall that my former parishioner and friend, the late Joe Paterno, was <u>not</u> accused of failing to report the abuse allegations he received about Jerry Sandusky, but he was criticized and fired as the head Penn State football coach for not following-up and ensuring that the abuse allegations he reported were properly investigated.

In a letter dated April 22, 2020 to Cardinal Timothy Dolan and other responsible parties (See: <u>www.gomulka.net/Dolan.pdf</u>), I reported allegations I received of inappropriate sexual behavior on the part of the NAC vice-rector, Father Adam Park, that appeared to be covered up by Cardinal Dolan and the rector, Father Peter Harman. Insofar as I neither received an acknowledgement nor a response to my letter, I feel compelled to write you lest I later be accused of failing to ensure that the reported allegations were "properly investigated" in the spirit of *Vos Estis* and *Christus vivit*.

I am confident you will want to ensure that any current or future seminarians from your (arch)diocese are not in any danger of victimization given the allegations surrounding the current NAC administration.

It is my hope that, upon your careful reflection on the article of which you are now in receipt, you will be inspired to take action to address the dire challenges expressed therein. In order to preclude the recipients of this correspondence from saying they were never informed of the allegations contained in the article, I have imitated the late A.W. Richard Sipe who posted his report to Pope Benedict XVI regarding Theodore McCarrick on his website. Thus, the enclosed communication may also be found at <u>www.gomulka.net/Gorgia.pdf</u>.

With every best wish, I remain

Sincerely in Christ,

Homulko

Gene Thomas Gomulka Rev. Msgr., CAPT, CHC, USN (Ret)

#### GORGIA V. DOLAN

Attending to the facts of Gorgia versus Dolan, one may perceive the echoes of lessons not learned from history. Consider, for instance, the legacy of tolerance toward misconduct, reprisals against the innocent who call it to light, the neglect of moral duty, or the repetition of predation, once suffered, now inflicted upon new generations of victims. All of these portray the larger picture in which this case stands today. Let's look at the evidence.

When he was a Monsignor, Timothy Cardinal Dolan served as the rector of the North American College from 1994 to 2001, during whose administration present-rector Father Peter Harman was a student. Dolan's predecessor was then-Monsignor Edwin O'Brien, who invited Father Robert Kelly, a NAC alumnus of the class of 1994, to serve on the faculty as the academic dean. Less than half-way through his five-year contract, Kelly was sent back to his diocese where his bishop, Joseph Adamec, reported that he supposedly had a "drinking"

problem." Kelly was transferred to the Charleston Diocese only to return a few years later. After being accused of sexual abuse, Kelly later was permanently removed from ministry.

In time Monsignor O'Brien was made an auxiliary bishop and one year later was named the Archbishop for the Military Services, USA. In 2002 then-Archbishop O'Brien received a letter dated May 6, 2002 from one of his senior supervisory chaplains about a young chaplain who was cohabitating with a "live-in boyfriend," as well as about a veteran, who after retiring entered the seminary only to leave within six months after the seminary administration ignored his complaints about being "hit on" by different gay seminarians. O'Brien refused to look at the evidence of the allegations involving the chaplain with a "live-in boyfriend," or to inquire about the gay infested seminary at which the veteran had been enrolled. The chaplain concluded that O'Brien was not interested in removing sexually active homosexual chaplains from ministry, nor in heterosexually-oriented servicemen becoming priests. Five years after this encounter, the chaplain with the "live-in boyfriend" was arrested and charged with aggravated assault, conduct unbecoming an officer, sodomy, and failure to inform sex partners that he was HIV positive. He is currently serving a 30-year sentence in a Federal Correctional Institution.

During a 2005 Courage Conference for men struggling with same-sex attraction, Archbishop O'Brien attempted to recruit two gay participants to study for the priesthood and become military chaplains. The following month, one of the gays O'Brien tried to recruit learned that O'Brien had been appointed to oversee the Papal Visitation of U.S. Seminaries. When he read in *The New York Times* that O'Brien said, "anyone who has engaged in homosexual activity or has strong homosexual inclinations" should not be admitted to a seminary, the gay young man wrote an article denouncing O'Brien as a fraud and voiced agreement with critics who believed the seminary investigation to be a "sham."

Gay French writer <u>Frederic Martel, author of *In the Closet of the Vatican*, calls out the <u>hypocrisy of Catholic prelates</u> who in public denounce homosexuality but in private lead double lives. There appears to be a similarity between O'Brien and ex-Cardinal McCarrick who, after writing the Dallas Charter in such a manner that excluded himself and other bishops from prosecution for abusing minors and seminarians, said, "<u>anyone who has been active in a gay life should not be admitted</u> [to the priesthood]."</u>

The current chairman of the United States Conference of Catholic Bishops (USCCB) Committee on Clergy, Consecrated Life and Vocations, Bishop James F. Checchio, as well as the previous chairman, <u>Cardinal Joseph Tobin</u>, have both been reported in the media for their relationships with known active homosexuals. The bishops who elected them to this post which involves promoting vocations to the priesthood need to realize that there are not enough gay men, who make up about 2.2 percent of the U.S. population, to staff <u>U.S. parishes which have steadily been closing</u> at an average rate of 93 per year since 1990. According to the <u>Center for Applied Research in the Apostolate</u> (CARA), the number of priests in the U.S. dropped from around 60,000 in 1970 to approximately 35,000 today. The average age of U.S. priests today is 70 and the number of priestly ordinations declined in just one year by 27 percent from 590 in 2017 to 430 in 2018.

If Dolan was nominated by O'Brien to succeed him as the NAC rector, and if Harman, who was already a member of the NAC faculty, was one of the priests Checchio nominated to be his successor, it would seem that it was Father Harman who then invited Father Adam Park, of whom allegations of misconduct have been made, to serve as the NAC vice-rector.

In my letter dated 22 April 2020 to Cardinal Dolan, I wrote:

The late A.W. Richard Sipe, in addition to reporting ex-Cardinal Theodore McCarrick to Pope Benedict XVI in 2008 which resulted in McCarrick's censure, discussed his experience in the area of clerical sex abuse when he wrote that he had heard 'from many priests about their seduction by highly

placed clerics and the dire consequences in their lives that does not end in their victimization alone... This abuse paves the way for them to pass the tradition on—to have sex with each other and even with minors.' An investigation has yet to be undertaken to discover how many bishops and priests who were preyed upon by McCarrick when they were young priests and seminarians today 'pass this tradition on.'

Interestingly, Father Peter Harman was ordained in Springfield, Illinois by Bishop Daniel Ryan who was plagued by sexual abuse allegations. Ryan "<u>was accused of engaging in</u> <u>homosexual affairs with young men, prostitutes, and other priests.</u>"

The vice-rector, Adam Park, was likewise a seminarian under a known predator, Theodore McCarrick, who ordained him in 2005, the year before McCarrick retired. Before becoming the vice-rector, Park also served as the priest secretary to Cardinal <u>Donald Wuerl</u>, whom the Pennsylvania Grand Jury alleged to have covered up the sex abuse of Pittsburgh priests Ernest Paone, George Zirwas, and Richard Zula. McCarrick's former secretary, Msgr. Anthony J. Figueiredo, also produced evidence showing that Cardinal Wuerl lied when he said he did not know anything about restrictions that Pope Benedict XVI had imposed on McCarrick.

A number of seminarians from New York dioceses (Albany, Buffalo and New York) within the recent past reported having been threatened or forced to discontinue their studies for the priesthood as a result of encounters with priests perceived to be homosexuals. Father Ryszard <u>Biernat said he was threatened by Buffalo Auxiliary Bishop Edward Grosz</u> to be deported back to Poland and not ordained if he disclosed allegations that he was sexually assaulted in his rectory bedroom by Father Arthur J. Smith, the pastor of St. Thomas Aquinas Church. Although Biernat kept his mouth shut and was ordained, he was later <u>suspended by Bishop Richard Malone for leaking audio recordings to the media</u> that showed Malone knew about clerical sexual abuse allegations months before he acted on them. Bishop Edward Scharfenberger, the temporary administrator, did not lift Biernat's suspension when he concelebrated a pre-Lenten Mass with Buffalo clergy, including Auxiliary Bishop Grosz; Father Joseph Gatto, the disgraced ex-rector of Christ the King Seminary <u>who was accused by multiple men of sexual misconduct</u>; and Father Arthur Smith. Not only is Smith alleged to have molested Biernat, but he is also being sued by his nephew, Ryan Cooley, who claims that when he was nine years old, "<u>Father Art" abused him in his bedroom</u>.

Just as then-Archbishop Edwin O'Brien failed to address the homosexual predation that was reported to him involving a heterosexually-oriented veteran who felt forced to leave a seminary infested with gay seminarians, so too did an <u>ex-seminarian from the Diocese of Albany accuse</u> <u>Bishop Edward Scharfenberger</u> of failing to investigate his experiences with Father Christopher DeGiovane, the current pastor of <u>St. Matthew's Church in Voorheesville</u>, New York. The ex-seminarian claimed his canonical rights were denied when he was forced to receive spiritual direction from DeGiovane who attempted to get him to view homosexuality in an approving manner while stating, "In the ancient pagan times homosexuals were regarded as being closer to the Divine."

Matthew Bojanowski and Stephen Parisi are two former seminarians of Christ the King Seminary near Buffalo, which is scheduled to close. The former seminary rector, <u>Father Joseph</u> <u>C. Gatto</u>, was forced to resign after being accused of making sexual advances toward a seminarian. <u>Bojanowski resigned after alleging being reprised against for reporting sexual harassment</u> at the hands of Fr. Jeffrey Nowak, his confessor and spiritual director. <u>Parisi, a former dean of seminarians, attributed his departure</u> to a climate of "continual cover-up of sex abuse" at the seminary.

Gatto is not the only rector to be removed in recent history amid a homosexual abuse probe. <u>Monsignor James P. Moroney was forced to resign in December of 2018</u> as rector of St. John's Seminary in Brighton, Massachusetts. Moroney is alleged to have allowed a 'toxic culture' of homosexual abuse and cover-up to flourish during his tenure at St. John's. John Monaco, a former St. John's seminarian from 2014-2016, recounted, "I witnessed in abundance inappropriate behavior by faculty and seminarians alike." He said, "Some priests were known to 'groom' other seminarians with lavish gifts and favoritism. Other priests would form cliques with seminarians and would even invite certain ones into their rooms for private 'parties."

Anthony Gorgia was a seminarian for the Archdiocese of New York and in residence at the North American College while studying at the Pontifical Gregorian University in Rome. When he returned to New York during the 2018-2019 school year for non-elective surgery, he was told by his ordinary, Timothy Cardinal Dolan, that the NAC rector, Father Peter Harman, and the vicerector, Father Adam Park, did not want him to return owing to fabricated claims of problems involving his "human formation" and "permission documentation." Gorgia's documentation and professional witnesses prove that the statements made against him are false and that he felt forced by Cardinal Dolan to resign under duress without the fairness of an impartial investigation into his case. Based on evidence which Dolan refused to examine after five requests by Gorgia for a meeting, Gorgia is led to believe that the real reason the rector and vice-rector did not want him to return was that he observed inappropriate physical behavior on the part of Father Park, and later received reports from classmates of immoral associations involving the vice-rector. It appears conveniently coincidental that this same Father Park is the Director of Human Formation at the NAC, the same tool used to discredit Anthony despite all of his objectively superlative evaluations. Despite receiving numerous communications from multiple experts and other sources on Gorgia's behalf. Dolan refuses to investigate Park and Harman and resolve what appear to be very specious allegations against Gorgia. Apparently averse toward the prospect of an investigation. Dolan went so far as to hand-write his decision to "discard the correspondence" of the pained Gorgia parents requesting an investigation into the "ulterior motive" behind the injustices precipitated against their son.

What is common in the accounts brought forward by the above mentioned seminarians is that all the cases appear to involve defamation and sexual discrimination against heterosexually-oriented seminarians who refuse to be accepting of what they perceive to be a homosexual seminary culture.

It appears to be no coincidence that Fathers Peter Harman and Adam Park both were ordained by and have ties to prelates like ex-Cardinal Theodore McCarrick and Bishop Daniel Ryan who have been shown to have engaged in sex with priests among others. It also appears that Cardinal Dolan's refusal to investigate these two priests is in clear violation of recently promulgated Church documents including *Vos Estis* and *Christus vivit*. In his refusal to allow Gorgia to serve him with the evidence of alleged behavioral problems of Father Park similar to those which resulted in the 2018 dismissals of Father Gatto in Buffalo and Monsignor Maroney in Brighton, one might find Dolan guilty of "omission" which is legally defined as "a failure to act which can give rise to liability when the law imposes a duty to act and the defendant is in breach of that duty."

Evidence indicates that Dolan was already in receipt on multiple occasions of reports regarding allegations of misconduct by Park and cover-up by Harman and by Dolan himself, and yet failed to act in accord with Church law. The Vatican Congregation for Clergy, in receipt of abundant case-related documentation, charged Dolan with the task of resolving the case, and correspondences of 22 April 2020 and 8 May 2020 similarly relayed the reported misconduct and the urgency of an investigation. Given the inactivity to date, Dolan, Harman, and other responsible prelates may be considered in default of *Vos Estis*, art. 1, §1a-b, which mandates that action be taken not only against "derelicts against the sixth commandment," but also against those who commit "actions or omissions intended to interfere with or avoid civil investigations or canonical investigations..."

This is not the first time Cardinal Dolan has been accused of covering up for alleged homosexual predators. In December 2018, <u>Cardinal Sean O'Malley reported Dolan to the</u>

<u>Apostolic Nuncio</u>, Archbishop Christophe Pierre, for allowing Father Donald Timone to remain in active ministry despite two settlements paid for allegations of sexual abuse of teenage boys. By turning in another cardinal for negligence, O'Malley may have wished to show that he was not soft on abuse after being criticized for not creating a more probing and transparent board to investigate the alleged homosexual culture at St. John's Seminary.

A rector who was contacted about the current vocation situation in the Church wrote, "If there is not a strong formation program with solid candidates, the mediocrity will result in closures." Unfortunately, some exceptional candidates like Anthony Gorgia and others have had the misfortune of attending seminaries with very poor formation programs and left or felt compelled to leave because of environments where seminarians were being propositioned by seminary administrators, faculty members, or other students.

Ordinaries and vocation directors who are weighing where to send their priesthood candidates for formation may be particularly interested in learning what steps Cardinal Dolan and the NAC Board of Governors are taking amid allegations of sexual harassment and perceived homosexual behavior which - as of this date - they appear to be covering up. An investigation of the alleged misbehavior and the perceived subsequent cover-up should not resemble the whitewashed inspection undertaken by Cardinal Edwin O'Brien in 2005-2006, nor the 2018 investigation into St. John's Seminary led by Auxiliary Bishop Mark O'Connell who was a seminary faculty member at the time of the scandal who allegedly did little to stem homosexual misconduct. Former St. John's seminarian, John Monaco, advised Cardinal Sean O'Malley to avoid creating a compromised investigative body when he wrote, "The Catholic people have seen how bishops policing themselves and conducting internal investigations can ieopardize the objectivity so desperately needed for the pursuit of justice." The manner in which the Congregation for Clergy forwarded the Gorgia case back to Dolan for resolution, despite the fact that he himself was implicated in covering up the misbehavior, resembles how appeals to the Vatican by nuns who encountered abuse were remanded to ordinaries who were already aware of or complicit in the abuse they suffered.

Until a truly uncompromising investigation of the North American College is completed; the results made known; and any problems resolved; NAC seminarians currently quarantined in the US and future potential nominees to study at the NAC may be potentially in danger of victimization given the toxic environment under the administration of Fathers Harman and Park that enabled what happened to Anthony Gorgia to take place.

Gene Thomas Gomulka is a retired Navy captain/chaplain who served on active duty at Marine Corps and Navy commands for over 24 years. A Catholic priest (monsignor) ordained for the Pennsylvania Altoona-Johnstown diocese, Gomulka and Dominican Father Thomas Doyle had their ecclesiastical endorsements revoked as a result of their support for sexual abuse victims and their confrontations with Church leaders who underreported and covered up abuse. Rev. Thomas Devery Our Lady Star of the Sea 5371 Amboy Road Staten Island, NY 10312

Dear Father Devery,

This is to follow up on our conversation yesterday about your parishioner and former seminarian, Anthony Gorgia, who appears to have been reprised against as a whistleblower for the information he possessed about allegations of misconduct at the North American College (NAC) that are being covered up by Cardinal Dolan.

As I mentioned in the course of our conversation, I have not been able to find any justification for Anthony's not being allowed to return to NAC following his non-elective surgery in November of 2018. The reasons provided by the rector, Father Peter Harman, that were accepted by Cardinal Dolan, appear highly specious.

You asked me what I heard from the Cardinal. Attached is not only a copy of the email I received from Kevin Reynolds, Esq., the Administrator of the NYARCH Lay Review Board, but also my response in which I noted the Cardinal's failure to acknowledge or respond to my letter and email of 22 April 2020 in which I requested that "an impartial and thorough investigation into all of the allegations" of the Gorgia case be undertaken. As the Cardinal and "other responsible parties" such as Archbishop Wilton Gregory, Bishop Thomas Paprocki, and members of the NAC Board of Governors, appear to be covering up the reported allegations, I argued that Mr. Reynolds, owing to a "conflict of interest" as one employed by Cardinal Dolan who is himself now implicated in the case, could not be expected "to provide an objective appraisal of…Gorgia v. Dolan" (See: www.gomulka.net/Gorgia.pdf).

During our phone conversation when we agreed on the need to exercise "due diligence," I forgot to point out that I sent more than 3,000 queries to bishops, priests, deacons, religious, seminarians and laity in the New York, Washington, and Milwaukee archdioceses, and in the Diocese of Springfield in Illinois, as well as to NAC seminarians and every US Ordinary. Interestingly, not one among these recipients wrote back with something good to say about Cardinal Dolan. Actually, one priest who asked to remain anonymous wrote, "I will just say this, and I know this for sure, when he [Cardinal Dolan] dies, his soul will go right to hell. This I know with absolute certainty."

Another respondent who wished to remain anonymous wrote, "There are so many of us who have suffered under Dolan's 'reign of terror.' Dolan has no compunction of sending priests off for re-education to the Vianney Center at Downingtown, PA - weaponizing the place so much so that we call it 'Gulag Dolan'."

I may have noted during our conversation that I was moved to get involved in this case because like Anthony, I too suffered a reprisal for the knowledge I had of homosexual behavior that my ecclesiastical superior refused to consider. In November of 2002, then-Archbishop Edwin F. O'Brien (who hails from the Bronx) refused to allow me to present evidence I had that a fellow chaplain, Father John "Matt" Lee, had "a live-in boyfriend." Similarly, Cardinal Dolan refused to allow Anthony to share evidence supporting concerns he and his fellow NAC students expressed about allegations involving the vice rector, Father Adam Park. Interestingly, after O'Brien refused to investigate and discipline Lee in 2002, Lee went on to abuse Naval Academy Midshipmen and Marines only to be arrested in 2007 when he was charged with aggravated assault, conduct unbecoming an officer, sodomy, and failure to inform sex partners that he was HIV positive. Lee is currently serving a 30 year sentence in a federal correctional institution. I also wish to point out that when Anthony Gorgia was told by Cardinal Dolan that Fathers Harman and Park did not want him to return to NAC, it was at that very same time in late 2018 that a number of seminarians (Stephen Parisi, Matthew Bojanowski, John Monaco, Vincent DeGeorge, and others) were successful in exposing homosexual predation by bishops like Michael Bransfield (who gave \$350,000 in pay-offs to fellow prelates including Cardinal Dolan); sexual misconduct by rectors like Father Joseph Gotto at Christ the King Seminary near Buffalo; and a "toxic culture" of homosexual abuse and cover-up that flourished at St. John's Seminary near Boston, under the rector, Monsignor James Moroney. In addition to these explosive revelations, it was at this very same time that Holy Apostles Seminary in Connecticut announced the findings of an investigation which documented that "multiple Holy Apostles seminarians were active homosexuals" and that "for years, former Hartford Archbishop Henry Mansell and other U.S. prelates secretly imported gay seminarians from Latin America into the United States."

Insofar as three seminaries (Christ the King, St. John's, and Holy Apostles) all within a matter of three short months were rocked with scandals involving gay faculty members and seminarians, was it Cardinal Dolan's intent to prevent Anthony Gorgia from adding the North American College to the list of corrupted seminaries? Might Dolan, who was a former NAC rector and alumnus, have feared that a probe into this case would have revealed additional scandals, such as the findings of American psychiatrist Joseph Barone that, between 1983 and 1993, one in every twelve NAC seminarians tested positive for AIDS?

One might find Dolan and other clerics who failed to act guilty of "omission" which is legally defined as "a failure to act which can give rise to liability when the law imposes a duty to act and the defendant is in breach of that duty." Many individuals, including professionals, have questioned what your role has been along with that of Father Christopher Argano. Both of you were part of the "chain of command" respectively as Anthony's pastor and Vocation Director. The investigation has shown that to date, neither of you have taken action on Anthony's behalf, the omission of which has inflicted harm upon Anthony and has left unquestioned a potentially dangerous environment at the NAC. Interestingly, your parishioners are among those who are taking action in defense of Anthony. One parishioner submitted, "I am only one in a parish of over 4,000 families who all love Mr. Gorgia…we stand behind him in good conscience and in good faith…"

I believe that as you have no doubt of Anthony's innocence, others will lament that you failed to support your seminarian who served your parish of Our Lady Star of the Sea for over twenty years as an altar boy, catechist, Eucharistic minister, and master of ceremonies and whom you know in your heart would have made a truly inspiring, gifted, and dedicated priest.

Fraternally in Christ,

Amulko

Gene Thomas Gomulka CAPT, CHC, USN (Ret.)

To: US Ordinaries, Seminary Rectors, Vocation Directors, and Safe Environment Coordinators

All of you were informed that I received allegations of misconduct on the part of NAC vice-rector Father Adam Park that I requested Cardinal Timothy Dolan and the NAC Board of Governors to investigate in a letter sent by US Mail and email dated April 22, 2020.

When no response was forthcoming and it appeared that the "responsible parties" may be covering up homosexual predation as so many bishops have been guilty of doing for decades, I sent <u>an email to every</u> <u>US Ordinary</u> warning them of the alleged risk to NAC seminarians, while calling on them to demand an investigation of Cardinal Dolan and the NAC faculty in keeping with *Vos estis lux mundi*, *Christus vivit*, and the NAC's *Expectations of Ethical Conduct*.

When you read a copy of my June 15, 2020 letter below to Sister Mary Patrice Ahearn, the NAC staff psychologist, you will discover that only one US Ordinary responded by writing: "Out of concern for other seminarians now at the NAC, and in the interest of justice, I have passed your correspondence along to the Apostolic Nunciature." Unfortunately, as you will read, the Vatican appears to be handing this case the same way it dealt with complaints that religious sisters were being raped by African priests. Instead of investigating these claims, the Vatican sent the complaints back to the bishops who were covering up what was going on based on their belief that the chances of contracting AIDS were reduced if their priests had sex with nuns instead of with prostitutes.

Even though Sister Mary Patrice opened and read my letter at 9:15 am (Rome time) on June 16, 2020, she has yet to reply. In light of the fact that by law she is a mandatory reporter when it comes to allegations of sexual abuse, and insofar as seminarians are legally "vulnerable adults" given their superior-inferior relationship with both their formators and ecclesiastical superiors, her failure to act upon these allegations could pose very serious legal consequences for her.

This communication is being made available to the media, clergy, laity and other interested parties online at <u>www.gomulka.net/Ahearn.pdf</u>

I trust you will find the following letter of interest in bringing you up-to-date on the progress I am making in my investigation. Feel free to offer any comments.

June 15, 2020

Sister Mary Patrice Ahearn, RSM c/o Pontifical North American College 00120 Vatican City State

Dear Sister Mary Patrice,

I am confident that by now you have been informed that I am undertaking an investigation into allegations involving clerical misconduct at the North American College (NAC).

After contacting your motherhouse in Alma on 11 June 2020 at 12:35 PST, at which time I was assured of a response from you which as of present I have not received, I am reaching out to you for a second time via email.

The evidence I have gathered to date after speaking confidentially with different current and former NAC seminarians, priests, and laity, led me to write Cardinal Dolan, the NAC Board of Governors, and all US Ordinaries, requesting that an impartial investigation into concerns about the victimization of NAC seminarians and cover-up of this victimization be undertaken.

As a licensed psychologist employed at NAC, I am hoping you can answer a few questions that might prove helpful in my investigation.

1) After reviewing an audio recording from a January 2020 formation conference on sexual abuse of power that was made by an unnamed student, one may perceive the NAC student described as "crying out for help" who spoke at length following your presentation on sex abuse as actually reporting abuse that was occurring in his own life at NAC. Given the lack of response on the part of Church leaders regarding the accusations of clerical misconduct at NAC that have surfaced, how can mandated reporters justify the discrepancy between protocols stated in *Vos estis lux mundi*, *Christus vivit*, and the NAC's *Expectations of Ethical Conduct* and the absence of an investigation into these accusations to date?

2) Are you familiar with the work of New Jersey psychiatrist Joseph Barone, who over a seven year period tested "dozens" of NAC seminarians for AIDS and found that "<u>1 in 12 tested HIV-positive</u>"?

3) Did you know that Cardinal Edwin <u>O'Brien "coincidently" arranged for then-Monsignor James</u> <u>Checchio to replace Monsignor Kevin McCoy</u> early just before McCoy was scheduled to make a report to then-Archbishop O'Brien who was carrying out an investigation of all US seminaries?

4) Did you know that Argentine Bishop Gustavo Oscar Zanchetta who was accused of sexually abusing a number of seminarians and who claimed that all nude selfies of himself on his cell phone were uploaded by someone else, <u>has just recently been "resurrected" by Pope Francis</u> similar to the "resurrection" of ex-Cardinal McCarrick that occurred after Jorge Bergoglio was elected to the papacy?

Allow me to explain how your answers to these questions may shed light on my investigation.

1) After Anthony Gorgia witnessed inappropriate touching of a student by vice-rector Adam Park, Gorgia received disclosures not only from the student he witnessed being touched, but also from other seminarians. Based on what he saw, heard and received in written form, Gorgia had reason to believe that Father Park might be preying on seminarians, including those who report to him as their formator. While in New York, where Gorgia returned on a pre-approved leave from NAC to undergo non-elective surgery, he received communications from seminarians that heightened his concern that his fellow seminarians might be succumbing to victimization at NAC. Cardinal Timothy Dolan not once, but five times refused to discuss the allegations surrounding Father Park. Given that the seminarian whom Gorgia witnessed receiving Father Park's inappropriate touching was Park's formation advisee, Gorgia's concern only grew when he heard that a formation advisee of Father Park spoke at length in a very emotional manner following your presentation to the student body. Later Gorgia was told by a student that Father Park was now showing "interest" in a younger student.

When I myself investigated these claims, I was informed by another NAC seminarian of a pattern, such that Father Park is attracted to athletic, handsome students who tend to be somewhat naïve. I bring this to your attention, since you as a licensed psychologist are a mandatory reporter who is required by law to report allegations of sex abuse involving minors and vulnerable adults. Obviously, NAC seminarians are not minors, but might they be considered "vulnerable adults," a designation concurrent with a communication sent by Father Harman himself identifying them as "vulnerable?"

I would argue that seminarians are "vulnerable adults" based on the following case: In 2002 I reported a chaplain for having a "live-in-boyfriend" to his ecclesiastical endorser, then-Archbishop Edwin O'Brien. Just like Cardinal Dolan who refused to look at the evidence of alleged clerical misconduct that Anthony Gorgia tried to serve him 5 times, so too did O'Brien refuse to look at the evidence I brought to his office about Chaplain John "Matt" Lee. Five years after Lee went on to serve at the US Naval Academy and Marine Corps Base Quantico, he was arrested and charged with conduct unbecoming an officer, aggravated assault, sodomy, and failure to inform sex partners that he was HIV-positive. When contacted by the media, O'Brien lied by leading them to believe Lee's active gay sex life was never reported to him. Lee is currently serving a 30 year sentence in a Federal Prison. The point is that even though the sailor Lee lived with when I reported him and the Midshipmen and young Marines he seduced were technically

adults, they were considered to be "vulnerable adults" in so far as Lee enjoyed a superior-inferior relationship with them.

This opinion also seems to be shared by former NAC rector, Bishop James Checchio, who <u>maintains that</u> <u>a priest or seminarian is *de facto* a "vulnerable adult</u>" per the Dallas Charter, and therefore not in a position to give actual sexual consent when it comes to a person who wields authority over him. In so far as a seminary faculty member, particularly a formator, could have a seminarian sent home never to be ordained (like was done to Gorgia), he certainly is "vulnerable."

The "vulnerable" aspect is all the more serious in this case insofar as one NAC seminarian, who wished to remain anonymous, told me that after hearing what another student said with great emotion, he was concerned about what might happen to this fellow seminarian in the future. The former also mentioned the possibility that his peer, as a victim and a priest, might later speak out against this behavior as Chicago Father Paul John Kalchik is doing after having been raped when he was 19 by a gay priest. Finally, we also discussed the possibility that if the seminarian who appeared to be "crying out for help" truly is an abuse victim, he might later attempt suicide as has been known to happen among victims of abuse.

Those considered "vulnerable" amid accusations of misconduct at the NAC include not only present NAC seminarians, but also future generations of minors, seminarians, and other vulnerable adults whom studies have shown are at higher risk of suffering predation by those who themselves have incurred predation. The NAC seminarian who contacted me seemed to know that some people who are preyed upon later imitate that behavior as priests with others, thereby becoming predators themselves, a finding already noted in the work of A.W. Richard Sipe when he wrote of his knowledge "from many priests about their seduction by highly placed clerics and the dire consequences in their lives that does not end in their victimization alone … This abuse paves the way for them to pass the tradition on – to have sex with each other and even with minors." Sipe's statement has already been confirmed when an article published in *America* described a 1994 letter to Bishop Edward T. Hughes from a priest who reported enduring "sexual and emotional abuse" at the hands of ex-Cardinal Theodore McCarrick and contended that these experiences "had left him so traumatized that it triggered him to touch two 15-year-old boys inappropriately." Interestingly, seminarians abused by McCarrick have reported suffering some of the same physical behaviors as those now being alleged of Father Park, who himself was a seminarian and was ordained by McCarrick.

2) Dr. Joseph Barone was involved in HIV-testing with NAC seminarians and priests during the time when then-Monsignor Edwin O'Brien was rector. Only this week, a seminary rector with whom I studied in Rome shared with me that it was after he left NAC and was ordained a few years that someone told him about where gay seminarians engaged in sex at NAC when we were there between 1971 and 1975. While the average number of gay sex partners decreased at the height of the AIDS epidemic, the development of new drugs to treat HIV seems to have led to higher partnering rates again. If Dr. Barone's statistics are correct that "1 in 12 tested HIV-positive" as late as 1993, one year before O'Brien was replaced by Dolan, and two years before AIDS deaths peaked in 1995, then one might expect the percentage of infected seminarians to be even higher today owing to less fatal consequences surrounding gay sex that Dr. Barone identified as the major cause of seminarian and priest HIV infections.

If Church leaders say that "<u>men with homosexual inclinations should not be admitted to the seminary</u>," then how can one explain the presence of so many HIV-positive seminarians at NAC given that seminarians are tested before coming to NAC?

3) As you know, O'Brien was followed by Dolan in 1994 who was followed in 2001 by Monsignor Kevin McCoy. While I received one report presently under investigation that Dolan dismissed a heterosexually oriented seminarian who reported two classmates for engaging in gay sex in the room next door to his, I found nothing to indicate that McCoy tolerated either seminarians who engaged in consensual sex with one another, or gay seminarians who were reported for propositioning heterosexual seminarians. Everything I have been able to uncover about McCoy at this point in my investigation is positive. For

example, one person wrote, "He was a good father. The people that worked at the seminary loved him; he was like a pastor to them."

Although McCoy was offered a five year contract to serve as rector, then-Archbishop O'Brien and the NAC Board of Governors announced in late 2005 that he would be relieved early in January of 2006 by then-Monsignor James Checchio. Based on O'Brien's past record, one can surmise the reason behind this sudden and early mid-year change of command.

In late August of 2001, I published an article in *America* ("<u>Home Alone in the Priesthood</u>") that made a passing reference to five Catholic chaplains under my supervision in the early '90s who committed "offenses that resulted either in their imprisonment or separation from the military." Instead of writing me himself, O'Brien forwarded me a letter from a <u>Monsignor Patrick Brown</u> that questioned the accuracy of my article. <u>My response to Monsignor Brown</u> documented that "Five Catholic Chaplains (10 percent of the RC chaplains serving with Marines) committed UCMJ offenses (four involving homosexual behavior and one involving pedophilia). Three of the five RC Chaplains were incarcerated (one received a 12 year sentence for pedophilia) and two received other than honorable (OTH) discharges."

When O'Brien received a copy of my attached response, he had his auxiliary bishop, John Glenn, write a letter to the editor. Glenn avoided stating that four priests were disciplined because of homosexual behavior, but he simply wrote that they "had serious problems." He also left out that there were not four – but five problem priests including the one who was sentenced to 12 years for pedophilia. His biggest lie was to make it seem as if what I reported was an anomaly, and that no problems like that ever happened before or after those I reported. He wrote, "Nothing as serious as that had ever happened before in the history of the military ordinariate. I can testify that such a situation has not recurred."

When O'Brien was required to report the number of abusive priests within the Archdiocese for the Military Services who abused minors between 1950 and 2002, he wrote, "<u>As to our Archdiocese, two such cases have come forward where active-duty priest chaplains have been found guilty of engaging in immoral acts with minors.</u>" When I read his letter, I could not believe how he thought he could get away with such a boldface lie. When I confronted him for this misrepresentation, he revoked my ecclesiastical endorsement as he did Chaplain Tom Doyle's endorsement a few months earlier as a reprisal for his testimony at abuse trials throughout the country. Bishopaccountability has identified not 2, but over 150 military and VA chaplains credibly accused of abusing minors and vulnerable subordinate military personnel.

In light of O'Brien's history of underreporting and covering-up abuse mainly involving homosexual predation in the Archdiocese for the Military Services, I maintain that it follows he would want to cover it up in seminaries. When I reported to O'Brien in 2002 that a sailor I recommended for the priesthood left the seminary after six months when the administration failed to discipline the gay students who were propositioning him for sex, O'Brien did absolutely nothing. Had O'Brien been as interested in recruiting heterosexual candidates as he was homosexuals he was documented to have attempted to recruit, he would have inquired as to what seminary the former sailor attended.

O'Brien learned that McCoy reportedly took the Church's teaching on homosexuality seriously and did not hesitate to expel sexually active gay students. Rather than having to alter the data provided by McCoy to paint a very rosy picture of NAC, it appears he had McCoy removed early with the excuse that he was needed to fulfill the time of his contract by returning to the US to head the completion of NAC's capital <u>campaign</u>. With McCoy out of the way, O'Brien was free to conduct his sham of a seminary investigation with Checchio who, with little information of his own, would allow O'Brien to report whatever he wished. Unlike McCoy who upheld the Church's teaching on homosexuality, Checchio was reported by a former NAC seminarian as discontinuing his studies when this seminarian refused to attend the diaconate ordination that year because Checchio and the faculty endorsed ordinandi he knew to be sexually active gays. In view of the outcome O'Brien may have hoped to contrive in his study on seminaries, might he also have feared some calling into question how many homosexual seminarians expelled by McCoy might later have been recruited and ordained by Ordinaries of other dioceses or communities given how some seminaries in the United States have been shown to recruit knownhomosexual candidates?

Unlike former rectors like O'Brien, Dolan, and Checchio who were rewarded and promoted to the ranks of the episcopacy for covering up homosexual predation and behavior, McCoy is back working in a parish in the Diocese of Sioux City, Iowa. McCoy is able to sleep well at night knowing he protected his young men from clerical predators like McCarrick, Bransfield, Zanchetta, Gatto, and so many others guilty of sexually abusing seminarians.

4) When Dolan refused to meet with Gorgia and examine the evidence he had that Park might be preying on NAC seminarians, Gorgia sent evidence to the Apostolic Nuncio, Archbishop Christophe Pierre; the Congregation for the Clergy; and Cardinal Óscar Rodríguez Maradiaga. Pierre wrote back to Gorgia claiming that this case was outside his jurisdiction even though, in keeping with *Vos estis lux mundi*, allegations involving abuse cover-ups by Metropolitan Archbishops are to be reported to the Nuncio to then be investigated by the Vatican. Neither the Congregation of the Clergy nor Cardinal Óscar Rodríguez Maradiaga offered the courtesy of a response despite confirmation that their offices were in receipt of the evidence.

It appears that the Nuncio and Vatican officials are handling the Gorgia case the way the <u>documented</u> <u>abuse of nuns in Africa was handled</u>. When a mother superior complained that the local bishop wanted her to make her sisters available to have sex with his priests lest they become infected with HIV and die of AIDS, instead of disciplining and removing the bishop, the Vatican forwarded the complaint to the bishop who had the mother superior removed. When one nun was impregnated by a priest, he forced her to have an abortion which resulted in her death. It was the priest who got her pregnant who then conducted her funeral Mass.

Anthony Gorgia, who is fluent in Italian, learned from a high ranking prelate in Rome that his case was forwarded to Dolan, who to this day has failed to take action upon the reports he has received. So, like the case involving the mother superior in which the Vatican wanted to cover-up the abuse of religious women in Africa, so too does the Vatican want to cover up the abuse that may be going on not only at NAC, but at many other seminaries around the world.

Gorgia probably never would have written to Cardinal Óscar Rodríguez Maradiaga, the leader of the pope's advisory council, had he known that <u>Maradiaga slammed seminarians for exposing homosexual</u> <u>predation</u> and behavior inside his archdiocesan major seminary in Tegucigalpa, Honduras.

Another reason Gorgia wasted his time appealing to the Vatican is because Pope Francis himself has protected bishops like Gustavo Zanchetta credibly accused of abusing seminarians. The Argentine prelate opened the "St. John XXIII Seminary" in his diocese in 2016 with six seminarians. The following year Gustavo resigned after he was accused of sexual abuse by three seminarians, some of whom were minors. Press reports suggested that Zanchetta used diocesan funds to <u>buy the silence</u> of young seminarians he allegedly subjected to "masturbation, groping and psychological pressure."

It was recently reported on June 11, 2020 that <u>Pope Francis has welcomed Zanchetta to live and work in</u> the Vatican as if nothing ever happened. This should not come as a surprise seeing that no action was taken against him when "<u>naked selfies were reportedly sent to the Holy See's embassy in Argentina along</u> with testimonies regarding Zanchetta's misdeeds."

It is also clear to me that what happened to Anthony Gorgia at NAC that I addressed in "Gorgia v. Dolan" is not an isolated event. When Michael Rose published *Goodbye! Good Men* in 2002, he addressed "how seminary 'gay subculture' and its 'heterophobia' drive away healthy heterosexual men." Unfortunately, it appears that nothing much has changed – and perhaps has even gotten worse – over the past twenty years. In the sense that *history repeats itself*, it is a well-founded observation that NAC seems to be on the same path that led to the closure of the American College of Louvain (ACL) in June of 2011. ACL was reportedly plagued by accusations of homosexual misconduct on the part of the vice-rector, Father Michael Nash, who was later dismissed from the priesthood. It was also reported that the rector, Father

David Windsor, retaliated against a seminarian for refusing to comply with the alleged homosexual subculture. These scandals contributed to a decline in the number of seminarians nominated to attend ACL by sponsoring Ordinaries.

When Dominican Father Tom Doyle co-authored a <u>sex abuse report in 1985</u> while working at the Nunciature in Washington, DC, the Vatican and US Ordinaries responded the very same they are responding today to "<u>Gorgia v. Dolan</u>" which they have all received. Just as they moved Doyle to do something else with his life after he wrote an in-depth report about the abuse cases that had been coming across his desk, so too did Dolan, the NAC Board of Governors, and all save but one US Ordinary do nothing after Gorgia was coerced into leaving NAC owing to his possession of evidence of alleged clerical misconduct at NAC.

Only one US prelate, Bishop Edgar da Cunha from the Diocese of Fall River, had the moral courage to respond by writing, "Out of concern for other seminarians now at the NAC, and in the interest of justice, I have passed your correspondence along to the Apostolic Nunciature." In keeping with *Vos estis lux mundi*, da Cunha knows that a Metropolitan Archbishop like Dolan who is alleged to have covered up alleged abuse can only be investigated by someone appointed by the Vatican. Cardinal Sean O'Malley likewise recognized how *Vos estis* is supposed to work when <u>he too reported Dolan to the Nuncio</u> for keeping a credibly accused abusive cleric on the job in New York for years despite a large settlement paid to one of his victims.

What NAC officials, Cardinal Dolan, and all prelates who have been in receipt of these allegations and failed to act upon them should realize is that they are now under questioning for jeopardizing the vulnerable adults under their care by *omission*, which is legally defined as "a failure to act which can give rise to liability when the law imposes a duty to act and the defendant is in breach of that duty."

Knowing from personal experience how whistleblowers may unjustly be treated, and knowing too how people with certain incriminating evidence might also be either pressured to keep quiet or be dismissed, allow me to advise you to document any conversations and safeguard any communications you might have with the rector or any church officials in regard to this case.

As you ponder how you might respond to my inquiry, please remember <u>how many thousands of people</u> <u>could have avoided being abused had the bishops and the Vatican not covered-up Father Doyle's 1985</u> <u>report</u>, and how many sailors, Marines, and Midshipmen might not have been abused had then-Archbishop O'Brien not covered up my report regarding allegations of homosexual behavior on the part of Father John "Matt" Lee who, like Father Adam Park, is a priest of the Archbiocese of Washington.

As a licensed psychologist, you are well aware of the fact that some people who have been sexually abused, including seminarians, have been moved to commit suicide. The next time you find yourself in St. Peter's Square, you might want to look at the Papal Palace to your right and recall how former German sister, Doris Wagner, who was repeatedly raped by a priest in the Vatican, said <u>she almost committed suicide</u> one day when she was high up on a balcony inside the Papal Palace, right in front of the pope. It would be regrettable if one of the NAC seminarians whom you were employed to care for were to take his own life as a result of abuse that was covered up by NAC officials and all the US Ordinaries (save Bishop Edgar da Cunha).

I look forward to hearing back from you and ask God to bless you in your work and keep you safe.

Sincerely in Christ,

Asomulko

Rev. Msgr., CAPT, CHC, USN (Ret.)

Your Eminence/Excellency,

The following letter to Father Christopher Argano should help update you on my investigation into allegations of clerical misconduct at the North American College, as well as a cover-up by responsible prelates and clerics.

In addition to Fall River Bishop Edgar da Cunha, Boston Cardinal Sean O'Malley has also since written to the Apostolic Nuncio requesting that the Vatican investigate both of the above allegations.

As you will note in my letter to Father Argano, I have since had to withdraw the positive evaluation I originally afforded Monsignor Kevin McCoy who was the NAC Rector from 2001 to 2005. Although given a chance, Monsignor McCoy did not refute the allegations I received about his dealings with Adam Park who was ordained a deacon and a priest when McCoy was the rector.

Please do not hesitate to contact me with any information that might prove helpful in this case.

With every best wish, I remain

Sincerely in Christ,

Gene Thomas Gomulka

27 June 2020

Rev. Christopher Argano 201 Seminary Avenue Yonkers, NY 10704-1896

Dear Father Argano,

As you are well aware, I have been undertaking an investigation into allegations of misconduct on the part of Father Adam Park, vice-rector at the North American College (NAC), that appear to have been covered up by Cardinal Timothy Dolan, NAC rector Father Peter Harman, and other responsible parties. As the Archdiocesan Vocation Director who is responsible for assuring "the stability...vital to the mission of vocation recruitment and the formation of candidates," I find it necessary to look into your role, specifically, what you have done or failed to do to ascertain the real reason Fathers Harman and Park did not want Anthony Gorgia to return to NAC following his surgery in New York.

As a matter of exercising due diligence, I continue to undertake interviews and send queries to bishops, priests, deacons, religious, current and former seminarians and laity from dioceses across the United States. After sending out over 3,000 queries and after hundreds of hours of investigatory work, I cannot find any sound justification for Anthony not having been allowed to return to NAC.

I am confident that the discovery phase of a lawsuit will confirm my findings rooted in solid evidence that such specious and disprovable reasons as "permission documentation" and "human formation" could not have justified Anthony's coerced disenrollment just three months into the new academic year after all of his overwhelmingly positive evaluations by faculty, peers, and Cardinal Dolan.

After speaking with NAC alumni, especially with those who were never ordained or who did not complete their studies at NAC, it is eminently clear that homosexual predation and behavior were covered up and tolerated under all the rectors from O'Brien to Harman. New developments since my <u>18 June 2020</u> correspondence to the US bishops now show that Monsignor Kevin McCoy, NAC rector throughout Adam Park's seminary formation years from 2001-2005, also covered up for Park and reprised against heterosexually oriented seminarians who perceived him to be a sexually-active homosexual. Interestingly, allegations involving homosexual predation and behavior and cover-up of such behaviors were responsible in part for the closure of the <u>American College in Louvain</u>, <u>Christ the King Seminary in Buffalo</u>, and quite a number of other seminaries over the past decades, a path on which the NAC now seems to be headed in light of evidence-based accusations that have come forward against NAC faculty.

As part of my investigation, you received multiple reports containing the allegations of misconduct on the part of vice-rector Father Park to which you have given no response. The reports include a <u>22 April 2020 letter</u> to Cardinal Dolan copied to you among "other responsible parties" and reports of <u>8 May 2020</u>, <u>31 May 2020</u>, and <u>15/18 June 2020</u>. I also received communications and interviewed a number of individuals who found you to be negligent in your duties as vocation director. Your reported responses to them included that you were "too busy" and that it was "not your place" to address the matter. One respondent noted that you conveyed you "did not know Anthony" despite having known him for more than ten years through your connection to Our Lady Star of the Sea parish where he has been very active in ministry.

Interestingly, when Anthony was told by Cardinal Dolan that Fathers Harman and Park did not want him to return to NAC, it was at that very same time in late 2018 that a number of seminarians from dioceses such as Buffalo, Albany, Wheeling-Charleston, Boston, and others were successful in exposing homosexual predation by bishops like Michael Bransfield (who gave \$350,000 in pay-offs to fellow prelates including Cardinal Dolan); sexual misconduct by rectors like Father Joseph Gotto at Christ the King Seminary near Buffalo; and a "toxic culture" of homosexual abuse and cover-up that flourished at St. John's Seminary near Boston, under the rector, Monsignor James Moroney. In addition to these explosive revelations, it was at this very same time Holy Apostles Seminary in Connecticut announced the findings of an investigation which documented that "multiple Holy Apostles seminarians were active homosexuals" and that "for years, former Hartford Archbishop Henry Mansell and other US prelates secretly imported gay seminarians from Latin America into the United States."

Insofar as three seminaries within a matter of three short months were rocked with scandals involving homosexual behaviors committed by faculty members, was it Cardinal Dolan's intent to prevent Anthony Gorgia from adding the North American College to the list of corrupted seminaries? Might Dolan, who was a former NAC rector and alumnus, have feared that a probe into this case would have revealed additional scandals, such as the findings of American psychiatrist Joseph Barone that, between 1983 and 1993, one in every twelve NAC seminarians tested positive for AIDS?

Your lack of involvement contrasts with the responsiveness of Buffalo Diocese Vocation Director, <u>Father Andrew Lauricella</u>. When he received accusations of a toxic environment at Christ the King Seminary, he dutifully reported to the Ordinary his own concern for the "<u>physical, emotional, and spiritual health</u>" of the seminarians under his supervision. Unlike Lauricella, you have elected to remain silent amid accusations that your seminarians are being

exposed to some of the same alleged physical behaviors on the part of Father Park that were attributed to ex-Cardinal McCarrick toward his seminarians.

In an effort to carry out this investigation with integrity and transparency, I am making this communication available to the media, clergy, laity, and other interested parties online at www.gomulka.net/Argano.pdf

I regret that it appears you failed to support Anthony Gorgia who served the parish of Our Lady Star of the Sea for over twenty years as an altar boy, catechist, Eucharistic minister, and master of ceremonies, and whom you were reported to have said would have made a truly inspiring, gifted, and dedicated priest.

Fraternally in Christ,

Somulko

Gene Thomas Gomulka

CC: Archbishop Christophe Pierre

All US Ordinaries including the NAC Board of Governors New York Auxiliary Bishops Byrne, Colacicco, O'Hara, and Whalen Father Thomas Devery Father James Ferreira Sister Mary Patrice Ahearn, RSM, Psy.D. Elizabeth Diaz, The New York Times

Gene Thomas Gomulka is a retired Navy captain/chaplain who served on active duty at Marine Corps and Navy commands for over 24 years. A Catholic priest (monsignor) ordained for the Pennsylvania Altoona-Johnstown diocese, Gomulka and Dominican Fr. Thomas Doyle had their ecclesiastical endorsements revoked as a result of their support for sexual abuse victims and their confrontations with Church leaders who underreported and covered up abuse.

#### Your Eminence/Excellency,

In an effort to keep you up to date in regard to my investigation, I am sending you a copy of this email I sent to Father John McDonald. You may be interested in knowing that after I sent you my last update that contained an email to Sister Mary Patrice Ahearn, RSM, the North American College (NAC) staff psychologist, I received a letter from Cardinal Sean O'Malley noting that, along with Fall River Bishop Edgar da Cunha, he forwarded the allegations contained in my communications to the Apostolic Nuncio, Archbishop Christophe Pierre, in keeping with the Holy Father's Motu Proprio, *Vos Estis Lux Mundi.* 

From: E T Gomulka <nacinvestigation@gmail.com> Date: Fri, Jul 3, 2020 at 2:45 PM Subject: NAC INVESTIGATION UPDATE To: <pastor@sacredheartanniston.org>

#### Dear Father McDonald,

As you were Anthony Gorgia's formation advisor at the North American College (NAC), and due to the widespread knowledge of my investigation into accusations of clerical misconduct on the part of Father Adam Park and cover-up by Cardinal Dolan, Father Peter Harman, and NAC administration, I imagine you realized it was only a matter of time before you would be hearing from me. I am not going to ask you a lot of questions in regard to Anthony's case, as the mountains of objective evidence and emerging testimonies of witnesses are straightforward and validate the account of the victimization Anthony suffered.

After looking at all the evidence I have uncovered over the past months, it appears you cooperated with Fathers Harman and Park and Cardinal Dolan in a plan to unjustly remove Anthony from the NAC following Anthony's witnessing and receiving reports of clerical misconduct on the part of Father Park. My investigation has shown that when retaliatory action was taken against Anthony following his November 2018 surgery in New York, you were negligent in your role as his formation advisor when you left unchallenged the patently false statements claiming Gorgia did not obtain "proper permissions" for his brief medical leave and was "slow in human formation," the falsity of which you had direct knowledge. Those involved in the pursuit of remedy for Anthony's solid standing in formation and his having followed all of your instructions in the permissions documentation. I firmly believe many will question whether you might be hoping that no one will ever know how you may have been an "accomplice" in the injustice and apparent cover-up assembled against Anthony.

As I do not know how familiar you are with the legal system, when a person is called to testify at a trial, he or she may be deposed beforehand as part of the discovery process. Because the testimony you provide is given under oath, you could be prosecuted for perjury were it shown that you lied. While you should be aware that the truthfulness (or lack thereof) of your responses will be measured against the standard of overwhelmingly objective evidence in Anthony's favor, you should also know that I have received testimony from sources who lived with you and Father Park when you were both students at NAC. Consequently, you should also be prepared to answer questions in regard to specific aspects of your alleged "friendship" with him, and how this "friendship" may have compromised your competence as a formation advisor owing to what appears to be your participation in a cover-up of Anthony's knowledge of the vice-rector's behaviors.

An example of how one might get caught committing perjury involves a sex abuse trial in a diocese where the bishop testified that he came to learn of credible allegations involving a predator priest in a certain year which caused him to remove the priest immediately from ministry. However, the following day, when a priest testified how he informed the bishop of

abuse allegations regarding the predator priest some five years prior to the date provided the previous day in court by the bishop, the jury believed the priest and the diocese lost the lawsuit. Had the bishop not been in bad health and already retired, I believe the District Attorney would have prosecuted him for perjury.

In an effort to carry out this investigation with integrity and transparency, I am making this communication available to the media, clergy, laity, and other interested parties online at <a href="http://www.gomulka.net/McDonald.pdf">www.gomulka.net/McDonald.pdf</a>

Should you wish to respond, I welcome hearing back from you.

Sincerely,

Gene Thomas Gomulka

CC: Archbishop Christophe Pierre All US Ordinaries, including the NAC Board of Governors Fathers Thomas Devery and James Ferreira Sr. Mary Patrice Ahearn, RSM, Psy.D. Elizabeth Diaz, *The New York Times* 

Gene Thomas Gomulka is a retired Navy captain/chaplain who served on active duty at Marine Corps and Navy commands for over 24 years. A Catholic priest (monsignor) ordained for the Pennsylvania Altoona-Johnstown diocese, Gomulka and Dominican Fr. Thomas Doyle had their ecclesiastical endorsements revoked as a result of their support for sexual abuse victims and their confrontations with Church leaders who underreported and covered up abuse. Your Eminences/Excellencies,

I regret to inform you that my investigation into allegations of clerical misconduct at the Pontifical North American College (NAC) has revealed that the problems of heterophobia and retaliatory seminary homosexual subcultures is much broader than I had originally reported. Not only have present and past NAC seminarians spoken confidentially of how seminarians were reprised against for addressing this problem, but many of them identified gay subcultures at seminaries they attended even prior to studying in Rome (e.g, Pontifical College Josephinum, St. Joseph's in Dunwoodie, St. John's near Boston, etc.).

Insofar as neither the Vatican nor the U.S. Episcopacy has taken action to investigate the allegations reported to the Apostolic Nuncio, Archbishop Christophe Pierre; Cardinal Beniamino Stella, and others, I feel it necessary to offer an "immigration advisory" to the episcopal conferences of countries that have contributed the largest number of seminarians and priests to serve in the United States in recent years.

The following translated letter, available also in its <u>original Polish format</u>, will provide you with an example of the warning that will be conveyed to various episcopal conferences in their respective languages.

How many Catholic parents entrusted their sons to seminaries only to have had them <u>preyed</u> <u>upon and sexually abused by faculty members or older seminarians</u>? Parents of heterosexually oriented seminarians who may be assigned to study at NAC may wish to know why their bishops never appraised them of this uninvestigated issue which Cardinal Dolan, the NAC Board of Governors, and the current <u>NAC administration</u> appear to be covering-up or ignoring.

In keeping with my effort to carry out this investigation with integrity and transparency, this communication will be available to the media, clergy, laity, and other interested parties online at <u>http://www.gomulka.net/Poland.pdf</u>.

July 16, 2020

Secretariat of the Polish Episcopal Conference Skwer Ks. Kard. S. Wyszyńskiego 6, 01-015 Warsaw Poland

Your Eminences/Excellencies,

Poland is one country that has contributed quite a number of seminarians and priests to minister in U.S. dioceses over the past decades. I had the privilege of recruiting one of those priests, Father Stanisław Czernota, to be a chaplain in the United States Navy. Although he was already 55 years old when he was commissioned and could only serve until he reached the age of 62, he saw his military service to Navy and Marine Corps personnel and their families as a way of thanking the United States for adopting him and granting him citizenship.

I regret that some Poles who have immigrated to the United States have not always had positive experiences. Before being ordained a priest for the Diocese of Buffalo in New York, Ryszard Biernat was assigned as a seminarian to work over the summer in a local parish with Father Arthur Smith. When Smith came into Biernat's bedroom one night and wanted to engage in gay sex, the young seminarian threw him out and reported the matter to Auxiliary Bishop Edward

Grosz. Instead of disciplining the sexually abusive gay priest, Grosz told Biernat that what happened was his own fault for not having locked his bedroom door. Grosz threatened to have Biernat's Green Card for residency revoked and have him deported back to Poland never to be ordained a priest if he ever told anyone what had happened. It was after Biernat kept quiet and was later ordained that Father Smith was accused of having sexually abused his own nephew. Angered at how he was coerced as a seminarian into covering up Father Smith's homosexual predation, Biernat later disclosed to the media how his bishop had been covering up for many sexually abusive priests.

I share this true story with you because what happened to Biernat is happening to other seminarians and priests in the United States. When former seminarian Anthony Gorgia more recently witnessed inappropriate touching and received allegations of clerical misconduct on the part of Father Adam Park, vice-rector of the Pontifical North American College (NAC) in Rome, Gorgia was essentially offered the same option Biernat received: Be quiet about what you saw and heard and you will be ordained; tell anyone about it and you will never be a priest. Gorgia, unlike Biernat, felt in conscience he could not be quiet about the threat of predation his fellow seminarians faced, and he was coerced into discontinuing his studies for the priesthood for the Archdiocese of New York. While a genuine vocation such as Gorgia has been lost, priests accused of misconduct such as Father Park and clerics alleged to have covered-up misconduct such as Cardinal Timothy Dolan, the NAC Board of Governors, and Father Peter Harman remain in ministry.

Until the U.S. bishops correct this predation problem in seminaries and parishes instead of covering it up as they have been doing, I fear what could happen to other Polish seminarians and priests were they to immigrate here. You might even consider the risk that your dioceses will lose authentic vocations, as happened in the Archdiocese of New York, should seminarians continue to be exposed to clerical misconduct. Just as the U.S. State Department issues official warnings about traveling to certain unstable countries throughout the world, I encourage you to issue a warning about the moral dangers that currently exist in U.S. dioceses and seminaries.

After having concelebrated Mass and socialized with Cardinal Stefan Wyszyński and St. John Paul II on different occasions, I believe they would want me to issue you this warning. As of this writing, Father Ryszard Biernat has been suspended for revealing to the media that his bishop was covering up sex abuse, and Anthony Gorgia will be taking legal action after his attempts to resolve his case through ecclesiastical channels has only met with silence.

Proud of my Polish roots and grateful that I still have cousins living in Warsaw, I pray that God will bless you through the intercession of St. John Paul II, and that he will help you find inspiration in the life of the soon to be beatified Cardinal Stefan Wyszyński.

Sincerely in Christ,

# Original Polish Letter Signed

# E. T. Gomułka

CC: Ambassador Piotr Wilczek Ambassador Georgette Mosbacher Ambassador Callista L. Gingrich Archbishop Christophe Pierre All US Ordinaries including the NAC Board of Governors Rev. Peter Harman Dear Bishop Paprocki,

I recently read in *Church Militant* that "The chancellor and general counsel for the diocese of Springfield, Illinois, Mr. James Bock Jr., contacted Church Militant claiming an informant named in the lawsuit was not credible per the diocese's estimation." While serving as an investigator for the Inspector General of the U.S. Marine Corps, I discovered that what is *not* mentioned is often far more important than what is stated.

While Bock as your general counsel misrepresented the 2006 Springfield in Illinois "Special Panel" Report to be impartial and "independent," I find it interesting that he failed to attach the actual report which admits that Bishop Lucas himself hired Attorney Bill Roberts to investigate "allegations of misconduct by priests of the diocese." Insofar as both Lucas himself and Father Peter Harman, his alleged "homosexual lover," were reported to the Vatican for engaging in "homosexual activities," this so-called "investigation" was no different than had former President Bill Clinton himself appointed a lawyer to investigate claims that he was having sex with a White House intern. Given this conflict of interest, I am not surprised that Mr. Roberts failed to return calls I made to discuss the validity of some of the Panel's conclusions.

While investigating an abuse case involving a female chaplain who was separated from active duty, I discovered that her Commanding Officer had his own Admin Officer undertake a bogus "in-house" investigation similar to one then-Bishop George Lucas convened after he was reported for sexual misconduct to the Apostolic Nuncio in a letter dated January 6, 2005. Not only did the Vatican cover up the allegations, but the witness who provided incriminating testimony against Lucas and other Springfield priests also suffered reprisals and threats. You may be interested in knowing that I had the claims of the female chaplain who was reprised against for reporting abuse later investigated by the Department of Defense Inspector General (DODIG). The DODIG endorsed the findings of my investigation; disciplined not only the officer who abused the chaplain but also the Commanding Officer and Admin Officer who covered up the abuse; and compensated the abused chaplain \$3,000 a month for the rest of her life.

While the character of a witness is often considered when undertaking an investigation, if the testimony provided is corroborated by external evidence, by other witnesses, and by separate allegations against an accused party, as it is in this case, it ordinarily is not dismissed simply because an eyewitness in question may have had a checkered past. Consider, for example, how you, as an official of the Archdiocese of Chicago, failed to investigate credible allegations made by several male prostitutes who reported being paid for sexual favors by the late Bishop Daniel Ryan who had a history of homosexual misconduct.

After rejecting the integrity of the 2006 Special Panel Report overseen by Lucas for numerous reasons, the highly-credentialed former FBI Special Agent in Charge who reviewed evidence supporting allegations that Harman and Lucas engaged in graphic sexual acts in the presence of seminarians remains firm that you and your predecessor left these allegations "without an authentic, independent, and impartial investigation..." Truly, a jury would have a hard time believing that the 2006 Report was "authentic, independent, and impartial."

On the topic of a "videotape" brought up by Mr. Bock, are you prepared to testify under oath that you have no knowledge of 2018 video footage of a clerical drag party at which current members of your leadership team, including Fathers Christopher House, Jeffrey Goeckner, and Joseph Molloy, among others, were alleged to be participants?

Based on the information contained in my attached preliminary investigation of the Diocese of Springfield in Illinois, it appears to me that you not only covered for Bishop Ryan, but you also are now covering for Archbishop Lucas and Father Peter Harman. Consequently, I feel compelled, in keeping with "Vos Estis Lux Mundi," to send a copy of this letter to Cardinal Blase Cupich and Archbishop Christophe Pierre, even though both of them, like you, Cardinal Timothy Dolan and Cardinal Wilton Gregory, have failed to act on the allegations of homosexual misconduct and cover-up involving one of your own priests

at the Pontifical North American College (NAC) which you and the other prelates received dated April 22, May 8, June 18, June 27, July 3, and July 16 of 2020.

Only after the Plaintiff's lawsuit was filed, your general counsel sent February 2021 communications to the Plaintiff's attorney demanding to preview documentation, an apparent attempt to preempt discovery and to jeopardize the protection of witnesses who had already been abused by the Springfield Diocese for reporting clerical misconduct. In reading Bock's communications, one could get the impression that you never shared with him the multiple reports containing incriminating evidence that you, Cardinal Gregory, and the NAC Board of Governors already received and ignored between April and July of 2020. The fact that Bock never addressed the point raised by the Plaintiff's attorney in emails of February 14, 2021 that you had already been in receipt of these and other incriminating reports for nearly two years, could lead a jury to believe that you, Bock, or your Panel never had any intention of conducting an "impartial" investigation of the matter.

It is my opinion that the same charges of mishandling clerical abuse and misconduct which warranted disciplinary action against former Crookston Bishop Michael Hoeppner also apply to you and Cardinal Gregory as the Ordinaries of Fathers Harman and Park; the fifteen prelates who serve on the NAC Board of Governors; as well the Apostolic Nuncio, Archbishop Pierre; all of whom failed to act on the credible evidence addressed in the multiple reports you received and also contained in the lawsuit.

I wish to offer you the opportunity to refute or correct any of the information contained in the draft of my attached investigation, "<u>Clerical Abuse and Misconduct: Diocese of Springfield in Illinois</u>." You will find that it supports many of the allegations addressed in recently submitted affidavits, including that you failed to act upon sexual misconduct allegations which has caused many to question the credibility of your Diocese's purported "investigatory" procedures.

In the interest of transparency, just as each of my prior communications which you ignored have been published, all interested parties may access this letter in the public record at www.gomulka.net/Paprocki.pdf

Looking forward to your response, I remain

Sincerely in Christ,

fromulko

Gene Thomas Gomulka

CC: Cardinal Blase Cupich Cardinal Wilton Gregory Archbishop Christoph Pierre James A. Bock, Jr. From: Gene Thomas GomulkaTo: US Ordinaries and various Vatican officials

### Subj: GORGIA LAWSUIT UPDATE

1. Since April of 2020 each of you has been receiving reports of allegations of homosexual predation and misconduct by officials at the Pontifical North American College (NAC) in Rome.

2. Unlike many US and Vatican bishops who denied knowledge of the abuse of minors, seminarians and priests by ex-Cardinal Theodore McCarrick, you cannot say that you were not made aware of allegations of misconduct and cover-ups by named Church officials implicated in the Gorgia lawsuit. All the reports received and ignored by <u>US Ordinaries and Vatican officials</u> have been retained as evidence.

3. Bishops of accused priests, NAC rector, Father Peter Harman, and NAC vice rector, Father Adam Park, along with the fifteen bishops who serve on the NAC Board of Governors, are particularly implicated in the cover-up of homosexual predation and misconduct which, as the shocking <u>Persecuted Seminarian Summit</u> revealed, is not limited to the NAC.

4. Bishops with seminarians living at the NAC between 2020 and the present are also accountable for not disclosing to NAC seminarians and their families the grave allegations that were found to be credible by a former Special Agent in Charge of the Federal Bureau of Investigation.

5. The following letter addressed to Springfield in Illinois Bishop Thomas Paprocki exposes deceptive attempts on the part of accused church officials to conceal credible allegations of misconduct by using their own defense attorneys to fabricate bogus reports while failing to provide victims with impartial investigations.

6. Insofar as Bishop Paprocki did not refute any of the facts and allegations contained in a report he received on July 9, 2021, entitled, "<u>Clerical Abuse and Misconduct: Diocese of Springfield in Illinois</u>," his silence, in keeping with the maxim of the law, "*Qui tacet consentire*," can be interpreted as rendering consent to what was written about him, Archbishop George Lucas, Bishop Daniel Ryan, Cardinal Joseph Bernardin, and other prelates and priests accused of engaging in or covering up homosexual predation or misconduct.

7. In keeping with my consistent practice of maintaining transparency in this matter, a copy of this communication will be available online at <u>www.gomulka.net/Paprocki2.pdf</u>.

D from ulko

Gene Thomas Gomulka is a victims abuse advocate, investigative reporter, and retired Navy captain/chaplain. A Catholic priest (monsignor) ordained for the Pennsylvania Altoona-Johnstown Diocese, Gomulka was a victim of reprisals for confronting Church leaders who underreported and covered up abuse.

Dear Bishop Paprocki,

I received a July 22, 2021 response from your chancellor and general counsel, James Bock, Jr., in response to my <u>email to you of July 9, 2021</u>. As you recall, I wrote you after you and Mr. Bock requested that Michael Voris at Church Militant "issue a correction for two recent articles." Misrepresenting critical facts, Bock attempted unsuccessfully to undermine evidence-based findings of a highly-credentialed former FBI Special Agent in Charge (SAC) that "Harman's current and former Ordinaries have, to the present, left these allegations without an authentic, independent, and impartial investigation." Based on Bock's email to Voris on July 3, 2021, and his failure to address *any* of the points raised in my July 9, 2021 communication, it is evident that what your legal advisor omits is far more revealing than what he states.

For instance, after I apprised you of my extensive experience investigating bogus whitewashed investigations from subordinate Marine Corps Commands, and after I compared the purported "investigation" of the Springfield Diocese 2006 "Special Panel" headed by defense attorney Bill Roberts to tasking Bill Clinton's own defense lawyer with reporting on claims that Clinton was having sex with a White House intern, I am surprised that Bock would even suggest that the Plaintiff's counsel interfere with ongoing legal action by submitting all the incriminating evidence and witnesses to the very same Mr. Roberts and the Diocese's "Special Panel" which, as you already know, have serious conflicts of interest in the matter.

As you are aware, the Apostolic Nuncio failed to act upon a letter dated January 6, 2005 reporting to him allegations of "homosexual activities" involving Bishop George Lucas and various diocesan priests. Instead of the Vatican investigating the allegations it received, it was Lucas himself who organized a "Special Panel on Clergy Misconduct" in which he tasked defense attorney Roberts with directing an "investigation into allegations of misconduct by priests of the diocese." Note that the Panel's report did not read "allegations of misconduct by Bishop Lucas and priests of the diocese." The Lucas-appointed attorney shielded Lucas' name and the name of his reported homosexual lover, Father Peter Harman, from inclusion in this sentence because the real motive of the so-called "investigation" was specifically to clear Lucas and those surrounding him of accusations that he, along with priests from his diocese, engaged in "homosexual activities." Lucas' strategy resembles how the Vatican dealt with reports from mother superiors that African bishops wanted them to make their sisters available to priests for sex in an effort to reduce the clerical death rate from AIDS. Instead of investigating the claims it received, the Vatican forwarded the complaints to the offending bishops who retaliated by having the mother superiors removed for making these reports. When one nun was impregnated by a priest, he forced her to have an abortion which resulted in her death. It was the priest who got her pregnant who then conducted her funeral Mass.

Bock's July 22, 2021 communication is disingenuous at best when he advises that "any information or evidence that one of our clergy members is engaged in misconduct or that any person employed by or associated with the Diocese is at risk of harm" be referred "to Mr. William Roberts, to me ... and/or to any other appropriate civil or canonical authority as necessary." Bock never acknowledged that his request for "information" had already been fulfilled when you, as Harman's Ordinary, received and ignored multiple incriminating reports

for more than two years. It will surely be seen as a red-flag that you failed to act upon no less than seven such reports which requested an investigation into Harman, your priest, and informed

you that he had engaged in illicit conduct and concealed predation toward vulnerable seminarians. You will remember among the numerous reports you ignored was my own request that you investigate "whether or not Fathers Park and Harman are homosexuals who are discriminating against heterosexually oriented candidates for the priesthood" and whether Harman, along with those he used his position to recruit, are guilty of "abusing their power and reprising against heterosexually oriented vulnerable seminarians." While it has been in your power as Harman's Ordinary to recall and ultimately discipline him after being informed that his actions pose potential risks to the welfare of seminarians, you refused to cooperate with Cardinal Seán O'Malley and other U.S. Bishops who, while not being Harman's Ordinary, found the allegations against your priest worthy of an investigation through the Apostolic Nunciature. Interestingly, after two years of silence on your part, it was only after the February 2021 filing of the legal Complaint of Anthony J. Gorgia v. Timothy Dolan et al. that you had your general counsel attempt to preempt the damaging legal process of discovery against your own priest by demanding that we turn over to the Diocese all the evidence and jeopardize witnesses who already received abusive treatment by Springfield officials.

At this point, with multiple witnesses now prepared to testify in Court, you and your legal advisor wish us to believe that the same Springfield-employed defense attorney with manifested conflicts of interest, Bill Roberts, would honestly determine if you should be found liable for "<u>omission" by failing to act upon and investigate allegations of sexual misconduct when you had the duty to do so</u>. Since both you and Bock have experience as lawyers, you should know that leading vulnerable victims of misconduct into a forum of blatant conflicts of interest is reckless and unethical. Just as long-time Vatican defense attorney Jeffrey Lena would not break ranks from his Vatican employer and charge Pope Francis with failing to discipline ex-Cardinal Theodore McCarrick, I hardly believe Roberts, your underling, would be inclined to act impartially by rendering a "guilty" verdict against you for neglecting the welfare of seminarians and failing to act upon reports of homosexual misconduct, nor would he seek to charge himself and the "Special Panel" he directed with covering up the grave allegations against Lucas, Harman, and other Springfield priests.

Mr. Bock's present request that we usurp discovery by allowing Roberts to preview evidence showing how you covered up credible allegations of sexual misconduct on the part of Lucas, Harman, and other priests brings to mind a saying of my late State College pastor, Msgr. Patrick Fleming: "Fool me once, shame on you. Fool me twice, shame on me." Let it be known that, had you dutifully acted upon the allegations against your priest when you first learned of them, seminarians such as Gorgia would not have had to prepare themselves to bring damning testimony before the Court as the only means of addressing allegations you chose to ignore. You should also know that the witnesses are prepared to show that subsequent acts of alleged misconduct could have been prevented had you investigated reports concerning Fathers Harman and Park when you first received them.

This week's revelations regarding Msgr. Jeffrey <u>Burrill</u>, who held numerous positions at the <u>NAC from 2009-2013</u> forming seminarians; along with <u>recently-recorded testimony from</u> <u>seminarians</u> across the country, further support the claim that seminaries have become infested with predatory faculty members and superiors who abet such crimes. My own NAC classmate returned to serve as the NAC Academic Advisor, only to be recalled by his

Ordinary because he was exposed for having engaged in the same behavior alleged against Fathers Peter Harman and Adam Park and the prelates who ordained them, Bishop Daniel Ryan and ex-Cardinal McCarrick.

Just like my late friend and San Diego neighbor Richard Sipe held Church leaders accountable for the reports they received by publicly posting a copy of his <u>April 21, 2008 letter to Pope</u> <u>Benedict XVI</u> and his July 28, 2016 letter to Bishop Robert McElroy concerning McCarrick and other prelates who engaged in or covered up clerical sex abuse, so too will I make this letter publicly available at: <u>www.gomulka.net/Paprocki2.pdf</u>.

Fraternally in Christ,

Demulka

Gene Thomas Gomulka

CC: US Ordinaries Cardinal Luis Francisco Ladaria Ferrer, <u>SJ</u> Cardinal Beniamino Stella Archbishop Christophe Pierre Mr. James Bock, Jr.

# **APPENDIX G**

FOUR REPORTS OF SEXUAL MISCONDUCT AND COVER-UP RECEIVED BY KNIGHTS OF COLUMBUS LEADERSHIP AND COUNCILS THROUGHOUT THE UNITED STATES 356 H Avenue Coronado, CA 92118 20 July 2020

Henry Stolzenthaler Council No. 1675 Knights of Columbus 100 Kriescher Street Staten Island, NY 10309

Dear Governance of Stolzenthaler Council,

Over the past months I have sent you a number of communications related to my investigation of Cardinal Timothy Dolan, Father Peter Harman, and North American College (NAC) administration that appeared to have unjustly reprised against your fellow Knight of Columbus, Anthony Gorgia. As you know, it is shown that the reasons he was provided for not being allowed to return to NAC following a surgical procedure in New York were bogus, and that the real reasons involved that Gorgia witnessed and received reports of allegations of misconduct on the part of the NAC vice-rector, Father Adam Park.

The reason I have been communicating with you in Staten Island instead of the National Headquarters in Connecticut is because you know Anthony Gorgia. He grew up among many of the Knights of your Council. Your Knights and Columbiettes were among the most fervent supporters of Anthony's priestly vocation. You even displayed his photograph with Pope Francis in your Council building. When Anthony's mom recently encountered a local Knight, he said to her, "Maria, we can't go against the Church." The fact is, however, Cardinal Dolan is not the Church. The Church is "the People of God" which includes both the laity and the clergy. Recall the words of Bishop Fulton Sheen in his address to the Supreme Convention of the Knights of Columbus in June of 1972: "Who is going to save our Church? Not our bishops, not our priests and religious. It is up to you, the people. You have the minds, the eyes, and the ears to save the Church. Your mission is to see that your priests act like priests, your bishops act like bishops, and your religious act like religious."

Cardinal Sean O'Malley, the president of the Pontifical Commission for the Protection of Minors, <u>denounced Cardinal Timothy Dolan to the U.S. Papal Nuncio</u>, Archbishop Christophe Pierre, for covering up the crimes of a predator priest, Father Donald Timone. O'Malley felt obliged to report Dolan after *The New York Times* reported how Dolan allowed Timone to remain in ministry even after he compensated two of Timone's abuse victims. Victims' advocates like Anne Barrett Doyle branded Dolan "reprehensible" for allowing Timone to work for years with children while aware of his tainted background. She noted that she would like to ask Dolan, "<u>How many other accused priests</u> are you covering up?"

On June 10, 2020, after having received the same communications I sent you, Cardinal Sean O'Malley wrote me saying, "I note that you present the matters with significance to the life of the Church and....I will send a copy of your letter to the Most Rev. Christophe Pierre, Apostolic Nuncio." Do you really think Cardinal O'Malley would ask the Apostolic Nuncio to look into Anthony Gorgia's claims if he didn't believe they may be credible? Would Bishop Edgar da Cunha, from the Diocese of Fall River (MA), also have written, "Out of concern for other seminarians now at the NAC, and in the interest of justice, I have passed your correspondence along to the Apostolic Nunciature"?

As you can see, providing assistance in this matter is in no way "going against the Church," since clerics to be held accountable are those who have morally separated themselves from the Church by crimes such as reprisals, misconduct, or cover-ups. As evidenced by the responses of Cardinal O'Malley and Bishop da Cunha, and in response to the admonition of Bishop Fulton Sheen, the

greatest service one can render to the Church is to ensure that it be free of clerics who pose a threat to its members and the core values that we as Catholics uphold.

I am writing to ask that you either correspond with the Supreme Knight recommending that he write to the Apostolic Nuncio and request that Anthony's case be investigated in keeping the "Holy Father's Motu Proprio, *Vos Estis Lux Mundi*, or that you explain in writing why you believe the actions of Father Peter Harman, Father Adam Park, and Cardinal Timothy Dolan should remain uninvestigated by the Church.

As you consider your next steps, I pray the Knights will not make the same mistake <u>Covington Bishop Roger Foys and Lexington Bishop John Stowe made when they failed to support</u> <u>Nick Sandmann</u>, a Covington Catholic High School student who had been unjustly portrayed by the media as having been disrespectful toward Nathan Phillips, an elderly Native American in Washington, DC. After suing CNN for defamation to the tune of \$275 million, Foys and Stowe will forever be remembered for "throwing Sandmann under the bus," the same phrase used by the reporter who broke the story on Anthony Gorgia: "<u>Cdl. Timothy Dolan Threw Model Seminarian Under the Bus</u>."

You might also refer to what some call a "parallel case" to the one at hand. Just as additional accusations emerged against ex-Cardinal Theodore McCarrick who abused young priests, seminarians, and minors, so too are additional persons coming forward with allegations against Father Park who was ordained by McCarrick in 2005. Recall how authorities and the media exposed not only McCarrick, but <u>the network of persons and institutions that failed to act and contributed to the cover-up</u>.

A failure to respond in a timely matter to this request will be interpreted as your consent to the injustices that your brother Knight has been forced to endure these past 18 months. Know that your response – or lack thereof - will be part of the public record and will reflect upon the integrity and moral courage not only of your chapter, but of Knights of Columbus everywhere.

In order to preserve transparency in my investigation, you, your brother Knights, and all interested parties may access this correspondence at www.gomulka.net/KnightsofColumbus.pdf.

Praying that you would have the moral courage to act like real Knights, I remain,

Your brother Knight,

Gonelko

Gene Thomas Gomulka

CC: Carl A. Anderson, Supreme Knight Elizabeth Dias, *The New York Times* Brian Laline, *Staten Island Advance* 

Gene Thomas Gomulka is a retired Navy captain/chaplain who served on active duty at Marine Corps and Navy commands for over 24 years. A Catholic priest (monsignor) ordained for the Pennsylvania Altoona-Johnstown diocese, Gomulka and Dominican, Fr. Thomas Doyle, had their ecclesiastical endorsements revoked as a result of their support for sexual abuse victims and their confrontations of Church leaders who underreported and covered up abuse.

Dear Brother Knights,

I am writing to request that your Council give serious consideration to demand the resignation of your Knights of Columbus (KofC) Headquarters leadership, including your chaplain, Archbishop William Lori, whom I believe have been complicit in covering-up allegations of clerical misconduct at the North American College (NAC) in Rome.

Over the past months <u>I have communicated with both the Henry J. Stolzenthaler Council #1675</u> in Staten Island, New York, and the KofC Headquarters in New Haven, Connecticut, regarding my investigation of Cardinal Timothy Dolan; the NAC rector, Father Peter Harman; the vicerector, Father Adam Park; and former formation advisor, Father John McDonald. My reports detailed how these individuals appeared to have been involved in a reprisal against your fellow third-degree Knight of Columbus, Anthony Gorgia, after Gorgia witnessed and received reports of allegations of misconduct on the part of the NAC vice-rector, Father Adam Park.

The allegations involving Cardinal Dolan and the NAC leadership were forwarded by Cardinal Sean O'Malley, president of the Pontifical Commission for the Protection of Minors, and Bishop Edgar da Cunha of the Diocese of Fall River, to the Apostolic Nuncio, Archbishop Christophe Pierre. When the Vatican failed to open an investigation, Gorgia felt compelled to take legal action like Nick Sandmann who did not cave in to CNN and other media giants who unjustly defamed his character. Covington Bishop Roger Foys and Lexington Bishop John Stowe will forever be remembered for "throwing Sandmann under the bus," the same phrase used by the reporter who broke the story on Anthony Gorgia: "Cdl. Timothy Dolan Threw Model Seminarian Under the Bus."

Insofar as the Knights of Columbus have publicly come out in support of vocations to the priesthood, you should know how both local and senior leadership have placed all Knights in a position jeopardizing your credibility on this front. This discrepancy appears all the stronger when <u>Gorgia's pastor, Father Thomas Devery</u>, was believed to be part of the cover-up of the accusations against Cardinal Dolan and the NAC. Devery also recently has been <u>accused in a lawsuit of sexually abusing a minor</u> while being retained in ministry by Dolan as pastor of one of the largest parish elementary schools in Staten Island.

Lest members of the US hierarchy or the Knights of Columbus say they did not receive this communication and were unaware of this problem, it will be posted online for all to read at <u>www.gomulka.net/KofC.pdf</u>. In the spirit of transparency, the names of the more than 800 Councils to whom this is addressed are found at the bottom of this correspondence.

I pray the words Bishop Fulton Sheen addressed to the Supreme Convention of the Knights of Columbus in June of 1972 might inspire the call to Catholic knighthood: "Who is going to save our Church? Not our bishops, not our priests and religious. It is up to you, the people. You have the minds, the eyes, and the ears to save the Church. Your mission is to see that your priests act like priests, your bishops act like bishops, and your religious act like religious."

Fraternally in Christ,

Somelka

Gene Thomas Gomulka

Gene Thomas Gomulka is a retired Navy captain/chaplain who served on active duty at Marine Corps and Navy commands for over 24 years. Ordained for the Pennsylvania Altoona-Johnstown diocese, Father (Monsignor) Gomulka and Dominican Father Thomas Doyle were reprised against by prelates whom they confronted for underreporting and covering up abuse.

#### CC: US Ordinaries

Archbishop Christophe Pierre Knights of Columbus Headquarters Henry J. Stolzenthaler Council #1675 Christine Niles, *Church Militant* Elizabeth Dias, *The New York Times* Susan Edelman, *New York Post* Frank Donnelly, *Staten Island Advance* 

Albany Council #1577 (OR); Alhambra Council #2431 (CA); All Saints Council #10501 (MI); All Saints Council #14234 (KY); All Saints Council #14475 (SC); All Saints Council #15706 (TN); All Saints Council #16424 (KY); All Saints Council #4240 (WI); All Saints Council #8840 (FL); All Saints Council #9709 (NC); Allegan Council #2515 (MI); Americus Council #7113 (GA); Andrew's Apostles Council #17234 (KY); Angels Gate Council #1740 (CA); Annunciation Council #12761/St. Patrick Assembly #2883 (FL); Annunciation/Guadalupe Council #1755 (KY); Antioch Council #3265 (CA); Aquinas Council #757 (NY); Archangel Council #11732 (CO); Archbishop Charles A. Salatka Council #13366 (OK); Archbishop Fulton Sheen Council #7502 (CO); Archbishop Fulton Sheen Council #7547 (NC); Archbishop John Hughes Council #481 (NY); Archbishop Seghers Council #5011 (AK); Archbishop Thomas A. Donnellan Council #7923 (GA); Archbishop Thomas J. Murphy Council #12251 (WA); Archdiocese of Boston Chapter; Arden Council #4970 (CA); Ascension & St. Augustine Council #11618 (MD); Ashland Council #1487 (KY); Assumption Council #5252 (NY); Assumption Council #5819 (NJ); Assumption-Msgr. James J. Dorney Council #1694 (NY); Auburn Council #207 (NY); Ave Maria Council #15931 (KY); Ave Maria Council #7880 (CO); Bardstown Council #1290 (KY); Batesville Council #1461 (IN); Beaver Valley Council #604 (PA); Bernard P. O'Brien Council #3956 (MI)l Bernardo Council #1350 (CT); Big Thompson Council #3434 (CO); Bisbee Council #0863 (AZ); Bishop Ackerman Council #5453 (KY); Bishop Becker Council #2856 (DE); Bishop Busch Council #4863 (MN); Bishop Carroll Council #702 (KY); Bishop Charles B. McLaughlin Council #7282 (FL); Bishop Claude Dubuis #7445 (TX); Bishop Cunningham Council #10904 (NY); Bishop Dennis J. O'Connell Council #12366 (SC); Bishop Dwenger Council #1881 (IN); Bishop Edward C. O'Leary Council #13181 (ME); Bishop Evans Council #10122 (CO); Bishop Flaget Council #13053 (KY); Bishop Francis J. Green Council #11855 (AZ); Bishop Hafey Council #4507 (NC); Bishop Henry P. Northrop Council #2207 (SC); Bishop Hunt Council #5214 (UT); Bishop John England Council #724 (SC); Bishop John R. McGann Council #564 (NY); Bishop Maes Holy Cross Council #17445 (KY); Bishop Matthew F. Brady Council #5093 (NH); Bishop Maurice F. Burke Council #4031 (WY); Bishop McQuaid Council #7085 (NY); Bishop Mulloy Council #1301 (KY); Bishop Patrick J. Byrne Council #3877 (Washington, DC); Bishop Peterson Council #4442 (NH); Bishop Primeau Council #10896 (NH); Bishop Richard Pius Miles Council #4972 (TN); Bishop Robert F. Joyce Council #10535 (NY); Bishop Robert Tracy Council #10080 (LA); Bishop Soenneker Council #10725 (KY); Bishop Spalding Council #2761 (KY); Bishop Thomas J. Conaty Council #5385 (CA); Bishop W. Thomas Larkin Council #4727 (FL); Bishop William Connare Council #15373 (PA); Bishop Zaleski Council #6687 (MI); Blessed Louis Brisson Council #17125 (NC); Blessed Mother Council #14814 (NY); Blessed Sacrament Council #11416 (NY); Blessed Sacrament Council #11416 (NY); Blessed Sacrament Council #5322 (CA); Blessed Teresa of Calcutta Council #12006 (NY); Blessed Trinity Council #12274 (SC); Blessed Trinity Council #15181 (KY); Bluegrass Council #762 (KY); Br. Christopher Council #4270 (KY); Braintree Council #1462 (MA); Breese Council #2869 (IL); Brunswick Council #4847 (OH); Bunker Hill Council #62 (MA); Burlington Council #589 (NJ); Cardinal Bernardin Council #12263 (SC); Cardinal Edward Egan Council #16334 (NY); Cardinal Hayes Council #3995 (NY); Cardinal Spellman Council #5800 (NY); Cardinal Stritch Council #3674 (IL); Carlyle Council #1382 (IL); Carmel Mission Council #4593 (CA); Charles Andrew Smith Council #7531 (SC); Cheboygan Council #791 (MI); Chisholm Trail Council #9368 (TX); Christ Cathedral Council #12694 (CA); Christ the King Council #10066 (SC); Christ the King Council #12256 (TN); Christ the King Council #13159 (IA); Christ the King Council #13360 (MI); Christ the King Council #13388 (MA); Christ the King Council #14130 (KY); Christ the King Council #16232 (KY); Christopher Columbus Council #1414 (IN); Church of the Holy Spirit Council #16411 (NY); Church of the Holy Spirit Council #16411 (NY); Coeur de Leon Council #87 (MA); Columbia Council #12554 (SC); Columbia Council #411 (MA); Columbus Council #126 (NY); Concord Council #112 (NH); Coral Gables Council #3274 (FL); Coral Springs Council #8838 (FL); Coronation Council #1863 (NJ); Cortland Council #233 (NY); Council of Jesus #13606 (WA); Council of the Rock #15065 (CA); Cranston, RI Council #1738 (RI); Crescenta Valley Council #3254 (CA); Cypress Council #8599 (CA); Dan M. Kennedy Council #706 (MI); Daniel P. Sullivan Council #10208 (AR); De Goesbriand Council #209 (VT); Dedham Council #234 (MA); Delphos Council #1362 (OH); Dennison Council #576 (OH); Denver Council #539 (CO); DeSoto Council #327 (NY); Divine Mercy Council #11591 (KY); Divine Mercy Council #568 (IA); Divine Mercy-St. Anne Council #16022 (WI); Divine Savior Council #12268 (SC); Donald J. Godfrey Council #6726 (SC); Dr. Gilbert Ortiz Council #13525 (FL); Dracut Council #4225 (MA); East Hanover Council #6504 (NJ) Edward Douglass White Council #2473 (VA); Elder Council #69 (MA); Epiphany of Our Lord Council #14495 (FL); Evansville Council #1952 (IL); Everett Council #763 (WA); Exeter Council #2179 (NH); Fairmont Council #1575 (MN); Fitzgerald Council #459 (VA); Fleming Island Council #11220 (FL); Forest City Council #3 (CT); Fort Collins Council #1214 (CO); Fort Lauderdale Council #3080 (FL); Fr. Bealer Council #3908 (KY); Fr. Ben Powers Council #1315 (KY); Fr. Bonaventure Brown Council #9672 (SC); Fr. Brian Martin Council #8502 (SC); Fr. Capodanno Council #6522 (NJ); Fr. Charles A. Bartek Council #9431 (WY); Fr. Charles Spellman Council #6125 (FL); Fr. Connor Council #6101 (KY); Fr. Cyril Karlowicz Council #9002 (VA); Fr. Daley Council #642 (VT); Fr. Daniel J. Kennedy Council #1611 (MA); Fr. DeJaco Council #5220 (KY); Fr. Dunn Council #6368 (KY); Fr. Durbin Council #1004 (KY); Fr. Edward F. O'Sullivan Council #2579 (NY); Fr. Edward J. Kissane Council #12035 (NY); Fr. Emil Kapaun Council #12965 (KY); Fr. Emil Kapaun Council #3744 (CA); Fr. Fitzmaurice Council #607 (WI); Fr. Francis A. Friend Council #8295 (SC); Fr. Francis Coppens Council #4336 (MA); Fr. Francis L. Sampson Council #15914 (KY); Fr. Francis Maguire Council #3851 (CA); Fr. Francisco Garces Council #5693 (NV); Fr. George Fangauer Council #5168 (OK); Fr. George Feeney Council #5471 (AZ); Fr. Gerald Glahn Council #11132 (KY); Fr. Gettlefinger Council #10987 (KY); Fr. James Clement Council #6389 (LA); Fr. James E. Waters Council #12017 (NC); Fr. James F. Power Council #9917 (WY); Fr. James J. McCafferty Council #11013 (NY); Fr. James M. Early Hornell Council #243 (NY); Fr. James T. Breen Council #7490 (NY); Fr. James T. Breen Council #7490 (NY); Fr. Jeremiah J. Reilly Council #6561 (NY); Fr. Jerome Stern Council #16956 (KY); Fr. Jerzy Popieluszko Council #9599 (CA); Fr. John A. Walsh Council #11642 (WA); Fr. John B. Adaire Council #7129 (SC); Fr. John C. Drumgoole Council #5917 (NY); Fr. John C. Hecht Council #13103 (IL); Fr. John C.

Murphy Council #7987 (CA); Fr. John Deere Council #4914 (MN); Fr. John E. Doyle Council #9715 (PA); Fr. John Farrell Council #5962 (NY); Fr. John Garvey H.M. Council #16206 (KY); Fr. John H. Endejan Council #16171 (WI); Fr. John J. McCarthy Council #12472 (SC); Fr. John J. Murray Council #14666 (NY); Fr. John Lafarge Council #4012 (NY); Fr. John M. Grady Council #503 (NY); Fr. John M. Lynch Council #4188 (MI); Fr. John Menco Council #6707 (IL); Fr. John Rossiter Council #9385 (WI); Fr. Joseph A. Cassidy Council #6100 (NJ); Fr. Joseph Geary Council #3523 (CA); Fr. Joseph J. Murphy Council #7062 (SC); Fr. Joseph O'Connell Council #3481 (NY); Fr. Joseph Saffer Council #6897 (KY); Fr. Kass Council #3526 (CA); Fr. Keeney Council #8530 (PA); Fr. Leo John Dehon Council #14051 (MS); Fr. Leo Letterhouse Council #6614 (PA); Fr. Louis F. Knight Council #12451 (CA); Fr. Louis R. Williamson Council #8123 (SC); Fr. Marcel Salinas Council #11536 (AZ); Fr. Mathias Zerfas Council #664 (WI); Fr. Maurice R. Daly Council #6076 (SC); Fr. McCarthy Council #4983 (NH); Fr. McCormick Council #3880 (IL); Fr. McGivney Century Council #8027 (NH); Fr. McGivney Council #12502 (KY); Fr. McRedmond Council #3175 (TN); Fr. McSwiney Council #2525 (MA); Fr. Michael J. Finnegan Council #14456 (FL); Fr. Patrick Creed Council #12923 (KY); Fr. Patrick Power Council #4588 (CA); Fr. Paul J. Cuddy Assembly #2428 (NY); Fr. Peter Boerding Council #6357 (LA); Fr. Raho Council #04194 (IL); Fr. Richard Joyce Council #2270 (NY); Fr. Robert H. Hurley Council #5188 (MA); Fr. Roland Gross Council #11817 (NC); Fr. Ronald P. Anderson Council #8900 (SC); Fr. Roy E. Dentinger Council #390 (KY); Fr. Russell Council #11409 (NJ); Fr. Scott Buchanan Council #15223 (SC); Fr. Severin Westhoff Council #6627 (AZ); Fr. T.J. McGee Council #2612 (MA); Fr. Thomas Carroll Council #4566 (NY); Fr. Thomas F. Blake Council #2560 (NJ); Fr. Thomas Judge Council #6893 (NY); Fr. Thomas Malloy Council #6317 (KY); Fr. Thomas Price Council #2456 (NC); Fr. Vilarrasa Council #7268 (CA); Fr. Vincent R. Capodanno Council #13024 (AZ); Fr. Vincent R. Capodanno Council #16674 (NY); Fr. William Daly Council #2122 (NY); Frank A. Cutri Jr. Council #1445 (NY); Frankfort Council #1483 (KY); Freehold Council #1672 (NJ); Gate of Heaven Council #468 (NY); Geneva Council #272 (NY); George C. Shields Council #420 (MA); George J. McCarthy Council #2975 (MI); George L. Gagnon Council #8182 (SC); George P. Vainer Council #5957 9 (Ontario, Canada); George R. Kutterer Council #6165 (IL); Gilmour Council #310 (OH); Gloversville Council #265 (NY); Goldsmith Council #974 (WI); Good Samaritan Council #6175 (VA); Good Shepherd Council #16156 (MA); Good Shepherd Council #8669 (MI); Guardian Angels Council #15857 (CO); Guiding Star Council #212 (NY); Hamburg Council #2220 (NY); Hamilton Township Council #6213 (NJ); Hardinsburg Council #2499 (KY); Harry J. Tucker Council #11780 (WA); Hempstead Council #12672 (TX); Henderson Council #1320 (KY); Henry J. Stolzenthaler Council #1675 (NY); Hillsboro Council #1634 (OR); Holy Cross Council #10355 (GA); Holy Cross Council #12235 (FL); Holy Cross Council #16838 (NY); Holy Family Council #10019 (ME); Holy Family Council #11510 (MA); Holy Spirit Council #11548 (ID); Holy Family Council #4879 (WI); Holy Family Council #7215 (NY); Holy Innocents Council #11906 (WA); Holy Innocents Council #12562 (KY); Holy Innocents Council #3581 (NY)I Holy Name Council #14018 (MI); Holy Name Council #86 (MA); Holy Rosary Council #1055 (KY); Holy Rosary Council #4972 (TN); Holy Spirit Council #15196 (TN); Holy Spirit Council #9667 (CA); Holy Trinity Council #6891 (SC); Holy Trinity Council #7601 (GA); Howard Heath Council #7587 (MI); Immaculate Conception Annadale Council #6245 (NJ); Immaculate Conception Council #11991 (SC); Immaculate Conception Council #13904 (NH); Immaculate Conception Council #9021 (NJ); Immaculate Heart Council #5899 (OH); Immaculate Heart of Mary Council #12845 (NV); Indian River Council# 7471 (NY); Islands Council #10579 (GA); Ithaca Council #277 (NY); Jacksonville Council #11604 (AR); J.H. Newman Council #15452 (KY); J.V. Kavanaugh Council #5293 (NY); Jamaica Council #337 (NY); James L. Martin Council #637 (OH); Jean-Louis Cheverus Council #11390 (MA); Joan of Arc Council #1992 (NY); Joe Einecker Council #14902 (TN); John E. O'Brien Council #3361 (WA); John F. Kennedy Council #2952 (LA); John Paul II Council #13935 (PA); John Paul the Great Council #486 (NY); Joseph Lamb Council #5723 (NY); Joseph Miguel Ros, Jr. Council #3067 (SC); Joseph P. Solari Council #11172 (VA); Joseph Scott Council #7142 (CA); Joyce Kilmer Assembly #698 (NY); Juniper Valley Council #14578 (NY); Kankakee Council #745 (IL); Knights of Our Lady Council #11191 (KY); Knottsville Council #16125 (KY); Kona Council #13227 (HI); Latham-Colonie Council #3394 (NY); Lawrence Council #67 (MA); Lebanon Council #2656 (NH); Lime Rock Council #136 (ME); Longview-Cowlitz Council #2763 (WA); Loretto Council #536 (NY); Los Crucados Council #1990 (CA); Louisville St. Edward the Confessor Council #15841 (KY); Loves Park Council #4330 (IL); Manresa Council #2147 (NY); Mantua Council #3766 (OH); Maria Immacolata Council #3390 (NC); Marian Council #3779 (LA); Marian Council #3864 (OH); Marian Council #5748 (NH); Marquette Council #1437 (LA); Marquette Council #3631 (IN); Mary Queen of Heaven Council #14993 (KY); Mary Queen of Peace Council #9575 (SC); Mary Queen of Peace Council #9833 (WA); Mary Queen of the Holy Rosary Council #14372 (KY); Mason Council #9182 (MI); Massillon Council #554 (OH); Mater Dei Council #437 (IN); Mater Misericordiae Council #15576 (AZ); Maysville Council #1377 (KY); McGivney Council #29 (CT); McSweeney Council #400 (MA); Memorare Council #3476 (NY); Michael Flohr Council #766 (WA); Michael O'Connor Council #5026 (SC); Milford Council #3035 (NH); Monroe Council #1266 (MI); Monroe Council #2079 (NY); Monticello Council #550 (NY); Most Holy Rosary Council #11621 (NY); Mother Cabrini Assembly #1572 (NY); Mother of Good Counsel Council #1078 (MA); Mother of Perpetual Help Council #5629 (FL); Mother Seton Council #5427 (NJ); Mother Seton Council #6724 (FL); Mother Teresa of Calcutta Council #12181 (UT); Mount Mercy Council #14604 (KY); Msgr. Achtergael Council #12889 (WA); Msgr. Andrew K. Gwynn Council #1668 (SC); Msgr. Anton J. Frank Council #8771 (TX); Msgr. Baum Council #13112 (SC); Msgr. Bishop Council #2112 (FL); Msgr. Braun Council #17247 (KY); Msgr. Charles A. Kelly Jr. Council #14129 (VA); Msgr. Charles D. Woods Council #5194 (SC); Msgr. Charles Duke Council #3465 (LA); Msgr. Charles G. Corristin Assembly #1289 (NJ); Msgr. Charles G. McDonagh Council #16365 (NY); Msgr. Clement Kern Council #8284 (MI); Msgr. Delaney Council #5983 (NY); Msgr. Edward Russell #1418 (KY); Msgr. Eppenbrock Council #3615 (MI); Msgr. Esper Council #3027 (MI); Msgr. Eugene F. Marshall Council #103 (MA); Msgr. Francis Ansbro Council #462 (NY); Msgr. Francis Byrne Council #5476 (VA); Msgr. Francis X. Coyle Council #5560 (NJ); Msgr. George Louis Smith Council #3684 (SC); Msgr. Gettlefinger Council #1264 (KY); Msgr. Henry J. Watterson Council #1711 (NJ); Msgr. Henry O'Carroll #444 (NY); Msgr. Higdon Council #10962 (KY); Msgr. Hugh O'Sullivan Council #2046 (KY); Msgr. James S. Conlan Council #5329 (NY); Msgr. James Stapleton Council #3191 (MI); Msgr. James Willett Council #7847 (KY); Msgr. Jerome Reddy Council #6569 (FL); Msgr. John A. Gabriels Council #11099 (MI); Msgr. John C. Seidenschwang Council #11836 (NY); Msgr. John Danz Council #2459 (KY); Msgr. John R. McGinley Council #1170 (WI); Msgr. Joseph Newman Council #4665 (KY); Msgr. Lederer Council #4549 (WI); Msgr. Leonard Fries Council #1839 (NY); Msgr. Martin C. Murphy Council #6847 (SC); Msgr. O'Keefe Council #8250 (NY); Msgr. Patrick J. Connors Council #4997 (NY); Msgr. Richard C. Madden Council #6629 (SC); Msgr. Russell E. Kohler Council #15204 (MI); Msgr. Thompson Council #10988 (KY); Msgr. William Diersen Council #13304 (KY); Msgr. William McKune Council #14471 (KY); Msgr. William S. Bevington Council #9132 (TN); Murphysboro Council #988 (IL); Mustang Council #8633 (OK); Nativity of Our Lord Council #10961 (CO); New Hyde Park Council #2852 (NY); New Richmond Council #2845 (WI); Nicolet Council #1838 (WI); NJL Council #15960 (SC); North Port Council #7997 (FL); Northern Illinois District of Marquette Province (IL); Northfield Council #1516 (MN); Notre Dame Council #10514 (FL); Notre Dame Council #3021 (MI); Ocean Springs Council #5654 (MS ; Olean Council #338 (NY); Orange County Chapter (CA); Oswego Council #227 (NY); Our Lady Comforter of the Afflicted Council #14710 (MA); Our Lady of Fatima Council #4486 (NJ); Our Lady of Fatima Council #7755 (NJ); Our Lady of Grace Council #11968 (NY); Our Lady of Grace Council #14765 (SC); Our Lady of Guadalupe Council #15590 (PA); Our Lady of Guadalupe Council #8121 (NY); Our Lady of Hope Council #8086 (FL); Our Lady of Joy Council #11116 (AZ); Our Lady of Lourdes Council #10393 (TX); Our Lady of Lourdes Council #10803 (NY); Our Lady of Lourdes Council #12025 (NC); Our Lady of Lourdes Council #14290 (KY); Our Lady of Lourdes Council #7054 (CT); Our Lady of Lourdes/St. Joseph Parish Council #11606 (NH); Our Lady of Martyrs Shrine Council #16861 (NY); Our Lady of Mount Virgin Council #12700 (NJ); Our Lady of Mt. Carmel Council #9665 (CA); Our Lady of Peace Council #14282 (OH); Our Lady of Perpetual Help Council #14186 (OH); Our Lady of Perpetual Help Council #794 (NY); Our Lady of Space Council #5667 (FL); Our Lady of the Annunciation Council #194 (NY); Our Lady of the Genesee Council #4812 (NY); Our Lady of the Hills Council #6892 (SC); Our Lady of the Incarnate Word Council #15199 (NM); Our Lady of the Lakes Council #6318 (NY); Our Lady of the Miraculous Medal Council #6556 (NY); Our Lady of the Mountain Council #9832 (NY); Our Lady of the Pillar Council #7534 (CA); Our Lady of the Pillar Council #9210 (CA); Our Lady of the Pines Council #11950 (NY); Our Lady of the Rosary Council #10581 (ID); Our Lady of the Rosary Council #4428 (NY); Our Lady of the Sacred Heart Council #16903 (SC); Our Lady of the Sierra Assembly #2777 (NV); Our Lady of the Valley Council #9676 (NY); Our Lady Queen of the Knights Assembly #2679 (FL); Our Lady Queen of Peace Council #4556 (MI); Our Lady Queen of Peace Council #6139 (NJ); Our Lady Queen of the Foothills Council #11612 (CA); Our Lady Star of the Sea Council #7122 (SC); Owensboro Council #817 (KY); Parish of the Resurrection Council #11573 (NH); Patchogue Knights Council #725 (NY); Patrick Cardinal O'Boyle Council #11302 (Washington D.C.); Paul J. Trageser Council #10910 (NC); Pax Christi Council #15613 (KY); Peter T. Campon Council #206 (NY); Peter T. Villano Sr. Council #9576 (SC); Phil Kelley Council #6878 (TX); Phoenixville Council #1374 (PA); Pittsfield Council #103 (MA); Pope John Paul I Council #6020 (CA); Pope John Paul II Council #13794 (WA); Pope John Paul II Council #13900 (FL); Pope John Paul II Council #14188 (MA); Pope John Paul II Council #7387 (KY); Pope St. Pius X Council #11623 (ID); Presentation Council #6033 (NJ): Prince of Peace Council #13457 (GA): Prince of Peace Foothills Council #9184 (SC): Princeton Council #636 (NJ); Queen of Angels Council #15719 (CA); Queen of Heaven Council #4572 (TN); Queen of Peace Council #6725 (NH); Ramapo Valley Council #5846 (NJ); Raymond G. Bennett Council #7289 (SC); Reading Council #1031 (MA); Red Bank Council #3187 (NJ); Rennselaer Polytechnic Institute Council #13635 (NY); Resurrection Council #11692 (KS); Resurrection Council #13851 (OR); Resurrection Council #15675 (FL); Rev. A.A. Plikunas Council #8790 (SC); Rev. Daniel D. Hogan Council #6862 (NY); Rev. David J. Schiller Council #11910 (SC); Rev. John Egan Council #10334 (SC); Rev. John L. McLauglin Council #9475 (SC); Rev. John T. Weyer Council #11343 (TX); Rev. Norman F. Rockwood Council #9161 (SC); Rev. Paul D. O'Toole Council #10819 (SC); Rev. Richard A. Donnelly Council #322 (RI); Richmond Council #2667 (MI); Richmond Council #351 (NY); Ridgewood Council #1736 (NJ); Rome Council #391 (NY); Romeo Council #7018 (MI); Sacramento Council #953 (CA); Sacred Heart Council #12537 (NC); Sacred Heart Council #1847 (MA); Sacred Heart Council #4937 (NY); Sacred Heart Council #5071 (KY); Sacred Heart Council #518 (NY); Sacred Heart Council #8145 (KY); Sacred Heart Council #8659 (MI); Sacred Heart of Jesus Council #15023 (OH); San Juan Council #3448 (NM); San Marco Council #6344 (FL); San Pablo Council #15707 (KY); Santa Cruz Council #9038 (TX); Santa Cruz Council #971 (CA); San Jose Council #3474 (CA); Santa Maria Council #195 (DE); Santa Maria Council #2829 (NC); Santa Maria Council #4999 (FL); Saratoga Council #246 (NY); Sarto Council #1059 (NY); Savannah Council #631 (GA); Sayre Council #1807 (PA); Scituate Council #3176 (MA); Seattle Council #606 (WA); Sebree Council #7831 (KY); Shawnee Council #2332 (KS); Slidell Council #2732 (LA); Solanus Casey Council #1632 (MN); Somerville Council #1432 (NJ); Sons of Mother Seton Council #9847 (NC); Spalding Council #427 (IL); Springfield Council #624 (OH); St. Alphonsus Liguori Council #17238 (NY); St. Ambrose Council #15418 (UT); St. Anastasia Council #5911 (NY); St. Andrew Council #10632 (GA); St. Andrew Council #11275 (OH); St. Angela Merici Council #14617 (TX); St. Anne Church Council #10866 (GA); St. Anne Council #16720 (IL); St. Anne's Council #2429 (NY); St. Anne's Parish Council #2329 (CA); St. Anthony Council #2439 (OR); St. Anthony of Padua Council #417 (Washington, DC); St. Augustine Council # 13524 (NY); St. Augustine Council #611 (FL); St. Augustine of Hippo Council #14729 (MI); St. Basil Council #13271 (CA); St. Benedict Council #11590 (NY); St. Benedict Council #12246 (AZ); St. Benedict Council #13485 (MI); St. Benedict Council #15225 (FL); St. Bernadette Council #16376 (OH); St. Bernadette Parish Council #12164 (AZ); St. Bernard of Clairvaux Council #12313 (AZ); St. Bonaventure Council #12240 (FL); St. Boniface Council #1190 (NH); St. Brendan Council #11208 (OH); St. Bridget Council #9800 (AZ); St. Bridget of Ireland Council #16938 (VA); St. Brigid Council #13204 (GA); St. Brigid of Kildare Council #10863 (OH); St. Cabrini Council #3472 (CA); St. Catherine Council #13408 (NY); St. Catherine of Alexandria Parish Council #8265 (CA); St. Catherine of Bologna Council #6212 (NJ); St. Catherine of Siena Council #8156 (NY); St. Charles Borromeo Council #16415 (NY); St. Charles Council #2084 (MI); St. Charles/St. Sebastian Council #15484 (KY); St. Christopher Council #12623 (KY); St. Christopher's Council #16435 (NY); St. Clare Council #16443 (NY); St. Clare of Assisi Council #12851 (AZ); St. Columba Council #8637 (NY); St. Columbanus Council #14991 (NY); St. Cyprian Council #10008 (Washington, DC); St. Damien of Molokai Council #15733 (CA); St. Denis Council #1756 (OH); St. Dominic Council #4399 (NY); St. Dominic's & Hazelwood Council #1516 (MN); St. Edward Council #13196 (KY); St. Edward Council #5023 (OH); St. Elizabeth Ann Seton Council #11187 (OH); St. Elizabeth Council #13141 (PA); St. Elizabeth Council #2393 (NJ); St. Elizabeth Seton Council #12774 (KY); St. Eugene Council #10822 (OK); St. Fabian Council #967 (IL); St. Frances de Chantal #6526 (NY); St. Francis and St. Clare Council #222 (NY); St. Francis de Sales Council #10834 (KS); St. Francis of Assisi Council #11673 (FL); St. Francis of Assisi Council #13026 (NH); St. Francis of Assisi Council #15063 (KY); St. Francis of Assisi Council #16088 (TN); St. Francis of Assisi Council #8909 (CO); St. Francis Xavier Council #14728 (KY); St. Gabriel Council #15699 (KY); St. Gabriel the Archangel Council #12897 (MA); St. Gabriel the Archangel Council #13286 (AZ); St. Gerard Majella Council #6884 (SC); St. Gregory Council # 14687 (NY); St. Gregory the Great #7277 (NJ); St. Gregory the Great Council #12821 (RI); St. Helen Council #11738 (AZ); St. Helen Council #8304 (NM); St. Henry Council #11453 (KY); St. Hyacinth Council #10574 (TX); St. Ignatius of Antioch Council #8354 (TN); St. Ignatius of Loyola Council #12853 (CA); St. Irene Council #13848 (MA); St. Isaac Jogues #11428 (NY); St. Isaac Jogues Council #12229 (NJ); St. James Council #2883 (CT); St. Jerome Council #13005 (TX); St. Joan of Arc Council #10765 (OH); St. Joan of Arc Council #15905 (OH); St. Joan of Arc Council #9206 (CA); St. John Maron Council #16441 (NY); St. John Neumann Council #16169 (MI); St. John Neumann Council #7343 (NC); St. John Neumann Council #7566 (NY); St. John Paul Council #1610 (OH); St. John Paul II Assembly #3501 (UT); St. John Paul II Council #10821 (GA); St. John Paul II Council #15996 (GA); St. John Paul II Council #16488 (CA); St. John Paul II Council #1663 (ID); St. John the Baptist Council #14898 (CO); St. John the Baptist Council #9167 (IL); St. John the Beloved Council #11796 (DE); St. John the Evangelist Council #13608 (OH); St. John Vianney Council #7525 (VT); St. John XXIII Council #5634 (KY); St. John XXIII Council #6250 (SC); St. John/St. Francis Council #11470 (KY); St. John's Council #1345 (NJ); St. Johns River Council #10850 (FL); St. Josaphat Council #7530 (Washington, DC); St. Joseph- Bishop Baldwin Council #15809 (NY); St. Joseph Council #12163 (LA); St. Joseph Council #12354 (KY); St. Joseph Council #12554 (SC); St. Joseph Council #12941 (ME); St. Joseph Council #13700 (OR); St. Joseph Council #13977 (OH); St. Joseph Council #15471 (NY); St. Joseph Council #3656 (MN); St. Joseph Council #3814 (NJ); St. Joseph Council #4810 (NY); St. Joseph Council #5398 (NY); St. Joseph Council #5604 (FL); St. Joseph Council #7528 (WA); St. Joseph Council #8872 (WA); St. Joseph Council #9202 (CA); St. Joseph the Carpenter Council #14771 (NY); St. Joseph/St. Raymond Council #6850 (NH); St. Jude Council #11293 (TX); St. Jude Council #16513 (GA); St. Jude Thaddeus Council #2890 (MI); St. Jude the Apostle Council #12637 (NY); St. Junipero Serra Council #9498 (CA); St. Kilian Council #2204 (NY); St. Lawrence Council #1495 (NY); St. Lawrence Council #15681 (KY); St. Lawrence Council #9407 (VA); St. Leo Council #13917 (KY); St. Leonard Council #10215 (OH); St. Louis Bertrand Council #10682 (KY); St. Louis Council #11851 (CO); St. Louis Council #15833 (NY); St. Lucy of Racine Council #15659 (WI); St. Luke Council #10263 (KY); St. Luke Council #12832 (NC); St. Luke Council #9973 (LA); St. Luke the Evangelist Council #9201 (TX); St. Margaret Mary Council #15979 (KY); St. Mark Council #12852 (KY); St. Mark Council #1498 (CO); St. Mark Council #7613 (TX); St. Mark Council #8 (CT); St. Mark the Evangelist Council #10488 (NH); St. Mark's-Star of the Sea Council #11374 (NY); St. Mark-St. Denis Council #3231 (NJ); St. Martin de Porres Council #1183 (CO); St. Martin of Tours Council #14162 (WA); St. Mary Council #14224 (MA); St. Mary Council #1796 (OH); St. Mary Council #4065 (NY); St. Mary Council #9634 (TX); St. Mary Magdalene Council #13779 (AZ); St. Mary Magdalene Council #7186 (NC); St. Mary of Huntley Council #11666 (IL); St. Mary of the Falls Council #14416 (OH); St. Mary of the Lakes Council #6520 (NJ); St. Mary Parish Council #1056 (OH); St. Mary Pinckney Council #11761 (MI); St. Mary Star of the Sea Council #9111 (CA); St. Mary Star of the Sea Council #9301 (MI); St. Matthew Council #10852 (NC); St. Matthew Council #14360 (CT); St. Matthew Council #70123 (LA); St. Maximilian Kolbe Council #11355 (OH); St.

Maximillian Kolbe Council #11410 (FL); St. Maximilian Kolbe Council #9058 (NH); St. Maximillian Kolbe Council #11483 (FL); St. Michael Council #14700 (TX); St. Michael Council #15525 (KY); St. Michael Council #7311 (MI); St. Michael Council #8980 (SC); St. Michael Council #9664 (WA); St. Michael Council #9903 (TX); St. Mildred Council #14128 (KY); St. Nicholas Council #7011 (MI); St. Oliver Plunkett Council #13440 (GA); St. Patrick Council #11271 (Ontario, Canada); St. Patrick Council #11745 (AK); St. Patrick Council #12927 (TX); St. Patrick Council #1747 (OH); St. Patrick Council #6902 (NH); St. Patrick's Knights of Columbus Council #10924 (NY); St. Paul Council #11634 (CO); St. Paul the Apostle/Pope John XXIII Council #13352 (NY); St. Peter Chanel Council #13217 (GA); St. Peter Council #14289 (IL); St. Peter Council #258 (WI); St. Peter Council #8910 (FL); St. Peter of the Fields Council #5173 (OH); St. Philip the Apostle Council #14482 (TN); St. Pius X Council #17086 (NY); St. Pope John XXIII Council #5438 (WI); St. Raphael Council #10157 (FL); St. Raymond/Msgr. Walsh Council #7220 (NY); St. Robert Bellarmine Council #8964 (NY); St. Rose of Lima Council #6010 (UT); St. Scholastica Council #14885 (FL); St. Stephen Council #12458 (AR); St. Stephen Council #9282 (TN); St. Stephen the Martyr Council #13374 (WA); St. Stephen the Martyr Council #14122 (GA); St. Stephen's Council #2175 (NY); St. Sylvester Council #13277 (FL); St. Sylvester Council #6844 (NY); St. Theodore Guerin Council #14057 (IL); St. Theresa Council #11877 (FL): St. Theresa Council #2282 (KY): St. Therese Council #7406 (NC): St. Therese of Lisieux Council #7647 (NJ): St. Thomas Aquinas Council #15357 (FL); St. Thomas More Council #2188 (NJ); St. Thomas More Council #7431 (IN); St. Thomas More Council #7826 (FL); St. Thomas the Apostle Council #587 (MI); St. Thomas the Apostle Council #9287 (AZ); St. Timothy Council #12834 (CA); St. Timothy Council #15211 (KY); St. Vincent de Paul Council #11431 (CA); State Council of Arizona; State Council of California; State Council of Connecticut; State Council of Georgia; State Council of Illinois; State Council of Indiana; State Council of Kentucky; State Council of Massachusetts; State Council of New Jersey; State Council of New York; State Council of Pennsylvania; State Council of the District of Columbia; State Council of Washington; State; Council of Wisconsin; Staten Island Council #1662 (NY); Stella Maris Council #10 (CT); Stella Maris Council #3772 (CA); Sts. Anne and Joachim Council #11930 (ND); Sts. Brigid & James Council #16179 (KY); Sts. Gabriel and John Vianney Council #12335 (CO); Sulphur Council #3015 (LA); Sunrise Council #6607 (NY); The Citadel Council #6900 (SC); The Good Shepherd Council #5573 (IL); The Shrine of St. Jude Council #15446 (NY); Thomas D. Reilley, Sr. Council #10668 (SC); Thomas Dongan Council #1251 (NY); Thomas O'Reilly Council #4358 (GA); Thousand Islands Council #350 (NY); T.J. McGee Council #2612 (MA); Transfiguration Council #13713 (SC); Tri-Cities Council #10867 (SC); Trinity Council #4839 (FL); Twelve Apostles Council #5001 (NY); Union Council #4504 (NJ); Uniontown Council #1367 (KY); Valladolid Council #70 (MA); Vicksburg Council #898 (MS); Vincent Caggiano Sr. Council #12995 (SC); Vincent T. Lombardi Council #6552 (NJ); W.H. Jolly Council #7974 (MS); W.P. Morris Council #6645 (TN); Washington Council #224 (Washington, DC); Waterford Council #237 (NY); Waterloo Council #1334 (IL); Waverly Council #1361 (KY); Westbury Council #1012 (NY); Whitman Council #347 (MA); Wilmington Council #1074 (NC); Windham Council #7572 (NH); Wright-Hennepin Council #4174 (MN); Wyoming Council #2240 (NY); Yakima Council #894 (WA); Yavapai Council #1032 (AZ)

From: E T Gomulka Sent: Saturday, March 27, 2021 9:05 PM To: All K of C Councils Subject: KNIGHT BRINGS SUIT

Dear Brother Knights of Columbus,

In September of 2020, I informed you and nearly 1500 Knights throughout the United States about the victimization experienced by your fellow Third Degree Knight and former North American College (NAC) Seminarian, Anthony Gorgia. In the letter you received, found in the public record at www.gomulka.net/KofC.pdf, I requested that the Knights join in urging their leadership to request an independent investigation into homosexual predation at the NAC toward vulnerable seminarians in keeping with the Knight's charism of promoting the welfare of priestly vocations. In particular, I reported that Cardinal Timothy Dolan and NAC officials retaliated against Gorgia who witnessed and received reports from fellow seminarians about predatory behavior on the part of the NAC vice-rector, Father Adam Park, a priest of the Archdiocese of Washington. Insofar as many of the NAC seminarians who are endangered or victimized are your brother Knights, I was certain you would find my report urgent and relevant.

As a retired Navy Captain who co-authored the Navy and Marine Core Values of "Honor, Courage, and Commitment," I call upon your Supreme Knight Patrick E. Kelly to earn the \$1.8 million he is paid annually by addressing the matter with the Supreme Chaplain who to date has failed to act upon the alleged homosexual predation and misconduct at the NAC. Of all people, Supreme Knight Kelly, who is a retired Navy Captain from the Judge Advocate General's Corps (JAG), has the experience and ability to address the matter with Archbishop Lori. Unfortunately, Lori's lack of response to multiple 2020 reports was not the first time he was found to have covered up impropriety. In 2019, Lori reportedly concealed \$350,000 he received from disgraced Bishop Michael Bransfield who sexually abused priests and seminarians. Lori was likewise reported as having covered up homosexual harassment toward heterosexual seminarians of the Archdiocese of Baltimore.

While the Knights of Columbus state that they support vocations, they cannot expect to recruit heterosexually-oriented young men to become priests if they do not do all they can to address the problem of homosexual predation in seminaries. Insofar as your previous Supreme Knight, Carl Anderson, and your current Supreme Chaplain, Archbishop Lori, failed to even acknowledge the reports they received regarding the victimization of their brother Knight, Anthony Gorgia, be informed that Gorgia had no choice but to file suit against Cardinal Dolan, NAC officials, and other responsible parties in order to protect vulnerable seminarians.

A YouTube video summarizing the lawsuit may be found here: <u>https://youtu.be/2k\_C6Ij2-9U</u>

You may also access the lawsuit online here: https://iapps.courts.state.ny.us/nyscef/ViewDocument?docIndex=VQhEtLkS/cF\_PLUS\_a4QyW 6Ba\_PLU S\_g==

Having investigated this case for nearly one year in collaboration with other investigators, including a retired FBI Special Agent in Charge (SAC), let me say that we have amassed a significant amount of evidence that incriminates not only implicated NAC faculty members, but also Cardinal Dolan as well as several bishops reported to have engaged in homosexual relations with fellow clerics and seminarians.

While I regret that the Catholic Church lost Anthony Gorgia and other former seminarians who will be testifying in Court about sexual misconduct they suffered or reported, I think every Knight should be very proud that Knight Gorgia has demonstrated great moral courage in exposing this very serious problem in the Catholic Church. Please keep him and his family in your prayers as the case moves forward.

Fraternally,

Donueko

Gene Thomas Gomulka CAPT, CHC, USN (Ret.)

Gene Thomas Gomulka is an abuse advocate/consultant and a retired Navy captain/chaplain who served on active duty at Marine Corps and Navy commands for over 24 years. Ordained for the Pennsylvania Altoona-Johnstown diocese, Fr. (Monsignor) Gomulka and Dominican Fr. Thomas Doyle were reprised against by prelates whom they confronted for underreporting and covering up abuse.

356 H Avenue Coronado, CA 92118 August 11, 2021

Mr. Patrick E. Kelly Knights of Columbus Supreme Council 1 Columbus Plaza New Haven, CT 06510-4000

Dear Supreme Knight,

For the past 18 months I have been investigating a case involving Anthony Gorgia, a Knight of Columbus from the Stolzenthaler Council #1675 on Staten Island, New York. Mr. Gorgia, a former seminarian studying for the Archdiocese of New York at the North American College (NAC) in Rome, tried for two years to get Church officials to investigate predatory behavior on the part of the vice-rector, Father Adam Park, and the retaliation Anthony suffered after he was receiving word from fellow seminarians about Park's misconduct, which Anthony himself witnessed. When U.S. and Vatican Church officials, as well as the Knights of Columbus, ignored these reports, he had no choice but to seek the protection of vulnerable seminarians whose safety was at risk by filing suit in New York State Supreme Court against Cardinal Dolan and NAC officials who either engaged in or covered up homosexual predation or misconduct involving seminarians.

Catholic laypersons who are members of organizations like the Knights of Columbus often never act on grave issues without consulting their pastor or chaplain. It is my belief that Peter Fyfe and Steven Dolan, respectively the past and present Grand Knights of Stolzenthaler Council, discussed the communications I sent on July 20, 2020, September 23, 2020, and March 27, 2021 with their recently removed Our Lady Star of the Sea pastor, Father Thomas Devery; and that your predecessor, Carl A. Anderson, discussed these same communications he also received with the Supreme Chaplain, Archbishop William Lori.

As I never received the courtesy of a reply from Mr. Anderson, Mr. Fyfe, or Mr. Dolan, I believe it may have been because they were advised by the clerics they consulted not to cooperate with Cardinal Sean O'Malley and other bishops who wrote to the Apostolic Nuncio requesting an impartial investigation into the allegations of homosexual misconduct and cover-up against seminary and Church officials. If I am wrong in this belief, please inform me if you can ascertain why they did not choose to help their brother Knight and seminarians who have become victims of predation.

I am sure Mr. Anderson, Mr. Fyfe, and Mr. Dolan may all be interested in knowing that, while the accusations have been <u>found "entirely credible" by a former FBI Special Agent in Charge</u>, Archbishop Lori and Father Devery, both of whom covered up the sexual misconduct allegations, may have advised them to "stand down" because of ulterior motives on their part. Although Devery knew that Anthony was a highly respected member of Stolzenthaler Council and Our Lady Star of the Sea Parish, he did not want to support Gorgia's requests for an investigation into homosexual misconduct lest Devery's own history of alleged abuse come to light.

Fyfe and Dolan have since learned that <u>multiple victims have filed abuse lawsuits against Devery</u> which have resulted in his recent removal from the parish. While Devery is accused of sexual abuse, Lori stands accused of covering up not only sexual predation at the NAC, but also sexual harassment reported by the family of one of his former seminarians in a <u>November 1, 2019 letter to the Apostolic Nuncio</u>, Archbishop Christophe Pierre. Interestingly, it was around this same time that Anthony Gorgia and his supporters were writing numerous Vatican officials asking that Park's misconduct be investigated.

I do not believe it is a coincidence that Father Carter Griffin, the rector of St. John Paul II seminary <u>who</u> <u>himself is accused of sexual harassment</u> in the letter to the Nuncio, was one year ahead of Father Park at the NAC. Both Cardinal Wilton Gregory, Park's and Griffin's Ordinary, as well as Archbishop Lori, were made aware of the injustices suffered by Knight Anthony Gorgia in reports dated <u>April 22, 2020</u>, <u>May 8, 2020</u>, <u>June 18, 2020</u>, <u>July 3, 2020</u>, <u>July 16, 2020</u>, and <u>July 25, 2021</u>, and they <u>failed to act when they were responsible</u> to have done so.

You may also wish to know that Father Park has since resigned from the NAC in the wake of the homosexual misconduct allegations which Knights of Columbus leadership covered up. After calling your attention to the *LifeSiteNews* article, "Vice-rector of American seminary in Rome resigns after homosexual misconduct allegations," as the co-author of the Marine Corps and Navy Core Values of "Honor, Courage, and Commitment," I call upon you to issue an apology to your brother Knight, Anthony Gorgia, for failure on the part of the K of C leadership on the national and local levels to support and defend him after having been amply informed of the injustices he suffered. I also request that you call for the resignation of Archbishop Lori from his position as Supreme Chaplain not only for covering up homosexual predation and misconduct allegations at the NAC, but also at St. John Paul II Seminary in Washington, DC, which he, Cardinal Gregory, and Archbishop Pierre all failed to act upon.

If people were to learn that the Knights of Columbus' were involved in covering up sexual predation in seminaries like the NAC and St. John Paul II, might they ask, *How can the Knights be taken seriously when they say that they support priestly vocations?* Former seminarians and Knights like Anthony responded to the K of C appeals for vocations, only to be let down when it was shown that the Knights, through their silence, rendered consent to one of the largest predation crises tearing through U.S. seminaries today (Cf. St. Thomas More, "Qui tacet consentire videtur").

When my late Our Lady of Victory parishioner, Penn State Coach Joe Paterno, was informed by assistant coach Mike McQueary of the abuse he witnessed on the part of Jerry Sandusky, he reported the allegation immediately to Timothy Curley and Gary Schultz to whom the campus police reported. Because they covered up the abuse allegation they received from Paterno, Curley and Schultz were sentenced to two months behind bars followed by house arrest. As someone who has served as both a prosecutor and a defense lawyer, what sentence do you feel is appropriate for Dolan, Harman, Gregory, Lori and all of those who covered up for Park and those who continue to cover up for Griffin? What response do you feel is fitting for the

Knights of Columbus to offer their brother Knight for his moral courage in confronting seminary and church officials who engaged in or covered up predatory behavior and misconduct <u>similar to that which</u> was also exposed within the last few years at seminaries like <u>Christ the King</u> near Buffalo, <u>St. Mary's</u> near Detroit, <u>Holy Apostles</u> near Hartford, <u>St. John's</u> near Boston, <u>Mount Angel</u> near Portland, Oregon, and elsewhere in the U.S. and abroad in places like <u>Brazil</u>, <u>Honduras</u>, <u>Argentina</u>, and even <u>Vatican City</u>.

I look forward to your timely response.

Sincerely in Christ,

Somulk

Gene Thomas Gomulka Biography

CC: Archbishop William Lori Cardinal Wilton Gregory Archbishop Christophe Pierre Mr. Steven Dolan Mr. Peter Fyfe